



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion**  
**The Record of Proceedings**

Dydd Mercher, 2 Tachwedd 2011  
Wednesday, 2 November 2011

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy  
Questions to the Minister for the Environment and Sustainable Development
- 23 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth  
Questions to the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage
- 45 Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Creu Swyddi  
Welsh Conservatives Debate: Job Creation
- 75 Dadl Plaid Cymru: Cynllun Gweithredu ar gyfer y Diwydiant Llaeth  
Plaid Cymru Debate: A Dairy Action Plan
- 95 Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Codi CMC  
Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Raising GDP
- 126 Cyfnod Pleidleisio  
Voting Time
- 132 Dadl Fer: Trefi ar gyfer yr Unfed Ganrif ar Hugain?  
Short Debate: Twenty-first Century Towns?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Prynhawn da. Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.  
**The Presiding Officer:** Good afternoon. I call the Assembly to order.

## **Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy Questions to the Minister for the Environment and Sustainable Development**

### **Gwirfoddolwyr a Grwpiau Cynaliadwyedd**

### **Sustainability Groups and Volunteers**

*1. Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa gymorth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei roi i wirfoddolwyr a grwpiau cynaliadwyedd sy'n gweithio i ofalu am yr amgylchedd yn Nelyn. OAQ(4)0047(ESD)*

*1. Sandy Mewies: Will the Minister outline what support the Welsh Government gives to sustainability groups and volunteers working to care for the environment in Delyn. OAQ(4)0047(ESD)*

### **The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths):**

Several projects in the Delyn constituency are currently receiving funding from the Tidy Towns programme to deliver improvements in the local environment. Support is also available across Wales from Environment Wales, our support for sustainable living grant scheme, our Pathfinder project, and through the Sustainable Futures practitioners network.

### **Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths):**

Mae nifer o brosiectau yn etholaeth Delyn ar hyn o bryd sydd yn derbyn arian gan raglen Trefi Taclus i sicrhau gwelliannau yn yr amgylchedd lleol. Mae cymorth hefyd ar gael ar draws Cymru drwy Amgylchedd Cymru, ein cynllun grant cefnogi byw yn gynaliadwy, ein prosiect Braenaru, a thrwy rwydwaith ymarferwyr Dyfodol Cynaliadwy.

**Sandy Mewies:** I am sure that you will join me in congratulating the residents of Mold in my constituency after its annual spring clean was named the best community initiative in the UK in the Action for Market Towns awards. As you said, the project was funded by the Welsh Government through the Tidy Towns programme. Some 800 people took part in helping to clear litter, and, believe me, they did a marvellous job. Minister, do you agree that the success of this event reflects how important it is to involve the community and get it on board to support schemes as part of projects such as Tidy Towns? It also shows how successful the Tidy Towns scheme has become.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr wyf yn siŵr yr ymunwch â mi i longyfarch trigolion yr Wyddgrug yn f'etholaeth ar ôl i'w menter glanhau blynyddol gael ei enwi'n fenter gymunedol gorau y DU yn y gwobrau Action for Market Towns. Fel y dywedaso, ariannwyd y prosiect gan Lywodraeth Cymru drwy'r rhaglen Trefi Taclus. Cymerodd rhyw 800 o bobl ran yn helpu clirio sbwriel, a chredwch chi fi, gwnaethant waith penigamp. Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno bod llwyddiant y digwyddiad hwn yn adlewyrchu pa mor bwysig yw cynnwys y gymuned a'i chael i gymryd rhan a chefnogi cynlluniau fel rhan o brosiectau fel Trefi Taclus? Dengys hefyd pa mor llwyddiannus yw'r cynllun Trefi Taclus.

**John Griffiths:** I agree with those sentiments. It is impressive, as environment Minister, to go around Wales and see the commitment that exists in communities across the country to deliver a top-quality local environment. I pay tribute to the volunteers in Mold for their hard work and

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â'r teimladau hynny. Mae'n gyffrous, fel Gweinidog yr amgylchedd, i deithio o gwmpas Cymru a gweld yr ymrwymiad sy'n bodoli mewn cymunedau ar draws y wlad i ddarparu amgylchedd lleol o'r ansawdd gorau. Talaf deyrnged i'r gwirfoddolwyr yn

commitment to improving their local environment. Tidy Towns is a great scheme; it is delivering across Wales and I am pleased to say that funding is in place for the initiative through to 2015.

**Mark Isherwood:** I also congratulate the Mold spring clean on winning the public sector award in the Tidy Wales awards. I am sure that you will join me in welcoming the news that McDonald's restaurants have decided that Keep Wales Tidy will be the charity that receives the money that they take from the carrier bag charge during its first 12 months. However, how do you respond to a concern from the sector that increasing numbers of customers who are turning up with pre-used bags, often used several times before, are at risk of cross-contamination when open food from the retailer is placed in those bags? A food safety issue may arise that needs to be addressed.

**John Griffiths:** If the Food Standards Agency or local authorities' environmental health departments had any concerns around such issues, I would be keen to know about them and to consider whether there were problems that needed to be addressed. However, I have had no such contact to date. We are working closely with retailers on the plastic bag charge to ensure that the proceeds go to good causes in Wales, particularly environmental causes. We are open to any issues that retailers wish to raise about any aspect of the plastic bag charge.

### **Amddiffynfeydd rhag Llifogydd**

**2. Janet Finch-Saunders:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yng Ngogledd Cymru. OAQ(4)0044(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** North Wales is served by an extensive network of flood defences. In the last five years, the Welsh Government has provided £10 million for flood alleviation projects in the area. With additional support from European structural funds, it is

yr Wyddgrug am eu gwaith caled ac ymrwymiad i wella eu hamgylchedd lleol. Mae Trefi Taclus yn gynllun gwych sydd yn cyflawni ar draws Cymru ac mae'n dda gennyf ddweud bod cyllid mewn lle ar gyfer y fenter hyd at 2015.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf hefyd yn llongyfarch y glanhau mawr yn yr Wyddgrug ar ennill y wobr sector cyhoeddus yng ngwobrau Cymru Daclus. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i groesawu'r newyddion bod bwytaï McDonald's wedi penderfynu mai Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus fydd yr elusen a gaiff yr arian y maent yn ei gymryd o'r tâl am fagiau siopa yn ystod y 12 mis cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, sut ydych yn ymateb i bryder y sector bod niferoedd cynyddol o gwsmeriaid sy'n troi i fyny gyda bagiau ail-law, yn aml wedi cael eu defnyddio sawl gwaith o'r blaen, mewn perygl o groesheintio pan fydd bwyd agored o'r manwerthwr yn cael ei roi yn y cyfryw fagiau? Gall mater diogelwch bwyd godi sydd angen rhoi sylw iddo.

**John Griffiths:** Pe bai gan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd neu adrannau iechyd yr amgylchedd awdurdodau lleol unrhyw bryderon ynghylch materion o'r fath, byddwn yn awyddus i gael gwybod amdanynt ac i ystyried a oedd problemau yr oedd angen rhoi sylw iddynt. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw gyswllt o'r fath hyd yma. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda manwerthwyr ar y tâl am fagiau plastig i sicrhau bod enillion yn mynd at achosion da yng Nghymru, yn enwedig achosion amgylcheddol. Yr ydym yn agored i unrhyw faterion mae manwerthwyr am eu codi am unrhyw agwedd ar y tâl am fagiau plastig.

### **Flood Defences**

**2. Janet Finch-Saunders:** *Will the Minister make a statement on flood defences in North Wales. OAQ(4)0044(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Mae'r gogledd yn cael ei wasanaethu gan rwydwaith eang o amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd. Yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi darparu £10 miliwn ar gyfer prosiectau lliniaru llifogydd yn yr ardal. Gyda

investing a further £4.6 million toward an ongoing programme of schemes.

chefnogaeth ychwanegol gan gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, mae'n buddsoddi £4.6 miliwn pellach tuag at raglen barhaus o gynlluniau.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** The Welsh Conservatives are committed to the designation of blue-belt development land in north Wales to prevent irresponsible development taking place on flood plains. Will you acknowledge the obvious benefits of such a policy?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi ymrwymo i ddynodi tir datblygu llain las yn y gogledd i atal datblygiadau anghyfrifol ar orlifdiroedd. A wnewch chi gydnabod manteision amlwg polisi o'r fath?

**John Griffiths:** It is important that development and planning are taken forward in a way that understands the issues around flooding and flood risk. A great deal of work is going on at the moment, which Members will be familiar with, on changes and updates to the planning system in Wales. I have recently announced an independent review group to look at the delivery of planning, and we will have legislation in the pipeline in due course. These and many other issues will be considered as part of that work.

**John Griffiths:** Mae'n bwysig bod datblygu a chynllunio yn cael eu dwyn ymlaen mewn ffordd lle mae dealltwriaeth o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â llifogydd a pherygl llifogydd. Mae llawer iawn o waith yn bwrw rhagddi ar hyn o bryd, y bydd yr Aelodau yn gyfarwydd ag ef, ar newidiadau a diweddariadau i'r system gynllunio yng Nghymru. Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddais grŵp adolygu annibynnol i edrych ar ddarparu cynllunio, a bydd gennym ddeddfwriaeth ar y gweill yn y man. Caiff y rhain a llawer o faterion eraill eu hystyried fel rhan o'r gwaith hwnnw.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Weinidog, yn wyneb yr hinsawdd anwadal ac eithafol a'r tywydd garw sydd wedi bod yng Nghymru a thu hwnt, a yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu rhoi mwy o arian i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar gyfer cynlluniau i atal llifogydd yn y dyfodol?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Minister, in the light of the changeable and extreme climate, and the inclement weather that has been experienced in Wales and beyond, does the Government intend to put more funding into the Environment Agency for flood alleviation and defence projects in future?

**John Griffiths:** The challenges of climate change involve predicting more severe weather events, and we have to understand that in terms of future projections, policy and funding. We have fully committed funding in place for flood defence schemes for the current financial year. This month, I will be announcing our national strategy for flood risk and coastal erosion management, and I will be saying more about these issues at that stage.

**John Griffiths:** Mae heriau newid yn yr hinsawdd yn golygu rhagweld tywydd mwy difrifol, ac mae'n rhaid inni ddeall hynny o ran amcanestyniadau, polisi a chyllid yn y dyfodol. Mae gennym gyllid wedi ei ymrwymo'n llwyr mewn lle ar gyfer cynlluniau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol. Y mis hwn, byddaf yn cyhoeddi ein strategaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer risg llifogydd a rheoli erydu arfordirol, a dywedaf fwy am y materion hyn bryd hynny.

**Aled Roberts:** A fydd y datganiad hwnnw yn sôn am ba fath o arolwg a wneir o nodyn cyngor technegol 15, am fod pryderon ynglŷn â chynlluniau lleol yn y gogledd yn sgîl perygl llifogydd?

**Aled Roberts:** Will that statement refer to how technical advice note 15 will be reviewed, because there are concerns in north Wales about local plans as a result of flood risk?

**John Griffiths:** As I said, our planning

**John Griffiths:** Fel y dywedais, mae ein

policy in general is constantly reviewed, and we will be taking forward legislation in due course. However, a lot of work will be going on before that. If there are any particular issues that Members feel should be considered as part of that process, I would be interested to hear from them.

### Lles Anifeiliaid

**3. Christine Chapman:** *Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i wella lles anifeiliaid yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0041(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** We are committed through the animal health and welfare strategy to improving animal welfare. We will be taking forward legislative work on dog breeding. The ban on conventional cages for laying hens will commence from January 2012, and we will be implementing measures on the regulations for the protection of animals at the time of killing once those are developed.

**Christine Chapman:** Over the summer, I was delighted to visit the Dogs Trust rehoming centre in Bridgend with the First Minister. From speaking to the charity and from recent correspondence that I have received on the issue, there is a clear consensus that we need to improve the welfare requirements within dog breeding legislation, while also making sure that we do not unfairly penalise responsible breeders. You mentioned an update on this position, but when can we expect the publication of the report on this important subject?

**John Griffiths:** It is important that we get the balance right in terms of the regulations on dog breeding so that the activities of irresponsible dog breeders are properly curtailed and controlled, but that we also do not impose unnecessary burdens on legitimate and responsible dog breeding operations. So, we are very much committed to taking forward the regulations in that light, and I hope to have the draft regulations available for consultation within the next month or two.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Minister, I am encouraged to hear your last answer. Moving

polisi cynllunio yn gyffredinol yn cael ei adolygu yn gyson, a byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â deddfwriaeth maes o law. Fodd bynnag, bydd llawer o waith yn mynd ymlaen cyn hynny. Os oes unrhyw faterion penodol y teimla Aelodau y dylent gael eu hystyried fel rhan o'r broses honno, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb clywed oddi wrthynt.

### Animal Welfare

**3. Christine Chapman:** *What is the Welsh Government doing to improve animal welfare in Wales. OAQ(4)0041(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo drwy'r strategaeth iechyd a lles anifeiliaid i wella lles anifeiliaid. Byddwn yn cymryd gwaith deddfwriaethol yn ei flaen ar fridio cŵn. Bydd y gwaharddiad ar gewyll confensiynol ar gyfer ieir dodwy yn cychwyn o fis Ionawr 2012, a byddwn yn gweithredu mesurau ar y rheoliadau ar gyfer diogelu anifeiliaid adeg eu lladd unwaith y datblygir y rheini.

**Christine Chapman:** Dros yr haf, yr oeddwn wrth fy modd i gael ymweld â chanolfan y Dogs Trust ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr gyda'r Prif Weinidog. O siarad â'r elusen ac o ohebiaeth ddiweddar yr wyf wedi'i chael ar y mater, mae consensws clir bod angen i ni wella'r gofynion lles o fewn deddfwriaeth bridio cŵn, wrth i ni hefyd wneud yn siŵr nad ydym yn cosbi bridwyr cyfrifol yn annheg. Soniasoch am roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y sefyllfa hon, ond pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl cyhoeddi'r adroddiad ar y pwnc pwysig hwn?

**John Griffiths:** Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael y cydbwysedd iawn o ran y rheoliadau ar fridio cŵn fel bod gweithgareddau bridwyr cŵn anghyfrifol yn cael eu cwtogi a'u rheoli'n briodol, ond fel nad ydym ni hefyd yn gosod beichiau diangen ar weithrediadau bridwyr cŵn cyfreithlon a chyfrifol. Felly, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig dros ben i fwrw ymlaen â'r rheoliadau yn y goleuni hwnnw, a gobeithiaf y bydd y rheoliadau drafft ar gael i ymgynghori arnynt o fewn y mis neu ddau nesaf.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Weinidog, mae eich ateb diwethaf yn fy nghalonogi. Gan symud

on to other matters, you will be aware of Wales's reliance on its small abattoirs, as well as the contribution that these businesses make to the excellent standards of farm animal welfare by reducing journey times to slaughter. Will you confirm how many times you have met with officials from the Food Standards Agency to discuss the impact of proposals for the cost recovery of meat hygiene controls at Welsh abattoirs? In the light of the latest proposals—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I think that you have already asked a question.

**John Griffiths:** I meet with a range of organisations to discuss a range of issues, many of which touch on small abattoirs and their concerns about full cost recovery charge suggestions. Once again, if the Member wishes to write me with any particular concerns, I will make sure that those are addressed and answered.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Moving on to a written answer that you gave to me on 14 September of this year in response to a question asking for further information about the bovine tuberculosis expert review panel, you stated that the latest meeting would be on 28 October, which was last week. Are you now able to give us a definite indication of when the report is going to be given to you? Your statement was that the group will report in the autumn. Do you now have an indication of the time frame?

**John Griffiths:** It is an independent exercise, as I have made clear to Members on a number of occasions. We are in the hands of the review panel. Its last meeting is scheduled, I believe, to take place at the end of next week. I would hope to have the final report within a few weeks of that final meeting.

**Rebecca Evans:** Wales was the first country in Britain to produce codes of practice for companion animals under the Animal Welfare Act 2006. What assessment has the Welsh Government made of the impact that those codes of practice are having on raising

ymlaen at faterion eraill, byddwch yn ymwybodol o ddibyniaeth Cymru ar ei lladd-dai bach, yn ogystal â'r cyfraniad mae'r busnesau hyn yn ei wneud i'r safonau rhagorol o ran lles anifeiliaid fferm trwy leihau'r amserau teithio i gael eu lladd. A wnewch chi gadarnhau faint o weithiau yr ydych wedi cyfarfod â swyddogion o'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i drafod effaith cynigion ar gyfer adennill costau rheolaethau hylendid cig mewn lladd-dai yng Nghymru? Yng ngoleuni'r cynigion diweddaraf—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn meddwl eich bod eisoes wedi gofyn cwestiwn.

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn cwrdd ag amrywiaeth o sefydliadau i drafod ystod o faterion, ac mae llawer ohonynt yn cyffwrdd â lladd-dai bach a'u pryderon am awgrymiadau am dâl adennill costau llawn. Unwaith eto, os yw'r Aelod yn dymuno ysgrifennu ataf gydag unrhyw bryderon penodol, byddaf yn sicrhau bod y rheini yn derbyn sylw ac ateb.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Gan symud ymlaen at ateb ysgrifenedig a roesoch i mi ar 14 Medi eleni mewn ymateb i gwestiwn yn gofyn am ragor o wybodaeth am y panel adolygu arbenigol ar dwbercwlosis buchol, dywedasoch y byddai'r cyfarfod diweddaraf ar 28 Hydref, a oedd yr wythnos diwethaf. A ydych bellach yn gallu rhoi arwydd pendant i ni am ba bryd y caiff yr adroddiad ei roi i chi? Datganasoch y byddai'r grŵp yn adrodd yn yr hydref. A oes gennych bellach syniad o'r amserlen?

**John Griffiths:** Mae'n ymarfer annibynnol, fel yr wyf wedi ei wneud yn glir i Aelodau ar nifer o achlysuron. Yr ydym yn nwylo'r panel adolygu. Trefnwyd, yr wyf yn credu, y byddai ei gyfarfod diweddaraf yn cael ei gynnal ar ddiwedd yr wythnos nesaf. Gobeithiaf gael adroddiad terfynol o fewn ychydig wythnosau wedi'r cyfarfod terfynol hwnnw.

**Rebecca Evans:** Cymru oedd y wlad gyntaf ym Mhrydain i gynhyrchu codau ymarfer ar gyfer anifeiliaid anwes o dan Ddeddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006. Pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud o effaith y codau ymarfer hynny ar gynyddu lles

animal welfare in Wales?

**John Griffiths:** We have been very pleased to work with a number of organisations that are active in Wales on the animal welfare front regarding what they believe has happened, and from their experience on the ground, in terms of improvement. I met with the Dogs Trust this morning and we discussed a range of relevant issues. We are interested to hear from the organisations on the ground about their experiences and to work with them towards further progress.

#### Iechyd Anifeiliaid

**4. Andrew R.T. Davies:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa gynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud i hybu iechyd anifeiliaid yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0051(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank the Member for South Wales Central for that question. Under the umbrella of the Great Britain animal health and welfare strategy, we will strive to work on the promotion of animal health in Wales and continue to work with the animal health and welfare strategy steering group, which is progressing work on its industry-led disease priorities in the beef, dairy and sheep sectors.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Minister, thank you for that answer. One thing that is of critical importance when considering animal health is the need to understand the measures that could be put in place in the food chain to prevent the spread of E. coli. The Welsh Government is funding an improved food safety initiative, through the Institute of Biological, Environmental and Rural Sciences, in the poultry sector in particular, to bring forward additives that could be added to animal food to prevent the spread of E. coli through the food chain. What actions are your department undertaking to promote this initiative, after the successful launch in the Royal Welsh Show this year?

**John Griffiths:** I regularly meet with our chief veterinary officer, Christianne Glossop, to discuss a range of animal health issues. I will ask her to ensure that the Member gets a detailed response to that question.

anifeiliaid yng Nghymru?

**John Griffiths:** Yr ydym wedi bod yn falch iawn o weithio gyda nifer o sefydliadau sy'n weithgar yng Nghymru ar les anifeiliaid o ran yr hyn y maent yn credu sydd wedi digwydd, ac ar sail eu profiad ar lawr gwlad, o ran gwella. Cyfarfûm â'r Dogs Trust y bore yma, a chawsom drafodaeth ar ystod o faterion perthnasol. Mae gennym ddi-ddordeb mewn clywed gan y sefydliadau ar lawr gwlad am eu profiadau a gweithio gyda hwy tuag at gynnydd pellach.

#### Animal Health

**4. Andrew R.T. Davies:** *Will the Minister outline what progress is being made in the promotion of animal health in Wales. OAQ(4)0051(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganol De Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. O dan ymbarél strategaeth iechyd a lles anifeiliaid Prydain Fawr, byddwn yn ymdrechu i weithio ar hybu iechyd anifeiliaid yng Nghymru ac yn parhau i weithio gyda grŵp llywio'r strategaeth iechyd a lles anifeiliaid, sydd yn bwrw ymlaen â gwaith ar ei flaenoriaethau ar glefyd dan arweiniad diwydiant yn sectorau cig eidion, llaeth a defaid.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Weinidog, diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. Un peth sydd yn hanfodol bwysig wrth ystyried iechyd anifeiliaid yw'r angen i ddeall y mesurau y gellid eu rhoi ar waith yn y gadwyn fwyd er mwyn atal lledaeniad E. coli. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ariannu menter diogelwch bwyd gwell, drwy Sefydliad y Gwyddorau Biolegol, Amgylcheddol a Gwledig, yn y sector dofednod yn arbennig, i gyflwyno ychwanegion y gellid eu hychwanegu at fwyd anifeiliaid i atal lledaeniad E. coli drwy'r gadwyn fwyd. Pa gamau mae eich adran yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo'r fenter hon, ar ôl ei lansiad llwyddiannus yn Sioe Frenhinol Cymru eleni?

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'n prif swyddog milfeddygol, Christianne Glossop, i drafod ystod o faterion iechyd anifeiliaid. Byddaf yn gofyn iddi sicrhau bod yr Aelod yn cael ymateb manwl



i'r cwestiwn hwnnw.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'n fawr ein bod ni wedi cael awgrym o'r diwedd am amserlen adrodd y panel a gafodd ei sefydlu i edrych ar ddciaû mewn gwartheg. Yr ydych wedi sôn bod cyfarfod yr wythnos nesaf a'ch bod yn gobeithio gwneud penderfyniad ymhen ychydig wythnosau wedyn. A wnewch chi ymrwymo i roi datganiad i ni yma erbyn diwedd y mis hwn?

**John Griffiths:** The timeframe has not changed from what I set out in my initial statement in Plenary. We hoped that the review panel would produce a report in the autumn. That has not changed. I am committed to moving on with this process, and the ultimate decision, in a timely manner. The last meeting is due to take place at the end of next week, and the report hopefully will be prepared and ready a few weeks after that. It will then be a matter for consideration and decision making. I will come back to Plenary so that there is ample opportunity for Members to make their views known and to get answers to any questions that they might have.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Byddwch yn gwybod bod tua 700 o wartheg yn cael eu difa pob mis, felly mae pob wythnos sy'n cael ei cholli yn wythnos yn ormod. Er tryloywder, a allwch chi sicrhau y bydd yr adroddiad a'r argymhellion yn cael eu cyhoeddi'n llawn, ac yn ystyried cyhoeddi unrhyw gofnodion a phapurau sy'n deillio o'r trafodaethau?

**John Griffiths:** As I have made clear to Members on a number of occasions, this is very much an independent exercise that is overseen by our chief scientific officer. We want it to be as open and accessible as possible, and I am sure that normal process will be followed.

1.45 p.m.

**William Powell:** Will the Minister please outline his intentions with regard to tendering arrangements for bovine TB testing in Wales in the light of the current Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** I very much welcome the fact that we have at last heard a suggestion as to the reporting timetable for the panel established to look to bovine TB. You referred to a meeting next week and said that you hope to make a decision within a few weeks. Will you commit to bringing a statement to us here by the end of this month?

**John Griffiths:** Nid yw'r amserlen wedi newid o'r hyn a nodais yn fy natganiad cychwynnol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Yr oeddem yn gobeithio y byddai'r panel adolygu yn llunio adroddiad yn yr hydref. Nid yw hynny wedi newid. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i symud ymlaen â'r broses hon, a'r penderfyniad yn y pen draw, yn amserol. Mae'r cyfarfod diwethaf i fod i ddigwydd ar ddiwedd yr wythnos nesaf, a bydd yr adroddiad, gobeithio, yn barod ychydig wythnosau ar ôl hynny. Yna, bydd yn fater i'w ystyried a gwneud penderfyniadau yn ei gylch. Byddaf yn dod yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn fel bod digon o gyfle i Aelodau wneud eu barn yn hysbys ac i gael atebion i unrhyw gwestiynau a all fod ganddynt.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** You will be aware that almost 700 cattle are culled every month, so every week that passes is one week too many. For the sake of transparency, will you ensure that the report and recommendations are published in full, and will you consider publishing any minutes and papers emerging from the discussions?

**John Griffiths:** Fel yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir i Aelodau ar sawl achlysur, mae hyn i raddau helaeth yn ymarfer annibynnol sy'n cael ei oruchwylio gan ein prif swyddog gwyddonol. Yr ydym am iddo fod mor agored a hygyrch â phosibl, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff y broses arferol ei dilyn.

**William Powell:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei fwriadau o ran tendro trefniadau ar gyfer profion TB gwartheg yng Nghymru yng ngoleuni ymgynghoriad cyfoes Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig ar y

consultation on that topic?

pwnc?

**John Griffiths:** We have our own comprehensive TB eradication strategy in place in Wales, and we have made clear what the process is in terms of the review and, indeed, the intensive action area. There is an ongoing exercise to evaluate the UK-wide and GB-wide position, which we are very much party to, and, indeed, the European Union also has a role.

**John Griffiths:** Mae gennym ein strategaeth dileu TB cynhwysfawr ein hun yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi gwneud yn glir beth yw'r broses o ran yr adolygiad ac, yn wir, yr ardal triniaeth ddwys. Mae ymarfer parhaus i werthuso'r sefyllfa ledled y DU a ledled Prydain Fawr, yr ydym yn gyfrannog dros ben iddo, ac, yn wir, mae gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd rôl hefyd.

**William Powell:** I am grateful for that answer, Minister, but I have been contacted by farmers, particularly in the Mid and West Wales area, and veterinary practices, some of which straddle Offa's Dyke and operate on both sides of the border. They are currently involved in consultation on the DEFRA matter regarding bovine testing, and my understanding is that the intention is to create larger consortia to carry out testing across a wider area. That is a matter of concern to farmers because it adds to the trauma and difficulty of the whole testing regime when you are dealing with people who may be from well beyond your area. It is also a matter of concern for veterinary practices in the forward planning of their work programmes because testing is a significant part of their overall workload in the current climate. There is a need for transparency and forward planning in that respect.

**William Powell:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog, ond mae ffermwyr wedi cysylltu â mi, yn enwedig yn ardal Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, a milfeddygfeydd, y mae rhai ohonynt yn pontio Clawdd Offa ac yn gweithredu ar ddwy ochr y ffin. Ar hyn o bryd maent yn cymryd rhan mewn ymgynghoriad ar fater DEFRA ynghylch profi gwartheg, a deallaf mai'r bwriad yw creu consortia mwy o faint i gynnal profion ar draws ardal ehangach. Mae hynny'n achosi pryder ymhlith ffermwyr am ei fod yn ychwanegu at drawma ac anhawster y gyfundrefn brofi gyfan pan ydych yn delio â phobl a allai fod o ymhell y tu hwnt i'ch ardal chi. Mae hefyd yn achosi pryder i filfeddygfeydd wrth flaengynllunio eu rhaglenni gwaith oherwydd mae profi yn rhan sylweddol o'u llwyth gwaith cyffredinol yn yr hinsawdd bresennol. Mae angen tryloywder a blaengynllunio yn hynny o beth.

**John Griffiths:** We have our own bovine TB testing regime in place here in Wales, as I am sure Members are well aware. We have our own distinct approach, which fits in with our particular strategy. What I can say to the Member is that, even in the light of that, if you have any particular concerns as to how our interaction with UK Government policy is playing out at the current time, I would be very agreeable to responding to those particular concerns, were you to write to me.

**John Griffiths:** Mae gennym ein trefn brofi TB gwartheg ein hunain yma yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau yn ymwybodol iawn o hynny. Mae gennym ein dull arbennig ein hun, sy'n cyd-fynd â'n strategaeth benodol. Yr hyn y gallaf ei ddweud wrth yr Aelod yw, hyd yn oed yng ngoleuni hynny, os oes gennych unrhyw bryderon penodol ynghylch sut y mae ein rhyngweithio â pholisi Llywodraeth y DU yn gweithio ar hyn o bryd, byddwn yn fodlon iawn i ymateb i'r pryderon penodol hynny, pe ysgrifennech ataf.

### Profi ar Anifeiliaid

### Animal Testing

**5. Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** *A wnaiiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynglŷn â phrofi ar anifeiliaid yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0043(ESD)*

**5. Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** *Will the Minister make a statement regarding animal testing in Wales. OAQ(4)0043(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Mae profi ar anifeiliaid yn

**John Griffiths:** Animal testing in Wales

parhau i fod yn rhan annatod o'r broses yng Nghymru o atal a rheoli clefydau. Mae'r dull gweithredu cynhwysfawr a ddefnyddir i fynd i'r afael â TB gwartheg yng Nghymru yn cynnwys profi yn flynyddol a phrofi buchesi cyn eu symud.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi gofyn cwestiynau i chi, ac i'r Gweinidog datblygu economaidd, ynglŷn â'r rhesymoli sy'n digwydd o ran y gwasanaethau labordai profi yng Nghymru. Ar 28 Medi, dywedoch mewn ymateb i'm cwestiwn eich bod yn mynd i barhau i bwysio ar Lywodraeth San Steffan. Mewn ymateb i lythyr ar 5 Hydref, dywedoch wrthyf nad oeddech wedi derbyn unrhyw ymgynghoriad gan Lywodraeth San Steffan ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, ac, eto i gyd, ar 13 Hydref yn San Steffan, dywedodd Jim Paice, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Amaeth a Bwyd, bod eich prif swyddog milfeddygol wedi bod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau ynglŷn â'r rhesymoli sy'n digwydd ynglŷn â gwasanaethau labordai. A allwch egluro'r anghysondeb hwn yn yr atebion yr wyf wedi'u derbyn?

**John Griffiths:** What I can tell the Member is that I am, of course, concerned to ensure that services and provision in Wales around the animal health and veterinary laboratory agency work are everything that the Welsh Government, the agricultural industry and others would expect and require in Wales. So, obviously, we are very concerned to protect the interests of Wales. Recently, I met Caroline Spelman and Jim Paice in Westminster and made my concerns clear, including those around the process and the need for any changes that would affect Wales and service delivery in Wales to be dealt with at a ministerial level.

**Russell George:** There are some real concerns among the farming sector in Powys regarding the bureaucratic way in which bovine TB surveillance testing procedures are being carried out. I went to three cattle farms a few weeks ago and looked at the process. There is a real issue with the administrative procedure to record the tag numbers. The concern is not the veterinary aspect but rather the administrative aspect of logging the numbers and the time taken to do that. We

continues to play a central role in disease prevention and control. Our comprehensive approach to tackling bovine TB in Wales includes annual testing and pre-movement testing of cattle herds.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You will be aware that I have asked questions of you and the Minister for economic development about the rationalisation of animal testing laboratories in Wales. On 28 September, you said in reply to my question that you would continue to press the Westminster Government. In response to a letter on 5 October, you told me that you had not received any consultation from the Westminster Government on this matter, but in Westminster on 13 October, Jim Paice, the Minister of State for Agriculture and Food, said that your chief veterinary officer had been part of the discussions about the rationalisation of the laboratory service. Can you explain the inconsistency in the responses that I have received?

**John Griffiths:** Yr hyn y gallaf ei ddweud wrth yr Aelod yw fy mod, wrth gwrs, yn awyddus i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau a'r ddarpariaeth yng Nghymru o ran gwaith yr asiantaeth iechyd anifeiliaid a labordy milfeddygol yn bopeth y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru, y diwydiant amaethyddol ac eraill yn ei ddisgwyl a'i angen yng Nghymru. Felly, yn amlwg, yr ydym yn bryderus iawn i warchod buddiannau Cymru. Yn ddiweddar, cyfarfûm â Caroline Spelman a Jim Paice yn San Steffan gan wneud fy mhryderon yn glir, gan gynnwys y rhai am y broses a'r angen i drin unrhyw newidiadau a fyddai'n effeithio ar Gymru a darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru ar lefel weinidogol.

**Russell George:** Mae rhai pryderon gwirioneddol ymhlith y sector ffermio ym Mhowys ynghylch y modd biwrocraidaidd y mae gweithdrefnau profi gwyliadwriaeth TB gwartheg yn cael eu cynnal. Ymwelais â thair fferm wartheg ychydig wythnosau yn ôl ac edrych ar y broses. Mae problem wirioneddol â'r weithdrefn weinyddol i gofnodi rhifau tag. Nid yw'r pryder am yr agwedd filfeddygol ond yn hytrach yr agwedd weinyddol o logio'r niferoedd a'r amser a

have to ensure that health testing standards are maintained to the highest levels, but does the Minister believe that there is scope to simplify this procedure—I am specifically thinking of better use of IT or handheld devices—and therefore to reduce the time taken and the financial impact on the farmer. If the Minister cannot answer in full now, I would appreciate his giving that some serious consideration.

**John Griffiths:** What I can tell Russell George is that we are always open to ideas for easing the administrative burden on the farming industry in Wales. As the Member rightly said, it is about a balance. The animal health and disease eradication effort comes uppermost, but if there are any ways of ensuring that farmers face less onerous requirements in meeting the necessary standards, we are open to dialogue and discussion about them.

#### Adnoddau Ynni Adnewyddadwy

**6. Julie James:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu cynlluniau ei adran i hybu datblygu adnoddau ynni adnewyddadwy gwynt ar y môr ac adnoddau morol eraill. OAQ(4)0040(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank the Member for Swansea West for that question. Offshore energy has the potential to contribute significantly to our renewable energy targets, while providing large economic benefits. My department recently completed a £1 million marine energy project to aid policy development, while providing developers with key data to inform projects.

**Julie James:** As an advocate of green energy, I would like to draw your attention to the potential of Swansea bay, which is well placed to exploit both tidal and offshore wind energy. Minister, will you consider establishing a dialogue with the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science and other key stakeholders to promote the virtues of Swansea bay and its port as a base for technical support, maintenance and manufacturing services that

gymerir i wneud hynny. Mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau bod safonau profi iechyd yn cael eu cynnal i'r lefelau uchaf, ond a yw'r Gweinidog yn credu bod lle i symleiddio'r weithdrefn hon—yr wyf yn meddwl yn benodol am ddefnydd gwell o TG neu ddyfeisiau llaw—ac felly leihau'r amser a gymerir a'r effaith ariannol ar y ffermwr? Os na all y Gweinidog ateb yn llawn yn awr, byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi pe bai'n rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'r mater.

**John Griffiths:** Yr hyn y gallaf ei ddweud wrth Russell George yw ein bod bob amser yn agored i syniadau ar gyfer lleihau'r baich gweinyddol ar y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd yr Aelod yn gywir, mae'n ymwneud â chydbwysedd. Yr ymdrech iechyd anifeiliaid a chael gwared ar glefydau sydd yn dod yn uchaf, ond os oes unrhyw ffyrdd o sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn wynebu gofynion llai beichus o ran bodloni'r safonau angenrheidiol, yr ydym yn agored i ddeialog a thrafodaeth yn eu cylch.

#### Renewable Energy Resources

**6. Julie James:** *Will the Minister outline his department's plans to encourage the development of offshore wind and other marine based renewable energy resources. OAQ(4)0040(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Orllewin Abertawe am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae gan ynni ar y môr y potensial i gyfrannu'n sylweddol at ein targedau ynni adnewyddadwy, tra'n darparu manteision economaidd mawr. Yn ddiweddar, cwblhaodd fy adran brosiect ynni morol gwerth £1 miliwn i gynorthwyo datblygiad polisi, tra'n darparu data allweddol i lywio prosiectau i ddatblygwyr.

**Julie James:** Fel rhywun sy'n hyrwyddo ynni gwyrdd, hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at botensial bae Abertawe, sydd mewn sefyllfa dda i fanteisio ar ynni gwynt ar y môr a llanw. Weinidog, a wnewch chi ystyried sefydlu deialog gyda'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth a rhanddeiliaid allweddol eraill i hyrwyddo rhinweddau bae Abertawe a'i phorthladd fel canolfan ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cymorth technegol, cynnal a chadw a

such green energy infrastructure would need? I would like to see Swansea at the forefront of the south Wales green jobs economy for the future.

**John Griffiths:** I very much agree that Wales has extensive port facilities and a strong manufacturing base and energy tradition and that, therefore, it is well placed to play a part in renewable energy development in the UK to meet our own obligations and our wider international obligations. There is significant potential there that we must work towards realising. I know that there are interesting suggestions for a lagoon in Swansea bay—there is a project in the initial scoping phase at the moment—and that the Atlantic Array, for example, offers opportunities to a number of Welsh ports, including Swansea. I am keen to work with colleagues, including Edwina Hart as the Minister for business, and we are already doing that. Meetings are taking place between us and officials. In fact, we have jointly taken forward an exercise to look at the marine industry infrastructure in Wales, which will be important for the future.

**Angela Burns:** Minister, you just mentioned the Atlantic Array and the work that you are doing to look at the marine industry infrastructure, which I welcome. As offshore wind technology expands, the pressure on Government officials will increase. What planning are you undertaking to ensure that the marine unit that is under your control is adequately resourced and has the necessary expertise and skills in what is a new technology and to beef it up so that it has the same functions as the Marine Management Organisation in England?

**John Griffiths:** We always look at our staffing arrangements to ensure that we have sufficient capacity and resource to meet Welsh Government priorities. Energy and renewable energy are high-profile in terms of those priorities.

**Peter Black:** You mentioned the possible lagoon project in Swansea bay, and this is the second time that that project has reared its

gweithgynhyrchu y byddai seilwaith ynni gwyrdd o'r fath ei angen? Hoffwn weld Abertawe ar flaen y gad o ran economi swyddi gwyrdd de Cymru ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**John Griffiths:** Cytunaf yn llwyr fod gan Gymru gyfleusterau porthladd helaeth a sylfaen gweithgynhyrchu a thraddodiad ynni cryf ac, felly, mae mewn sefyllfa dda i chwarae rhan mewn datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy yn y DU i fodloni ein hymrwymiaid ein hunain a'n rhwymedigaethau rhyngwladol ehangach. Mae cryn botensial yno sydd yn rhaid i ni weithio tuag at ei wireddu. Gwn fod yna awgrymiadau diddorol ar gyfer morlyn ym mae Abertawe—mae prosiect yn y cam cwmpasu cychwynnol ar hyn o bryd—a bod yr Atlantic Array, er enghraifft, yn cynnig cyfleoedd i nifer o borthladdoedd Cymru, gan gynnwys Abertawe. Yr wyf yn awyddus i weithio gyda chydweithwyr, gan gynnwys Edwina Hart fel y Gweinidog dros fusnes, ac yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud hynny. Mae cyfarfodydd yn cael eu cynnal rhyngom ni a swyddogion. Yn wir, yr ydym wedi bwrw ymlaen gydag ymarfer ar y cyd i edrych ar seilwaith y diwydiant morol yng Nghymru, a fydd yn bwysig ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Angela Burns:** Weinidog, yr ydych newydd sôn am yr Atlantic Array a'r gwaith yr ydych yn ei wneud i edrych ar seilwaith y diwydiant morol, a chroesawaf hynny. Wrth i dechnoleg gwynt ar y môr ehangu, cynyddu a wna'r pwysau ar swyddogion y Llywodraeth. Pa gynllunio yr ydych yn ymgymryd ag ef i sicrhau bod gan yr uned forol sydd o dan eich rheolaeth adnoddau digonol a'r arbenigedd a'r sgiliau angenrheidiol yn yr hyn sydd yn dechnoleg newydd ac i'w nerthu fel bod ganddi'r un swyddogaethau â'r Sefydliad Rheoli Morol yn Lloegr?

**John Griffiths:** Yr ydym bob amser yn edrych ar ein trefniadau staffio er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym ddigon o allu ac adnoddau i gyflawni blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae proffil uchel gan ynni ac ynni adnewyddadwy o ran y blaenoriaethau hynny.

**Peter Black:** Soniasoch am y prosiect morlyn posibl ym mae Abertawe, a dyma'r ail dro mae'r prosiect wedi codi ei ben.

head. Your predecessor suggested that she might support a pilot project for lagoons in Wales, but nothing seems to have come of that. What dialogue is taking place between your department and possible developers of tidal lagoons regarding setting up a pilot project? What sort of timescale would we be looking at?

**John Griffiths:** There is a lot of work going on to assist the marine industry with regard to the development that it might take forward in Wales. I mentioned the work on marine industry infrastructure, for example. We have also undertaken an exercise, with £1 million in funding from the Welsh Government, to provide data that will help developers understand the opportunities for marine energy in Wales—where devices are best placed, for example. There is a whole raft of work going on and of organisations that are assisting. We are always open to dialogue with developers, and a range of help is in place.

#### Allyriadau Carbon Deuocsid

**7. Simon Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau'r Llywodraeth i ostwng allyriadau carbon deuocsid. OAQ(4)0039(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Mae strategaeth Cymru ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn nodi polisi Llywodraeth Cymru i ryddhau 3 y cant yn llai o allyriadau carbon deuocsid bob blwyddyn.

**Simon Thomas:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb ac am gadarnhau bod y Llywodraeth bresennol yn parhau â pholisi'r Llywodraeth flaenorol o ostyngiad o 3 y cant bob blwyddyn. I fynd yn ôl at ynni'r môr, awgrymaf i'r Gweinidog fod y polisi presennol yn boddi wrth ymyl y lan. Mae gan y Llywodraeth darged o 4 GW o ynni'r môr erbyn 2016, ac un cais, ar gyfer prosiect arbrofol 1.2 MW yn sir Benfro, sydd wedi'i gael hyd yn hyn. Pa gamau go iawn y byddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod cymaint â hynny o ynni yn dod o'r môr yn ystod y ddegawd nesaf, oherwydd dyna beth fydd yn sicrhau bod Cymru yn gweld gostyngiad yn ei hallyriadau carbon ac yn elwa'n economaidd?

Awgrymodd eich rhagflaenydd y gallai hi gefnogi prosiect peilot ar gyfer morlynnoedd yng Nghymru, ond ymddengys fod dim wedi dod o hynny. Pa ddeialog sydd yn cael ei gynnal rhwng eich adran chi a datblygwyr posibl o forlynnoedd llanw ynglŷn â sefydlu prosiect peilot? Pa fath o amserlen fyddai'n debygol?

**John Griffiths:** Mae llawer o waith yn mynd ymlaen i gynorthwyo'r diwydiant morol o ran y datblygiad y gallai ei symud ymlaen yng Nghymru. Soniais am y gwaith ar seilwaith y diwydiant morol, er enghraifft. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cynnal ymarfer, gyda gwerth £1 miliwn o gyllid gan Lywodraeth Cymru, er mwyn darparu data a fydd yn helpu datblygwyr i ddeall y cyfleoedd ar gyfer ynni morol yng Nghymru—lle sydd orau i osod dyfeisiau, er enghraifft. Mae lluo o waith yn mynd ymlaen a lluo o sefydliadau sy'n cynorthwyo. Yr ydym bob amser yn agored i ddeialog gyda datblygwyr, ac mae ystod o gymorth ar gael.

#### Carbon Dioxide Emissions

**7. Simon Thomas:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the Government's plans to reduce carbon dioxide emissions. OAQ(4)0039(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** The climate change strategy for Wales sets out Welsh Government policy to reduce carbon dioxide emissions by 3 per cent per year.

**Simon Thomas:** I thank the Minister for that response and for confirming that the current Government is continuing with the previous Government's policy of a 3 per cent reduction per annum. To go back to marine energy, I suggest to the Minister that the current policy is drowning in the shallows. The Government has a target of 4 GW from offshore energy by 2016, and there has been just one application, for a 1.2 MW experimental project in Pembrokeshire, so far. What genuine steps will you take to ensure that that much energy is generated from the sea over the next decade, because that is what will ensure that Wales reduces its carbon dioxide emissions and benefits economically?

**John Griffiths:** I agree with Members that marine energy offers great potential for us to take forward our renewable energy priorities in Wales. I have mentioned some work that has already taken place with regard to Welsh Government funding and policy. We have a marine strategy framework, which is important, we have done work to identify the potential for developers to exploit and we have done work on the marine infrastructure. That DeltaStream project off the Pembrokeshire coast has £7 million of Welsh Government money committed to it. I understand the Members' impatience to see marine energy developing apace in Wales, but we all know that wind power was commercially ready to go well in advance of marine energy. We all want to see marine energy catch up and we have put in place a strategy and funding to help produce that improvement.

**The Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that this question is about reducing carbon dioxide emissions.

**Nick Ramsay:** A significant amount of carbon dioxide emissions in Wales is produced by motor vehicles. Given that there is great potential to reduce substantially the amount of carbon dioxide emissions produced in Wales through encouraging the use of electric vehicles, how many public electric car charging points are there in Wales? Have you had any discussions with the Minister for Local Government and Communities, who has responsibility for transport, as to ways in which that number could be increased and thereby the number of electric vehicles used in Wales increased?

**John Griffiths:** I have regular conversations with ministerial colleagues, including the Minister with responsibility for transport, on a range of transport issues. I will write to the Member with details of the current infrastructure that supports electric car use in Wales. I agree that transport is key to a reduction in carbon dioxide emissions, and we have a range of policies in place, such as eco-driving and investment in the public transport network. I hope that we will see further important developments on the public transport front in the near future.

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn cytuno ag Aelodau bod ynni'r môr yn cynnig potensial gwych i ni ddatblygu ein blaenoriaethau ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi sôn am beth gwaith sydd eisoes wedi digwydd mewn perthynas â chyllid a pholisi Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae gennym fframwaith strategaeth forol, sy'n bwysig, yr ydym wedi gwneud gwaith i nodi'r potensial y gall datblygwyr fanteisio arno ac yr ydym wedi gwneud gwaith ar yr isadeiledd morol. Mae £7 miliwn o arian Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei ymrwymo i'r prosiect DeltaStream oddi ar arfordir sir Benfro. Yr wyf yn deall diffyg amynedd Aelodau i weld ynni'r môr yn datblygu'n gyflym yng Nghymru, ond yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod bod ynni gwynt yn barod i fynd yn fasnachol ymhell cyn ynni morol. Yr ydym i gyd am weld ynni'r môr yn dal i fyny ac yr ydym wedi rhoi strategaeth a chyllid ar waith i helpu cynhyrchu'r gwelliant hwnnw.

**Y Llywydd:** Atgoffaf yr Aelodau fod y cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â lleihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid.

**Nick Ramsay:** Mae swm sylweddol o allyriadau carbon deuocsid yng Nghymru yn cael ei gynhyrchu gan gerbydau modur. Gan fod potensial mawr i leihau faint o allyriadau carbon deuocsid a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru yn sylweddol drwy annog defnydd cerbydau trydan, sawl pwynt gwefrio cyhoeddus ar gyfer ceir trydan sydd yna yng Nghymru? A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, sydd â chyfrifoldeb am drafndiaeth, ynghylch ffyrdd o gynyddu'r rhif hwnnw ac felly gynyddu nifer y cerbydau trydan a ddefnyddir yng Nghymru?

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn cael sgorsiau rheolaidd gyda chyd-Weinidogion, gan gynnwys y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros drafndiaeth, ar ystod o faterion trafndiaeth. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gyda manylion y seilwaith presennol sy'n cefnogi defnydd ceir trydan yng Nghymru. Cytunaf fod trafndiaeth yn allweddol i ostwng allyriadau carbon deuocsid, ac mae gennym ystod o bolisiau ar waith, megis eco-yrru a buddsoddi yn y rhwydwaith trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Gobeithiaf y gwelwn ddatblygiadau pwysig pellach o ran

trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn y dyfodol agos.

2.00 p.m.

### **Ariannu Amddiffyn yr Arfordir**

**8. Janet Finch-Saunders:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ariannu amddiffyn yr arfordir yng Ngogledd Cymru. OAQ(4)0045(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank Janet Finch-Saunders for that question. In the last five years, the Welsh Government has provided over £2 million for coastal defence projects in north Wales. With additional support from the European regional development fund, we are investing a further £7.9 million in an ongoing programme of schemes.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Some areas of my constituency are now beginning to suffer from coastal erosion that is threatening to undermine several properties. My follow-up question was going to be on how much investment you are making. I will therefore just request that that funding comes through sooner rather than later, because we currently have a case that, I am told, might not even make it through to the application process. This is a very serious issue in my constituency.

**John Griffiths:** We have a five-year programme of flood-risk and coastal-risk management work, supported by almost £50 million from the European regional development fund. With match funding, our total investment in the programme will be in excess of £100 million. Of that, £18 million is being invested in coastal and estuarine works in north Wales. As I said earlier, the budget for work is fully committed for the current financial year, but, beyond that, bids will be assessed in accordance with the relevant criteria.

### **Adnoddau Ynni Naturiol**

**9. Leanne Wood:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fanteisio ar adnoddau ynni naturiol Cymru. OAQ(4)0054(ESD)*

### **Coastal Defence Funding**

**8. Janet Finch-Saunders:** *Will the Minister make a statement on coastal defence funding in North Wales. OAQ(4)0045(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolchaf i Janet Finch-Saunders am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi darparu dros £2 miliwn ar gyfer prosiectau amddiffyn yr arfordir yng ngogledd Cymru. Gyda chymorth ychwanegol gan y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd, yr ydym yn buddsoddi £7.9 miliwn pellach mewn rhaglen barhaus o gynlluniau.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Mae rhai ardaloedd yn fy etholaeth yn awr yn dechrau dioddef o erydu arfordirol sydd yn bygwth tanseilio nifer o eiddo. Yr oedd fy nghwestiwn dilynol yn mynd i fod ar faint o fuddsoddiad yr ydych yn ei wneud. Felly, byddaf ond yn gofyn bod y cyllid yn ymddangos yn gynt yn hytrach nag yn hwyrach, oherwydd ar hyn o bryd mae gennym achos, caf ar ddeall, na fydd hyd yn oed yn cyrraedd y broses ymgeisio. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol iawn yn fy etholaeth i.

**John Griffiths:** Mae gennym raglen pum mlynedd o waith rheoli perygl llifogydd ac erydu arfordirol, a gefnogwyd gan bron £50 miliwn o Gronfa Datblygu Rhanbarthol Ewrop. Gydag arian cyfatebol, bydd cyfanswm ein buddsoddiad yn y rhaglen yn fwy na £100 miliwn. O hynny, mae £18 miliwn yn cael ei fuddsoddi mewn gwaith aberol ac arfordirol yn y gogledd. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae'r gyllideb ar gyfer gwaith yn gwbl ymrwymedig ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol, ond, y tu hwnt i hynny, bydd ceisiadau yn cael eu hasesu yn unol â meini prawf perthnasol.

### **Natural Energy Resources**

**9. Leanne Wood:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the exploitation of Wales's natural energy resources. OAQ(4)0054(ESD)*



**John Griffiths:** I thank the Member for South Wales Central for that question. The safe, clean and environmentally responsible development of Wales's natural energy resources is key to future prosperity and wellbeing. As a Government, we want to ensure that the potential within the energy sector will deliver real benefits to the people and communities of Wales.

**Leanne Wood:** I welcome your use of the word 'safe' because there has been a lot of concern about proposals to test for the viability of hydraulic fracturing in the Vale of Glamorgan in recent months. As you will be aware, this is commonly known as fracking, and there are many unanswered questions about its side effects and the impact on the local environment. In a report that went before the Vale of Glamorgan Council last month, for example, Dŵr Cymru raised concerns that proposals could lead to the contamination of ground water, and said that any future applications should be accompanied by an environmental statement covering such matters.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Can you come to your question?

**Leanne Wood:** Dŵr Cymru sources around 5 per cent of its supplies from ground water, and elsewhere there have been concerns about earth tremors. Will you agree to make representations to your counterparts in Westminster to call for a moratorium on onshore and offshore exploration, development and production of shale gas until these questions over safety and potential environmental damage are resolved?

**John Griffiths:** As I have stated in the Chamber on many occasions, I am not able to comment on the merits or otherwise of any particular planning application or development. In general, in terms of shale gas, I am on record as stating the Welsh Government's position, which is that we understand the concerns that were expressed about exploration and the tapping of reserves. Our position is to communicate those concerns to the UK Government and be part of the development of the UK response. We

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganol De Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r datblygiad diogel, glân ac amgylcheddol gyfrifol o adnoddau ynni naturiol Cymru yn allweddol i ffyniant a lles yn y dyfodol. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym am sicrhau y bydd y potensial o fewn y sector ynni yn sicrhau manteision gwirioneddol i bobl a chymunedau Cymru.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr wyf yn croesawu eich defnydd o'r gair 'diogel' gan y bu llawer o bryder am gynigion i brofi ar gyfer hyfywedd hollti hydrologig ym Mro Morgannwg yn y misoedd diwethaf. Fel y byddwch yn ymwybodol, mae hyn yn cael ei adnabod yn gyffredin fel ffracio, ac mae llawer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb ynghylch ei sgîl-ffeithiau a'r effaith ar yr amgylchedd lleol. Mewn adroddiad a oedd yn mynd gerbron Cyngor Bro Morgannwg y mis diwethaf, er enghraifft, cododd Dŵr Cymru bryderon y gallai cynigion arwain at halogi dŵr daear, a dywedodd y dylai unrhyw geisiadau yn y dyfodol cael eu hatodi gan ddatganiad amgylcheddol sy'n cwmpasu materion o'r fath.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A alwch chi ddod at eich cwestiwn?

**Leanne Wood:** Mae Dŵr Cymru yn tynnu tua 5 y cant o'i chyflenwadau o ddŵr daear, ac mewn mannau eraill bu pryderon ynghylch cryndod yn y ddaear. A gytunwch i gyflwyno sylwadau i'ch cymheiriaid yn San Steffan i alw am foratoriwm ar archwilio ar y tir a môr ac ar ddatblygu a chynhyrchu nwy siâl hyd nes y bydd y cwestiynau hyn ar ddiogelwch a difrod amgylcheddol posibl yn cael eu datrys?

**John Griffiths:** Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddatgan yn y Siambr ar sawl achlysur, ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar rinweddau, neu beidio, unrhyw gais neu ddatblygiad cynllunio penodol. Yn gyffredinol, o ran nwy siâl, yr wyf wedi datgan safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru ar goedd, sef ein bod yn deall y pryderon a fynegwyd ynghylch archwilio a thapio cronfeydd. Ein safbwynt yw cyfleu'r pryderon hynny i Lywodraeth y DU a bod yn rhan o'r gwaith o ddatblygu ymateb y DU. Mae gennym ein hymagwedd cynllunio

have our own precautionary planning approach, which is set out in our planning policy, and indeed in the technical advice note on mineral policy.

**William Graham:** Minister, you will be aware of a recent independent survey on this subject, published by Cuadrilla Resources, which indicated that it was highly probable that hydraulic fracking was the cause of seismic damage on the Fylde coast in Lancashire. Would you undertake to adequately correspond with and make your influence felt at the Department of Energy and Climate Change, and also to engage with partners such as the British Geological Survey, the Health and Safety Executive and the Environment Agency, before any resumption of fracking is possible?

**John Griffiths:** Again, in general in terms of shale gas, I can say that my officials have been in touch with the UK Government, and part of that dialogue has concerned the report that the Member mentions and the situation around Blackpool in England. Officials are in constant contact with UK officials on these matters.

**Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas:** Weinidog, pa drafodaethau a fu gyda Gweinidog Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd y Deyrnas Unedig cyn y datganiad y gorfodwyd y Gweinidog i'w wneud yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ddydd Llun, ac yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi diolch i ymyrraeth y Llefarydd, ynglŷn â newid mewn lefelau tariffau bwydo i mewn? Beth fydd effeithiau'r newidiadau hyn ym mholisi Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ar fwriad pobl yng Nghymru i sicrhau ynni cynaliadwy ac yn enwedig ar gymdeithasau tai?

**John Griffiths:** My officials and I are in regular dialogue with UK Government Ministers and officials. We always want to be involved at the earliest possible stage in policy developments and announcements, and there is an ongoing effort to ensure that that is the case. We await announcements from the UK Government on what the green deal will involve with great interest. I know that the changes to the feed-in tariffs have caused concern as to how policy development might or might not aid the development of

rhagofalus ein hunain, a nodir yn ein polisi cynllunio, ac yn wir yn y nodyn cyngor technegol ar bolisi mwynau.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r arolwg annibynnol diweddar ar y pwnc hwn, a gyhoeddwyd gan Cuadrilla Resources, a nododd ei fod yn debygol iawn bod ffracio hydrologig yn achosi difrod seismig ar yr arfordir Fylde yn swydd Gaerhirfryn. A ymglymerwch i gyfathrebu'n llawn â'r Adran Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd ac i ddylanwadu arnynt, a hefyd i ymgysylltu â phartneriaid megis Arolwg Daearegol Prydain, yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, cyn i unrhyw aildechrau ffracio fod yn bosibl?

**John Griffiths:** Unwaith eto, yn gyffredinol o ran nwy siâl, gallaf ddweud bod fy swyddogion wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â Llywodraeth y DU a bod rhan o'r ddeialog honno wedi ymwneud â'r adroddiad y mae'r Aelod wedi'i grybwyll a'r sefyllfa o gwmpas Blackpool yn Lloegr. Mae swyddogion mewn cysylltiad cyson â swyddogion y DU ar y materion hyn.

**Lord Elis-Thomas:** Minister, what discussions were held with the UK Minister for Energy and Climate Change before the statement that the Minister was forced to make in the House of Commons on Monday, and in the House of Lords thanks to the Speaker's intervention, on the changes in the feed-in tariffs? What impact will these changes in UK Government policy have on the intention of people in Wales to secure sustainable energy and on the housing associations in particular?

**John Griffiths:** Mae fy swyddogion a minnau'n cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Gweinidogion a swyddogion Llywodraeth y DU. Rydym bob tro am gael ein cynnwys yn y cam cynharaf posibl o ran cyhoeddiadau a datblygiadau polisi, ac mae ymdrech barhaus i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Rydym yn aros gyda diddordeb mawr am gyhoeddiadau gan Lywodraeth y DU ar beth fydd y fargen werdd yn ei gynnwys. Gwn bod y newidiadau yn y tariffau cyflenwi trydan wedi achosi pryder ynghylch sut y gallai datblygu polisi

renewable energy. I have already received representations from housing associations in Wales, which I will be keen to respond to.

**Eluned Parrott:** Returning to the subject of hydraulic fracturing, the report published today by Cuadrilla gives significant new evidence on the safety, or otherwise, of this particular method of gas extraction. Can you tell us whether you have investigated what powers you have under planning to halt any future fracking proposals until such a time that the implications of this case are more fully understood? As I understand it, the Vale of Glamorgan proposal that has been described will be coming to you for review.

**John Griffiths:** Again, I am not able to discuss any particular planning matters given my planning responsibilities and the fact that matters may come to me in due course. In general, it is quite clear that licensing, for example, is a matter for the UK Government; however, there are ancillary consenting matters that lie with local authorities in Wales and may come to Welsh Ministers. Therefore, the general position is quite clear.

### Canllawiau Cynllunio

**10. Paul Davies:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ganllawiau cynllunio a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru. OAQ(4)0046(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank Paul Davies for that question. Planning policy and guidance for Wales is set out in 'Planning Policy Wales', 'Minerals Planning Policy Wales' and the technical advice note series.

**Paul Davies:** Thank you for that response, Minister. You will remember a number of weeks ago that we debated the issue of planning guidance in this Chamber. A number of issues were brought up, including the role of planning in sustaining town centres. I am aware that the Welsh Government is establishing a comprehensive

helpu, neu beidio â helpu, datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy. Yr wyf eisoes wedi derbyn sylwadau gan gymdeithasau tai yng Nghymru, y byddaf yn awyddus i ymateb iddynt.

**Eluned Parrott:** Gan ddychwelyd at y pwnc o hollti hydrologig, mae'r adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd heddiw gan Cuadrilla yn rhoi tystiolaeth newydd sylweddol ar ddiogelwch, neu beidio, y dull penodol hwn o echdynnu nwy. A allwch ddweud wrthym a ydych wedi ymchwilio i weld pa bwerau sydd gennych o dan gynllunio i atal unrhyw gynigion ffracio yn y dyfodol hyd nes bod goblygiadau'r achos hwn yn cael eu deall yn llawnach? Yn ôl a ddeallaf, bydd cynnig Bro Morgannwg sydd wedi cael ei ddisgrifio yn dod atoch ar gyfer ei adolygu.

**John Griffiths:** Unwaith eto, nid wyf yn gallu trafod unrhyw faterion cynllunio penodol o ystyried fy nghyfrifoldebau cynllunio a'r ffaith y gallai materion ddod ataf maes o law. Yn gyffredinol, mae'n eithaf clir bod trwyddedu, er enghraifft, yn fater i Lywodraeth y DU; fodd bynnag, ceir materion cydsynio atodol sy'n gorwedd gyda'r awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ac efallai y byddant yn dod at Weinidogion Cymru. Felly, mae'r sefyllfa gyffredinol yn eithaf clir.

### Planning Guidance

**10. Paul Davies:** *Will the Minister make a statement on planning guidance issued by the Welsh Government. OAQ(4)0046(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolchaf i Paul Davies am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Nodir polisi a chanllawiau cynllunio ar gyfer Cymru yn 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', 'Polisi Cynllunio Mwynau Cymru' a'r gyfres o nodau cyngor technegol.

**Paul Davies:** Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Byddwch yn cofio nifer o wythnosau yn ôl ein bod wedi trafod y mater o ganllawiau cynllunio yn y Siambr hon. Crybwyllwyd nifer o faterion, yn cynnwys rôl cynllunio o ran cynnal canol trefi. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn sefydlu adolygiad cynhwysfawr o'r system

review of the planning system. I welcome that because planning plays an important role in regenerating town centres, and changes to planning would help the regeneration efforts of areas such as Milford Haven and Fishguard in my constituency. Given the circumstances, will the Minister outline what role his colleague the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage will play in the review of the planning system, given the importance of the regeneration of our town centres?

**John Griffiths:** Yes. My colleague, Huw Lewis, the Minister for regeneration, is keen to ensure that his departmental priorities and strategies are part of the working-up of future planning policy in Wales. The independent review group that I have set up, headed by John Davies, is looking at delivery and structures. It will be calling for evidence in due course. I hope that Members and organisations in Wales will use that opportunity to ensure that they have a role in shaping what eventually emerges.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Pan fu i mi gynnal dadl fer yn y Senedd ym mis Rhagfyr 2009 yn canolbwyntio ar effeithiolrwydd clustogfeydd o amgylch pyllau glo brig, dywedodd eich rhagflaenydd, Jane Davidson, bod angen profi'r polisi cyn ei ailasesu. O ystyried bod penderfyniad y barnwr yn y Llys Apêl yn ddiweddar ar achos rhwng Celtic Energy a Llywodraeth Cymru wedi amlygu nifer o anghysondebau o ran clustogfeydd, a wnewch chi a'ch swyddogion ailedrych ar eu heffeithiolrwydd a gwneud diwygiadau posibl i'r polisi hwn o ran lleoliad y clustogfeydd a pha mor bell ydynt o dai pobl?

**John Griffiths:** Planning policy in Wales is constantly kept under review. There is important work going on at the moment in terms of delivery and structures under John Davies and the independent review group. In due course, we will be taking forward legislation. Therefore, there is constant review and improvement, and there are opportunities for Members to feed in their views as part of the processes involved. If the Member wishes to write to me with any

gynllunio. Yr wyf yn croesawu hynny oherwydd mae cynllunio yn chwarae rhan bwysig o ran adfywio canol trefi, a byddai newidiadau i gynllunio yn helpu'r ymdrechion i adfywio ardaloedd megis Aberdaugleddau ac Abergwaun yn fy etholaeth i. O ystyried yr amgylchiadau, a wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa rôl fydd ei gydweithiwr, y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth, yn ei chwarae yn yr adolygiad o'r system gynllunio, o ystyried pwysigrwydd adfywio canol ein trefi?

**John Griffiths:** Gwnaf. Mae fy nghydweithiwr, Huw Lewis, y Gweinidog dros adfywio, yn awyddus i sicrhau bod ei flaenoriaethau a strategaethau adrannol yn rhan o'r gwaith datblygu polisi cynllunio yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru. Mae'r grŵp adolygu annibynnol, yr wyf wedi'i sefydlu, dan arweiniad John Davies, yn edrych ar gynhyrchu a strwythurau. Bydd yn galw am dystiolaeth yn y man. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau a sefydliadau yng Nghymru yn defnyddio'r cyfle hwnnw i sicrhau bod ganddynt rôl wrth lunio'r hyn a ddaw yn y pen draw.

**Bethan Jenkins:** When I held a short debate in the Senedd in December 2009 on the effectiveness of buffer zones around opencast sites, your predecessor, Jane Davidson, said that the policy needed to be tested before being reassessed. Bearing in mind that the decision of the judge in the Court of Appeal on a recent case between Celtic Energy and the Welsh Government highlighted a number of inconsistencies in terms of buffer zones, will you and your officials review their effectiveness and make possible changes to this policy in terms of where the buffer zones should be located and how far they are from people's homes?

**John Griffiths:** Mae polisi cynllunio yng Nghymru yn cael ei adolygu'n gyson. Mae gwaith pwysig yn mynd ymlaen ar hyn o bryd o ran cyflwyno a strwythurau o dan John Davies a'r grŵp adolygu annibynnol. Maes o law, byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â deddfwriaeth. Felly, mae adolygu a gwella parhaus, ac mae cyfleoedd i Aelodau i gyflwyno eu barn fel rhan o'r prosesau dan sylw. Os yw'r Aelod yn dymuno ysgrifennu ataf gydag unrhyw bryderon penodol

particular concerns regarding recent developments, I would be happy to respond.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** Minister, as part of a national scheme, Network Rail is currently rolling out a series of telecommunications masts along the Heart of Wales railway line. As there are permitted development rights, it is not required to go through the normal planning procedure, but many of my constituents are greatly concerned about the placements of these masts, especially near a primary school and local residences. What guidance can you give to reassure constituents that masts should be placed a certain distance away from homes or schools, and what guidance can you offer constituents facing this situation?

**John Griffiths:** We expect extant guidance governing these matters to be adhered to, notwithstanding permitted development rights. There have been numerous reports on health issues and positions adopted by Government that have to be respected. We are in a difficult position because many people in Wales complain about the lack of coverage and of their inability to use mobile phones, but when developments are proposed that would provide better coverage, there are many objections. As ever, it is a matter of trying to balance competing interests. Certainly, any health concerns that people have should be made known and will be part of any decision-making processes.

### Prosiectau Trydan Dŵr

**11. Mick Antoniw:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cymorth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei roi i brosiectau trydan dŵr bach sy'n cael eu harwain gan y gymuned yn ardal De Cymru. OAQ(4)0042(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank Mick Antoniw for that question. The Welsh Government's Ynni'r Fro programme was launched in January 2010 with the aim of supporting community-scale renewable energy schemes including hydro projects. To date, 34 hydro

ynghylch datblygiadau diweddar, byddwn yn hapus i ymateb.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** Weinidog, fel rhan o gynllun cenedlaethol, mae Network Rail ar hyn o bryd yn cyflwyno cyfres o fastiau telathrebu ar hyd llinell reilffordd Calon Cymru. Gan fod hawliau datblygu wedi'u caniatáu, nid yw'n ofynnol arno fynd drwy'r weithdrefn gynllunio arferol, ond y mae llawer o'm hetholwyr yn bryderus iawn ynghylch lleoliadau'r mastiau hyn, yn enwedig ger yr ysgol gynradd a phreswylfeydd lleol. Pa arweiniad y gallwch ei roi i dawelu meddyliau etholwyr y dylai mastiau cael eu rhoi bellter penodol i ffwrdd o gartrefi neu ysgolion, a pha ganllawiau y gallwch eu cynnig i etholwyr sy'n wynebu'r sefyllfa hon?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym yn disgwyl i ganllawiau sydd ar gael, sy'n llywodraethu'r materion hyn, gael eu glynu wrthynt, er gwaethaf hawliau datblygu a ganiateir. Bu nifer o adroddiadau ar faterion iechyd a swyddi a fabwysiadwyd gan y Llywodraeth y mae'n rhaid eu parchu. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa anodd oherwydd bod llawer o bobl yng Nghymru yn cwyno am y diffyg gwasanaeth a'u hanallu i ddefnyddio ffonau symudol, ond pan gynigir datblygiadau a fyddai'n darparu gwasanaeth gwell, mae llawer o wrthwynebiadau. Fel bob amser, mae'n fater o geisio cydbwysu buddiannau sy'n cystadlu. Yn sicr, dylai unrhyw bryderon iechyd sydd gan bobl cael eu gwneud yn hysbys a bydd yn rhan o unrhyw brosesau o ran gwneud penderfyniadau.

### Hydroelectric Projects

**11. Mick Antoniw:** *Will the Minister give an update on the support the Welsh Government is providing to small-scale, community-led, hydroelectric projects in the South Wales area. OAQ(4)0042(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolchaf i Mick Antoniw am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Lanswyd rhaglen Ynni'r Fro Llywodraeth Cymru yn Ionawr 2010 gyda'r nod o gefnogi cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy cymunedol, gan gynnwys prosiectau ynni dŵr. Hyd yma, cefnogwyd 34

projects have been supported by the Ynni'r Fro programme in south Wales.

**Mick Antoniw:** Minister, the Treforest Residents Association, which is based in my constituency of Pontypridd, is in the process of establishing a hydroelectric scheme at Treforest weir by harnessing the power of the River Taff. A feasibility report has been carried out and has estimated that the 385 kW scheme will pay for itself over eight years, and might eventually lead to producing an income for the community of some £50,000 to £100,000 per annum. Would the Minister be willing to visit Treforest in order to meet some of those involved in the project and to see for himself the way that the project is developing and some of the potential advantages?

**John Griffiths:** I congratulate Mick Antoniw and his constituents on their interest and work in taking forward that community energy project. I would be happy to visit sometime if my diary allows it. There are interesting recent developments in community energy and Cynnal Cymru is taking forward proposals to add to the support that Ynni'r Fro provides for community energy schemes, and I hope very much that we will see many more such projects coming forward.

**William Graham:** Minister, you will know that Monmouthshire has become a bit of a hotbed for hydro projects with a number of successful schemes, including that of the Archimedean screw at Osbaston on the River Monnow. As you know, these things are particularly good because they work all the time, unlike some of the land-based wind turbines. Are you thinking of simplifying the planning process so that communities and landowners can benefit from these hydroelectric schemes?

**John Griffiths:** We are looking at the planning system at the moment in terms of how it might provide greater support for community energy projects, and that will be part of the ongoing work.

**Leanne Wood:** Minister, it has been just over 18 months since the Welsh Government

o brosiectau ynni dŵr gan y rhaglen Ynni'r Fro yn ne Cymru.

**Mick Antoniw:** Weinidog, mae Cymdeithas Trigolion Trefforest, sydd wedi'i leoli yn fy etholaeth ym Mhontypridd, yn y broses o sefydlu cynllun trydan dŵr yng nghored Trefforest drwy harneisio pŵer Afon Taf. Mae adroddiad dichonolrwydd wedi'i gynnal ac mae wedi amcangyfrif y bydd y cynllun 385 kW yn talu am ei hun dros wyth mlynedd, ac efallai yn y pen draw yn arwain at gynhyrchu incwm i'r gymuned o ryw £50,000 i £100,000 y flwyddyn. A fyddai'r Gweinidog yn barod i ymweld â Threfforest er mwyn cwrdd â rhai o'r rhai sy'n rhan o'r prosiect ac i weld drosto'i hun y ffordd y mae'r prosiect yn datblygu a rhai o'r manteision posibl?

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn llongyfarch Mick Antoniw a'i etholwyr ar eu diddordeb a'u gwaith wrth ddatblygu'r prosiect ynni cymunedol hwnnw. Byddwn yn hapus i ymweld ag ef rywbryd os bydd fy nyddiadur yn caniatáu hynny. Mae datblygiadau diweddar diddorol mewn ynni cymunedol ac y mae Cynnal Cymru yn bwrw ymlaen â chynigion i ychwanegu at y cymorth y mae Ynni'r Fro yn ei ddarparu ar gyfer cynlluniau ynni cymunedol, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr y byddwn yn gweld llawer mwy o brosiectau o'r fath yn cael eu cyflwyno.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod bod sir Fynwy wedi dod yn dipyn o ferw gwyllt ar gyfer prosiectau ynni dŵr gyda nifer o gynlluniau llwyddiannus, gan gynnwys y sgrîw Archimedean yn Osbaston ar Afon Mynwy. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r pethau hyn yn arbennig o dda oherwydd y maent yn gweithio trwy'r amser, yn wahanol i rai tyrbinau gwynt sydd ar y tir. A ydych yn bwriadu symleiddio'r broses gynllunio fel y gall cymunedau a thirfeddianwyr elwa o'r cynlluniau trydan dŵr hyn?

**John Griffiths:** Yr ydym yn edrych ar y system gynllunio ar hyn o bryd o ran sut y gellid rhoi mwy o gymorth ar gyfer prosiectau ynni cymunedol, a bydd hynny'n rhan o'r gwaith parhaus.

**Leanne Wood:** Weinidog, mae wedi bod ychydig dros 18 mis ers i Lywodraeth Cymru

published its document, 'A Low Carbon Revolution: Wales's Energy Policy Statement' and announce that we could produce nearly twice our electricity needs through wholly renewable sources by 2025.

2.15 p.m.

Hydroelectric schemes could help reach this goal, given the abundance of rain in this country. However, is it not the case that the goal is simply unobtainable by your Government as long as Westminster retains jurisdiction over large-scale projects that generate more than 50 MW of energy? What are your views on this, Minister? What representations have you made to counterparts in London, who continue to hold these powers over our country?

**John Griffiths:** The First Minister and I have been crystal clear that we want consenting powers for energy schemes over 50 MW in Wales, and we will continue to make that case, with, I hope, the support of other parties in this Chamber.

gyhoeddi ei dogfen, 'Chwyldro Carbon Isel: Datganiad Polisi Ynni Cymru' a chyhoeddi y gallem gynhyrchu bron ddwywaith ein hanghenion trydan drwy ffynonellau gwbl adnewyddadwy erbyn 2025.

Gall cynlluniau trydan dŵr helpu i gyrraedd y nod hwn, o ystyried bod mwy na digon o law yn y wlad hon. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir, onid yw, bod y nod yn syml yn amhosibl i'ch Llywodraeth chi cyn belled â bod San Steffan yn cadw awdurdodaeth dros brosiectau ar raddfa fawr sy'n cynhyrchu mwy na 50 MW o ynni? Beth yw'ch barn ar hyn, Weinidog? Pa sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno i gymheiriaid yn Llundain, sy'n parhau i ddal y pwerau hyn dros ein gwlad?

**John Griffiths:** Mae'r Prif Weinidog a finnau wedi bod yn gwbl glir ein bod eisiau pwerau caniatâd ar gyfer cynlluniau ynni dros 50 MW yng Nghymru, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud yr achos hwnnw, gyda, yr wyf yn gobeithio, chefnogaeth pleidiau eraill yn y Siambr hon.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth Questions to the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage**

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 1, OAQ(4)0046(HRH), has been transferred for written answer by the Minister for Education and Skills.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 1, OAQ (4) 0046 (HRH), wedi'i drosglwyddo i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Sgiliau.

#### **Blaenoriaethau Cyllidebol**

**2. Nick Ramsay:** *A wnai'ff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau cyllidebol i gefnogi adfywio. OAQ(4)0042(HRH)*

**The Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage (Huw Lewis):** I thank the Member for Monmouth for that question. I want to achieve the maximum benefit from my regeneration investment in order to help deliver on the anti-poverty agenda within our programme for government. I hope to do that by focusing expenditure on intensive, holistic programmes, working across Government and with our delivery partners.

**Nick Ramsay:** I welcome the Minister's comments regarding dealing with poverty.

#### **Budget Priorities**

**2. Nick Ramsay:** *Will the Minister make a statement on his budget priorities for supporting regeneration. OAQ(4)0042(HRH)*

**Y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth (Huw Lewis):** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Fynwy am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yr wyf am sicrhau'r budd mwyaf o'm buddsoddiad adfywio er mwyn helpu i gyflawni'r agenda gwrthdlodi o fewn ein rhaglen lywodraethu. Yr wyf yn gobeithio gwneud hynny drwy ganolbwyntio gwariant ar raglenni dwys a chyfannol gan weithio ar draws y Llywodraeth a chyda'n partneriaid cyflenwi.

**Nick Ramsay:** Yr wyf yn croesawu sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch trechu tlodi.

The seven strategic regeneration areas throughout Wales that you announced recently are all in heavily urbanised areas—that may be the point of their designation—but there is also a large amount of regeneration required in rural areas across Wales. Will you outline how you are dealing with poverty in rural areas, specifically rural areas that may border urban areas? There seems to be a lack of focus on that sort of deprivation.

**Huw Lewis:** I would not necessarily agree that our designated regeneration areas are entirely urban in character. If you take, for example, large stretches of Môn a Menai or the north Wales coast area, or, indeed, the Heads of the Valleys area, there are many stretches and communities embedded in those areas that would not describe themselves as classically urban in any sense. The regeneration areas enable us to focus resource to bring together partnerships around the particular and pressing regeneration priorities that those areas are up against. That is not to say that regeneration is not a priority for almost every part of Wales. Rural housing enablers, for instance, form an important part of addressing the housing problems that rural Wales has with regard to the particular characteristics of rural housing shortage. I am saying to the Member for Monmouth that I do not necessarily accept the premise of his question. Although regeneration areas do and should exist, regeneration is on the list of governmental priorities for all communities across Wales.

**Leanne Wood:** Yesterday, I mentioned to the First Minister the retrofitting of homes as a means of stimulating the Welsh economy. He mentioned the Arbed scheme, which is good, but I do not think that this initiative is sufficient to make the significant impact that our economy needs right now. The Compass manifesto, which was unveiled this week, proposes the retrofitting of older, energy-inefficient homes of which, as you will be aware, there are very many in Wales. Will you look into the possibility of expanding retrofitting schemes in order to provide an economic stimulus, to create jobs and to ensure that fewer households have to choose

Mae'r saith ardal adfywio strategol ar draws Cymru a gyhoeddwyd gennych yn ddiweddar i gyd mewn ardaloedd trefol iawn—efallai mai dyna pam eu bod wedi'u dynodi—ond hefyd mae angen llawer o adfywio mewn ardaloedd gwledig ar draws Cymru. A wnewch amlinellu sut yr ydych yn trechu tlodi mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn benodol ardaloedd gwledig sy'n ffinio ardaloedd trefol? Ymddengys fod diffyg ffocws ar y math hwnnw o amddifadedd.

**Huw Lewis:** Ni fyddwn o reidrwydd yn cytuno bod ein hardaloedd adfywio dynodedig yn gwbl drefol o ran cymeriad. Os ydych yn cymryd, er enghraifft, ddarnau mawr o Fôn a Menai neu ardal arfordir y gogledd, neu, yn wir, ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd, mae llawer o rannau a chymunedau yn yr ardaloedd hynny na fyddent yn eu disgrifio eu hunain yn draddodiadol drefol mewn unrhyw synnwyr. Mae'r ardaloedd adfywio yn ein galluogi i ganolbwyntio adnoddau i ddwyn ynghyd bartneriaethau o gwmpas y blaenoriaethau adfywio penodol sy'n herio'r ardaloedd hynny. Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â dweud nad yw adfywio yn flaenoriaeth ar gyfer bron bob rhan o Gymru. Mae swyddogion galluogi tai gwledig, er enghraifft, yn rhan bwysig o fynd i'r afael â'r problemau tai sy'n wynebu Cymru wledig mewn perthynas â'r nodweddion penodol o brinder tai gwledig. Yr wyf yn dweud wrth yr Aelod dros Fynwy nad wyf o reidrwydd yn derbyn cynsail ei gwestiwn. Er bod ardaloedd adfywio yn bodoli, a dylent fodoli, mae adfywio ar y rhestr o flaenoriaethau llywodraeth ar gyfer pob cymuned ar draws Cymru.

**Leanne Wood:** Ddoe, soniais wrth y Prif Weinidog am ôl-ffitio cartrefi fel ffordd o ysgogi economi Cymru. Soniodd am gynllun Arbed, sy'n beth da, ond nid wyf yn credu bod y fenter hon yn ddigon i gael yr effaith sylweddol sy'n angenrheidiol i'n heconomi ni ar hyn o bryd. Mae manifestio Compass, a ddadorchuddiwyd yr wythnos hon, yn cynnig ôl-ffitio cartrefi hŷn ac aneffeithlon o ran ynni, ac, fel y gwyddoch, mae llawer iawn ohonynt yng Nghymru. A wnewch edrych i mewn i'r posibilrwydd o ehangu cynlluniau ôl-ffitio er mwyn darparu ysgogiad economaidd, creu swyddi a sicrhau bod llai o aelwydydd sydd angen dewis rhwng



between heating and eating this winter?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for that intervention, which is timely and important. I take a particular and personal interest in how, for instance, Arbed phase 2—a second tranche of Arbed intervention—would roll out, precisely what form it would take, and how we meet the challenge of addressing the special characteristics, apart from anything else, of older properties, which tend to dominate the Welsh housing stock. We should be careful of retrofitting that is undertaken in order to take the path of least resistance, if you like. It is not necessarily the quickest or easiest form of retrofitting that we should undertake, and we should always have in mind the special characteristics of the housing in which we are investing. There are some very interesting examples. I was with Mike Hedges in Swansea East just yesterday looking at a housing renewal area. The co-working of renewal areas with Arbed is something that I want to look at very closely. You mentioned the level of resource, and we need to maximise that. Working schemes together simultaneously in certain communities is a way to accomplish that. If Leanne Wood wishes, I would offer a further meeting to talk through the particular concerns about Arbed. It is an item for debate, and it is an item for debate right now.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Leanne Wood. Just ask a question, please.

**Leanne Wood:** Thank you, Minister. I will take you up on your offer of a meeting. On a different matter, this week, the Westminster Government announced that it would be slashing the feed-in tariff on 11 December, some 11 days before the consultation on the scheme ends. Some commentators have said that this will deliver a hammer blow—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Can you just come to a question, please? We are way over time on this item. We need a question now, not a preamble, please.

**Leanne Wood:** Are you prepared to make representations to your counterparts in Westminster on how the slashing of the feed-

gwresogi a bwyta'r gaeaf hwn?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am yr ymyriad, sy'n amserol a phwysig. Yr wyf yn cymryd diddordeb arbennig a phersonol mewn sut, er enghraifft, y byddai cam 2 Arbed yn cael ei gyflwyno—hynny yw, yr ail ran o ymyrraeth Arbed—yr union ffurf y byddai'n ei gymryd, a sut yr ydym yn cwrdd â'r her o fynd i'r afael â nodweddion arbennig, ar wahân i unrhyw beth arall, eiddo hŷn, sy'n tueddu i ddominyddu stoc tai Cymru. Dylem fod yn ofalus o ran ôl-ffitio sy'n cael ei wneud er mwyn cymryd y llwybr hawsaf, os mynnwch. Nid o reidrwydd y modd cyflymaf neu hawsaf y dylem ei ddefnyddio, o ran ôl-ffitio, a dylem bob amser gadw mewn golwg nodweddion arbennig y tai yr ydym yn buddsoddi ynddynt. Mae rhai enghreifftiau diddorol iawn. Roeddwn gyda Mike Hedges yn Nwyrain Abertawe ddoe yn edrych ar ardal adnewyddu tai. Mae cyd-weithio'r ardaloedd adnewyddu gydag Arbed yn rhywbeth yr wyf eisiau edrych arno'n ofalus iawn. Soniasoch am lefel yr adnoddau, ac mae angen inni wneud y gorau o hynny. Un ffordd o gyflawni hynny yw cynlluniau lle yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'n gilydd ar yr un pryd mewn rhai cymunedau. Os yw Leanne Wood yn dymuno, byddwn yn cynnig cyfarfod pellach i drafod y pryderon penodol ynghylch Arbed. Mae'n eitem i'w thrafod, ac mae'n eitem i'w thrafod yn awr.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf Leanne Wood. Gofynnwch gwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Leanne Wood:** Diolch, Weinidog. Byddaf yn derbyn eich cynnig o gyfarfod. Ar fater gwahanol, yr wythnos hon, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth San Steffan y byddai'n torri'r tariff cyflenwi trydan ar 11 Rhagfyr, tua 11 diwrnod cyn i'r ymgynghoriad ar y cynllun ddod i ben. Mae rhai sylwebyddion wedi dweud y bydd hyn yn ergyd fawr—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A allwch jest ofyn cwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda? Yr ydym yn bell dros amser ar yr eitem hon. Mae arnom angen cwestiwn yn awr, nid rhagarweiniad, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Leanne Wood:** A ydych yn barod i gyflwyno sylwadau i'ch cymheiriaid yn San Steffan ar sut y bydd torri'r tariff cyflenwi trydan yn

in tariff will affect the policy areas in your portfolio? Will you make an assessment of how the changes to the feed-in tariff will affect the general principle of making Wales a more sustainable country?

**Huw Lewis:** Of course I will. I am repeatedly bewildered by the attitude and stance of the Westminster Government on issues such as this. Not only is it entirely incoherent in terms of its stated priorities, but it reeks of bad faith.

### Tai Fforddiadwy

**3. Mark Isherwood:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei gynlluniau i wella'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy. OAQ(4)0041(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** One of my key priorities is to improve people's lives in Wales by increasing housing supply. I am working with the whole housing sector to maximise the number of affordable homes that can be delivered with and without capital grant and across all forms of tenure.

**Mark Isherwood:** You will be aware that the new Joseph Rowntree Foundation report, 'Welsh housing policy: where next?', refers to a reduction in capital grant for new affordable housing, noting that this not only drives a search for other forms of finance, but underlines the need to get more value, such as through additional employment and training opportunities. However, given the consequential that has come to the Welsh Government of £38.9 million from the council tax freeze in England, which has been ruled out for that purpose in Wales, do you agree that at least some of that money could be invested in affordable housing, while meeting the criteria set by the Welsh Government for infrastructure investment? It would have a multiplier effect of bringing in three times as much in additional private sector money—in other words, quadrupling the money, to deliver possibly hundreds of additional affordable homes in Wales.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for North Wales for that question. I would agree, but, then again, seeking to defend the housing

effeithio ar y meysydd polisi yn eich portffolio? A wnewch asesiad o sut y bydd y newidiadau i'r tariff cyflenwi trydan yn effeithio ar yr egwyddor gyffredinol o wneud Cymru yn wlad fwy cynaliadwy?

**Huw Lewis:** Wrth gwrs y byddaf yn gwneud hynny. Yr wyf yn drysu dro ar ôl tro gan agwedd a safiad Llywodraeth San Steffan ar faterion fel hyn. Nid yn unig y mae'n hollol ddigyswllt o ran ei flaenoriaethau datganedig, ond mae'n edrych yn annidwyll.

### Affordable Homes

**3. Mark Isherwood:** *Will the Minister outline his plans to improve the supply of affordable homes. OAQ(4)0041(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Un o'm blaenoriaethau allweddol yw gwella bywydau pobl yng Nghymru drwy gynyddu'r cyflenwad tai. Yr wyf yn gweithio gyda'r sector tai cyfan i wneud y gorau o ran nifer y tai fforddiadwy y gellir eu darparu gyda a heb grant cyfalaf ac ar draws pob math o ddeiliadaeth.

**Mark Isherwood:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod adroddiad newydd Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, 'Welsh housing policy: where next?', yn cyfeirio at ostyngiad yn y grant cyfalaf ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy newydd, gan nodi bod hyn nid yn unig yn arwain at chwilio am fathau eraill o gyllid, ond yn tanlinellu'r angen i gael mwy o werth, megis drwy gyfleoedd cyflogaeth a hyfforddiant ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried y cyllid canlyniadol o £38.9 miliwn sydd wedi dod i Lywodraeth Cymru o rewi'r dreth gyngor yn Lloegr, ac sydd wedi cael ei diystyru at y diben hwnnw yng Nghymru, a ydych yn cytuno y gall o leiaf rywfaent o'r arian hwnnw gael ei fuddsoddi mewn tai fforddiadwy, tra'n cwrdd â'r meini prawf a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn seilwaith? Byddai'n cael effaith lluosydd o ddod â thair gwaith yr arian o'r sector preifat—hynny yw, pedair gwaith yr arian, i gyflenwi cannoedd o bosibl o gartrefi fforddiadwy ychwanegol yng Nghymru.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ogledd Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Byddwn yn cytuno, ond, eto, gan geisio amddiffyn y

portfolio, I would say that would I not? However, he is right to say that investment in housing has an almost automatic multiplier effect in terms of its impact on the economy and the jobs and skills agenda.

**Sandy Mewies:** Minister, Shelter Cymru has warned that changes to the housing benefit system introduced by the Conservative-Lib Dem coalition Government will leave thousands of people at risk of losing their homes. In fact, there are currently 48,710 people in Wales receiving local housing allowance. The estimate is that 48,530 of these will lose out under the package of so-called reforms. Therefore, do you agree that the warm words about affordable homes coming from the Conservative Party are only that, and that perhaps they would be better looking to their UK Government and asking it to put a stop to this policy, which is devastating Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for that intervention. I welcome Shelter's input to this debate. As yet, to my mind, the extent to which changes in the welfare and benefits system will affect the Welsh housing picture is unclear. However, one thing is for sure: it will be a negative effect, and ever-more people will be pushed into a precarious situation in being able to afford a roof over their heads, and the UK Westminster Government is directly responsible for that.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae llywodraeth leol yn Lloegr wedi bod yn pwysu ar Lywodraeth San Steffan am yr hawl i drethu ail gartrefi'n llawn a defnyddio'r arian at godi tai fforddiadwy. Mae'r sefyllfa'n wahanol yng Nghymru, gan fod yr hawl i drethu'n llawn yno yn barod. Gellid trethu ail gartrefi'n drymach, wrth gwrs, gan ddefnyddio'r arian at godi mwy o dai fforddiadwy. A fydddech yn fodlon, mewn egwyddor, ystyried hyn?

**Huw Lewis:** I would consider it in principle, absolutely. I hope that this specific issue will form part of our cross-party debate, and indeed our debate with partners beyond this Chamber with regard to the forthcoming housing Bill. It is important to examine every

portffolio tai, byddwn yn dweud hynny, oni fyddwn? Fodd bynnag, mae'n iawn i ddweud bod buddsoddi mewn tai yn cael effaith lluosydd bron yn awtomatig o ran ei effaith ar yr economi a'r agenda swyddi a sgiliau.

**Sandy Mewies:** Weinidog, mae Shelter Cymru wedi rhybuddio y bydd newidiadau i'r system budd-daliadau tai a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth glymblaid y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gadael miloedd o bobl mewn perygl o golli eu cartrefi. Yn wir, mae yna 48,710 o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n derbyn lwfans tai lleol ar hyn o bryd. Yr amcangyfrif yw y bydd 48,530 o'r rhain yn colli allan o dan y pecyn o ddiwygiadau, fel y'u gelwir. Felly, a ydych yn cytuno bod y geiriau cynnes am gartrefi fforddiadwy a ddaw oddi wrth y Blaid Geidwadol yn eiriau cynnes yn unig, ac y byddai'n well efallai iddynt edrych ar eu Llywodraeth y DU a gofyn iddi roi terfyn ar y polisi hwn, sy'n ddinistriol i Gymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am yr ymyriad hwnnw. Yr wyf yn croesawu mewnbyn Shelter i'r ddadl hon. Hyd yn hyn, yn fy marn i, mae'n aneglur i ba raddau y bydd y newidiadau yn y system les a budd-daliadau yn effeithio ar y darlun tai yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae un peth yn sicr: bydd yn cael effaith negyddol, a bydd mwyfwy o bobl yn cael eu gwthio i mewn i sefyllfa fregus o ran gallu fforddio to uwch eu pennau, ac mae Llywodraeth San Steffan y DU yn gyfrifol yn uniongyrchol am hynny.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Local government in England is pressing the Westminster Government for the right to charge full council tax on second homes and to use that money for building affordable homes. The situation is different in Wales, as the right to charge a full tax already exists. Second homes could be taxed more heavily, of course, with the money used to build more affordable housing. Would you be willing, in principle, to consider that?

**Huw Lewis:** Byddwn yn ei ystyried mewn egwyddor, yn sicr. Gobeithiaf y bydd y mater penodol hwn yn rhan o'n dadl drawsbleidiol, ac yn wir ein dadl gyda phartneriaid y tu hwnt i'r Siambr hon mewn perthynas â'r Bil tai sydd ar y gweill. Mae'n bwysig archwilio

possibility for gaining extra revenue and gaining investment that can be targeted at affordable housing over the coming difficult period.

**Peter Black:** Minister, since taking up your post, you have made great play of your policy for co-operative housing. I am happy to support any initiative that gives people greater control over the accommodation they live in. How many additional affordable homes are likely to be provided as a result of that policy?

**Huw Lewis:** It is far too early to say. I will keep Members up to date in terms of progress made on the co-operative housing agenda. I recently undertook visits to London and Stockholm to see how co-operative housing models operate there. Distinctively different systems have developed in London and Stockholm, and many lessons were learned. It is a little early still to be talking of targets and numbers, although they will be developed. I intend to publish targets for co-operative housing and other forms of affordable housing as this agenda unfolds. There is a job of work yet to be done, along with a great deal of heavy lifting, to ensure that we get the model of co-operative housing that suits Wales's housing sector best—first, we have to get that right. Secondly, we have to raise awareness in people's minds of the potential for co-operative housing to address specific needs within the current housing situation.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. Do you anticipate that pursuing any co-operative housing model will attract additional funding streams?

**Huw Lewis:** I hope so very much, because of its nature and its newness—it is a novel model in the UK. There are co-operative housing examples that you can point to throughout the UK, but we are proposing something on a different scale. I think that private investors, and ethical investors in particular, would be particularly interested in looking at what would constitute a safe, long-term investment, which, in turn, would be an ethical way of investing money.

pob posibilrwydd ar gyfer ennill refeniw ychwanegol a chael buddsoddiad y gellir ei dargedu at dai fforddiadwy yn ystod y cyfnod anodd i ddod.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, ers ichi ddechrau eich swydd, yr ydych wedi rhoi pwyslais mawr ar eich polisi ar gyfer tai cydweithredol. Yr wyf yn hapus i gefnogi unrhyw fenter sy'n rhoi mwy o reolaeth i bobl dros y llety y maent yn byw ynddo. Faint o gartrefi fforddiadwy ychwanegol sy'n debygol o gael eu darparu o ganlyniad i'r polisi hwnnw?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n llawer rhy gynnar i ddweud. Byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau o ran y cynnydd a wnaed ar yr agenda tai cydweithredol. Yn ddiweddar, ymwelais â Llundain a Stockholm i weld sut mae modelau tai cydweithredol yn gweithredu yno. Mae systemau cwbl wahanol wedi datblygu yn Llundain a Stockholm, a dysgwyd llawer o wersi. Mae'n dal i fod ychydig yn gynnar i siarad am dargedau a rhifau, er y byddant yn cael eu datblygu. Yr wyf yn bwriadu cyhoeddi targedau ar gyfer tai cydweithredol a mathau eraill o dai fforddiadwy wrth i'r agenda hon ddatblygu. Mae jobyn o waith eto i'w wneud, ynghyd â llawer iawn o godi trwm, i sicrhau ein bod yn cael y model tai cydweithredol sydd orau ar gyfer sector tai Cymru—yn gyntaf, mae'n rhaid inni gael hynny'n iawn. Yn ail, mae'n rhaid inni godi ymwybyddiaeth ym meddyliau pobl o'r potensial ar gyfer tai cydweithredol i fynd i'r afael ag anghenion penodol o fewn y sefyllfa dai bresennol.

**Peter Black:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. A ydych yn rhagweld y bydd canlyn unrhyw fodel tai cydweithredol yn denu ffrydiau ariannu ychwanegol?

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf yn gobeithio hynny yn fawr iawn, oherwydd ei natur a'i newydddeb—mae'n fodel newydd yn y DU. Mae yna enghreifftiau o dai cydweithredol y gallwch eu gweld ledled y DU, ond yr ydym yn cynnig rhywbeth ar raddfa wahanol. Yr wyf yn meddwl y byddai buddsoddwyr preifat, a buddsoddwyr moesegol yn arbennig, â diddordeb arbennig mewn edrych ar beth fyddai'n fuddsoddiad hirdymor a diogel, a fyddai, yn ei dro, yn ffordd foesegol o

fuddsoddi arian.

### Treftadaeth Cymru

**4. David Rees:** *Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i gefnogi treftadaeth Cymru. OAQ(4)0056(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Aberavon for that question. Our programme for government outlines our commitment to supporting and promoting Welsh heritage. We want to promote our culture and history through events and attractions throughout Wales and abroad. We aim to develop a sense of ownership and pride in our heritage. I hope that the redevelopment of St Fagans: National History Museum will be seen as an excellent example of this.

**David Rees:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. I am sure that you agree that a strong element of our heritage lies in our industrial past. We must do as much as possible to keep and restore buildings that represent this history. I was disappointed to see that two important Victorian buildings in Port Talbot—the Custom House and the Royal Buildings, which are an important part of our town’s industrial heritage—have not been listed by Cadw. Minister, can you ensure that buildings associated with industry are given full consideration by Cadw, to ensure that their history is preserved for future generations, so that they can understand our towns’ past?

2.30 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Aberavon for the question. I entirely agree that Wales’s industrial heritage is of enormous importance to us and that it should be protected and conserved wherever possible. I am aware in outline of the issues surrounding the Customs House and the Royal Buildings in Port Talbot, and I would urge the Member to share my view that we should distinguish between valuing a building for its contribution to local heritage, and listing. Those things are quite different as there are set criteria for listing; it is not discretionary. However, that does not mean

### Welsh Heritage

**4. David Rees:** *What action is the Welsh Government taking to support Welsh heritage. OAQ(4)0056(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i’r Aelod dros Aberafan am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae ein rhaglen lywodraethu yn amlinellu ein hymrwymiad i gefnogi a hyrwyddo treftadaeth Cymru. Rydym yn awyddus i hyrwyddo ein diwylliant a’n hanes drwy ddigwyddiadau ac atyniadau ledled Cymru a thramor. Rydym yn anelu at ddatblygu ymdeimlad o berchnogaeth a balchder yn ein treftadaeth. Rwy’n gobeithio y bydd y gwaith o ailddatblygu Sain Ffagan: Amgueddfa Werin Cymru yn cael ei weld fel enghraifft ardderchog o hyn.

**David Rees:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno mai elfen gref o’n treftadaeth yw ein hanes diwydiannol. Mae’n rhaid inni wneud cymaint â phosibl i gadw ac adfer adeiladau sy’n cynrychioli’r hanes hwn. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig i weld nad yw dau adeilad pwysig Fictoraidd ym Mhort Talbot—y Tollty a’r Adeiladau Brenhinol, sy’n rhan bwysig o dreftadaeth ddiwydiannol ein tref—wedi eu rhestru gan Cadw. Weinidog, a allwch sicrhau bod adeiladau sy’n gysylltiedig â diwydiant yn cael ystyriaeth lawn gan Cadw, i sicrhau bod eu hanes yn cael ei gadw ar gyfer cenedlaethau’r dyfodol, fel y gallant ddeall hanes ein trefi?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i’r Aelod dros Aberafan am y cwestiwn. Cytunaf yn llwyr fod treftadaeth ddiwydiannol Cymru yn bwysig iawn i ni ac y dylid ei diogelu a’u cadw lle bynnag y bo’n bosibl. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol yn fras o’r materion sy’n ymwneud â’r Tollty a’r Adeiladau Brenhinol ym Mhort Talbot, a byddwn yn annog yr Aelod i rannu fy marn y dylem wahaniaethu rhwng gwerthfawrogi adeilad am ei gyfraniad at dreftadaeth leol, a rhestru. Mae’r pethau hynny’n wahanol iawn gan fod meini prawf penodol ar gyfer rhestru; nid yw’n ddewisol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny’n golygu nad yw’r adeiladau hynny yn

that those buildings are not important. As we move towards introducing a heritage Bill during this Assembly, we need to have a debate about buildings of local importance that are key to civic pride within an area and which may have a driving effect on regeneration within themselves, and how they may not necessarily be listed, but are valued and protected as part of our legislative framework.

**Suzy Davies:** Minister, will you join me in recognising the important role played by the Welsh Books Council in promoting the Welsh publishing sector, and congratulate it on reaching its fiftieth anniversary, which it celebrates this coming Sunday?

**Huw Lewis:** I readily join you in congratulating the Welsh Books Council as it continues to evolve and develop, particularly into the e-books market; it is exciting as to what the future might hold for the Welsh Books Council in that regard. So, congratulations to it.

**Suzy Davies:** The publishing sector is an important contributor to culture and heritage in Wales, as well as to the Welsh economy. However, I understand that a tender for a Cadw publication was recently advertised in the wrong section of the Sell2Wales website, affecting the way in which the daily alerts to those with a registered interest operated. Will you work with the Minister for business to ensure that Welsh publishers, large or small, are treated equally when it comes to public procurement, and to ensure that Sell2Wales avoids such confusion in the future?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for bringing that to my attention. I would be grateful if you would be willing to drop me a line with a little more detail, as I was not aware of that particular glitch. It sounds as if it is something that I should follow up to ensure that it does not happen again.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Going back to the Customs House issue, I have raised this with you on a number of occasions. It is all well and good to say that these buildings could be of special interest, but they are still under threat of

bwysig. Wrth i ni symud tuag at gyflwyno Bil treftadaeth yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn, mae angen i ni gael dadl am adeiladau o bwysigrwydd lleol sy'n allweddol i falchder dinesig o fewn ardal ac sy'n gallu bod yn sbardun eu hunain i adfywio lleol, ac er nad ydynt o reidrwydd wedi cael eu rhestru, maent yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi a'u diogelu fel rhan o'n fframwaith deddfwriaethol.

**Suzy Davies:** Weinidog, a wnewch ymuno â mi i gydnabod y rôl bwysig a chwaraeir gan Gyngor Llyfrau Cymru wrth hyrwyddo'r sector cyhoeddi yng Nghymru, a'i longyfarch ar gyrraedd ei ben-blwydd yn hanner cant, y mae'n ei ddathlu ddydd Sul nesaf?

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf yn ymuno â chi yn frwd i longyfarch Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru wrth iddo barhau i esblygu a datblygu, yn enwedig yn y farchnad e-lyfrau; mae'r dyfodol yn gyffrous o ran yr hyn a allai ddigwydd yng Nghyngor Llyfrau Cymru yn hynny o beth. Felly, llongyfarchiadau iddo.

**Suzy Davies:** Mae'r sector cyhoeddi yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig i ddiwylliant a threftadaeth yng Nghymru, yn ogystal ag i economi Cymru. Fodd bynnag, deallaf fod tendr diweddar am gyhoeddiad gan Cadw wedi ei hysbysebu ar adran anghywir y wefan GwerthwchiGymru, gan effeithio ar y ffordd yr anfonwyd gwybodaeth ddyddiol at y rhai sydd â diddordeb cofrestredig. A wnewch chi weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros fusnes i sicrhau bod cyhoeddwr Cymru, mawr neu fach, yn cael eu trin yn gyfartal pan ddaw i gaffael cyhoeddus, ac i sicrhau bod GwerthwchiGymru yn osgoi dryswch o'r fath yn y dyfodol?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ddod â hynny i fy sylw. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddech yn fodlon ysgrifennu ataf gydag ychydig mwy o fanylion, gan nad oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r broblem benodol honno. Mae'n swnio fel rhywbeth y dylwn ei ddilyn i fyny i sicrhau nad yw'n digwydd eto.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Gan fynd yn ôl at fater y Tollty, yr wyf wedi codi hyn gyda chi ar nifer o achlysuron. Mae'n ddigon hawdd dweud y gallai'r adeiladau hyn fod o ddiddordeb arbennig, ond maent yn dal i fod o dan

demolition. Would you be willing to look again at this issue, specifically taking account of the representations that I have received from local people saying that many of the building's features are concealed by false ceilings and stud walls, and that Cadw has not looked at the building properly in that regard? Will you urge Cadw to go back to look at the Royal Buildings to see if it can reassess the situation so that these buildings are not demolished and so that the heritage of Port Talbot is retained for the future?

**Huw Lewis:** I fully concur with the Member that the heritage of Port Talbot is as important as the heritage of anywhere else in Wales, and, with that in mind, should be taken care of and be thought about in imaginative terms as regards what the conservation of that heritage might mean for the future of that town and community. My understanding is that Cadw has visited these buildings on four separate occasions, so if Cadw has missed anything I would appreciate it if the Member would write to me with further details as to what precisely that might be. I emphasise that it is open to the local authority to register these buildings as being of local importance, and that that would matter in terms of the local development plan and the way in which the buildings might be treated in the future. There is more open to us than simply the option of listing.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, an aspect of our heritage of which we can justly be proud is the tradition of producing outstanding internationally renowned musicians, writers and performing artists. Many of us in this Chamber were concerned that that tradition would be jeopardised by the decision of the Arts Council of Wales to withdraw funding from youth theatre productions in areas such as Gwent and mid Powys. What discussions have you had with the arts council since coming to office about its replacement strategy for youth arts, so that that aspect of our heritage can continue in future?

**Huw Lewis:** Ongoing discussions with the arts council are a regular feature of the work within my portfolio. As the Member is well aware, there is an arm's-length relationship

fygythiad o gael eu dymchwel. A fyddech yn barod i edrych eto ar y mater hwn, gan ystyried yn benodol y sylwadau a gefais gan bobl leol yn dweud bod llawer o nodweddion yr adeilad yn cael eu cuddio gan nenfydau ffug a waliau pared, ac nad yw Cadw wedi edrych ar yr adeilad yn briodol yn hynny o beth? A wnewch chi annog Cadw i fynd yn ôl i edrych ar yr Adeiladau Brenhinol i weld a ellir ailasesu'r sefyllfa fel nad yw'r adeiladau hyn yn cael eu dymchwel ac fel bod treftadaeth Port Talbot yn cael ei chadw ar gyfer y dyfodol?

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r Aelod bod treftadaeth Port Talbot yr un mor bwysig â threftadaeth unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru, a, chyd hynny mewn golwg, dylid ei warchod a'i ystyried gyda dychymyg o ran yr hyn y gallai gwarchod y dreftadaeth ei olygu ar gyfer dyfodol y dref a'r gymuned. Fy nealltwriaeth i yw bod Cadw wedi ymweld â'r adeiladau hyn ar bedwar achlysur gwahanol, felly os yw Cadw wedi colli unrhyw beth, byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi pe byddai'r Aelod yn ysgrifennu ataf gyda manylion pellach ynglŷn â beth yn union y gallai hynny fod. Pwysleisïaf ei fod yn agored i'r awdurdod lleol i gofrestru'r adeiladau hyn fel rhai o bwysigrwydd lleol, ac y byddai hynny o bwys o ran y cynllun datblygu lleol a'r modd y gallai'r adeiladau gael eu trin yn y dyfodol. Mae yna fwy o opsiynau ar gael i ni na rhestru yn unig.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, un agwedd ar ein treftadaeth y gallwn fod yn haeddiannol falch ohoni yw'r traddodiad o gynhyrchu cerddorion, awduro ac artistiaid perfformio o fri. Roedd llawer ohonom yn y Siambr hon yn pryderu y byddai'r traddodiad hwnnw yn cael ei beryglu gan benderfyniad Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i dynnu cyllid oddi wrth gynrychiadau theatr ieuenctid mewn ardaloedd fel Gwent a chanol Powys. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda chynghor y celfyddydau ers dechrau yn eich swydd am ei strategaeth newydd ar gyfer celfyddydau ieuenctid, fel y gall yr agwedd honno ar ein treftadaeth barhau at y dyfodol?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae trafodaethau parhaus gyda chynghor y celfyddydau yn nodwedd reolaidd o'r gwaith yn fy mhortffolio. Fel y mae'r Aelod yn ei wybod, mae perthynas hyd-

with the arts council regarding individual funding decisions across the country. However, all parties concerned in these discussions are as one when it comes to recognising the importance of investment in great-quality arts and life experiences for children and young people in and out of the school environment.

### Safon Ansawdd Tai Cymru

**5. William Graham:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu'r cynnydd mewn perthynas â Safon Ansawdd Tai Cymru. OAQ(4)0051(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for South Wales East for that question. To be precise, by 31 March 2010, social landlords had assessed that 35 per cent of registered social landlord housing and 16 per cent of local authority housing met the Welsh housing quality standard. By April 2013, it is anticipated that 78 per cent of RSL housing and 39 per cent of local authority housing will meet the standard.

**William Graham:** I thank the Minister for his answer. He will be aware of Caerphilly County Borough Council's decision to delay the ballot of its council house tenants on transferring the housing stock to a registered social landlord. It has been delayed from this month to an undefined time in early 2012. The idea, as you say, is to bring the stock up to the required Welsh housing quality standard. I do not expect you to comment on that particular issue, but do you agree that, in future, you will provide sufficient encouragement, shall we say, that these ballots should be conducted with the fullest information, and at the earliest possible time, to minimise costs?

**Huw Lewis:** Yes. My officials have been working closely with Caerphilly local authority members and officers. Only yesterday, I met with the leader of the local authority and we have all underlined the importance of moving forward with the balloting in Caerphilly. My understanding is that there is a date emerging for the ballot, which could be held in late February or early March. Tenants within Caerphilly county borough, some of whom I represent myself, want to get on with this, and we do not want

braich gyda chyngor y celfyddydau ynghylch penderfyniadau ariannu unigol ar draws y wlad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r holl bartïon dan sylw yn y trafodaethau hyn o'r un farn pan ddaw i gydnabod pwysigrwydd buddsoddi mewn profiadau celfyddydol a bywyd o ansawdd gwyb ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc o fewn yr ysgol a thu allan.

### The Welsh Housing Quality Standard

**5. William Graham:** *Will the Minister outline progress with regard to the Welsh Housing Quality Standard. OAQ(4)0051(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ddwyrain De Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. I fod yn fanwl gywir, erbyn 31 Mawrth 2010, yr oedd landlordiaid cymdeithasol wedi asesu bod 35 y cant o dai landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ac 16 y cant o dai awdurdod lleol yn bodloni safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Erbyn Ebrill 2013, rhagwelir y bydd 78 y cant o dai LCC a 39 y cant o dai awdurdod lleol yn cyrraedd y safon.

**William Graham:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. Bydd yn ymwybodol o benderfyniad Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili i ohirio pleidlais o'i denantiaid tai cyngor ar drosglwyddo'r stoc tai i landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Mae wedi cael ei ohirio o'r mis hwn nes cyfnod amhenodol yn gynnar yn 2012. Y syniad, fel y dywedwch, yw sicrhau bod y stoc yn cyrraedd y safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Nid wyf yn disgwyl i chi roi sylwadau ar y mater penodol hwnnw, ond, a ydych yn cytuno y byddwch, yn y dyfodol, yn rhoi digon o anogaeth, dywedwn, y dylai'r pleidleisiau hyn gael eu cynnal gyda'r wybodaeth lawnaf, ac ar yr amser cynharaf posibl, i leihau costau?

**Huw Lewis:** Ydw. Mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos gydag aelodau a swyddogion awdurdod lleol Caerffili. Dim ond ddoe, cefais gyfarfod ag arweinydd yr awdurdod lleol ac yr ydym i gyd wedi tanlinellu pwysigrwydd symud ymlaen â'r pleidleisio yng Nghaerffili. Fy nealltwriaeth i yw bod yna ddyddiad sy'n dod i'r amlwg ar gyfer y bleidlais, a allai gael ei gynnal ddiwedd mis Chwefror neu ddechrau mis Mawrth. Mae tenantiaid o fewn bwrdeistref sirol Caerffili, rhai ohonynt yr wyf yn eu



this to fall foul of any kind of purdah period in the run-up to the next local elections. I underline that fact that there are enormous benefits from moving forward with this agenda, primarily for the people of Caerphilly county borough.

### Tai Fforddiadwy

**6. Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am dai fforddiadwy yng Ngogledd Cymru. OAQ(4)0048(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Since 2008-09, the Welsh Government has provided over £87 million in capital funding for affordable housing in local authorities in north Wales. That has significantly helped to meet the local need for housing in the region.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Diolch am eich ateb, Weinidog. Yn absenoldeb targed gan y Llywodraeth yma i ymgyrraedd tuag ato o ran tai fforddiadwy, yr oeddwn yn falch i weld fod cynllun partneriaeth tai Cymru am godi 150 o dai yn y flwyddyn gyntaf—dywedwch a fynnoch am ba mor uchelgeisiol yw 150 o dai—ond, cefais siom i ddeall mai dim ond 15 o'r tai hynny fyddai'n cael eu codi yn y gogledd, lle mae dros 10,000 o bobl ar restrau aros am dai cyngor. A ydych o ddifrif ynghylch mynd i'r afael â phroblem tai fforddiadwy yng ngogledd Cymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Of course we are serious; we are serious to the tune of £87 million thus far. The Member for North Wales is being a bit economical when it comes to describing the whole picture. He, and his colleagues, regard targets as central to their concerns, therefore, let me address that. I have every respect for my predecessor, but, the world has changed. I must consider that we have to draw in new forms of finance, look at questions of land release with a greater urgency, consider new forms of housing altogether—such as co-operative housing—as well as the effect of an upcoming national empty homes strategy that I hope will have a major impact on this agenda. That will take time. There will be targets; I can say today that I will announce targets. However, they will be based on the

cynrychioli fy hun, yn awyddus i fwrw ymlaen â hyn, ac nid ydym am i hyn fynd yn groes i unrhyw fath o gyfnod *purdah* yn y cyfnod cyn yr etholiadau lleol nesaf. Yr wyf yn tanlinellu'r ffaith bod manteision enfawr yn deillio o symud ymlaen â'r agenda hon, yn bennaf ar gyfer pobl bwrdeistref sirol Caerffili.

### Affordable Housing

**6. Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** *Will the Minister make a statement on affordable housing in North Wales. OAQ(4)0048(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Ers 2008-09, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi darparu dros £87 miliwn o gyllid cyfalaf ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy mewn awdurdodau lleol yng ngogledd Cymru. Mae hynny wedi bod o gymorth sylweddol i gwrdd â'r angen lleol am dai yn y rhanbarth.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Thank you for your answer, Minister. In the absence of a Government target to try to attain in terms of affordable housing, I was pleased to see that the Welsh housing partnership is to erect 150 homes in its first year—you can make your own decision about how ambitious 150 homes is—but I was then disappointed to discover that only 15 of those homes will be in north Wales, where more than 10,000 people are on waiting lists for council houses. Are you serious about getting to grips with the problem of affordable housing in north Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** Wrth gwrs ein bod o ddifrif; yr ydym o ddifrif hyd at gost o £87 miliwn hyd yn hyn. Mae'r Aelod dros Ogledd Cymru yn bod ychydig yn economaidd pan ddaw i ddisgrifio'r darlun cyfan. Y mae ef, a'i gydweithwyr, yn ystyried bod targedau yn ganolog i'w pryderon, felly, gadewch i mi fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae gen i bob parch at fy rhagflaenydd, ond, mae'r byd wedi newid. Mae'n rhaid i mi ystyried bod yn rhaid inni dynnu mathau newydd o gyllid i mewn, edrych ar gwestiynau o ryddhau tir â mwy o frys, ystyried mathau newydd o dai yn gyfan gwbl—megis tai cydweithredol—yn ogystal ag effaith strategaeth tai gwag cenedlaethol sydd ar y gweill fydd, yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn cael effaith fawr ar yr agenda hwn. Bydd hynny'n cymryd amser. Bydd targedau;

facts and on clear thinking, not on wishful thinking.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** I am delighted to hear that you will base your targets on the facts, Minister, because, in the light of the latest projections from the Office for National Statistics that the majority of future population growth will occur in the south-east of England, with relatively modest changes in north Wales, there are serious concerns about the accuracy of the Welsh Government's population projections in north Wales, which rely on the migration patterns that existed before the downturn to guide its policies for affordable and general housing. Can you confirm what discussions you have had with your Cabinet colleagues about the need to review those projections, and do you agree that it is vital that new affordable housing in north Wales is concentrated where there is genuine local need in the community?

**Huw Lewis:** Let us be clear, it is not for myself or for the Welsh Government to decide upon the housing need in a particular local authority area. That is clearly a matter for local authorities, based on good evidence and good viability testing to ensure that that is done correctly. It is all part of putting together their local development plans. Having said that, I am always willing to revisit any assumption that may have been inherited from the past. I have asked officials to take a look at exactly how population projections are constructed at a fundamental level. I would say to the Member that I am always suspicious of anything that simply has been inherited from previous times. The inheritance here goes back some way.

**Aled Roberts:** You will be aware from the Office for National Statistics that 86 per cent of affordable homes in 2010-11 were provided through capital grants, Minister. With the reduction in capital funding, great reliance will be necessary, as far as local authorities are concerned, on planning and affordable housing thresholds. Given that

gallaf ddweud heddiw y byddaf yn cyhoeddi targedau. Fodd bynnag, byddant yn cael eu seilio ar y ffeithiau ac ar feddwl yn glir, nid ar freuddwyd gwrach.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn o glywed y byddwch yn seilio eich targedau ar y ffeithiau, Weinidog, oherwydd, yng ngoleuni'r rhagolygon diweddaraf gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol y bydd y mwyafrif o'r twf yn y boblogaeth yn y dyfodol yn digwydd yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, gyda newidiadau cymharol fach yng ngogledd Cymru, mae pryderon difrifol am gywirdeb amcanestyniadau poblogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru yng ngogledd Cymru, sy'n dibynnu ar batrymau ymfudo a oedd yn bodoli cyn y dirywiad i lywio ei pholisïau ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy a chyffredinol. A allwch gadarnhau pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda'ch cydweithwyr yn y Cabinet am yr angen i adolygu'r rhagamcanion hynny, ac a ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol bod tai fforddiadwy newydd yng ngogledd Cymru yn cael eu hadeiladu lle mae angen lleol gwirioneddol yn y gymuned?

**Huw Lewis:** Gadewch inni fod yn glir, nid mater i mi neu i Lywodraeth Cymru yw penderfynu ar yr angen am dai mewn ardal awdurdod lleol penodol. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn fater i awdurdodau lleol, yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth dda a phrofion hyfywedd da er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n cael ei wneud yn gywir. Mae hyn i gyd yn rhan o lunio eu cynlluniau datblygu lleol. Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf bob amser yn barod i ailedrych ar unrhyw ragdybiaeth a all fod wedi cael eu hetifeddu o'r gorffennol. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion ystyried sut yn union y lluniwyd y rhagamcanion poblogaeth ar lefel sylfaenol. Byddwn yn dweud wrth yr Aelod fy mod bob amser yn amheus o unrhyw beth sydd wedi cael ei etifeddu oddi wrth adegau blaenorol. Mae'r etifeddiaeth yma yn mynd yn ôl gryn dipyn.

**Aled Roberts:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol y cafodd 86 y cant o gartrefi fforddiadwy yn 2010-11 eu darparu drwy grantiau cyfalaf, Weinidog. Gyda'r gostyngiad mewn cyllid cyfalaf, bydd dibyniaeth fawr, cyn belled ag y mae awdurdodau lleol yn y cwestiwn, ar gynllunio a throthwyon tai fforddiadwy. O ystyried bod

many of the LDPs are currently being framed, and that local authorities are receiving legal advice that they cannot go as far as they would wish, what discussions will you have with your colleague, the Minister for planning, regarding national guidance that will allow local authorities more leeway to raise those planning thresholds for affordable homes?

**Huw Lewis:** As I have already said, those inter-ministerial conversations go on all the time. If the Member were willing to be a little more specific about the problems faced by a particular local authority, perhaps he could write to me and I could address those concerns head on.

### Y Bil Tai

**7. Keith Davies:** *Pryd y mae'r Gweinidog yn rhagweld y bydd y Bil Tai yn cael ei gyflwyno. OAQ(4)0050(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** On 12 July, the First Minister announced the inclusion of a housing Bill in the Welsh Government's five-year legislative programme. I intend to publish proposals next spring in a White Paper, with the Bill provisionally planned for introduction in the third year of the legislative programme, in 2013-14.

**Keith Davies:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae sawl un o'm hetholwyr wedi prynu eu tai oddi wrth yr awdurdod lleol o dan y cynllun hawl i brynu, ond, yn anffodus, mae gan lawer o'r tai hyn, sy'n cael eu galw yn dai Dorlonco, neu yn dai â ffrâm ddr, broblemau strwythurol sydd ond wedi dod i'r amlwg ers eu prynu. A wnech chi ystyried anghenion y sawl sy'n byw yn y cartrefi hyn wrth ichi gynllunio'ch polisiau ac unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for those comments, and I register his deep concern for his constituents. These are serious problems dating back to the 1980s. The Housing Defects Act 1984 enabled local authorities, within a certain time period, to provide

llawer o'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol yn cael eu fframio ar hyn o bryd, a bod awdurdodau lleol yn derbyn cyngor cyfreithiol na allant fynd cyn belled ag y dymunant, pa drafodaethau y byddwch yn eu cael gyda'ch cydweithiwr, y Gweinidog dros gynllunio, ynghylch canllawiau cenedlaethol a fydd yn caniatáu mwy o ryddid i awdurdodau lleol i godi trothwyon cynllunio ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy?

**Huw Lewis:** Fel yr wyf eisoes wedi ei ddweud, mae'r trafodaethau rhyngweinidogol hynny'n mynd ymlaen drwy'r amser. Pe bai'r Aelod yn barod i fod ychydig yn fwy penodol am y problemau a wynebir gan awdurdod lleol penodol, efallai y gall ysgrifennu ataf a gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hynny yn uniongyrchol.

### The Housing Bill

**7. Keith Davies:** *When does the Minister anticipate that the Housing Bill will be introduced. OAQ(4)0050(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Ar 12 Gorffennaf, cyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog gynnwys Bil tai fel rhan o raglen ddeddfwriaethol bum mlynedd Llywodraeth Cymru. Yr wyf yn bwriadu cyhoeddi cynigion y gwanwyn nesaf mewn Papur Gwyn, gyda chynllun amodol i gyflwyno'r Bil yn ystod trydedd flwyddyn y rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol, yn 2013-14.

**Keith Davies:** Thank you for that response, Minister. Several of my constituents have purchased their house from the local authority under the right-to-buy scheme, but, unfortunately, many of these houses, which are called Dorlonco houses or steel-framed houses, have structural problems that have only become apparent since their purchase. Could you keep in mind the needs of the people who live in these homes when planning your policies and any Welsh Government legislation during this Assembly?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am y sylwadau hynny, ac yr wyf yn nodi ei bryder dwfn dros ei etholwyr. Mae'r rhain yn broblemau difrifol sy'n dyddio'n ôl i'r 1980au. Mae Deddf Diffygion Tai 1984 yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol, o fewn cyfnod amser

financial assistance to homeowners who purchased their council property under right-to-buy regulations to gain the necessary repairs to designated house types, which I understand included those steel-framed houses, but that time has passed. That time-limited legislation has now moved on. We and those residents are now left in a situation where the assistance they could access is entirely a matter for their local authority. However, in the run-up to fresh legislation, my door will always be open for talking through possible solutions to this issue.

2.45 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** Recent publicity over the evictions from the Dale Farm Traveller site in England has once again focused attention on related issues in north Wales and in the rest of Wales. Given that the memorandum for the original legislative competence Order referred to proposals for Gypsy and Traveller sites in Wales, do you intend that the housing Bill that you will be bringing forward will incorporate such proposals so that there will be sufficient official sites to meet the need identified in the Niner report of 2006—it was the first proper research into Gypsy and Traveller accommodation need in Wales—and so that local authorities, rather than simply incorporating a site into their local development plans, co-operate to match need to the travelling patterns and the geographical boundaries of the communities affected?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for that. These issues are all open for discussion. The White Paper that will be published early next spring as a precursor to the housing Bill signals the beginning of an all-encompassing debate on housing in Wales, as far as I am concerned. It will be a comprehensive piece of legislation, and it is for all partners, whether in the political world, or the private, public or voluntary sectors, to come forward with ideas, suggestions and concerns in the debate that we will have in the run-up to the formulation of this Bill, including on those matters.

penodol, i ddarparu cymorth ariannol i berchnogion tai a brynodd eu heiddo cyngor o dan reoliadau hawl-i-brynu i sicrhau'r gwaith atgyweirio angenrheidiol i fathau o dai dynodedig, sydd, yr wyf ar ddeall, yn cynnwys tai â ffrâm dur, ond mae'r amser hwnnw wedi mynd heibio. Roedd terfyn amser ar y ddeddfwriaeth honno, sydd eisoes wedi pasio. Yr ydym ni a'r trigolion hynny yn awr mewn sefyllfa lle mae'r cymorth y gallent ei gael yn gyfan gwbl yn fater i'w hawdurdod lleol. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfnod sy'n arwain at ddeddfwriaeth ffres, bydd fy nrws bob amser ar agor er mwyn trafod atebion posibl i'r mater hwn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'r cyhoeddusurwydd diweddar dros y dadfeddiannu o'r safle Sipsiwn yn fferm Dale yn Lloegr unwaith eto wedi canolbwyntio sylw ar faterion cysylltiedig yn y gogledd a gweddill Cymru. O gofio bod y memorandwm ar gyfer y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol gwreiddiol yn cyfeirio at gynigion ar gyfer safleoedd Sipsiwn a Theithwyr yng Nghymru, a yw'n fwriad gennych y bydd y Bil y byddwch yn dod gerbron yn cynnwys cynigion o'r fath fel bod digon o safleoedd swyddogol i ddiwallu angen a nodwyd yn adroddiad Niner 2006—hwnnw oedd yr ymchwil cyntaf go iawn i lety Sipsiwn a Theithwyr yng Nghymru—ac fel bod awdurdodau lleol, yn hytrach na dim ond ymgorffori safle yn eu cynlluniau datblygu lleol, yn cydweithio i gyfateb angen y patrymau teithio a ffiniau daearyddol y cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am hynny. Mae'r materion hyn i gyd yn agored i'w trafod. Mae'r Papur Gwyn a gyhoeddir yn gynnar yn y gwanwyn fel rhagflaenydd i'r Bil tai yn arwydd o ddechrau'r ddadl hollgynhwysol ar dai yng Nghymru, o'm safbwynt i. Bydd yn ddarn cynhwysfawr o ddeddfwriaeth, ac mater i'r holl bartneriaid, boed yn y byd gwleidyddol, neu'r sectorau preifat, cyhoeddus neu wirfoddol, yw cyflwyno syniadau, awgrymiadau a phryderon yn y ddadl y byddwn yn ei chael yn y cyfnod cyn i'r Bil hwn gael ei ddatblygu, gan gynnwys ar y materion hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, cyfeirioch nifer o weithiau wrth ateb cwestiynau y prynhawn yma at eich ymrwymiad i sicrhau bod mwy o dai fforddiadwy ar gael. Pe bai'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn ystod y 13 blynedd yr oedd yn llywodraethu yn San Steffan wedi gwneud i ffwrdd â'r cynllun cyfrif refeniw tai, byddai miliynau o bunnoedd wedi cael eu harbed gan lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, a byddai cyfle wedi bod i greu tai fforddiadwy yn y sector rhent. A ydych wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i gyflwyno cap ar rent o fewn y sector rhentu preifat? Mae deddfwriaeth wedi ei phasio ar hyn yng Ngwerniniaeth Iwerddon ac mae bwrdd tenantiaeth wedi ei sefydlu yno er mwyn rheoli rhent ac, yn Efrog Newydd, mae cap wedi bod ar rent o fewn elfennau o'r sector rhentu preifat ers 1940. A oes modd gwneud hynny yng Nghymru?

**Huw Lewis:** It is possible, of course. It is very important, in the run-up to the first major piece of comprehensive housing legislation that Wales has produced, that the private rented sector features front and centre. We need a healthy, vibrant private rented sector. Many millions of people will need that over coming years, perhaps more than ever before in our experience. That means help and support for landlords. It also means a fresh look at regulation and affordability and fairness for tenants as consumers of private rented sector housing. So, yes, it is possible; let us have that debate, and the White Paper will follow very soon.

**Jenny Rathbone:** I recently visited a flat in my constituency, which had been privately rented to three students. It had damp, with water running down the walls, and, every time that they left the windows open, intruders came in to steal their property. What measures will be included in the housing Bill to deter disreputable private landlords and enhance the rights of the tenants so that they can insist on decent housing in exchange for their rent?

**Huw Lewis:** The Member for Cardiff Central raises very important matters relating to the quality of housing and the quality of the management of housing within the private rented sector. That will be a critical part of

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, while answering questions this afternoon, you have referred several times this afternoon to your commitment to ensure that more affordable homes are made available. If the Labour Government had got rid of the housing revenue account scheme during the 13 years it was in power in Westminster, millions of pounds would have been saved by local government in Wales, and there would have been an opportunity to create affordable houses in the rented sector. Have you considered introducing a cap on rent in the private rented sector? Legislation has been passed in the Republic of Ireland and a tenancy board has been established in order to control rent and, in New York, there has been a cap on rents in parts of the private rented sector since 1940. Is there a way of doing that in Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n bosibl, wrth gwrs. Mae'n bwysig iawn, yn y cyfnod cyn y darn mawr cyntaf o ddeddfwriaeth tai gynhwysfawr y mae Cymru wedi'i chynhyrchu, bod y sector rhentu preifat yn cael blaenoriaeth. Mae angen arnom sector rhentu preifat iach a bywiog. Bydd angen hynny ar filiynau o bobl yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, efallai'n fwy nag erioed o'r blaen yn ein profiad ni. Mae hynny'n golygu help a chymorth i landlordiaid. Mae hefyd yn golygu edrych o'r newydd ar reoleiddio a fforddiadwyedd a thegwch i denantiaid fel defnyddwyr tai yn y sector rhentu preifat. Felly, ydy, mae'n bosibl; gadewch inni gael y ddadl honno, a bydd y Papur Gwyn yn dilyn yn fuan iawn.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Yn ddiweddar, ymwelais â fflat yn fy etholaeth, a oedd wedi'i rentu'n breifat i dri o fyfyrwyr. Roedd ganddo leithder, gyda dŵr yn rhedeg i lawr y muriau, a phob tro y byddent yn gadael y ffenestri ar agor, roedd lladron yn dod mewn a dwyn eu heiddo. Pa fesurau a gaiff eu cynnwys yn y Bil tai i rwystro landlordiaid preifat diegwyddor ac i wella hawliau'r tenantiaid fel bod modd iddynt fynnu tai o safon dda am eu rhent?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r Aelod dros Ganol Caerdydd yn codi materion pwysig iawn o ran ansawdd tai ac ansawdd rheoli tai yn y sector rhentu preifat. Bydd hynny'n rhan hanfodol o'r Bil tai, a bydd cael y

the housing Bill and getting that right will be very important. Looking after people and their rights as tenants will be central, as will enabling landlords and supporting landlords to maintain properties and manage them well. The registration and regulation of landlords in some form or another will have to be a part of the discussion.

### Adfywio Trefi a Phentrefi Cymru

**8. Christine Chapman:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am adfywio trefi a phentrefi Cymru. OAQ(4)0044(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** We are committed to the renewal of town centres and the revival of seaside towns. In our regeneration areas, we are leading co-ordinated partnership programmes to regenerate key settlements and the communities that they serve.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome the renewal programmes across Wales, and the commitment that has been made by the Government to breathe new life into our town centres. Do you agree that, in regenerating our communities, it is important to reflect upon the experiences of all sectors of society? Could you tell me what the Welsh Government is doing to improve accessibility in our town centres for people with disabilities?

**Huw Lewis:** Our towns and villages should be enjoyed by all members of society. Our aspiration is to create sustainable, vibrant places for people to live in, work, visit and enjoy, regardless of their situation. There are legal underpinnings to the work that needs to be done in this regard, and I am engaged in a great deal of work with officials on how buildings—not necessarily listed buildings, but historic ones—that are a key part of regeneration projects are included in the accessibility agenda, along with all other buildings. This issue is at the top of the list, as far as I am concerned, in any regeneration or renewal project that we undertake in terms of housing investment and the regeneration of town and village centres.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Minister, the Heads of

ddarpariaeth briodol yn bwysig iawn. Bydd edrych ar ôl pobl a'u hawliau fel tenantiaid yn ganolog, fel y bydd galluogi landlordiaid a chefnogi landlordiaid i gynnal a chadw eiddo a'u rheoli'n dda. Bydd yn rhaid i gofrestru a rheoleiddio landlordiaid mewn rhyw ffurf neu'i gilydd fod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth.

### The Regeneration of Welsh Towns and Villages

**8. Christine Chapman:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the regeneration of Welsh towns and villages. OAQ(4)0044(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i adnewyddu canol trefi ac adfywio trefi glan môr. Yn ein hardaloedd adfywio, rydym yn arwain rhaglenni partneriaeth cydgysylltiedig i adfywio'r aneddiadau allweddol a'r cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf y rhaglenni adnewyddu ledled Cymru, a'r ymrwymiad a wnaed gan y Llywodraeth i ddod â bywyd newydd i ganol ein trefi. A ydych yn cytuno, wrth adfywio ein cymunedau, ei bod yn bwysig adlewyrchu profiadau bob rhan o gymdeithas? A allech ddweud wrthyf beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i wella hygyrchedd ein trefi i bobl ag anabledau?

**Huw Lewis:** Fe ddylai ein trefi a'n pentrefi gael eu mwynhau gan bawb o'n cymdeithas. Ein dyhead yw creu lleoedd cynaliadwy, bywiog i bobl i fyw, gweithio, ymweld a mwynhau, waeth beth yw eu sefyllfa. Mae seiliau cyfreithiol i'r gwaith sydd angen ei wneud yn hyn o beth, ac yr wyf yn ymgymryd mewn llawer o waith gyda swyddogion o ran sut mae adeiladau—nid o reidrwydd adeiladau wedi'u rhestru, ond rhai hanesyddol—sydd yn rhan allweddol o brosiectau adfywio yn cael eu cynnwys yn yr agenda hygyrchedd, ynghyd â phob adeilad arall. Mae'r mater hwn ar frig y rhestr, yn fy marn i, mewn unrhyw brosiect adfywio neu adnewyddu a wnawn o ran buddsoddi mewn tai ac adfywio canol trefi a phentrefi.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Weinidog, Blaenau'r

the Valleys is one of the Welsh Government's regeneration areas. An aim of the Welsh Government strategy for the area is the development of an

'appealing and coherent tourism and leisure experience'.

However, Cadw site statistics show that, between 2007 and 2010, there was no increase in the number of conservation areas, parks or gardens in the Heads of the Valleys area. How are you promoting heritage-led regeneration in areas such as the Heads of the Valleys, and how are you working with your ministerial colleagues to ensure that an appealing and coherent tourism and leisure experience is available in this part of south-east Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** It would be very difficult for any Member to tour the Heads of the Valleys area without seeing multiple examples of how heritage-led regeneration is transforming communities throughout the former coalfield area. Take a trip anywhere from Blaenavon over to Ferndale and all points in between and you will see these examples over and over again, often involving enormously proud and engaged groups of local people at the forefront of the work.

**Simon Thomas:** What role do supermarkets and free parking play in the regeneration of town centres?

**Huw Lewis:** I will not issue a blanket ministerial judgment upon supermarkets and free parking here. I am human enough to realise that probably each and every one of us within this Chamber, whatever the political stance we might take on these issues, has quite enjoyed the facilities of supermarkets and free parking at some point or other. In addressing these issues we must always address the particular needs of the community that we are speaking about. I do not think that there is a blanket or standard answer that can be rolled out in this regard. I intend for our regeneration work, as we roll it forward, to be tailored as far as possible to the needs of each community and to deliver a bespoke product. No doubt there are communities that would jump at the chance to have a large supermarket with free parking

Cymoedd yw un o ardaloedd adfywio Llywodraeth Cymru. Nod strategaeth Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer yr ardal yw datblygu

'profiad deniadol a chydlynol ym maes twristiaeth a hamdden'.

Fodd bynnag, dengys ystadegau safle Cadw, rhwng 2007 a 2010, nad oedd unrhyw gynnydd yn y nifer o ardaloedd cadwraeth, parciau neu erddi ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd. Sut ydych yn hyrwyddo adfywio a arweinir gan dreftadaeth mewn ardaloedd fel Blaenau'r Cymoedd, a sut ydych yn gweithio gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion i sicrhau bod profiad deniadol a chydlynol ym maes twristiaeth a hamdden ar gael yn y rhan hon o dde-ddwyrain Cymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Byddai'n anodd iawn i unrhyw Aelod deithio ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd heb weld sawl enghraifft o sut mae adfywio wedi ei arwain gan dreftadaeth yn gwednewid cymunedau ar hyd a lled hen ardal y pyllau glo. Os ewch ar daith i unrhyw le o Flaenafon i Lyn Rhedynog a phob man rhyngddynt, fe welwch enghreifftiau o hyn drosodd a throsodd, yn aml yn cynnwys grwpiau o bobl leol hynod falch ac ymrwymedig sydd ar flaen y gad yn y gwaith.

**Simon Thomas:** Pa rôl y mae archfarchnadoedd a pharcio am ddim yn chwarae wrth adfywio canol trefi?

**Huw Lewis:** Ni fyddaf yn gwneud dyfarniad gweinidogol cyffredinol ar archfarchnadoedd a pharcio am ddim yma. Yr wyf yn ddigon dynol i sylweddoli ei fod yn debygol fod pob un ohonom yn y Siambr hon, pa bynnag safbwynt gwleidyddol yr ydym yn ei gymryd ar y materion hyn, wedi mwynhau cyfleusterau archfarchnadoedd a pharcio am ddim ar ryw adeg neu'i gilydd. Wrth fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn rhaid inni bob amser ymdrin ag anghenion penodol y gymuned yr ydym yn siarad amdani. Ni chredaf y gellir cyflwyno ateb safonol neu gyffredinol yn y cyswllt hwn. Bwriadaf i'n gwaith adfywio, wrth i ni ei gyflwyno, gael ei deilwra gymaint ag y bo modd i anghenion pob cymuned ac i ddarparu cynnyrch pwrpasol. Nid wyf yn amau bod cymunedau a fyddai'n neidio ar y cyfle i gael archfarchnad fawr â pharcio am

attached. There would be other communities with other priorities, such as the need to look after town centres, for instance, and to get away from the idea of out-of-town shopping developments. My answer, I suppose, is that we must deliver a tailored product for each community.

**William Powell:** As the Minister may be aware, the Institute of Historic Building Conservation recently raised concerns that Welsh local authorities are left understaffed in terms of qualified building conservation officers. Given the vital role that such officers play in the sustainable regeneration of Welsh towns and villages, often acting as the eyes and ears of Cadw on the ground, will the Minister reaffirm the importance that he attributes to building conservation professionals working across Wales? Will he commit the Welsh Government to allocating appropriate support to safeguard this aspect of our heritage?

**Huw Lewis:** I am concerned about this issue, not just in relation to building conservation officers, but in relation to procurement officers with sufficient expertise to ensure best value from regeneration and housing investment, and, as we move forward with our empty homes strategy, in relation to empty homes officers, who are employed by some local authorities, but not others. I am working with my colleague Carl Sargeant, particularly with regard to the Simpson agenda and how co-operation between local authorities could solve some of these issues. However, I take on board the point that, without the expertise of certain specialist officers, we approach many regeneration issues with one hand tied behind our backs.

### **Blaenoriaethau Sector Tai Cymdeithasol**

**9. Joyce Watson:** *Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog ar gyfer y sector tai cymdeithasol. OAQ(4)0055(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** My priorities are to increase the supply of housing, improve the quality of existing homes and improve the quality of housing services and support, particularly for those who need it most. I am working closely

ddim ynddi. Byddai blaenoriaethau eraill gan gymunedau eraill, megis yr angen i edrych ar ôl canol trefi, er enghraifft, ac i symud oddi wrth y syniad o safleoedd siopa ar gyron trefi. Fy ateb, mae'n siŵr, yw bod yn rhaid inni ddarparu cynnyrch wedi'i deilwra ar gyfer pob cymuned.

**William Powell:** Fel efallai y gwŷr y Gweinidog, cododd y Sefydliad Cadwraeth Adeilad Hanesyddol bryderon yn ddiweddar bod awdurdodau lleol Cymru yn brin o staff o ran swyddogion adeiladau cadwraeth cymwys. O ystyried y rôl hollbwysig mae swyddogion o'r fath yn ei chwarae wrth adfywio trefi a phentrefi yn gynaliadwy, gan weithredu yn aml fel llygaid a chlustiau Cadw ar lawr gwlad, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ailddatgan y pwysigrwydd mae'n ei roi i weithwyr proffesiynol adeiladau cadwraeth sy'n gweithio ledled Cymru? A wnaiff ymrwymo Llywodraeth Cymru i ddyrannu cymorth priodol i ddiogelu'r agwedd hon ar ein treftadaeth?

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf yn bryderus am y mater hwn, nid yn unig o ran swyddogion adeiladau cadwraeth, ond mewn perthynas â swyddogion caffael sydd â digon o arbenigedd er mwyn sicrhau y gwerth gorau o fuddsoddiad adfywio a thai, ac, wrth inni symud ymlaen â'n strategaeth cartrefi gwag, o ran swyddogion cartrefi gwag, a gyflogir gan rai awdurdodau lleol, ond nid gan rai eraill. Yr wyf yn gweithio gyda fy nghyd-Aelod Carl Sargeant, yn enwedig o ran yr agenda Simpson a sut y gallai cydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol ddatrys rhai o'r materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, derbynïaf y pwynt ein bod, heb arbenigedd swyddogion arbenigol penodol, yn ymdrin â nifer o faterion adfywio gydag un llaw wedi ei chlymu tu ôl i'n cefnau.

### **Priorities for the Social Housing Sector**

**9. Joyce Watson:** *What are the Minister's priorities for the social housing sector. OAQ(4)0055(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Fy mlaenoriaethau yw i gynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai, gwella ansawdd cartrefi sy'n bodoli eisoes a gwella ansawdd gwasanaethau tai a chymorth, yn enwedig i'r rhai sydd ei angen fwyaf. Yr wyf yn



with the housing sector to achieve that.

**Joyce Watson:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. As you work towards assembling a housing Bill to meet those challenges, I know that you will also consider how we can best respond in Wales to the sweeping changes to the housing benefit system imposed by Westminster in order to mitigate the impact on vulnerable households. With regard to local housing allowance rates, have you made an assessment of the impact of the changes introduced in April, particularly with regard to whether people are being priced out of the private rented sector, thus putting extra pressure on social housing providers? The Department for Work and Pensions' own equality impact assessment has predicted that the Welfare Reform Bill 2011 will affect the income of 40 per cent of working-age housing-benefit claimants in the social rented sector. Therefore, it is an issue that we need to consider carefully in Wales.

**Huw Lewis:** It certainly is, and I thank the Member for underlining its importance. It has yet to dawn on the public mind in large part quite what the size and depth of the impact of these changes upon the housing picture across Wales will be. It is still rather early to identify the precise impact of these reforms, but it is pretty certain that demand for properties in the social sector will increase. We are working with DWP to monitor the impacts, through a joint research project, and, following a decision by the Welsh Cabinet, we have established a ministerial task and finish group to assess and monitor the cumulative impact of the UK Government's welfare reforms across the Welsh Government. There are many variables here, particularly when you consider the cross-border flow of people. It is therefore difficult to be specific about the impact upon the Welsh housing picture. However, one thing is for sure—it will be negative and significant.

**Lindsay Whittle:** My parents lived in a shared council house for four years, and when I was three days old we were given our own tenancy as a family on the Penyrheol council estate in Caerphilly, which remained our happy family home for 53 years. The need for social housing has never been

gweithio'n agos gyda'r sector tai i gyflawni hynny.

**Joyce Watson:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Wrth ichi weithio tuag at roi Bil tai at ei gilydd i ddatrys yr heriau hynny, gwn y byddwch hefyd yn ystyried sut orau y gallwn ymateb yng Nghymru i'r newidiadau ysgubol i'r system budd-dal tai a orfodwyd gan San Steffan er mwyn lliniaru'r effaith ar aelwydydd sy'n agored i niwed. O ran cyfraddau lwfans tai lleol, a ydych wedi gwneud asesiad o effaith y newidiadau a gyflwynwyd ym mis Ebrill, yn enwedig o ran a yw pobl yn cael eu prisio allan o'r sector rhentu preifat, gan roi pwysau ychwanegol ar ddarparwyr tai cymdeithasol? Mae asesiad effaith ar gydraddoldeb gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn rhagweld y bydd y Bil Diwygio Lles 2011 yn effeithio ar incwm 40 y cant o hawlwyd budd-dal tai o oedran gweithio yn y sector rhentu cymdeithasol. Felly, mae'n fater y mae angen inni ei ystyried yn ofalus yng Nghymru.

**Huw Lewis:** Yn sicr, a diolch i'r Aelod am danlinellu ei bwysigrwydd. Nid yw wedi gwawrio eto ar y cyhoedd, i raddau helaeth, beth fydd maint a dyfnder effaith y newidiadau hyn ar y sefyllfa dai ledled Cymru. Mae'n dal braidd yn gynnar i nodi union effaith y diwygiadau hyn, ond mae'n bur sicr y bydd cynnydd yn y galw am eiddo yn y sector cymdeithasol. Rydym yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i fonitro'r effeithiau, drwy brosiect ymchwil ar y cyd, ac, yn dilyn penderfyniad gan Gabinet Cymru, rydym wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl gweinidogol i asesu a monitro effaith gronol diwygiadau lles Llywodraeth y DU ar draws Llywodraeth Cymru. Ceir nifer o ffactorau amrywiol yma, yn enwedig pan ystyriwch llif pobl ar draws ffiniau. Felly, mae'n anodd bod yn benodol am yr effaith ar y sefyllfa dai yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae un peth yn sicr—bydd yn negyddol ac yn sylweddol.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Roedd fy rhieni yn byw mewn tŷ cyngor a rannwyd am bedair blynedd, a phan oeddwn yn dridiau oed cawsom denantiaeth ein hunain fel teulu ar ystâd cyngor Penyrheol yng Nghaerffili, a fu'n gartref teulu hapus i ni am 53 blynedd. Mae mwyn o angen tai cymdeithasol nag

greater, and, in the programme for government, there was a pledge to develop and promote new ways of providing land and funding for housing. You made reference in your previous answers to housing co-operatives and, incidentally, I worked for 25 years in social housing in Cardiff for a fully mutual co-operative of tenants in the 1990s. Will you give us an update on what developments have been made? You mentioned stock in your previous answer, but I am particularly interested in how you are going to make more land available.

3.00 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for that question. For his information, I was born into a shared house, although—[*Interruption.*] It was not shared with the Member. [*Laughter.*] It was shared owner occupation rather than a shared tenancy, but it was a shared property.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Please answer the question.

**Huw Lewis:** Forgive me, Presiding Officer. We are going through a sort of four Yorkshire men sketch. Was it three Yorkshire men? I cannot remember. [*Laughter.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are not going there either. Please get on with it and answer the question.

**Huw Lewis:** You cannot make more land available. Land is a finite resource. What matters is that we have land that can be developed at the point at which we have a viable financial model. We need the flow of capital and land to come together at the right time with a viable model for the future. My discussions with fellow Cabinet members have been intensive along these lines and further announcements will follow shortly.

**Vaughan Gething:** I have a similar point to make. We are aware of the increasing demand for social housing, with an estimate that an additional 100,000 non-market homes will be needed in the next 15 years. While I note your recent Progress article on legal

erioed, ac, yn y rhaglen llywodraethu, roedd addewid i ddatblygu a hyrwyddo ffyrdd newydd o ddarparu tir a chyllid ar gyfer tai. Fe wnaethoch gyfeirio yn eich atebion blaenorol at fentrau tai cydweithredol a, gyda llaw, bûm yn gweithio am 25 mlynedd yn y maes tai cymdeithasol yng Nghaerdydd i gwmni cwbl gydweithredol a chydffuddiannol tenantiaid yn y 1990au. A wnewch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am y datblygiadau a wnaed? Gwnaethoch sôn am stoc yn eich ateb blaenorol, ond mae gen i ddiddordeb arbennig gwybod sut y byddwch chi'n sicrhau bod mwy o dir ar gael.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Er gwybodaeth, cefais fy magu mewn tŷ a rannwyd, er—[*Torri ar draws.*] Ni chafodd ei rannu gyda'r Aelod. [*Chwerthin.*] Yr oedd yn berchen-feddiannaeth a rannwyd yn hytrach na thenantiaeth a rannwyd, ond yr oedd yn eiddo a rannwyd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Atebwch y cwestiwn os gwelwch yn dda.

**Huw Lewis:** Maddeuwch imi, Lywydd. Mae fel pe baem mewn sgetsh pedwar dyn o Swydd Efrog. Ai tri dyn o Swydd Efrog ydoedd? Nid wyf yn gallu cofio. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydym yn mynd i ddilyn y trywydd hwnnw chwaith. Bwriwch ati ac atebwch y cwestiwn os gwelwch yn dda.

**Huw Lewis:** Ni allwch sicrhau bod mwy o dir ar gael. Mae yna ben draw ar dir. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod gennym dir y gellir ei ddatblygu pan fo gennym fodel ariannol hyfyw. Mae arnom angen i'r llyf o gyfalaf a thir ddod at ei gilydd ar yr amser iawn gyda model hyfyw ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae fy nhrafodaethau gyda chyd-Aelodau Cabinet wedi dilyn y trywydd hwn yn ddwys a daw cyhoeddiadau pellach yn fuan.

**Vaughan Gething:** Mae gennyf bwynt tebyg i'w wneud. Gwyddom am y galw cynyddol am dai cymdeithasol, gydag amcangyfrif y bydd angen 100,000 ychwanegol o gartrefi nad ydynt ar y farchnad yn y 15 mlynedd nesaf. Er fy mod yn nodi eich erthygl

barriers to housing co-ops, as has already been mentioned, land availability is a big barrier. Can you confirm where the Welsh Government is on making publicly owned land available for social housing projects?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Cardiff South and Penarth for making that point. Publicly owned land is where we will begin. We have recently had the announcement concerning the land previously owned by the NHS surrounding the Caerphilly District Miners Hospital. That was the most recent example. More examples will follow shortly. However, all publicly owned land is within the focus of my attention, whether it is owned by the Welsh Government or other public sector partners, including local government.

#### Budd-dal Tai

**10. Mark Drakeford:** *Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o effaith newidiadau arfaethedig i'r budd-dal tai ar denantiaid yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0047(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Cardiff West for his question. I am very concerned about the financial implications for the vast majority of local housing allowance claimants. My officials are working closely, as I have said, with local authorities. We are also jointly funding a research programme, with the Department for Work and Pensions, to monitor the impacts of the changes.

**Mark Drakeford:** You have dealt extensively this afternoon with the impact of housing benefit changes on private sector tenants. However, these changes will have an impact on people in the public rented sector as well. I recently met a number of residents who were distressed due to the bills that they had now received because of the increase in non-dependant deductions from benefits, which they simply had no way of paying. When these people find themselves at the sharp end of all of this, they will begin to claim from the homelessness budgets. Can you give us an assurance that, as part of the monitoring that you are carrying out, you will be looking at the impact of housing benefit changes on public sector tenants and the

ddiweddar yn *Progress* ar rwystrau cyfreithiol i fentrau tai cydweithredol, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae argaeledd tir yn rhwystr mawr. A allwch gadarnhau lle mae Llywodraeth Cymru arni o ran rhyddhau tir cyhoeddus ar gyfer prosiectau tai cymdeithasol?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Dde Caerdydd a Phenarth am wneud y pwynt hwnnw. Byddwn yn dechrau gyda thir cyhoeddus. Cawsom y cyhoeddiad diweddar am y tir a arferai fod yn eiddo'r GIG o amgylch Ysbyty Dosbarth Glowyr Caerffili. Dyna oedd yr enghraifft ddiweddaraf. Bydd mwy o enghreifftiau yn dilyn yn fuan. Fodd bynnag, mae fy sylw ar yr holl dir cyhoeddus, boed yn eiddo i Lywodraeth Cymru neu bartneriaid eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys llywodraeth leol.

#### Housing Benefit

**10. Mark Drakeford:** *What assessment has the Minister made of the impact of proposed changes to housing benefit on tenants in Wales. OAQ(4)0047(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Orllewin Caerdydd am ei gwestiwn. Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn am y goblygiadau ariannol i'r mwyafrif helaeth o hawlwyd lwfans tai lleol. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio'n agos, fel y dywedais, gydag awdurdodau lleol. Yr ydym hefyd yn ariannu rhaglen ymchwil ar y cyd gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau er mwyn monitro effeithiau'r newidiadau.

**Mark Drakeford:** Yr ydych wedi sôn yn helaeth y prynhawn yma am effaith newidiadau mewn budd-dal tai ar denantiaid sector preifat. Fodd bynnag, bydd y newidiadau hyn effeithio ar bobl yn y sector rhentu cyhoeddus yn ogystal. Yn ddiweddar, cyfarfûm â nifer o drigolion a boenai am y biliau yr oeddynt bellach wedi eu cael yn sgîl y cynnydd mewn didyniadau o fuddaliadau sydd ddim yn ymwneud â dibynyddion, nad oedd ganddynt unrhyw fodd o'u talu. Pan fydd y bobl hyn yn canfod eu bod ar drugaredd y sefyllfa, byddant yn dechrau hawlio o'r cyllidebau digartrefedd. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni, fel rhan o'r gwaith monitro yr ydych yn ei wneud, y byddwch yn edrych ar effaith y newidiadau mewn budd-dal tai ar

impact that they will have on demands relating to homelessness in Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** Of course I will give that assurance. It is an issue of enormous concern. It causes me a great deal of worry, and I do not think that anyone has an exact picture, yet, of how this is going to affect the housing situation across Wales as a whole. The signals that we are getting early on from our surgeries, as the Member has mentioned—all of us have probably picked this up already—are very ominous indeed.

**Mark Isherwood:** Over 215,000 families in Wales will benefit from above indexation increases in child tax credit, 10,000 low-earning taxpayers in Wales will be taken out of tax all together and 187,000 of the 236,000 housing benefit recipients in Wales will be unaffected by the proposed changes. However, for those who will be affected—largely people in the private rented sector and largely those who are economically inactive—support provided by local authorities will be key.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Can you move on to the question, please?

**Mark Isherwood:** What engagement have you or your colleagues had with local authorities? Some have stated that they do not believe that they can do much to help tenants in these circumstances. The National Landlords Association states that it has already built in new reductions in the local housing allowance in Wales and change needs to be managed in local authorities—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I think that you have asked a question.

**Mark Isherwood:** The Department for Work and Pensions has provided local authorities with good practice guidance aimed at those who are most vulnerable.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Presiding Officer for assuring me that there was a question

denantiaid yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r effaith y byddant hwy yn ei gael ar ofynion sy'n ymwneud â digartrefedd yng Nghymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Wrth gwrs y rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw. Mae'n fater sy'n peri pryder enfawr. Mae'n achosi llawer iawn o bryder i mi, ac nid wyf yn credu bod gan unrhyw un ddarlun eto o sut yn union mae hyn yn mynd i effeithio ar y sefyllfa dai ar draws Cymru gyfan. Mae'r arwyddion cynnar a gawn yn ein cymorthfeydd, fel y crybwyllodd yr Aelod—mae'n debyg fod pob un ohonom wedi sylwi ar hyn yn barod—yn dywyll dros ben.

**Mark Isherwood:** Bydd dros 215,000 teulu yng Nghymru yn elwa o godiadau tu hwnt i fynegeio mewn credyd treth plant, bydd 10,000 o drethdalwyr sy'n ennill cyflogau isel yng Nghymru yn cael eu cymryd allan o dreth yn gyfan gwbl ac ni fydd 187,000 o'r 236,000 o'r rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau tai yng Nghymru yn cael eu heffeithio arnynt gan y newidiadau arfaethedig. Fodd bynnag, i'r rhai a fydd yn cael eu heffeithio—yn bennaf, pobl yn y sector rhentu preifat a phobl sy'n economaidd anweithgar—bydd cefnogaeth a ddaw gan awdurdodau lleol yn allweddol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A allwch chi symud ymlaen at y cwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Mark Isherwood:** Pa ymgysylltu a gawsoch chi neu eich cyd-Aelodau ag awdurdodau lleol? Mae rhai wedi dweud nad ydynt yn credu y gallant wneud llawer i helpu tenantiaid yn yr amgylchiadau hyn. Mae Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Landlordiaid yn dweud ei bod eisoes wedi cynnwys gostyngiadau newydd yn y lwfans tai lleol yng Nghymru a bod angen rheoli newid mewn awdurdodau lleol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn meddwl eich bod wedi gofyn cwestiwn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau wedi darparu canllawiau arferion da i awdurdodau lleol a anelwyd at y rhai sydd fwyaf agored i niwed.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Llywydd am fy sicrhau fod cwestiwn yng nghyfraniad Mark

embedded within Mark Isherwood's contribution. I really do not know what my response could be. [*Laughter.*]

Isherwood. Nid wyf yn gwybod pa fath o ymateb y dylwn ei roi. [*Chwerthin.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. If you do not want to respond, that will be fine. Thank you very much.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Os nad ydych yn dymuno ymateb, bydd hynny'n iawn. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

## **Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate**

### **Creu Swyddi Job Creation**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendment 2 in the name of Jane Hutt and amendments 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Peter Black.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliant 2 yn enw Jane Hutt a gwelliannau 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Peter Black.

*Cynnig NDM4838 William Graham*

*Motion NDM4838 William Graham*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i hwyluso creu swyddi drwy alluogi'r sector preifat i dyfu drwy:*

*1. Calls on the Welsh Government to facilitate the creation of jobs by enabling the private sector to grow through:*

*a) canolbwyntio gwariant datblygu economaidd ar fesurau sy'n hybu twf busnes yn uniongyrchol;*

*a) focusing economic development spending on measures that directly promote business growth;*

*b) adolygu rheoliadau Llywodraeth Cymru sy'n effeithio ar fusnesau yng Nghymru; ac*

*b) reviewing Welsh Government regulation that affects businesses in Wales; and*

*c) cynorthwyo pobl yng Nghymru i ennill sgiliau fel bod mwy o gyfleoedd cyflogaeth yn agored iddynt.*

*c) assisting people in Wales to gain the skills to access increased employment opportunities.*

**Nick Ramsay:** I move the motion.

**Nick Ramsay:** Cynigiaf y cynnig.

The debate that we have tabled for debate today is vitally important. It is important that the Assembly sends out a clear message that it is committed to job creation in Wales, and that Wales should have a balanced economy that supports both the public and private sectors. My group believes that the best route out of the current economic difficulties is to recognise the vital role of the public sector in Wales, but also to recognise that you need to create the correct conditions for the private sector to grow. Doing that would create jobs

Mae'r ddadl yr ydym wedi'i chyflwyno heddiw yn bwysig iawn. Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn anfon neges glir ei bod wedi ymrwymo i greu swyddi yng Nghymru, ac y dylai Cymru feddu ar economi gytbwys sy'n cefnogi'r sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat. Mae fy ngrŵp yn credu mai'r ffordd orau allan o'r anawsterau economaidd presennol yw cydnabod rôl hanfodol y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ond hefyd bod angen creu'r amodau cywir i'r sector preifat dyfu. Byddai hynny yn creu swyddi ac yn rhoi terfyn ar y

and end the reliance on public sector Government jobs that we have seen develop in Wales over the last decade.

Less than six weeks ago, we learnt that public sector employment in Wales had grown by over 35,800 between June 2010 and July 2011. A good thing, you might think. At the same time, private sector employment fell by close to 3.7 per cent—around 35,000. There was give and take there, but there was a loss of private sector employment. Do not get me wrong: I am pleased that people are in employment, whether it is in the public or private sector, but we have to ask how stable these jobs are and whether they can be sustained. I made the point when those figures were released that they were startling and worrying. The First Minister has admitted that the private sector is too small—not that the public sector is too large, but that the private sector is too small and needs to grow. The statistics that have been coming out over the last few weeks are proof that his concerns, not just mine, are not being translated into action that we would like to see. There is an urgent need for private sector growth and job creation, but we need to see the Welsh Labour Government taking far more action at a far greater pace than it has in the past. I appreciate that we have a relatively new Minister in post, as well as a Government that has not been in place for that long on its own in Wales, but the pace of change that we have seen has simply not been good enough. All of us need to recognise that and make sure that changes are made.

Unemployment in Wales has risen from 8.1 per cent in 1996 to 8.5 per cent in 2011. Compare that to the UK average of 7.6 per cent in March 2011 and 7.9 per cent 14 years earlier. I do not want to go too much into the statistics, but I think that it is worth noting that during the 11 years when we had a Labour Government in both Cardiff bay and Westminster, there was only one year when Welsh unemployment was lower than the UK average. If you dig down a bit deeper, the figures do not get any better. Employment in west Wales and the Valleys has risen by 4.3 per cent over the last six years and has doubled in east Wales, from 4 per cent in 2005 to 8.4 per cent this year. Let us get

ddibyniaeth ar swyddi sector cyhoeddus y Llywodraeth a welsom yn datblygu yng Nghymru dros y ddegawd diwethaf.

Lai na chwe wythnos yn ôl, dysgasom fod cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi tyfu fwy na 35,800 rhwng Mehefin 2010 a Gorffennaf 2011. Da hynny, fe dybiech. Ar yr un pryd, syrthiodd cyflogaeth yn y sector preifat yn agos i 3.7 y cant—tua 35,000. Bu ennill a cholli, ond collwyd cyflogaeth yn y sector preifat. Peidiwch â'm camddeall: yr wyf yn falch bod pobl mewn cyflogaeth, boed hynny yn y sector cyhoeddus neu breifat, ond mae'n rhaid gofyn pa mor sefydlog yw'r swyddi hyn ac a ellir eu cynnal. Gwneuthum y pwynt pan ryddhawyd y ffigurau hynny eu bod yn syfrdanol ac yn peri pryder. Cyfaddefodd y Prif Weinidog bod y sector preifat yn rhy fach—nid bod y sector cyhoeddus yn rhy fawr, ond bod y sector preifat yn rhy fach a bod angen iddo dyfu. Mae'r ystadegau a gyhoeddwyd dros yr wythnosau diwethaf yn brawf nad yw ei bryderon ef, nid dim ond fy rhai innau, yn cael eu cyfleu yn gamau yr hoffem eu gweld. Mae angen brys am dwf a chreu swyddi yn y sector preifat, ond mae angen inni weld Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru yn gweithredu yn llawer cynt nag y gwnaeth yn y gorffennol. Gwerthfawrogaf fod gennym Weinidog cymharol newydd yn ei swydd, yn ogystal â Llywodraeth sydd heb fod mewn grym ers hir ar ei phen ei hun yng Nghymru, ond ni fu cyflymder y newid a welsom yn ddigon da. Mae angen i bob un ohonom gydnabod hynny a gwneud yn siŵr bod newidiadau yn cael eu gwneud.

Mae diweithdra yng Nghymru wedi codi o 8.1 y cant yn 1996 i 8.5 y cant yn 2011. Cymharwch hynny â chyfartaledd y DU o 7.6 y cant ym Mawrth 2011 a 7.9 y cant 14 mlynedd yn gynharach. Nid wyf eisiau ymhelaethu gormod ar yr ystadegau, ond mae'n werth nodi yn ystod yr 11 mlynedd pan oedd gennym Lywodraeth Lafur ym mae Caerdydd a San Steffan, dim ond mewn un blwyddyn y bu diweithdra yng Nghymru yn is na chyfartaledd y DU. Os edrychwch ychydig yn ddyfnach, nid yw'r ffigurau yn gwella dim. Mae cyflogaeth yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd wedi codi 4.3 y cant dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf ac wedi dyblu yn nwyrain Cymru, o 4 y cant yn 2005 i 8.4 y

away from the silly arguments that this is all somehow come about since the coalition Government came to power in Westminster. Clearly, we are in a difficult economic situation, but these problems are structural and embedded, and it is about time that all parties in Wales got to grips with dealing with them.

It is not as if there has not been a spend of billions on economic development—

**Sandy Mewies** *rose*—

**Nick Ramsay:** I will give way in a moment, Sandy. There have been two rounds of European funds to tackle the deep-rooted unemployment problems in Wales. Many groups in Wales still remain as far from the labour market as they were before devolution. I will make this point before I let Sandy Mewies in: we had hoped that Wales would be in far too good a position to qualify for European structural funds as we move into the next round. However, now, while we may well need them, we lament the fact that we are in that position. I give way to Sandy Mewies.

**Sandy Mewies:** I thank Nick Ramsay for that. Nick, you have moved on slightly. As you know, growth is currently flat lining in Britain. I do not know who you think is responsible for it, but I think that there is something called plan A, which may well be responsible for it. Do you accept that the business people who were calling last weekend for George Osborne and David Cameron to consider a plan B, which they patently do not have, were asking the right question?

**Nick Ramsay:** At least the Government, when it came to power, had a plan. I have looked at what Ed Balls and Ed Miliband have proposed and, sadly, there is no plan A, B or C, there is just the plan criticise. The point of this debate, Sandy, is that it is not about throwing the usual rhetoric back and forth across the Chamber, it is about all of us recognising that we are in an economic—*[Interruption.]* You may laugh, but the people out there who are losing their jobs because of the massive debt racked up by the last Labour Government are not laughing, Minister. So, if

cant eleni. Gadewch i ni symud oddi wrth y dadleuon gwirion bod hyn i gyd rywsut wedi digwydd ers i'r Llywodraeth glymblaid ddod i rym yn San Steffan. Yn amlwg, yr ydym mewn sefyllfa economaidd anodd, ond mae'r problemau hyn yn strwythurol ac wedi bod yno ers tro byd, ac mae'n hen bryd i bob plaid yng Nghymru fynd i'r afael â hwy.

Nid yw fel pe na chafodd biliynau eu gwario ar ddatblygu economaidd—

**Sandy Mewies** *a gododd*—

**Nick Ramsay:** Ildiaf mewn munud, Sandy. Bu dau gylch o gyllid Ewropeaidd i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau diweithdra dybryd yng Nghymru. Mae sawl grŵp yng Nghymru yn dal mor bell o'r farchnad lafur ag yr oeddent cyn datganoli. Dywedaf hyn cyn ildio i Sandy Mewies: yr oeddem wedi gobeithio y byddai Cymru mewn sefyllfa llawer rhyw dda i fod yn gymwys i gael cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd wrth i ni symud at y cylch nesaf. Fodd bynnag, yn awr, er efallai y byddwn wir eu hangen, yr ydym yn gresynu at y ffaith ein bod yn y sefyllfa honno. Ildiaf i Sandy Mewies.

**Sandy Mewies:** Diolch i Nick Ramsay am hynny. Nick, yr ydych wedi symud ymlaen ychydig. Fel y gwyddoch, mae twf yn ei unfan ym Mhrydain ar hyn o bryd. Ni wn pwy yn eich barn chi sy'n gyfrifol am hynny, ond yr wyf yn meddwl bod prif gynllun a allai fod yn gyfrifol amdano. A ydych yn derbyn fod y bobl busnes a oedd yn galw y penwythnos diwethaf ar George Osborne a David Cameron i ystyried cynllun amgen, sydd yn amlwg ddim ganddynt, yn gofyn y cwestiwn iawn?

**Nick Ramsay:** O leiaf pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth i rym, yr oedd cynllun ganddi. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar beth mae Ed Balls ac Ed Miliband wedi ei gynnig ac, yn anffodus, nid oes prif gynllun, ail gynllun na thrydydd cynllun, dim ond cynllun beirniadu. Pwynt y ddadl hon, Sandy, yw nad mater o daflu'r rhethreg arferol yn ôl ac ymlaen ar draws y Siambr ydyw, ond y dylai pob un ohonom gydnabod ein bod, yn economaidd, mewn—*[Torri ar draws.]* Chwarddwch chi, ond nid chwerthin wna'r bobl allan yna sydd yn colli eu swyddi oherwydd y ddyled enfawr a

we could have a grown-up debate, it would be appreciated. We need to focus on economic development—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Gracious me, may we please remember that we are in Cardiff and not elsewhere in the UK?

**Nick Ramsay:** We are certainly not in Greece; we are in Cardiff, thank goodness. We need to focus on economic development spending to directly promote business growth. We need to review Welsh Government regulation that affects businesses in Wales, and we need to assist people in Wales to gain the skills to access increased employment opportunities. If Government money and support is put into the right places and the right schemes, things can get better. However, for too long, we have not seen money being put into the right areas. In fact, Ieuan Wyn Jones, the former Deputy First Minister, said in June:

‘Wales spent more money on economic development than other parts of the United Kingdom. I am not quite sure that we always derived value out of that.’

That was from a former Government Minister. There is another comment from Derek Vaughan, a Labour Member of the European Parliament in Brussels, who said:

‘I think there’s a recognition that the first round of European funding we had perhaps wasn’t spent wisely.’

It is worth noting that only seven of 66 Objective 1 regions became poorer, of which west Wales and the Valleys was one.

**David Rees:** You referred to Derek Vaughan’s statement. Do you recognise that he added to that that he believed that the second round was dealt with far better by the Welsh Government and that we were making progress?

**Nick Ramsay:** I do not have the second part

gronodd y Llywodraeth Lafur ddiwethaf, Weinidog. Felly, pe gallem gael dadl aeddfed, byddai’n cael ei werthfawrogi. Mae angen i ni ganolbwyntio ar ddatblygu economaidd— [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Annwyl dad, a allwn ni efallai gofio mai yng Nghaerdydd ydym ni ac nid yn rhywle arall yn y DU?

**Nick Ramsay:** Yn sicr nid ydym yng Ngroeg; yr ydym yng Nghaerdydd, diolch byth. Mae angen i ni ganolbwyntio ar wario ar ddatblygu economaidd i hyrwyddo busnes yn uniongyrchol. Mae angen i ni adolygu rheoleiddio gan Lywodraeth Cymru sy’n effeithio ar fusnesau yng Nghymru, ac mae angen i ni helpu pobl yng Nghymru i ennill y sgiliau i gyrraedd mwy o gyfleoedd cyflogaeth. Os yw arian a chymorth y Llywodraeth yn cael eu rhoi yn y manau iawn a’r cynlluniau iawn, gall pethau wella. Fodd bynnag, ers rhy hir, nid ydym wedi gweld arian yn cael ei roi yn y meysydd cywir. Yn wir, dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, y cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, ym mis Mehefin:

‘bod Cymru wedi gwario mwy o arian ar ddatblygu economaidd na rhannau eraill o’r Deyrnas Unedig. Nid wyf yn gwbl sicr a ydym bob amser wedi cael gwerth o hynny’.

Cyn-Weinidog y Llywodraeth a ddywedodd hynny. Mae sylw arall gan Derek Vaughan, Aelod Llafur o Senedd Ewrop ym Mrwsel, a ddywedodd:

Credaf fod yna gydnabyddiaeth efallai na chafodd y rownd gyntaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd a oedd gennym ei wario yn ddoeth.

Mae’n werth nodi mai dim ond saith o’r 66 rhanbarth Amcan 1 a aeth yn dlotach, ac mae gorllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd yn un ohonynt.

**David Rees:** Cyfeiriasoch at ddatganiad Derek Vaughan. A ydych yn cydnabod iddo ychwanegu at hynny ei fod o’r farn bod ymdriniaeth Llywodraeth Cymru o’r ail rownd llawer yn well a’n bod yn gwneud cynnydd?

**Nick Ramsay:** Nid yw ail ran y dyfyniad gen



of the quote, David Rees, as you would expect, so I am not going to quote it. However, the first part clearly shows that whatever he added on to it—probably when he was worried that he had said too much before speaking to his colleagues—the first part is revealing. However, I hear you what you say.

On a positive note, I wholeheartedly welcome the enterprise zone programme that the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science has introduced. It seemed to take a very long time to reach that decision, but we got there and our party believes that, in taking that decision on enterprise zones, the Government is on the right track to attract new businesses and employment opportunity to promote the private sector.

It still has to remain a concern that Wales's business birth rate was the third lowest of the UK's nations and regions in 2009. However, it should be pointed out that 70 per cent of all employment growth in Wales between 2003 and 2010 came from small and medium-sized enterprises. We appreciate any efforts that the Minister for business and the Government are making to support SMEs. This, surely, is where support and encouragement from the Welsh Government should be focused and not on continuing to create jobs in the Welsh public sector. Why does the Welsh Government still not give the private sector the support that it needs?

I have mentioned the Minister's support for enterprise zones and I also support the review of business rates that was announced recently. This is a step in the right direction. Again, it is good to see that a Welsh Conservative policy that we put forward before the elections has finally been adopted. Maybe if we had been in power, it would have been adopted at the time that it should have been, but better late than never—let us be positive. I also recognise that a number of task and finish groups have been set up, and I hope that the Minister will tell us when she expects those to report, so that they can be successfully evaluated.

i, David Rees, fel y byddech yn ddisgwyl, felly nid wyf yn mynd i'w ddyfynnu. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhan gyntaf yn dangos yn glir, beth bynnag yr ychwanegodd ato—pan oedd yn poeni mae'n siŵr ei fod wedi dweud gormod cyn siarad â'i gyd-Aelodau—mae'r rhan gyntaf yn ddadlennol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn clywed beth a ddywedwch.

Ar nodyn cadarnhaol, croesawaf yn wresog y rhaglen parth menter mae'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth wedi ei chyflwyno. Mae'n edrych fel pe bai wedi cymryd hir iawn i wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, ond yr ydym wedi ei wneud ac mae ein plaid yn credu bod y Llywodraeth, wrth wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw ar barthau menter, ar y trywydd iawn i ddenu busnesau newydd a chyfleon cyflogaeth i hyrwyddo'r sector preifat.

Mae'n rhaid ei fod yn bryder o hyd mai cyfradd genedigaethau busnes Cymru oedd y trydydd isaf o wledydd a rhanbarthau'r DU yn 2009. Fodd bynnag, dylid nodi bod 70 y cant o'r holl dwf cyflogaeth yng Nghymru rhwng 2003 a 2010 wedi dod o fentrau bach a chanolig. Yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi unrhyw ymdrechion y mae'r Gweinidog busnes a'r Llywodraeth yn eu gwneud i gefnogi busnesau bach a chanolig. Dyma, yn sicr, lle y dylid canolbwyntio cefnogaeth ac anogaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru ac nid ar barthau i greu swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Pam fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn dal heb roi'r cymorth sydd ei angen i'r sector preifat?

Yr wyf wedi sôn am gefnogaeth y Gweinidog i barthau menter ac yr wyf hefyd yn cefnogi'r adolygiad o drethi busnes a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar. Dyma gam yn y cyfeiriad cywir. Unwaith eto, mae'n dda gweld bod polisi a gyflwynodd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig cyn yr etholiadau wedi ei fabwysiadu o'r diwedd. Pe baem wedi bod mewn grym, efallai y byddai wedi cael ei fabwysiadu pan y dylai, ond gwell hwyr na hwyrach—gadewch i ni fod yn gadarnhaol. Yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod bod nifer o grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffenn wedi cael eu sefydlu, a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym pryd y mae'n disgwyl iddynt adrodd, fel y gallant gael eu gwerthuso yn llwyddiannus.

3.15 p.m.

Turning to the Government amendments, we will support amendment 2, which calls on the Government to consult business and other stakeholders in order to find the most effective way to support the Welsh economy. This is a good amendment. It is common sense. Businesses cannot be ordered to grow. You cannot create innovation and demand; only individuals can do that. However, listening to individuals and businesses is a step in the right direction. I have had a number of meetings with the Minister and entrepreneurs in Wales, and I have raised concerns that I have about other aspects of policy with Finance Wales. I hope that the Minister will be looking to address those issues.

In closing, I know that the Government points to the Future Jobs fund, on which we have been criticised in the past. In areas where the Government—the previous Welsh Labour Government—has had good intentions in bringing in things such as the Future Jobs fund, it has been criticised on the basis that it costs too much, particularly relative to the cost of other interventions that may be equally effective. My party values the work that the Government has done to encourage job creation, but we feel that more could be done. We will support that Government amendment, and I hope that Members in the Chamber support our motion today.

*Gwelliant 1 Jocelyn Davies*

*Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*ymateb i'r toriadau anghymesur i gyllideb cyfalaf Cymru gan Lywodraeth y DU drwy chwilio am ddulliau arloesol o godi arian cyfalaf, ac eithrio Mentrau Cyllid Preifat, i hwyluso prosiectau isadeiledd.*

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies

Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y drafodaeth hon ac i gyflwyno'r gwelliant yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Mae'r ddadl hon yn un o'r dadleuon cyffredinol hynny sydd mewn perygl o roi

Gan droi at welliannau'r Llywodraeth, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2, sy'n galw ar y Llywodraeth i ymgynghori â busnesau a rhanddeiliaid eraill er mwyn canfod y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o gefnogi economi Cymru. Mae hwn yn welliant da. Synnwyr cyffredin ydyw. Nid yw'n bosibl gorchymyn busnesau i dyfu. Ni allwch greu arloesedd a galw; dim ond unigolion all wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae gwrando ar unigolion a busnesau yn gam yn y cyfeiriad cywir. Cefais sawl cyfarfod gyda'r Gweinidog ac entrepreneuriaid yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf wedi mynegi fy mhryderon am agweddau eraill ar bolisi gyda Chyllid Cymru. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny.

Wrth gloi, gwn fod y Llywodraeth yn cyfeirio at gronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol, y cawsom ein beirniadu arni yn y gorffennol. Mewn meysydd lle yr oedd gan y Llywodraeth—y Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru blaenorol—fwriadau da o ran cyflwyno pethau fel cronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol, cafodd ei beirniadu ar y sail ei bod yn costio gormod, yn enwedig o'i gymharu â chost ymyriadau eraill a allai fod yn llawn mor effeithiol. Mae fy mhlaid yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwaith a wnaeth y Llywodraeth i annog creu swyddi, ond teimlwn y gellid gwneud mwy. Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant y Llywodraeth, a gobeithio y bydd Aelodau yn y Siambwr yn cefnogi ein cynnig heddiw.

*Amendment 1 Jocelyn Davies*

*Add as new sub-point at end of motion:*

*responding to the disproportionate cuts to the Welsh capital budget by the UK government by seeking innovative ways of raising capital funds, apart from PFI, to facilitate infrastructure projects.*

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Thank you for the opportunity to contribute to this debate and to move the amendment in the name of Jocelyn Davies. This debate is one of those general debates that is at risk of

enw drwg i'r lle hwn. Er enghraifft, wrth i'r ddadl hon gael ei hagor, nid ydym wedi clywed unrhyw beth, mewn gwirionedd, am y cynnig ei hun a'r manylion sydd ynddo. Wrth gwrs, mae Plaid Cymru o blaid cael sector busnes preifat bywiog a llwyddiannus. Mae busnesau bach a mawr yn hanfodol i gymuned iach; hebddynt, nid oes mentergarwch a blaengaredd, ac nid ydych am gystadlu gyda goreuon Ewrop a'r byd heb sector preifat iach. Mae hynny, mae'n debyg, yn rhywbeth y byddai pobl Twm, Dic a Harri yn yr adeilad hwn yn cytuno arno.

O edrych ar y cynnig ei hun, mae cyfeiriad at fesurau sy'n 'hybu twf busnes yn uniongyrchol'. A yw hynny'n cynnwys pethau fel band eang, neu system drafnidiaeth gydlynus, ynteu a yw'n cynnwys dim byd mwy nag arian uniongyrchol i hybu busnesau? Ni chlywsom yr un gair am hynny gan y cynigydd. Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu at hynny. Mae'r cynnig yn mynd yn ei flaen i sôn am ddileu rheoliadau sy'n effeithio ar fusnesau. A gawn ni wybod pa reoliadau yw'r rhai hynny? A ydych yn sôn am ddeddfwriaeth iechyd a diogelwch? A ydych am ddileu hynny, neu rannau o hynny? Os ydych yn dod â chynnig fel hyn gerbron, gan siarad yn gyffredinol am y ffaith bod pethau'n ddrwg a'ch bod am i bethau wella, nid wyf yn siŵr beth a gyflawnir.

**Nick Ramsay:** I am grateful to the—I should not keep calling you the Minister; you are not; you are the former Minister—Assembly Member for giving way. With regard to what you said about broadband, of course, we fully accept that, but the point about this debate, Alun Ffred Jones, is that it is a debate about jobs. We felt that it was important to put a specific focus on jobs, and specifically job development in the private sector. There is a whole raft of other things that I could have mentioned, but that was the focus.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn gytûn bod angen mwy o swyddi a bod angen creu swyddi, ond y cwestiwn yw beth yn union yr ydych am ei wneud.

Trof yn awr at welliant Plaid Cymru, sy'n sôn yn benodol am un o'r ffyrdd y gallwn ei

giving this place a bad name. For example, in the opening of the debate, we have not heard anything about the motion itself and the details contained therein. Of course, Plaid Cymru is in favour of having a successful and vibrant private business sector. Large and small businesses are vital to healthy communities; without them, there is no entrepreneurship and innovation, and we will not be able to compete with the best in Europe and the world without a healthy private sector. That is something every Tom, Dick and Harry in this building would agree with.

However, when you get to the motion itself, there is a reference to measures that 'directly promote business growth'. Does that include things such as broadband, or an integrated transport system, or is it referring to direct funding for the promotion of businesses? We did not hear a word about that from the mover of the motion. I am surprised by that. The motion goes on to talk about abolishing regulations affecting businesses. Can you tell us which regulations these are? Are you talking about health and safety legislation? Are you going to abolish that, or parts of that? If you table a motion such as this and then talk in general terms about things being bad and say that you want things to improve, we are not sure what is accomplished.

**Nick Ramsay:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r—ni ddylwn ddal i'ch galw'n Weinidog, gan nad ydych; y cyn-Weinidog ydych chi—Aelod Cynulliad am ildio. O ran yr hyn a ddywedoch am fand eang, wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn derbyn hynny'n llwyr, ond y pwynt am y ddadl hon, Alun Ffred Jones, yw mai dadl am swyddi ydy hi. Roeddem yn teimlo ei fod yn bwysig i roi ffocws penodol ar swyddi, ac yn benodol datblygu swyddi yn y sector preifat. Mae llu o bethau eraill y gallwn fod wedi eu crybwyll, ond dyna oedd y ffocws.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I am sure that we would all agree that more jobs are needed and that we need to create jobs, but the question is what exactly you would do.

I turn now to the Plaid Cymru amendment, which refers specifically to one of the ways

ddefnyddio i wneud yr hyn yr ydych yn sôn amdano, sef creu mwy o gyflogaeth. Yr wyf am gyfeirio—gan fod ein gwelliant yn sôn am fater yr ydym wedi sôn amdano nifer o weithiau yn y Siambr dros y chwe mis diwethaf—at yr adroddiad Compass a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Mae'n ddiddorol gweld bod cymaint o elfennau o'r adroddiad hwnnw yn cyd-fynd â'r dadleuon yr ydym wedi bod yn eu gwneud yn y Cynulliad ers chwe mis. Mae'n cyfeirio at fentrau cyllid preifat. Awgrym Compass, gyda llaw, yw dileu holl ddyledion PFI ym Mhrydain, sy'n gyfystyr â £200 biliwn mewn ad-daliadau. Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn ddychrynllyd, ac yn profi unwaith eto pa mor ffôl oedd Llywodraethau Thatcher, Blair a Brown wrth ddilyn y trywydd hwn a rhoi'r fath ddyled ar y sector cyhoeddus. Diolch i'r drefn ein bod ni yng Nghymru wedi defnyddio PFI yn gynnil iawn, a bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi llwyddo i atal hynny yn gyfan gwbl.

Mae adroddiad Compass hefyd yn argymhell creu banc buddsoddi—ar lefel Brydeinig, wrth gwrs—a fyddai'n canolbwyntio ar sectorau carbon isel megis tai, trafnidiaeth ac ynni adnewyddadwy, gyda golwg ar hybu busnesau o'r newydd. Eto, yr oedd hyn yn elfen ganolog yn ein maniffesto o dan Adeiladu dros Gymru.

Mae anawsterau, wrth gwrs, o ran creu model hyd braich o'r Llywodraeth i ddenu arian preifat i gyflawni gwaith ar ran y sector cyhoeddus. Beth bynnag fo'r anawsterau hynny, credaf ei bod yn weddol glir, a bod pawb yn derbyn, nad oes digon o arian i'w gael yn y sector cyhoeddus ar ei ben ei hun a bod angen denu arian o'r sector preifat i hybu cynlluniau cyfalaf a ddaw â budd economaidd a chymdeithasol, gan hybu'r economi'n uniongyrchol.

Yr wyf wedi siarad â chynrychiolwyr y diwydiant adeiladu yn ddiweddar, ac maent yn pledio ar y Llywodraeth i gyhoeddi rhaglen gyfalaf gynhwysfawr i godi hyder yn y diwydiant, creu gwaith i gwmnïau lleol a chynyddu cyflogaeth. Maent yn pwysleisio ei bod yn hollbwysig bod y rhaglen honno yn cynnwys cynlluniau cyfalaf drwy Gymru gyfan. Mae un neu ddau o gynlluniau mawr yn debycach o roi gwaith i gwmnïau rhyngwladol, ac ni fyddai hynny'n dod â

we can achieve what you are talking about, namely creating more employment. I want to mention—as our amendment refers to a matter that we have raised a number of times in this Chamber over the past six months—the Compass report that was published yesterday. It is interesting to see that so many elements of that correspond to arguments that we have made in the Assembly over the past six months. It refers to private finance initiatives. Compass' suggestion is to write off all of the PFI debts in Britain, which correspond to a figure of £200 billion in repayments. That is a frightening figure that shows how foolish the Thatcher, Blair and Brown Governments were in following this route and placing such a heavy burden on the public sector. Thank goodness that we in Wales have used PFI sparingly, and that the One Wales Government managed to avoid it altogether.

The Compass report also recommends the creatio of an investment bank—on a British level, of course—that would focus on low carbon sectors such as housing, transport and renewable energy, with a view to promoting neww businesses. Again, this was a central plank of our manifesto under Build for Wales.

There are difficulties, of course, in creating a model at arm's length from Government to attract private sector money for public sector work. Whatever those difficulties, I believe that it is fairly clear, and that everyone accepts, that there is not enough money in the public sector alone and that money needs to be attracted from the private sector to facilitate capital projects that will bring economic and social benefits, directly benefitting the economy.

I have recently spoken to representatives of the construction industry, and they are pleading for the Government to announce a comprehensive capital programme to build confidence in the industry, create work for local companies and increase employment. They stress that it is vital that such a programme includes capital schemes right across Wales. One or two large schemes are more likely to provide work for international companies, which would not directly benefit

budd uniongyrchol i Gymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed gan y Gweinidog pa waith sy'n mynd rhagddo i ddenu arian o ffynonellau preifat ar gyfer rhaglen gynhwysfawr i'r dyfodol.

*Gwelliant 2 Jane Hutt*

*Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*ymgyngori â'r byd busnes a rhanddeiliaid eraill ynglyn â'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o gefnogi economi Cymru.*

**The Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science (Edwina Hart):** I move amendment 2 in the name of Jane Hutt.

*Gwelliant 3 Peter Black*

*Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*sefydlu trefn ariannu drwy gynyddrannau treth fel ffordd o alluogi awdurdodau lleol i gyllido prosiectau adfywio economaidd mawr.*

*Gwelliant 4 Peter Black*

*Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*anolbwyntio Twf Swyddi Cymru ar gyfleoedd hyfforddi yn y sector preifat.*

*Gwelliant 5 Peter Black*

*Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*sefydlu cronfa arloesedd i ysgogi datblygiad yr economi wybodaeth.*

**Eluned Parrott:** I move amendments 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Peter Black.

At this time, creating jobs is undoubtedly one of the most important issues facing the Chamber. While I welcome this additional opportunity to discuss ideas, I have to say that I share Alun Ffred Jones's disquiet about the lack of specific detail in this motion—frankly, there is a slight drift towards the

Wales. I look forward to hearing from the Minister what work is being done to attract money from private sources for a comprehensive programme in the future.

*Amendment 2 Jane Hutt*

*Add as new sub-point at end of motion:*

*consulting with business and other stakeholders on the most effective way to support the Welsh economy.*

**Y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Jane Hutt.

*Amendment 3 Peter Black*

*Add as new sub point at end of motion:*

*establishing tax increment financing as a way of enabling local authorities to fund large-scale economic regeneration projects.*

*Amendment 4 Peter Black*

*Add as new sub point at end of motion:*

*focusing Jobs Growth Wales on training opportunities in the private sector.*

*Amendment 5 Peter Black*

*Add as new sub point at end of motion:*

*developing an innovation fund to stimulate the development of the knowledge economy.*

**Eluned Parrott:** Cynigiau welliannau 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Peter Black.

Ar hyn o bryd, heb amheuaeth, creu swyddi yw un o'r materion pwysicaf sy'n wynebu'r Siambr. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r cyfle ychwanegol hwn i drafod syniadau, rhaid i mi ddweud fy mod yn rhannu anesmwythyd Alun Ffred Jones am y diffyg manylion penodol yn y cynnig—a dweud y gwir, i

realm of truisms. I would hope that the motion's point a,

'focusing economic development spending on measures that directly promote business growth',

would go without saying. I am sure that we are not expecting the Minister to tell us that she is going to focus her attention on measures that will not promote business growth. The operative question really is 'How?' I would be interested to hear from the Conservative group, in summing up, what specific measures they would suggest with regard to point a.

Reviewing regulation is also extremely important to help businesses that are struggling with the burden of red tape. Red tape can hit Welsh businesses disproportionately, because so many of our enterprises are small and medium-sized. They have limited access to such things as professional business support, which makes it more difficult for them to bear those regulatory burdens. For that reason, I am very glad that the Westminster Government has already taken several steps in this direction, one of which is to undertake a public audit of the 21,000 or so regulations currently in force. Another step that it has taken is a one-in, one-out principle to ensure that, when new regulations are introduced, they are not additional, but instead of or to improve what already exists. I hope that the Welsh Government watches this process and responds by reviewing some of its own regulations in this regard.

With regard to skills, I am sure that the Welsh Government will tell us that it has invested heavily in training programmes. However, it is crucial that we offer people the chance to gain skills for a purpose, not just a collection of certificates. It is a really sad fact that only 32 per cent of people on EU-funded training programmes have found employment. That has to be a real cause for concern. That is why we have moved amendment 4. We think it vital that training opportunities provided under Jobs Growth Wales deliver the skills that our private sector needs. For that to happen, it logically follows

raddau, mynegi gwirebion y mae'r cynnig yn ei wneud. Byddwn yn gobeithio y byddai pwynt a y cynnig,

'canolbwyntio gwariant datblygu economaidd ar fesurau sy'n hybu twf busnes yn uniongyrchol'

yn amlwg heb orfod cael ei ddweud. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad ydym yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthym ei bod yn mynd i ganolbwyntio ei sylw ar fesurau na fydd yn hybu twf busnes. Y cwestiwn mewn gwirionedd yw 'Sut?' Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb clywed gan y grŵp Ceidwadol, wrth gloi'r ddadl, pa fesurau penodol y byddent yn awgrymu o ran pwynt a.

Mae adolygu rheoleiddio hefyd yn hynod o bwysig i helpu busnesau sy'n cael trafferth gyda baich biwrocratiaeth. Gall tâp coch daro busnesau Cymru'n anghymesur, gan fod cynifer o'n mentrau yn fach a chanolig. Mae ganddynt fynediad cyfyngedig at bethau megis cymorth busnes proffesiynol, sy'n ei gwneud hi'n fwy anodd iddynt ysgwyddo'r beichiau rheoleiddio hynny. Oherwydd hynny, yr wyf yn falch iawn bod Llywodraeth San Steffan eisoes wedi cymryd sawl cam yn y cyfeiriad hwn, ac un ohonynt yw cynnal archwiliad cyhoeddus o'r 21,000 neu fwy o reoliadau sydd mewn grym. Cam arall a gymerodd yw'r egwyddor un i mewn, un allan i sicrhau, pan fydd rheoliadau newydd yn cael eu cyflwyno, nad ydynt yn ychwanegol, ond yn disodli neu wella'r hyn sy'n bodoli eisoes. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwylio'r broses hon ac yn ymateb trwy adolygu rhai o'i rheoliadau ei hun yn hyn o beth.

O ran sgiliau, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn dweud wrthym ei bod wedi buddsoddi'n helaeth mewn rhaglenni hyfforddi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cynnig cyfle i bobl ennill sgiliau at bwrpas, nid dim ond casgliad o dystysgrifau. Mae'n ffaith drist iawn mai dim ond 32 y cant o bobl ar raglenni hyfforddi a ariennir gan yr UE sydd wedi cael gwaith. Rhaid i hynny fod yn destun pryder gwirioneddol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cynnig gwelliant 4. Credwn ei fod yn hanfodol bod cyfleoedd hyfforddi a ddarperir o dan Twf Swyddi Cymru yn darparu'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen

that we must involve the private sector substantially in developing the details of this programme. I welcome the Minister's previous statements recognising that need.

The intention of amendment 3 is to offer a practical suggestion for helping local authorities to drive economic growth and regeneration. Tax increment financing has been mentioned before, but we hope that the Welsh Government will give an indication soon of its intentions in this regard.

Finally, amendment 5 reiterates the importance of supporting innovation in Wales as a driver for growth. Creating an innovation fund could help research organisations to develop more patents, contributing to the creation of more spin-out companies and more opportunities for the high-levels jobs that we need. It would also help with growing an economy for Wales that is more robust for being based on the quality of our innovation, rather than the cheapness of our workforce. I do not want to live in a Wales that is famously cheap—I want to live in a Wales that is famously good. If we work in a positive way and pool ideas, we can achieve that. Therefore, I ask you to support the amendments tabled in the name of Peter Black.

**Mark Isherwood:** After 12 years of boom and bust, we have heard the rhetoric. Is it too much to hope that this Welsh Government can now, at last, support job creation by enabling the business sector to grow, by targeting economic development spending on business growth and by working with business to deliver the skills needed for people to access employment opportunities?

Thanks to self-deluding socialism and minds trapped by a discredited nineteenth-century ideology, youth unemployment in Wales has been rising to record levels since 2005. Wales has the highest proportion of 18 to 24-year-olds not in education, employment or training. A total of 628,000 people of working age in Wales are not in work, and the benches opposite laugh like guilty children.

ar ein sector preifat. Er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd, mae'n dilyn bod yn rhaid i ni gynnwys y sector preifat yn sylweddol wrth ddatblygu manylion y rhaglen hon. Croesawaf ddatganiadau blaenorol y Gweinidog yn cydnabod yr angen hwnnw.

Bwriad gwelliant 3 yw cynnig awgrym ymarferol i helpu awdurdodau lleol i yrru twf economaidd ac adfywio. Mae ariannu drwy gynyddrannau treth wedi cael ei grybwyll o'r blaen, ond gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhoi syniad yn fuan o'i fwriad yn hyn o beth.

Yn olaf, mae gwelliant 5 yn ailadrodd pwysigrwydd cefnogi arloesi yng Nghymru i sbarduno twf. Gallai greu cronfa arloesi helpu sefydliadau ymchwil i ddatblygu mwy o batentau, gan gyfrannu at greu mwy o gwmnïau dilynol a chreu mwy o gyfleoedd ar gyfer y swyddi lefel-uchel sydd eu hangen arnom. Byddai hefyd yn helpu gyda thyfu economi Cymru sy'n fwy cadarn oherwydd ei fod yn seiliedig ar ansawdd ein harloesi, yn hytrach na pha mor rhad yw ein gweithlu. Nid wyf am fyw mewn Cymru sydd yn enwog am fod yn rhad—yr wyf am fyw mewn Cymru sydd yn enwog am fod yn dda. Os gweithiwn mewn ffordd gadarnhaol a rhannu syniadau, gallwn gyflawni hynny. Felly, gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enw Peter Black.

**Mark Isherwood:** Ar ôl 12 mlynedd o ffyniant a methiant, yr ydym wedi clywed y rhethreg. A yw'n ormod gobeithio y gall Llywodraeth Cymru nawr gefnogi creu swyddi drwy alluogi'r sector busnes i dyfu, drwy dargedu gwariant datblygu economaidd ar dwf busnes a thrwy weithio gyda busnes er mwyn darparu'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen er mwyn i bobl gael mynediad at gyfleoedd cyflogaeth?

Oherwydd sosialaeth hunan-dwyllodrus a meddyliau sy'n gaeth i ideoleg tanseiliedig o'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, mae diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc yng Nghymru wedi codi i'r lefelau uchaf a welwyd erioed ers 2005. Cymru sydd â'r gyfran uchaf o bobl 18 i 24 oed nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Mae cyfanswm o 628,000 o bobl o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn gweithio, ac mae'r

meinciau gyferbyn yn chwethin fel plant euog.

Before they respond with their one-size-fits-all excuse that this is all the UK coalition Government's fault, note that this is almost identical to the position applying in Wales before the recession started, when one in three working age adults were not in work, which is double the UK rate. It is a matter of shame that, despite spending billions on economic development, including two rounds of European Union funds, the Welsh Government failed to tackle this.

**Kenneth Skates:** Do you not find it rather difficult to put that together with the fact that, on the eve of the 2008 financial crash, your current Chancellor agreed to every penny of the Labour UK Government's spending policy, and that you as a banker in the 1990s and early 2000s wanted further deregulation of the financial services sector?

**Mark Isherwood:** You will find that, when I spoke on finance in 2003, 2004 and 2005, I warned of what was coming. [*Laughter.*] You laughed, and you are still laughing like guilty, naughty children. At the time of devolution, Wales had the poorest figure for gross value added wealth creation among the devolved UK nations and regions, and 12 years later, it is still bottom. Year on year, the gap has widened.

Added to this, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation found that barriers to work in the tax and benefit system had increased from 2000 under Gordon Brown. Despite years of boom before bust, too many communities had become places of intergenerational worklessness, hopelessness and dependency. Having inherited deep and complex social problems, the UK coalition Government has had to spend time, energy and resources putting right what went wrong.

Before the recession began, the UK had over 4 million people stuck on out-of-work benefits, many for a decade or more. Over 10

Cyn iddynt ymateb gyda'u hesgus un ateb i bopeth mai bai Llywodraeth glymblaid y DU yw hyn, sylwch fod hwn bron union yr un fath â'r sefyllfa a fu yng Nghymru ers cyn i'r dirwasgiad ddechrau, pan oedd nad oedd un o bob tri oedolyn o oedran gweithio mewn gwaith, ddwywaith cyfradd y DU. Mae'n gywilydd o beth, er gwario biliynau ar ddatblygu economaidd, gan gynnwys dau gylch o arian gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, fod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi methu mynd i'r afael â hyn.

**Kenneth Skates:** Onid ydych yn ei chael hi braidd yn anodd cyplysu hynny â'r ffaith, ar y diwrnod cyn y cwmp ariannol yn 2008, fod eich Canghellor presennol wedi cytuno i bob ceiniog o bolisi gwariant Llywodraeth Lafur y DU, ac eich bod chi fel banciwr yn y 1990au a dechrau'r 2000au am weld dadreoleiddio pellach ar y sector gwasanaethau ariannol?

**Mark Isherwood:** Fe welwch, pan siaradais ar gyllid yn 2003, 2004 a 2005, fy mod wedi eich rhybuddio am yr hyn oedd i ddod. [*Chwethin.*] Fe chwethoch, ac yr ydych yn dal i chwethin fel plant euog, drwg. Ar adeg datganoli, Cymru oedd â'r ffigur gwaethaf ar gyfer creu cyfoeth gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ymysg cenedloedd a rhanbarthau datganoledig y DU, a 12 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae'n dal i fod ar y gwaelod. O flwyddyn i flwyddyn, mae'r bwlch wedi lledu.

At hyn, canfu Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree bod rhwystrau i weithio yn y system dreth a budd-dal wedi cynyddu ers 2000 o dan Gordon Brown. Er blynyddoedd o ffyniant cyn y methiant, yr oedd gormod o gymunedau wedi troi'n lleoedd lle'r oedd diweithdra o un genhedlaeth i'r nesaf, anobaith a dibyniaeth. Ar ôl etifeddu problemau cymdeithasol dwfn a chymhleth, gorfu Llywodraeth glymblaid y DU dreulio amser, egni ac adnoddau i ddatrys yr hyn a aeth o'i le.

Cyn i'r dirwasgiad ddechrau, roedd gan y DU dros 4 miliwn o bobl yn glwm i fudd-daliadau diweithdra, llawer ohonynt ers



per cent of these were in Wales, which has just 5 per cent of the UK's population. We had one of the highest levels of unsecured personal debt in western Europe. Social mobility had virtually ground to a halt, and the section of society on the lowest incomes had become static and entrenched. Too many children born into such communities find that, at best, they will remain in the same condition as their parents.

At the same time, spending on working age welfare rocketed by 50 per cent in real terms under Labour before the recession. Over 1 million UK children had a parent addicted to drugs or alcohol, with income inequality at its worst level for a generation. The last UK Government left us with a welfare system that treated symptoms, not causes. Is it any wonder that we face such entrenched levels of family breakdown, inactivity, poverty and dependency?

Ending this failure is like turning a supertanker around, with the Welsh Government often like a tug pulling in the opposite direction. At a UK level, the work programme is about giving new skills to people far from the jobs market. The voluntary and private sectors are paid only when they get people into work and, as they help people sustain it by developing the work habit, delivering value for money. Those able to work will immediately seek employment and join the work programme; others who could work in the future will get tailored support.

3.30 p.m.

Under the system inherited from Labour, some people lose up to 96p of every £1 earned in work because of the way in which their benefits are withdrawn. Universal credit is not due to come into effect until 2013, so stop this scaremongering; many more amendments will be coming your way. Universal credit will ensure that people are better off in work than out of it, and give taxpayers better value for money by placing work at the heart of the benefit system and helping our people to access the jobs that are

degawd neu fwy. Roedd dros 10 y cant o'r rhain yng Nghymru, sydd â dim ond 5 y cant o boblogaeth y DU. Yr oedd gennym un o'r lefelau uchaf o ddyled bersonol heb ei warantu yng ngorllewin Ewrop. Yr oedd symudedd cymdeithasol bron â dod i stop, ac yr oedd y rhan o gymdeithas ar yr incwm isaf yn ddisymud ac wedi ymwreiddio. Mae gormod o blant sy'n cael eu geni i mewn i gymunedau o'r fath yn canfod y byddant, ar y gorau, yn aros yn yr un cyflwr â'u rhieni.

Ar yr un pryd, mae gwariant ar les i'r rheini o oedran gweithio wedi codi'n sylweddol o 50 y cant mewn termau real o dan Lafur cyn y dirwasgiad. Roedd gan dros 1 miliwn o blant yn y DU riant yn gaeth i gyffuriau neu alcohol, gydag anghydraddoldeb incwm ar ei waethaf ers cenhedlaeth. Fe'n gadawyd gan Lywodraeth ddiwethaf y DU gyda system les sy'n trin symptomau, nid achosion. A oes syndod ein bod yn wynebu lefelau mor uchel o deuluoedd yn chwalu, anweithgarwch, tlodi a dibyniaeth?

Mae ymdrin â'r methiant hwn yn debyg i droi llong danc enfawr, gyda Llywodraeth Cymru yn aml fel cwch tynnu yn tynnu i'r cyfeiriad arall. Ar lefel y DU, mae'r rhaglen waith yn ymwneud â rhoi sgiliau newydd i bobl ymhell oddi wrth y farchnad swyddi. Mae'r sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat yn cael eu talu ond pan fyddant yn cael pobl i mewn i waith ac, wrth iddynt helpu pobl i'w gynnal drwy ddatblygu arfer gwaith, cyflawni gwerth am arian. Mae'r rhai sy'n gallu gweithio yn ceisio cyflogaeth ar unwaith ac yn ymuno â'r rhaglen waith; bydd eraill a allai weithio yn y dyfodol yn cael cymorth wedi'i deilwra.

O dan y system a etifeddwyd gan Lafur, mae rhai pobl yn colli hyd at 96c o bob £1 a enillir mewn gwaith oherwydd y ffordd y caiff eu budd-daliadau eu tynnu'n ôl. Nid yw credyd cynhwysol i fod i ddod i rym tan 2013, felly, dewch â'r codi bwganod hyn i ben; bydd nifer mwy o welliannau yn dod eich ffordd. Bydd credyd cynhwysol yn sicrhau bod pobl yn well eu byd mewn gwaith nag allan ohono, ac yn rhoi gwell gwerth am arian i drethdalwyr drwy roi gwaith wrth wraidd y system budd-daliadau a helpu ein pobl i gael

available.

We must respond to the latest research from the Forum of Private Business, which shows that more must be done to help small firms tackle high business costs. As the Federation of Small Businesses in Wales says, everyone looking for a job could be employed if every small or medium-sized enterprise recruited one more person. However, as we heard, in the year to June 2011, private sector employment in Wales fell as public sector employment continued to grow. The Confederation of British Industry has said that Wales has a growing reputation as one of the most difficult places in the United Kingdom for public procurement, and the former head of the Welsh Development Agency has said that there has been expenditure in excess of £100 million per annum that has produced next to nothing in the form of outcomes. This is not year zero; it is the start of year 13.

**Ann Jones:** When I looked at this motion, I thought that the Welsh Conservatives might have outlined the specific discussions they have had with their Westminster colleagues about Wales's unemployment problems, but, surprise surprise, there has been no reference to that from the speakers so far. Mark, you can shout the facts out, but shouting does not make us think that you are actually more angry. In this Chamber, week by week, we have had confirmation of how Cameron's Conservatives could not care less about this place. We have yet to see if their arguments and pledges carry any weight. In contrast to that, Welsh Labour is pushing ahead with practical policies, such as Jobs Growth Wales, which is specifically aimed at providing training, apprenticeships and job placements for young people in Wales. That is badly needed across Wales, particularly within areas in my own constituency. The Conservatives' first job in Government was to axe the Future Jobs Fund. The message that the UK Government sends to the people of Rhyl—the people who I represent who are without work—in doing that is a damning one, far worse than Norman Tebbit's 'get on your bike and look for work' message, which I am old enough to remember. That was far worse, because, since then, what you have

mynediad at y swyddi sydd ar gael.

Rhaid inni ymateb i'r ymchwil diweddaraf gan y Fforwm Busnes Preifat, sy'n dangos bod rhaid gwneud mwy i helpu cwmnïau bach i fynd i'r afael â chostau busnes uchel. Fel y dywed y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yng Nghymru, gallai pawb sy'n chwilio am swydd gael eu cyflogi pe bai pob menter fach neu ganolig eu maint yn recriwtio un person ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, fel y clywsom, yn y flwyddyn i fis Mehefin 2011, gostyngodd cyflogaeth yn y sector preifat yng Nghymru tra parhaodd gyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus i dyfu. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi dweud yn gynyddol bod gan Gymru enw am fod yn un o'r lleoedd mwyaf anodd yn y Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer caffael cyhoeddus, ac mae cyn-bennaeth Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi dweud bod gwariant dros £100 miliwn y flwyddyn wedi cynhyrchu fawr ddim ar ffurf canlyniadau. Nid y flwyddyn sero yw hon; dechrau blwyddyn 13 yw hi.

**Ann Jones:** Pan edrychais ar y cynnig hwn, yr oeddwn yn credu efallai y byddai Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi amlinellu'r trafodaethau penodol y maent wedi eu cael gyda'u cymheiriaid yn San Steffan ynghylch problemau diweithdra Cymru, ond, er mawr syndod, nid oes cyfeiriad at hynny wedi bod gan y siaradwyr hyd yn hyn. Mark, gallwch weiddi ffeithiau allan, ond nid yw gweiddi yn gwneud inni feddwl eich bod mewn gwirionedd yn fwy dig. Yn y Siambr hon, o wythnos i wythnos, yr ydym wedi cael cadarnhad na allai Ceidwadwyr Cameron poeni llai am y lle hwn. Yr ydym eto i weld os yw eu dadleuon ac addewidion yn rhai o bwys. Mewn cyferbyniad â hynny, mae Llafur Cymru yn gwthio ymlaen â pholisïau ymarferol, megis Twf Swyddi Cymru, sydd wedi anelu'n benodol at ddarparu hyfforddiant, prentisiaethau a lleoliadau swyddi ar gyfer pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Y mae gwir angen hynny ledled Cymru, yn arbennig o fewn ardaloedd yn fy etholaeth fy hun. Swydd gyntaf y Ceidwadwyr mewn Llywodraeth oedd cael gwared ar Gronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol. Mae'r neges y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn anfon at y bobl yn Rhyl—y bobl a gynrychiolaf sydd heb waith—wrth wneud hynny yn un damniol, ac yn llawer gwaeth na neges Norman Tebbit

been doing is slashing the tyres of those bikes, if those people could afford bikes to get on them in the first place.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Millions of pounds of European funding has been poured into Rhyl by the Welsh Government in order to regenerate the area, and it has failed miserably. The problem is not with spending money, but with the delivery by the Welsh Government.

**Ann Jones:** You may say that, but, your Government, from 1979 onwards, destroyed housing in the west end. [*Interruption.*] You can shout all you like, but we have had to stop the tanker and turn it around. That is what we are doing, and I am proud of what this Welsh Government has done for Rhyl. I am proud of the north Wales regeneration area. I suggest that the Conservatives start to think about what they want to do for economic development instead of sitting there and telling me that we have all failed. There are 4,000 placements to be created in Wales and that forms just a part of the Government's actions that will have a strong focus on vocational skills. We have also improved the standard of our universities through the much needed reform—

**Nick Ramsay** *rose*—

**Ann Jones:** I am not going to give way; I may do later if I have time. The whole sum of the Welsh Government's effort is only part of that picture. The economic policies from Westminster are still holding back growth in the UK. That is why most of us on these benches here will be supporting Ed Balls, the shadow chancellor, with his five point plan for growth. [*Laughter.*] Laugh all you like, it is there. I believe that we should reverse the VAT hike, because it will save families £450 per year. Smile all you like, you did not win the election. This is a responsible policy that is committed to growth and to keeping and creating jobs. When the recession hit the Assembly in the last term, the Welsh Labour Minister for finance brought forward capital

'neidiwch ar eich beic a chwiliwch am waith', yr wyf yn ddigon hen i'w gofio. Yr oedd hynny'n waeth o lawer, oherwydd, ers hynny, yr hyn rydych wedi bod yn ei wneud yw torri teiars y beiciau hynny, os gallai'r bobl hynny fforddio beiciau yn y lle cyntaf.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Mae miliynau o bunnoedd o arian Ewropeaidd wedi'u harllwys i mewn i'r Rhyl gan Lywodraeth Cymru er mwyn adfywio'r ardal, ac mae wedi methu'n druenus. Nid gwario'r arian yw'r broblem, ond cyflawni gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

**Ann Jones:** Gallech ddweud hynny, ond, dinistriodd eich Llywodraeth, o 1979 ymlaen, tai yn y pen gorllewinol [*Torri ar draws.*] Gallwch weiddi, ond rydym wedi gorfod stopio'r tancer a'i wyrdroi. Dyna beth yr ydym yn ei wneud, ac yr wyf yn falch o'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud ar gyfer y Rhyl. Yr wyf yn falch o ardal adfywio gogledd Cymru. Yr wyf yn awgrymu bod y Ceidwadwyr yn dechrau meddwl am beth y maent am ei wneud ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yn hytrach nag eistedd yno a dweud wrthyf ein bod oll wedi methu. Mae 4,000 o leoliadau i'w creu yng Nghymru ac mae hynny'n ffurfio dim ond rhan o weithredoedd y Llywodraeth y bydd â ffocws cryf ar sgiliau galwedigaethol. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gwella safon ein prifysgolion drwy ddiwygio sydd wir ei angen—

**Nick Ramsay** *a gododd*—

**Ann Jones:** Nid wyf am ildio; efallai y gwnaf yn nes ymlaen os bydd gennyf amser. Dim ond rhan o'r darlun hwnnw yw'r cyfan o ymdrech Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae polisiau economaidd o San Steffan yn dal yn ôl twf yn y DU. Dyna pam y bydd y rhan fwyaf ohonom ar y meinciau hyn yn cefnogi Ed Balls, canghellor yr wrthblaid, yn ei gynllun pum pwynt ar gyfer twf. [*Chwerthin.*] Gallwch chwerthin cymaint â hoffwch, y mae yno. Credaf y dylem wrthdroi'r cynnydd mewn TAW, oherwydd bydd yn arbed £450 y flwyddyn i deuluoedd. Gallwch wenu, ni wnaethoch ennill yr etholiad. Mae hwn yn bolisi cyfrifol sydd wedi ymrwymo i dwf a chadw a chreu swyddi. Pan darodd y dirwasgiad y Cynulliad yn y tymor diwethaf,

projects worth £700 million to create jobs. The Welsh Conservatives have no basis to criticise as long as their Chancellor watches our economy slide in a stubborn attempt to save while ignoring the need for a plan B.

We have heard about the business rate relief scheme that came from these benches, which allows half of Wales's small businesses to pay no rates, while 20 per cent have significant reductions. It is a practical way to help businesses while ensuring that we do not slash budgets such as education, which risked losing 20 per cent of its funding had the Tories in Wales won the last election.

As for the successes of business in Wales, it is encouraging to note that the value of our exports has doubled since 1999, with specific growth seen in products from energy and engineering to biotechnology and pharmaceuticals. That is a positive. To turn to a positive in my constituency, St Asaph business park, which was initially created by the Tories in the 1980s and then left empty, it is thanks to Labour's investment and the efforts of Chris Ruane MP that, I am delighted to say, it now hosts nearly 3,000 jobs. The technium, in particular, has been especially successful. I was delighted to see a representative of the centre join the First Minister on his recent visit to China.

We have no reason to believe that the Welsh Conservatives would take the action that is needed to support growth. Their colleagues in London refused to do so, so why should we listen to them here in Wales?

**Byron Davies:** I support the motion in the name of William Graham. The motion before us today recognises simple truths, namely that Wales desperately needs a thriving private sector to create long-term sustainable jobs and we need to focus on economic development, spending on measures that directly promote business growth, a method

gwnaeth y Gweinidog Llafur dros gyllid gyflwyno prosiectau cyfalaf gwerth £700 miliwn i greu swyddi. Nid oes unrhyw sail gan Geidwadwyr Cymru i feirniadu cyhyd ag y mae eu Canghellor yn gwylio ein heconomi'n llithro mewn ymgais ystyfnig i arbed tra'n anwybyddu'r angen am gynllun B.

Yr ydym wedi clywed am y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes a ddaeth o'r meinciau hyn, sy'n caniatáu i hanner busnesau bach Cymru i beidio â thalu ardrethi, tra bod 20 y cant yn derbyn gostyngiadau sylweddol. Mae'n ffordd ymarferol i helpu busnesau wrth sicrhau nad ydym yn torri cyllidebau megis addysg, a oedd mewn perygl o golli'r 20 y cant o'i gyllid os oedd y Torïaid yng Nghymru wedi ennill yr etholiad diwethaf.

O ran y llwyddiannau busnes yng Nghymru, mae'n galonogol i nodi bod gwerth ein hallforion wedi dyblu ers 1999, gyda thwf penodol a welwyd mewn cynhyrchion o ynni a pheirianneg i fiotechnoleg a chynhyrchion fferyllol. Mae hynny'n gadarnhaol. I droi at rywbeth positif yn fy etholaeth i, parc busnes Llanelwy, a grëwyd yn wreiddiol gan y Torïaid yn y 1980au ac wedyn cafodd ei adael yn wag, diolch i fuddsoddiad y Blaid Lafur ac ymdrechion Chris Ruane AS, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud, mae bellach yn cynnal bron i 3,000 o swyddi. Yn benodol, mae'r *technium* wedi bod yn arbennig o lwyddiannus. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o weld cynrychiolydd o'r ganolfan yn ymuno â'r Prif Weinidog ar ei ymweliad diweddar â Tsieina.

Nid oes gennym unrhyw reswm i gredu y byddai Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cymryd y camau sydd eu hangen i gefnogi twf. Gwrthododd eu cyd-Aelodau yn Llundain gwneud hynny, felly pam y dylem wrando arnynt yma yng Nghymru?

**Byron Davies:** Cefnogaf y cynnig yn enw William Graham. Mae'r cynnig ger ein bron heddiw yn cydnabod gwirioneddau syml, sef bod ar Gymru daer angen sector preifat ffyniannus i greu swyddi cynaliadwy tymor hir ac mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar ddatblygu economaidd a gwariant ar fesurau sy'n uniongyrchol yn hybu twf busnes, dull

that the Welsh Development Agency understood only too well. However, I do not want to dwell on the huge mistake of abolishing the WDA; no matter how significant the effect of the unbelievably short-sighted nature of the decision, we must move on and open Wales up for business.

**Sandy Mewies:** I think that it is true to say that I and Members on this bench would not deny that we have to support and encourage a thriving private sector. However, I heard Nick Ramsay talk about the public sector and jobs and saying 'Well, we don't really mind' but I do not think that any of you will come out and say that public sector jobs are as valuable to people in Wales as private sector jobs. You should be telling your UK Government colleagues to stop attacking the sector and harming Wales.

**Byron Davies:** I do not think that they are. In supporting this motion, I want to concentrate on two key issues: the importance of integrated public transport and investing in our infrastructure of roads, railways and air travel. Since being elected, I have met with many businesses across South Wales West and organisations across Wales, such as the freight association. The message is clear from business: invest in our transport infrastructure.

First, I want to highlight the missed opportunities, mainly in terms of EU funding. We only have to look at how many of the Objective 1 regions became poorer while having full access to these funds. Wales is one of the seven that became poorer, out of 66. A big difference between our nation's use of European moneys and that of other countries' is the reluctance to use large sums for visionary transport and infrastructure projects. If you travel to other countries, both member states and accession countries, it is hard to miss the 'part-funded by the EU' signs on the sides of buses, on roads and on other transport projects. The funding streams are designed to be flexible, and there is no excuse for not pushing the case for investment in our transport infrastructure. This underlines the key message that this is

yr oedd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn deall yn dda. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am ymhelaethu ar y camgymeriad enfawr o ddiddymu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru; ni waeth pa mor sylweddol yw effaith natur anhygoel diffyg gweledigaeth y penderfyniad, rhaid inni symud ymlaen ac agor Cymru ar gyfer busnes.

**Sandy Mewies:** Credaf ei fod yn wir i ddweud na fyddaf i nac Aelodau ar y fainc hon yn gwadu bod yn rhaid inni gefnogi ac annog sector preifat ffyniannus. Fodd bynnag, clywais Nick Ramsay yn sôn am y sector cyhoeddus a swyddi ac yn dweud 'Wel, nid oes ots gennym, mewn gwirionedd', ond ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw un ohonoch yn dod allan ac yn dweud bod swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus mor werthfawr i bobl yng Nghymru â swyddi yn y sector preifat. Dylech ddweud wrth eich cyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU i roi'r gorau i ymosod ar y sector a niweidio Cymru.

**Byron Davies:** Ni chredaf eu bod. Wrth gefnogi'r cynnig hwn, yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar ddau fater allweddol: pwysigrwydd trafndiaeth gyhoeddus integredig a buddsoddi yn ein seilwaith ffyrdd, rheilffyrdd a theithio awyr. Ers cael fy ethol, yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â nifer o fusnesau ar draws Gorllewin De Cymru a sefydliadau ledled Cymru, megis y gymdeithas cludo nwyddau. Mae'r neges yn glir gan fusnes: buddsoddwch yn ein seilwaith trafndiaeth.

Yn gyntaf, hoffwn dynnu sylw at y cyfleoedd a gollwyd, yn bennaf o ran cyllid yr UE. Mae dim ond angen inni edrych ar faint y rhanbarthau Amcan 1 a aeth yn dlotach tra'n cael mynediad llawn at y cronfeydd hyn. Mae Cymru yn un o'r saith a ddaeth yn dlotach, allan o 66. Y gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng defnydd arian Ewropeaidd ein cenedl a gwledydd eraill yw'r amharodrwydd i ddefnyddio symiau mawr ar gyfer prosiectau gweledigaethol trafndiaeth a seilwaith. Os ydych yn teithio i wledydd eraill, aelod-wladwriaethau a gwledydd sydd wedi'u derbyn, mae'n anodd methu arwyddion 'ariennir yn rhannol gan yr UE' ar ochrau bysiau, ar ffyrdd ac ar brosiectau trafndiaeth eraill. Cynllunnir y ffrydiau ariannu i fod yn hyblyg, ac nid oes esgus am beidio gwthio'r achos dros fuddsoddi yn ein seilwaith

not primarily a funding issue. The funding is there, should we wish to grasp it. To quote the former Minister responsible for economic development, as did Nick Ramsay earlier,

‘I understood when I was a Minister in the last Government...that Wales spent more money on economic development than other parts of the United Kingdom. I am not quite sure that we always derived value out of that’.

It was an honest assessment, damning of both his administration and, more widely, an indication of the lacklustre nature of the Labour-led Government. This is backed up by statistical evidence that, for example, compares Wales’s investment with that of the midlands, which received over double. Again, this is not a funding issue, but an issue of competence.

There are real effects arising from this inability to provide an integrated transport system or to invest substantially in transport infrastructure. The effects mean that people across Wales are struggling to access the job market. This is compounded in rural areas, and I am sure that we can think of areas in our constituencies and regions that are difficult to reach and to travel around without a car. For an increasing number of people, a car is a luxury that they can ill afford especially when looking for employment. There are areas in South Wales West for example that could be far better connected. We have a railway and a bus network, which rarely connects at a hub—

**Mick Antoniw:** Do you accept that the Thatcher Government’s privatisation and deregulation of the bus service was a major contribution to breaking up integrated public transport?

**Byron Davies:** I prefer to look to the future and not go back 20, 30 or 40 years, but that is the organisation that we have opposite us. There are areas in South Wales West that could be far better connected. We have

trafnidiaeth. Mae hyn yn tanlinellu’r neges allweddol nad yw hwn yn fater ariannu yn bennaf. Mae’r cyllid yno, os ydym yn dymuno gafael ynddo. I ddyfynnu’r cyn-Weinidog a oedd yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu economaidd, fel y gwnaeth Nick Ramsay yn gynharach,

Deallais pan oeddwn yn Weinidog yn y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf...fod Cymru wedi gwario mwy o arian ar ddatblygu economaidd na rhannau eraill o’r Deyrnas Unedig. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr ein bod bob amser wedi deillio gwerth allan o hynny.

Yr oedd yn asesiad gonest, yn ddamniol o’i weinyddiaeth ac, yn fwy eang, yn arwydd o natur di-fflach y Llywodraeth dan arweiniad Llafur. Ategir hyn gan dystiolaeth ystadegol sydd, er enghraifft, yn cymharu buddsoddi Cymru â hwnnw yng nghanolbarth Lloegr, a dderbyniodd dros ddwbl. Unwaith eto, nid mater ariannu yw hwn, ond mater o gymhwysedd.

Ceir effeithiau go iawn sy’n deillio o’r anallu hwn i ddarparu system drafnidiaeth integredig neu i fuddsoddi’n sylweddol mewn seilwaith trafnidiaeth. Mae’r effeithiau yn golygu bod pobl ledled Cymru yn cael trafferth i gael mynediad at y farchnad swyddi. Mae hyn yn waeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem feddwl am ardaloedd yn ein hetholaethau a’n rhanbarthau sy’n anodd eu cyrraedd ac i deithio o gwmpas heb gar. Ar gyfer nifer cynyddol o bobl, mae car yn foethusrwydd ni allant fforddio, yn enwedig wrth chwilio am gyflogaeth. Ceir ardaloedd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru er enghraifft y gellid eu cysylltu llawer gwell. Mae gennym reilffordd a rhwydwaith bysiau, sy’n anaml yn cysylltu mewn hwb—

**Mick Antoniw:** A dderbyniwch yr oedd preifateiddio a dadreoleiddio’r gwasanaeth bws gan Lywodraeth Thatcher yn gyfraniad mawr tuag at chwalo trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig?

**Byron Davies:** Mae’n well gennyf edrych i’r dyfodol ac nid mynd yn ôl 20, 30 neu 40 mlynedd, ond honno yw’r drefn sydd gyferbyn â ni. Ceir ardaloedd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru y gellid eu cysylltu llawer gwell.

railway networks and a bus network that rarely connects. In Gower, we have potential bus routes that would open up the peninsula for the younger generation to and from the job market in Swansea and Cardiff. Indeed, if you look at west Wales and the potential for travelling and gaining employment in Cardiff, some of these young people have no hope of getting jobs in the legal services or the insurance industry in Cardiff because they cannot get there and back in a day.

Another worrying trend can be seen in the aviation sector. Cardiff Airport—our Welsh gateway to the world—needs urgent direction from this Government. I commend this motion to you. Other Members have spoken at length about focusing on economic development. This is all important, but the most effective way to facilitate the creation of jobs and to grow the private sector is through investment in infrastructure and by enabling young persons across Wales to gain access to the job market through integrated public transport.

**Vaughan Gething:** I am pleased to have an opportunity to speak in this debate. There is already a clear and obvious difference between the approach of this Government and the Government in the UK. It has been highlighted a number of times here, but you cannot get away from Conservatives in this Chamber talking as if all the ills that affect Wales today have only come about since devolution and are only the responsibility of any Government here. It is as if what the UK Government has done has not actually happened. It is as if there is no responsibility for having record unemployment. The last time unemployment was this high, John Major was still Prime Minister and I was still at school. We have record youth unemployment. That is not an accident; that is a direct result of what you have done in Westminster. Before the Tories came to power and started cutting, there was a recovery and growth of about 2.6 per cent. Now, it is about 0.5 per cent. There is a huge difference in approach. Paul Krugman, a Nobel economics laureate, has called Cameron's approach 'fantasy', and I do not

Mae gennym rwydweithiau rheilffordd a rhwydwaith bysiau sy'n cysylltu yn anaml iawn. Yng Ngŵyr, mae gennym lwybrau bws posibl a fyddai'n agor y penrhyn ar gyfer y genhedlaeth iau i gael mynediad at y farchnad swyddi yn Abertawe a Chaerdydd. Yn wir, os edrychwch chi ar orllewin Cymru a'r potensial ar gyfer teithio ac ennill cyflogaeth yng Nghaerdydd, nid oes unrhyw obaith gan rai o'r bobl ifanc hyn o gael swyddi yn y gwasanaethau cyfreithiol neu'r diwydiant yswiriant yng Nghaerdydd oherwydd na allant fynd yno ac yn ôl mewn diwrnod.

Gellir gweld tuedd arall sy'n peri pryder yn y sector hedfan. Mae angen ar faes awyr Caerdydd—porth Cymru i'r byd—gyfeiriad brys gan y Llywodraeth hon. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn i chi. Mae Aelodau eraill wedi siarad yn faith am ganolbwyntio ar ddatblygu economaidd. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig, ond y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol i hwyluso'r broses o greu swyddi ac i dyfu'r sector preifat yw trwy fuddsoddi mewn seilwaith a galluogi personau ifanc ledled Cymru i gael mynediad at y farchnad swyddi drwy drafndiaeth gyhoeddus integredig.

**Vaughan Gething:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Eisoos, mae gwahaniaeth clir ac amlwg rhwng dull y Llywodraeth hon a'r Llywodraeth yn y DU. Tynnwyd sylw ato nifer o weithiau yn y fan hon, ond ni allwch ddianc rhag y Ceidwadwyr yn y Siambr hon yn siarad fel pe bai'r holl broblemau sy'n effeithio ar Gymru heddiw wedi dod ers datganoli yn unig a chyfrifoldeb unrhyw Lywodraeth yma ydynt yn unig. Mae fel pe na bai'r hyn a wnaed gan Lywodraeth y DU wedi digwydd mewn gwirionedd. Mae fel pe na bai gyfrifoldeb am ddiweithdra sydd ar ei uchaf. Y tro diwethaf yr oedd diweithdra mor uchel â hwn, roedd John Major yn dal i fod yn Brif Weinidog, ac yr oeddwn i'n dal i fod yn yr ysgol. Mae gennym y lefelau uchaf erioed o ddiweithdra ymysg pobl ifanc. Nid yw hynny'n damwain; mae hynny'n ganlyniad uniongyrchol o'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i wneud yn San Steffan. Cyn i'r Torïaid ddod i rym a dechrau torri, cafwyd adferiad a thwf o tua 2.6 y cant. Bellach, y mae tua 0.5 y cant. Mae gwahaniaeth enfawr yn yr ymagwedd. Mae Paul Krugman, llawryfog economeg Nobel, wedi galw

think there are many here who would disagree with that. He points out that none of the countries who had embarked on a major programme of austerity in response to the economic crisis have seen a trampoline effect in private sector jobs and private sector growth. We see that here in this country as well. Low interest rates are not the product of austerity. Low interest rates were here before Cameron came into power.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you to the Member for Cardiff South and Penarth for taking an intervention. What about the 0.5 million jobs that have been created in the private sector? Are they not new jobs since the coalition Government formed in May 2010?

**Vaughan Gething:** The point you fail to recognise there is the loss in other jobs in both the private and the public sectors. That is the problem. This Government in Wales has identified the need and taken the opportunity to create enterprise zones. We have taken proactive action with ReAct and ProAct to try and support people in employment. Those were distinctive policies that were supported and led here by a Labour-led Government and they were never supported by Members on the opposite benches. We have also recognised for many years the need to increase and improve the number of apprentices across Wales. I know that Byron does not like to return to history, but apprenticeships crashed as a direct result of UK Tory Government policy.

**Mohammad Asghar** *rose—*

**Vaughan Gething:** I may take an intervention if I have more time later. I would, however, agree with the previous contributor about the value of transport and infrastructure. There are some questions here about how we shift priorities and whether we are prepared to continue to spend all of our transport moneys on road or to seriously invest in rail and greater integrated transport. Every Member in this Chamber, regardless of party, should support this Government in its bid to get Valleys electrification.

ymagwedd Cameron yn ‘ffantasi’, ac nid wyf yn credu bod llawer yma a fyddai’n anghytuno â hynny. Mae’n nodi nad yw un o’r gwledydd sydd wedi dechrau ar raglen fawr o lymder mewn ymateb i’r argyfwng economaidd wedi gweld effaith trampolîn mewn swyddi yn y sector preifat a thwf y sector preifat. Gwelwn hynny yma yn y wlad hon hefyd. Nid yw cyfraddau llog isel yn ganlyniad i lymder. Roedd cyfraddau llog isel yma cyn i Cameron ddod i rym.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch i’r Aelod dros Dde Caerdydd a Phenarth am dderbyn ymyriad. Beth am yr 0.5 miliwn o swyddi a grëwyd yn y sector preifat? Onid ydynt yn swyddi newydd ers ffurfio’r Llywodraeth glymblaid ym mis Mai 2010?

**Vaughan Gething:** Y pwynt nad ydych yn cydnabod yw bod colled mewn swyddi eraill yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a preifat. Dyna’r broblem. Mae’r Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru wedi nodi’r angen a manteisio ar y cyfle i greu ardaloedd menter. Rydym wedi cymryd camau rhagweithiol gyda ReAct a ProAct i geisio cefnogi pobl mewn cyflogaeth. Roedd y rheiny’n bolisiâu unigryw a gefnogir ac arweinir yma gan y Llywodraeth dan arweiniad Llafur ac ni chefnogwyd hwy byth gan Aelodau ar y meinciau gyferbyn. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cydnabod ers nifer o flynyddoedd yr angen i gynyddu a gwella nifer y prentisiaid ar draws Cymru. Gwn nad yw Byron yn hoffi dychwelyd at hanes, ond plymiodd prentisiaethau o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i bolisi Llywodraeth Doriaidd y DU.

**Mohammad Asghar** *a gododd—*

**Vaughan Gething:** Efallai y gwnaf dderbyn yr ymyriad os bydd gennyf fwy o amser yn ddiweddarach. Byddwn i, fodd bynnag, yn cytuno gyda’r cyfrannwr blaenorol am werth trafndiaeth a seilwaith. Ceir rhai cwestiynau yma ynghylch sut yr ydym yn newid blaenoriaethau ac a ydym yn barod i barhau i wario’r holl arian trafndiaeth ar ffyrdd neu i’w fuddsoddi o ddifrif mewn rheilffyrdd a mwy o drafndiaeth integredig. Dylai pob Aelod yn y Siambr hon, waeth beth fo’u plaid, cefnogi’r Llywodraeth hon yn ei chais i drydaneiddio’r Cymoedd.



3.45 p.m.

If we do not achieve a significant improvement in the way that we get people around our towns, valleys and cities, then we will not see a significant improvement in our economy. One point in the motion that I agree with is the need to improve skills. However, again, if you look at what our Government is doing, there is a direct focus on skills, and that is not just in the qualification review and the realisation that we need to improve skills and outcomes in normal education; there is also a commitment to improving skills while people are in work, and to keep them in work. I was very proud to be part of celebrating some of that success in my former role as the president of the Wales Trades Union Congress, because trade union learning and education is a fantastic opportunity for people who may have problems with basic skills. People are much more likely to go to their trade union and say that they cannot read or write properly than to their employer, because, understandably, they would be worried about losing their jobs. If you go to your employer and say that you cannot read properly, you may not be too surprised if you do not have a job at the end of the month. Trade union education helps to deliver and get past that barrier. It is about employers and trade unions working in a genuine partnership. All of us should want to support that, rather than looking for opportunities to take a pot shot at our colleagues in the trade unions.

I am particularly pleased to note recent announcements by this Government on looking more closely, with a task and finish group, at city region planning, and at what we could and should do to look at wider planning for economic regeneration and growth. I am also pleased to see today's announcement on a business rates review. We have to recognise that, in this place, we have significant handicaps that are given to us by the UK Government. There are things that we cannot do here, but I am pleased to support a Government that is doing all that it can in recognition of the fact that we need a bigger, better and stronger private sector and that we

Os nad ydym yn gwella'r ffordd yr ydym yn cludo pobl o gwmpas ein trefi, cymoedd a dinasoedd yn sylweddol, ni fyddwn yn gwella ein heconomi yn sylweddol. Rwyf yn cytuno ag un pwynt yn y cynnig, sef bod angen gwella sgiliau. Fodd bynnag, unwaith eto, os edrychwch chi ar beth mae ein Llywodraeth yn ei wneud, ceir canolbwynt penodol ar sgiliau, nid dim ond yn yr adolygiad o gymwysterau a'r ffaith i ni sylweddoli bod angen gwella sgiliau a chanlyniadau mewn addysg arferol; ceir ymrwymiad hefyd i wella sgiliau tra bod pobl mewn gwaith, ac i'w cadw mewn gwaith. Roeddwn yn falch iawn o fod yn rhan o ddathlu rhywfaint o'r llwyddiant hwnnw pan oeddwn yn llywydd Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru, gan fod dysgu ac addysgu trwy'r undeb llafur yn gyfle rhagorol i bobl a allai fod â phroblemau gyda sgiliau sylfaenol. Mae pobl yn llawer mwy tebygol o fynd at eu hundeb llafur a dweud nad ydynt yn gallu darllen ac ysgrifennu yn iawn nag at eu cyflogwr, gan y byddent, yn ddealladwy, yn poeni am golli eu swyddi. Os ydych yn mynd at eich cyflogwr a dweud nad ydych yn gallu darllen yn iawn, efallai na fyddwch yn synnu gormod na fydd gennych swydd ar ddiwedd y mis. Mae addysg drwy'r undeb llafur yn helpu i gyflawni ac i oresgyn y rhwystr hwnnw. Mae'n ymwneud â chyflogwyr ac undebau llafur yn cydweithio mewn partneriaeth go iawn. Dylem i gyd fod eisiau cefnogi hynny, yn hytrach na chwilio am gyfleoedd i ymosod ar ein cydweithwyr yn yr undebau llafur.

Rwy'n arbennig o falch o nodi'r cyhoeddiadau diweddar gan y Llywodraeth hon ar edrych yn fwy manwl, gyda grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, ar gynllunio dinas-ranbarth, a'r hyn y gallem ac y dylem fod yn ei wneud i edrych ar gynllunio ehangach ar gyfer adfywio a thwf economaidd. Roeddwn hefyd yn falch o weld cyhoeddiad heddiw ar adolygu trethi busnes. Rhaid i ni gydnabod, yn y lle hwn, fod Llywodraeth y DU yn ein rhoi o dan anfantais sylweddol. Mae pethau na allwn eu gwneud yma, ond rwy'n falch o gefnogi Llywodraeth sy'n gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i gydnabod y ffaith ein bod angen meddu ar sector preifat mwy, gwell a

need to maintain our public sector, rather than cutting it instead of trying to support the private sector.

**Mohammad Asghar:** The Welsh Government needs to take serious and substantial action to help grow the Welsh private sector. Both the First Minister and Peter Hain admit that the private sector in Wales is too small. Sadly, these admissions come despite billions being spent on economic development, while Wales has also benefited from two rounds of EU funding.

Yet while Wales needs a successful private sector to create jobs, even Welsh Labour politicians have flagged up the party's hostility towards the private sector. Eluned Morgan, the former Welsh Labour MEP, said that many in the private sector sense 'animosity' from Labour and are reluctant to enter into engagement with it.

Unemployment in Wales is 150,000 higher than when devolution began in 1999. The Welsh Government might blame the recession, but, in 2007, nearly one quarter of people in Wales was economically inactive, which was greater than the UK average. Youth unemployment in Wales has exceeded that in the UK in every year since 2001.

Clearly, the nation has suffered from Welsh Governments spending ineffectively, neglecting business and regulating excessively. Ieuan Wyn Jones, the former Minister for economic development, admitted in June that the One Wales Government 'spent more money on economic development' than any other UK nation, but, despite that, he was 'not quite sure' what Wales achieved as a consequence.

On business support, the Federation of Small Businesses feels that the 2011 Welsh Labour manifesto 'largely ignored' the needs of SMEs, despite the fact that they are the lifeblood of our economy. The Institute of Directors feels that regulation in Wales is in excess of anywhere else in the UK.

chryfach a bod angen i gynnal ein sector cyhoeddus, yn lle ei dorri yn hytrach na cheisio cefnogi'r sector preifat.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae angen i Lywodraeth Cymru gymryd camau difrifol a sylweddol i helpu i dyfu'r sector preifat yng Nghymru. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a Peter Hain yn cyfaddef fod y sector preifat yng Nghymru yn rhy fach. Yn anffodus, daw'r cyfaddefiadau hyn er bod biliynau yn cael eu gwario ar ddatblygu economaidd, ac mae Cymru hefyd wedi elwa o gael dau gylch o arian UE.

Eto tra bod Cymru angen sector preifat llwyddiannus i greu swyddi, mae hyd yn oed gwleidyddion Llafur Cymru wedi tynnu sylw at elyniaeth y blaid tuag at y sector preifat. Dywedodd Eluned Morgan, cyn ASE Llafur Cymru, fod llawer yn y sector preifat yn synhwyro 'gelyniaeth' gan Lafur ac yn gyndyn o ddechrau ymgysylltu â hi.

Mae diweithdra yng Nghymru 150,000 yn uwch nag oedd pan ddechreuodd datganoli yn 1999. Efallai bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn beio'r dirwasgiad, ond yn 2007 roedd bron i chwarter pobl yng Nghymru yn economaidd anweithgar, a oedd yn uwch na chyfartaledd y DU. Mae diweithdra ymysg pobl ifanc wedi bod yn uwch na'r hyn ydyw yn y DU bob blwyddyn ers 2001.

Yn amlwg, mae'r genedl wedi dioddef oherwydd bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gwario'n aneffeithiol, gan esgeuluso busnes a rheoleiddio yn ormodol. Cyfaddefodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, y cyn-Weinidog datblygu economaidd, ym mis Mehefin fod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un 'wedi gwario mwy o arian ar ddatblygu economaidd' nag unrhyw genedl arall yn y DU, ond, er hynny, 'nid oedd yn siŵr' beth oedd Cymru wedi ei chyflawni o ganlyniad.

O ran cymorth busnes, mae'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn teimlo fod manifesto Llafur Cymru wedi 'anwybyddu gan fwyaf' anghenion busnesau bach a chanolig, er mai hwy yw curiad calon ein heconomi. Dywed Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr fod mwy o reoleiddio yng Nghymru nag yn unman arall yn y DU.

**Mick Antoniw:** In view of what you said about excessive regulation, would you perhaps like to identify two or three key regulations that you would wish to abolish?

**Mohammad Asghar:** You had better listen to my speech, and the answer will come.

The Confederation of British Industry Wales has accused the Welsh Government of failing to use its powers to deregulate. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Shall we just listen to the speaker, please?

**Mohammad Asghar:** This paints a picture of a Welsh nation that is not business-friendly and lacks ambition for private sector development and engagement, which is so important for properly stimulating durable employment. For example, over the past year, I have been in discussions with a gentleman who wants to bring a business manufacturing modular building systems for the housing market to Wales, which would be based in the south-east Wales Valleys. I would have hoped that the Welsh Government would have jumped at the chance to offer support and advice, but he found it difficult to obtain clear answers regarding the support available and initially made over 50 telephone calls before being directed to the correct officials.

I note that a review of business rates has been launched by the Welsh Government. Our party pledged to abolish business rates for businesses with a rateable value below £12,000. That would take 73 per cent of business premises out of rates altogether, stimulating employment and encouraging private sector growth. I therefore hope that the Minister takes that on board.

Sadly, at present, business birth rates in Wales are too low. In 2009, we were the third lowest of the United Kingdom's nations and regions. In 2009, there were 665 fewer enterprise births in Wales than there were in 2002, but 2,270 more enterprise deaths. Blaenau Gwent, Torfaen and Merthyr Tydfil—all in South Wales East—are three of Wales's four worst performing areas in this field. The Government needs to facilitate job creation by implementing a framework that

**Mick Antoniw:** O ystyried beth a ddywedasoch am reoleiddio gormodol, a wnewch chi efallai nodi dau neu dri o reoliadau yr hoffech chi eu diddymu?

**Mohammad Asghar:** Gwrandewch ar fy araith, ac fe ddaw'r ateb.

Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain Cymru wedi cyhuddo Llywodraeth Cymru o fetu â defnyddio ei phwerau i ddadreoleiddio. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A gawn ni wrando ar y siaradwr, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae hyn yn creu darlun o genedl Gymreig nad yw'n groesawgar i fusnes ac sydd heb uchelgais i ddatblygu ac ymgysylltu â'r sector preifat, sydd mor bwysig i ysgogi cyflogaeth sy'n para. Er enghraifft, dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, bûm mewn trafodaethau gyda gŵr bonheddig sydd eisiau dod â busnes yn cynhyrchu systemau adeiladu modiwlaidd i'r farchnad dai i Gymru, a fyddai wedi ei leoli yng Nghymoedd de-ddwyrain Cymru. Fy ngobaith oedd y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru wedi neidio ar y cyfle i gynnig cymorth a chyngor, ond fe'i cafodd yn anodd cael atebion clir am y cymorth oedd ar gael ac ar y cychwyn gwnaeth dros 50 o alwadau ffôn cyn cael ei gyfeirio at y swyddogion cywir.

Nodaf fod adolygiad o drethi busnes wedi cael ei lansio gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Addawodd ein plaid ddiddymu trethi busnes i fusnesau â gwerth trethadwy is na £12,000. Byddai hynny yn golygu na fyddai raid i 73 y cant o eiddo busnes dalu trethi o gwbl, ac felly yn ysgogi cyflogaeth ac annog twf sector preifat. Gobeithiaf felly y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi ystyriaeth i hynny.

Yn anffodus, ar hyn o bryd, mae cyfraddau geni busnesau yng Nghymru yn rhy isel. Yn 2009, ni oedd y trydydd isaf o genhedloedd a rhanbarthau'r Deyrnas Unedig. Yn 2009, roedd 665 yn llai o enedigaethau menter yng Nghymru nag oedd yn 2002, ond 2,270 yn fwy o farwolaethau menter. Blaenau Gwent, Torfaen a Merthyr Tudful—i gyd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru—yw tair o'r pedair ardal sy'n perfformio gwaethaf yng Nghymru yn y maes hwn. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth

allows the private sector to grow, but Labour-led Governments in Cardiff bay have denied Wales those opportunities for too long. If you think of the economy as a knife, a knife in the hands of a professional doctor can save lives, but, unfortunately, that knife has been in the hand of Labour's unqualified economists, and they have ruined the economy of this nation.

**The Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science (Edwina Hart):** I welcome this debate and discussion today. There are various views across the Chamber in respect of the UK Government's direction of travel with regard to the economy. However, I will not dwell on those today, but rather concentrate on our responsibilities as a Government in Wales. We are absolutely committed to building on our relationship with the business community and our social partners to help to create the conditions needed for companies to thrive and grow. I was pleased that Vaughan Gething alluded to the trade union movement with regard to social partners, because, when I am out and about with industry, people tell me that they value their relationship with the trade unions, because they see it as a partnership that is keeping people in employment, attracting investment and helping with the training agenda.

During these difficult economic times, we need to ensure that, using the powers at our disposal, we are putting the right measures in place to assist economic recovery in Wales and to convey the message that Wales is an excellent place in which to do business. When I meet companies that do business in Wales, I am told that they do consider it to be an excellent place in which to do business. Some companies have concerns about various issues, but some of the biggest concerns are about central Government policies, such as what is happening with regard to energy costs and how that is impacting on industry and what more can be done to make it a fairer place for them to be.

In recent weeks, I have made significant announcements here concerning the

hwyluso'r broses o greu swyddi drwy roi fframwaith ar waith sy'n galluogi'r sector preifat i dyfu, ond mae Llywodraethau dan arweinyddiaeth Llafur ym mae Caerdydd wedi gwadu'r cyfleoedd hynny i Gymru ers rhy hir. Os meddyliwch am yr economi fel cylllell, gall cylllell yn nwylo meddyg proffesiynol achub bywydau, ond, yn anffodus, mae'r gyllell honno wedi bod yn llaw economegwyr digymhwyster Llafur, ac maent wedi difetha economi'r genedl hon.

**Y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth (Edwina Hart):** Croesawaf y ddatl a'r drafodaeth hon heddiw. Mae amrywiaeth barn ar draws y Siambr am gyfeiriad trywydd Llywodraeth y DU o ran yr economi. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaif ymhelaethu ar y rheini heddiw, ond yn hytrach ganolbwyntio ar ein cyfrifoldebau fel Llywodraeth yng Nghymru. Rydym wedi ymrwmo'n llwyr i ddatblygu ein perthynas gyda'r gymuned fusnes a'n partneriaid cymdeithasol i helpu i greu'r amodau sydd eu hangen i gwmgiau ffynnu a thyfu. Roeddwn yn falch fod Vaughan Gething wedi cyfeirio at y mudiad undeb llafur o ran partneriaid cymdeithasol, achos pan wyf yn ymweld â diwydiant, mae pobl yn dweud wrthyf eu bod yn gwerthfawrogi eu perthynas gyda'r undebau llafur, gan eu bod yn ei weld fel partneriaeth sy'n cadw pobl mewn cyflogaeth, yn denu buddsoddiad ac yn helpu gyda'r agenda hyfforddiant.

Yn yr amseroedd economaidd anodd hyn, rhaid i ni sicrhau, gan ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd gennym, ein bod yn rhoi'r mesurau cywir ar waith i gynorthwyo i adfer yr economi yng Nghymru ac i gyfleu'r neges fod Cymru yn lle rhagorol i wneud busnes. Pan rwyf yn cwrdd â chwmnïau sy'n gwneud busnes yng Nghymru, dywedir wrthyf eu bod yn ystyried ei fod yn lle rhagorol i wneud busnes. Mae pryderon gan rai cwmnïau am amryw o faterion, ond mae rhai o'r pryderon mwyaf yn ymwneud â pholisïau'r Llywodraeth ganolog, megis beth sy'n digwydd o ran costau ynni a sut mae hynny yn effeithio ar ddiwydiant a beth yn fwy y gellid ei wneud i'w wneud yn lle tecach iddynt weithredu ynddo.

Yn yr wythnosau diwethaf, gwneuthum gyhoeddiadau arwyddocaol yn y maes hwn

development of enterprise zones, and I very much welcome the support for that and for establishment of the task and finish group on a microbusiness strategy and the creation of the three new sector panels. This week, as has been mentioned, I announced that I am setting up a city region task and finish group, chaired by Dr Elizabeth Haywood, to identify areas that it might be appropriate to support as city regions within Wales and to consider the key economic development opportunities and benefits that could arise from nurturing them. Within that discussion must come the discussions on infrastructure and transport. It is important that we look holistically at developments in that regard, as was raised by Byron Davies and Vaughan Gething, in looking at projects, whether a Valleys metro system or how we can deal with electrification. All those areas are key areas.

I have listened to Members on business rates, because it is an issue that is raised with me both by Members and when I am out and about. I hope that you will all welcome the announcement today that Professor Brian Morgan is to chair a task and finish group to review business rates policy, and, importantly, has an expert group that consists of independently minded people, who, I hope, will give a fair assessment of what we will be able to do in Wales.

When Nick Ramsay opened the debate, he recognised the role of the public sector, and it was quite interesting, because I have been having quite a few discussions with the private sector in which I have been told that some of the cuts in the public sector are adversely affecting what the private sector does. For example, once public sector jobs go, those people do not have money to spend, and that has a direct impact on retail. Also, cuts to the public sector have implications for companies that are looking for Government contracts. Therefore, we have to look at this in the round. We have to value every job in Wales. Every job we retain in Wales keeps someone in employment, paying bills and spending in the community. That is very important for us.

am ddatblygu parthau menter, ac rwy'n croesawu'n fawr y gefnogaeth i hynny ac i sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar strategaeth microfusnes a chreu'r tri phanel sector newydd. Yr wythnos hon, fel y soniwyd, cyhoeddais fy mod yn sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen dinas-ranbarth, a gadeirir gan Dr Elizabeth Haywood, er mwyn nodi ardaloedd a allai fod yn briodol i'w cefnogi fel dinas-ranbarthau yng Nghymru ac i ystyried y cyfleoedd datblygu economaidd a'r buddion allweddol a all ddod yn sgil eu meithrin. Yn y drafodaeth honno rhaid hefyd cael trafodaethau am seilwaith a thrafnidiaeth. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych yn holistaidd ar ddatblygiadau yn hynny o beth, fel y dywedodd Byron Davies a Vaughan Gething, wrth edrych ar brojectau, pa un a yw hynny ar fetro'r Cymoedd neu sut y gallwn ddelio gyda trydaneiddio. Mae'r rheini i gyd yn feysydd allweddol,

Rwyf wedi gwranddo ar Aelodau ar drethi busnes, gan ei fod yn fater a godir gyda mi gan Aelodau a phan rwyf allan yn ymweld. Gobeithio y byddwch i gyd yn croesawu'r cyhoeddiad heddiw y bydd yr Athro Brian Morgan yn cadeirio grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen er mwyn adolygu'r polisi trethi busnes, ac, yn bwysig, mae ganddo grŵp arbenigol sy'n cynnwys pobl â meddwl annibynnol a fydd, gobeithio, yn rhoi asesiad teg o beth fyddwn yn gallu ei wneud yng Nghymru.

Pan agorodd Nick Ramsay y ddadl, fe wnaeth gydnabod rôl y sector cyhoeddus, ac roedd yn reit ddiddorol, achos rwyf wedi bod yn cael cryn dipyn o drafodaethau gyda'r sector preifat lle dywedwyd wrthyf fod rhai o'r toriadau yn y sector cyhoeddus yn cael effaith andwyol ar yr hyn mae'r sector preifat yn ei wneud. Er enghraifft, pan fydd swyddi sector cyhoeddus yn cael eu colli, nid oes arian i'w wario gan y bobl hynny, ac mae hynny'n cael effaith uniongyrchol ar fanwerthu. Hefyd, mae gan doriadau i'r sector cyhoeddus oblygiadau i gwmnïau sy'n chwilio am gontractau Llywodraeth. Felly, rhaid i ni edrych ar hyn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Rhaid i ni werthfawrogi bob swydd yng Nghymru. Mae pob swydd rydym yn ei chadw yng Nghymru yn cadw rhywun mewn gwaith, yn talu biliau ac yn gwario yn y gymuned. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn i ni.

There was also a lot of discussion about European funds. Those funds are making a real difference to Wales, and they have helped us to mitigate the worst effects of the recession in Wales over the years. EU projects have assisted over 240,000 participants, which is quite a substantial number. Some 72,500 people have been supported to gain qualifications and over 29,500 have been helped into work; 9,000 gross jobs have been created and 1,800 new enterprises have been created. Those statistics are not bad. We monitor the performance of the EU projects to see whether they are delivering the ambitious targets to benefit the people and the economy of Wales. We have achieved all programme annual expenditure targets to date, including this year's end-of-calendar-year target, for the four programmes. That is important information on how European projects have been dealt with.

I will now turn to the amendments, and to Alun Ffred's contribution in respect of amendment 1, which we will support as a Government. I was particularly taken by his comments on private finance initiatives, which I concur with. He also talked about the importance of capital schemes and the discussion that he had had with the construction sector. It is important to recognise that we need to look strategically at construction schemes, and to look at them in the context of what we do and how they can aid industry and communities. They have to be within that context.

Eluned Parrott moved the amendments in the name of Peter Black on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats. With regard to amendment 3, we are aware of the tax incremental financing proposals in the UK Government's consultation paper. Any potential increase in local government's capacity for prudent long-term capital investment is generally to be welcomed. Subject to the details of the eventual proposals, it is likely that the Welsh Government will want comparable powers. Like all borrowing, the cost of TIF would have to be funded from within local authority budgets. It should be noted that TIF is not without risk. Local authorities will be borrowing against a projected future increase

Roedd llawer o drafod hefyd am arian Ewropeaidd. Mae'r arian hwnnw yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i Gymru, ac mae wedi ein helpu i liniaru effeithiau gwaethaf y dirwasgiad yng Nghymru dros y blynyddoedd. Mae projectau UE wedi helpu dros 240,000 o gyfranogwyr, sy'n nifer sylweddol. Mae rhyw 72,500 o bobl wedi cael eu cefnogi i ennill cymwysterau ac mae dros 29,500 wedi eu helpu i gael gwaith; cafodd 9,000 o swyddi gros eu creu a 1,800 o fentrau newydd eu creu. Nid yw'r ystadegau hynny yn rhy ddrwg. Rydym yn monitro perfformiad y projectau EU i weld a ydynt yn cyflawni'r targedau uchelgeisiol i elwa pobl ac economi Cymru. Rydym wedi cyflawni bob targed gwariant blynyddol y rhaglen hyd yma, gan gynnwys targed diwedd blwyddyn galendr eleni, ar gyfer y pedair rhaglen. Mae hynny yn wybodaeth bwysig o ran sut y deliwyd â phrojectau Ewropeaidd.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau, ac i gyfraniad Alun Ffred o ran gwelliant 1, y byddwn yn ei gefnogi fel Llywodraeth. Roedd gennyf gryn ddiddordeb yn ei sylwadau ar fentrau cyllid preifat, ac rwyf yn cytuno â hwy. Soniodd hefyd am bwysigrwydd cynlluniau cyfalaf a'r drafodaeth roedd wedi ei chael gyda'r sector adeiladu. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod ein bod angen edrych yn strategol ar gynlluniau adeiladu, ac edrych arnynt yng nghyd-destun beth rydym yn ei wneud a sut y gallan nhw fod o gymorth i ddiwydiant a chymunedau. Rhaid iddynt fod o fewn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

Cynigiodd Eluned Parrott y gwelliannau yn enw Peter Black ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. O ran gwelliant 3, rydym yn gwybod am y cynigion cyllido cynyddrannol treth ym mhapur ymgynghori Llywodraeth y DU. Ar y cyfan, mae unrhyw gynnydd posibl yng ngallu llywodraeth leol i fuddsoddi cyfalaf yn ddarbodus yn y tymor hir i'w groesawu. Yn amodol ar fanylion y cynigion a ddaw i'r golwg yn y pen draw, mae'n debygol y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru eisiau cael pwerau tebyg. Fel bob benthyc, byddai'n rhaid talu cost cyllido cynyddrannol treth o gyllidebau awdurdod lleol. Dylid nodi nad yw hyn heb risg. Bydd awdurdodau lleol yn benthyc yn erbyn cynnydd rhagamcanol yn y dyfodol yn eu hincwm annomestig. Os

in their non-domestic yield. If those increases fail to materialise, local authorities will have to find the money from other sources. Therefore, it is a difficult area and we will not be supporting this amendment at this stage.

I now turn to amendment 4. While the majority of jobs generated through Jobs Growth Wales will be generated within the private sector, the programme has been designed to provide a range of private, public and third sector work experiences. I do not understand the comments made about skills. What we are doing on the skills agenda has been praised by the companies that I see. The Deputy Minister has also been engaged with the sectors and is having further engagement with the sectors and companies about whether we should do more bespoke schemes. This is an agenda where we can really add value. When companies look to locate to Wales, they are very pleased by the training packages and programmes that we can deal with. Therefore, I will certainly not be supporting that amendment.

I now turn to amendment 5. Finance is already available from the Directorate for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science for all stages of the research and development and innovation life cycle, and last week I agreed to look at making non-repayable finance offers.

Turning to some of the other contributions, Ann Jones illustrated, in a very practical manner, the reality of the Welsh Government's policies and how they have improved things on the ground in terms of regeneration and skills and the hope given to people in certain areas. Byron Davies spoke about infrastructure issues. He spoke about European funds; £140 million has gone into transport under the European programmes. You only have to look at some of the things that we did with regard to modal facilities; £56 million went into Port Talbot. Therefore, transport has been key. He spoke about the airport. The airport is run by a private company, at the end of the day. We have to recognise that.

4.00 p.m.

nad yw'r cynnydd hwnnw yn dod, bydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ganfod yr arian o ffynonellau eraill, Felly, mae'n faes anodd ac ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn ar hyn o bryd.

Trof yn awr at welliant 4. Er y bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r swyddi a gaiff eu creu drwy Twf Swyddi Cymru yn cael eu creu yn y sector preifat, cynlluniwyd y rhaglen i ddarparu amrywiaeth o brofiad gwaith yn y sector preifat, sector cyhoeddus a'r trydydd sector. Nid wyf yn deall y sylwadau a wnaed am sgiliau. Cafodd yr hyn rydym yn ei wneud ar yr agenda sgiliau ei ganmol gan y cwmnïau yr wyf yn eu gweld. Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog hefyd wedi ymwneud â'r sectorau ac mae'n gwneud rhagor gyda'r sectorau a'r cwmnïau ynghylch a ddylem ddarparu mwy o gynlluniau wedi eu teilwra. Dyma agenda lle gallwn wir ychwanegu gwerth. Pan mae cwmnïau yn ystyried dod i Gymru, maent yn falch iawn o'r pecynnau a'r rhaglenni hyfforddi y gallwn ddelio â hwy. Felly, ni fyddaf yn sicr yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Trof yn awr at welliant 5. Mae cyllid eisoes ar gael gan y Gyfarwyddiaeth Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth ar gyfer bob cam o'r cylch ymchwil a datblygu ac arloesi, a chytunais wythnos diwethaf i edrych ar wneud cynigion cyllid nad oes rhaid eu had-dalu.

Gan droi at rai o'r cyfraniadau eraill, dangosodd Ann Jones, mewn ffordd ymarferol iawn, realiti polisïau Llywodraeth Cymru a sut maent wedi gwella pethau ar lawr gwlad o ran adfywio a sgiliau a'r gobraith a roddwyd i bobl mewn rhai ardaloedd. Soniodd Byron Davies am faterion seilwaith. Soniodd am arian Ewropeaidd; mae £140 miliwn wedi mynd tuag at drafnidiaeth o dan y rhaglenni Ewropeaidd. Nid oes ond rhaid i chi edrych ar rai o'r pethau a wnaethom o ran cyfleusterau moddol; aeth £56 miliwn i Bort Talbot. Felly, bu trafnidiaeth yn allweddol. Soniodd am y maes awyr. Caiff y maes awyr ei redeg gan gwmni preifat, yn y pen draw. Rydym yn cydnabod hynny.

We have limited influence on that airport, but any influence that we have, we will try to bring to bear, because a viable airport is important for the economy of Wales. Airports and ports are essential for the Welsh economy. Vaughan Gething also alluded to good initiatives such as ReAct and ProAct. Both have been praised everywhere I have gone, because they were schemes that addressed the key issues that were facing individuals. The Member for South Wales East gave anecdotal experience about companies that are around and seeking help. We seek to help any company that wishes to come to us. I thank Members for their contributions to today's debate.

**Suzy Davies:** Thank you to all Members who have taken part in what has been a lively and important debate. Mohammad Asghar spoke earlier about Baroness Eluned Morgan, who not only made the comments that Mohammad Asghar referred to, but also commented on this place, saying that we have been discussing matters that are less important than the economy and jobs, and that what we should be discussing is what we are discussing today.

It has been a lively debate. Mark Isherwood made his impeccable contribution, reminding us of the unpalatable statistics that affect this country and the Assembly, which is here to try to deal with them. There is no point avoiding even the distant past, because we have to learn the lessons of the past in order to get it right for the future. That is no more evident than in two of the points that were raised—one by Mark and one by many other Members. The first is the current benefits system, which is a matter for another place, but surely we cannot support a benefits system that encourages people to stay on benefits rather than looking for work. The other is the less-than-effective use of EU money that has been coming to Wales for a number of years now: more than €10 billion has come to my region, yet the gross value added figure has plummeted during the last 10 years.

In terms of detail, the Welsh Conservatives have constantly contributed to debates in this Chamber and raised the matters of business

Dim ond hyn a hyn o ddylanwad sydd gennym ar y maes awyr hwnnw, ond ceisiwn ddefnyddio unrhyw ddylanwad sydd gennym, gan fod maes awyr hyfyw yn bwysig i economi Cymru. Mae meysydd awyr a phorthladdoedd yn hanfodol i economi Cymru. Cyfeiriodd Vaughan Gething hefyd at fentrau da megis ReAct a ProAct. Cafodd y ddau eu canmol ym mhob man yr wyf wedi bod, am eu bod yn gynlluniau sy'n delio â'r prif faterion roedd unigolion yn eu hwynebu. Soniodd yr Aelod dros Ddwyrain De Cymru yn anecdotaidd am gwmnïau sydd o gwmpas ac yn ceisio cymorth. Rydym yn ceisio helpu unrhyw gwmni sy'n dymuno dod atom ni. Diolch i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau i ddadl heddiw.

**Suzy Davies:** Diolch i'r holl Aelodau sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddadl fywiog a phwysig hon. Soniodd Mohammad Asghar yn gynharach am y Farwnes Eluned Morgan, sydd nid yn unig wedi gwneud y sylwadau y cyfeiriwyd atynt gan Mohammad Asghar, ond hefyd wedi gwneud sylwadau ar y lle hwn, gan ddweud y buom yn trafod materion sydd yn llai pwysig na'r economi a swyddi, ac mai'r hyn y dylem drafod yw'r hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw.

Bu'n ddadl fywiog. Gwnaeth Mark Isherwood ei gyfraniad di-fai, yn ein hatgoffa o'r ystadegau anodd eu stumogi sy'n effeithio ar y wlad hon a'r Cynulliad, sydd yma i geisio delio â hwy. Nid oes diben osgoi hyd yn oed y gorffennol pell, oherwydd rhaid inni ddysgu gwersi o'r gorffennol er mwyn ei gael yn iawn ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n amlwg iawn wrth ystyried dau bwynt a godwyd—un gan Mark ac un gan nifer o Aelodau eraill. Y cyntaf yw'r system budd-daliadau bresennol, sy'n fater i le arall, ond ni allwn yn bendant gefnogi system budd-daliadau sy'n annog pobl i aros ar fudd-daliadau yn hytrach na chwilio am waith. Y llall yw'r defnydd llai-nag-effeithiol o arian UE sydd wedi bod yn dod i Gymru ers nifer o flynyddoedd yn awr: mae mwy na €10 biliwn wedi dod i fy rhanbarth i, ac eto mae'r ffigur gwerth ychwanegol crynswth wedi gostwng yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf.

O ran y manylion, mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi cyfrannu'n gyson at ddadleuon yn y Siambr hon ac wedi codi ardrethi busnes



rates and enterprise zones. This is something that Eluned Parrot also mentioned: the development of skills and that the private sector and universities should be contributing to the design of skills. I am pleased that the Minister has found those arguments attractive and has taken them on board.

One of the comments with which I had to disagree most profoundly was one made by Vaughan Gething, who said that we should be supporting the public sector instead of looking at how to improve the private sector. That is not acceptable.

**Vaughan Gething:** I did not say that.

**Suzy Davies:** You did say that; I wrote it down. Please check the Record. We need both. All parties agreed to that. What I do agree with is what you said about transport infrastructure, which Byron Davies and Alun Ffred Jones also alluded to. We would all like to see capital investment in transport infrastructure, but bearing in mind the rather shocking record of the last Government when it came to transport infrastructure projects, which have all gone over time and over budget, you can understand why there might be reluctance out there to start investing in those matters here. I look to this Government to start trying to deal with the detail of that.

Ann Jones mentioned that she had a message for her constituents in Rhyl regarding the Future Jobs fund. I have one as well: that did not work. Welsh Conservatives and Conservatives in the coalition Government can offer a much better alternative.

**Ann Jones:** Will you take an intervention?

**The Presiding Officer:** Are you taking the intervention?

**Suzy Davies:** No, I am sorry, Ann, I do not have enough time, but you made your point.

**Ann Jones:** You have only had two minutes.

**Suzy Davies:** You do not know how much I have got to say yet. The UK coalition

a pharthau menter. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth a grybwyllwyd gan Eluned Parrot hefyd: datblygu sgiliau, a'r ffaith y dylai'r sector preifat a phrifysgolion fod yn cyfrannu at ddylunio sgiliau. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi gweld gwerth yn y dadleuon hynny ac wedi eu hystyried.

Un o'r sylwadau yr oedd yn rhaid i mi anghytuno fwyaf ag ef oedd un a wnaed gan Vaughan Gething, a ddywedodd y dylem fod yn cefnogi'r sector cyhoeddus yn lle edrych ar sut i wella'r sector breifat. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol.

**Vaughan Gething:** Ni ddywedais i hynny.

**Suzy Davies:** Fe wnaethoch ddweud hynny; fe'i ysgrifennais i lawr. Gwiriwch y Cofnod. Mae arnom angen y ddau. Cytunodd bob plaid ar hynny. Beth yr wyf yn cytuno â chi arno yw'r hyn a ddywedoch am seilwaith trafndiaeth, a soniodd Byron Davies ac Alun Ffred Jones hefyd am hyn. Byddem i gyd yn hoffi gweld buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn seilwaith trafndiaeth, ond o gofio record ddifrifol y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf ar brojectau seilwaith trafndiaeth, sydd i gyd wedi bod yn hwyr a thros gyllideb, gallwch ddeall pam y byddai pobl yn amharod, o bosibl, i ddechrau buddsoddi yn y materion hyn yma. Edrychaf i'r Llywodraeth hon i ddechrau ceisio delio â manylion hynny.

Soniodd Ann Jones fod ganddi neges i'w hetholwyr yn y Rhyl ynghylch cronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol. Mae gen i un hefyd: ni weithiodd hynny. Gall y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig a'r Ceidwadwyr yn y Llywodraeth glymblaid gynnig dewis llawer gwell.

**Ann Jones:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Y Llywydd:** A ydych yn derbyn yr ymyriad?

**Suzy Davies:** Na, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ann, nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser, ond yr ydych wedi gwneud eich pwynt.

**Ann Jones:** Dim ond dwy funud rydych wedi eu cael.

**Suzy Davies:** Ni wyddoch faint sydd gennyf i'w ddweud eto. Mae Llywodraeth glymblaid

Government has designed a personalised, longer lasting and more effective works programme for people to take part in, which will not put them back on jobseeker's allowance within seven months of starting their programme.

**Ann Jones:** Tosh.

**Suzy Davies:** It is not tosh, I am afraid.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Will you either take interventions or not, and not listen to comments that are made when people are seated? Will you carry on, please?

**Suzy Davies:** I certainly will; thank you very much. Turning briefly to the Minister's comments, I am pleased that you have acknowledged some of the good ideas that have come out of this Chamber, not least from these benches. You mentioned retail. Surely, one of the best ways of helping the retail sector in Wales is to ensure that there is that little bit more money left in people's pockets by allowing them to keep their council tax consequential from the announcement that was made by the UK Government not so long ago. We could also have a further discussion on public procurement. We have spoken a little about that today, but that would also be of assistance by creating sustainable jobs in the public and private sectors, and I am sure that that is something that we all want.

In essence, we have had a debate today that has not taken us much further forward, except to hear from the Minister that she is prepared to look at these new and exciting ideas, and we look forward to any ideas coming forward that we are able to support. On the other hand, we have had problems, especially regarding EU funding for the last 10 years, and there is no point denying it: they have all been on Labour's watch here and in the UK.

**The Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections, therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

y DU wedi cynllunio rhaglen waith wedi ei theilwra, a fydd yn para'n hirach ac a fydd yn fwy effeithiol i'r bobl a fydd yn cymryd rhan ynddi, ac na fydd yn eu gweld yn mynd yn ôl i dderbyn y lwfans ceisio gwaith o fewn saith mis i ddechrau'r rhaglen.

**Ann Jones:** Rwtsh.

**Suzy Davies:** Nid rwtsh, mae arnaf ofn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A wnewch chi naill ai gymryd ymyriadau neu beidio, ac nid gwrando ar sylwadau sy'n cael eu gwneud pan fydd pobl yn eistedd? A wnewch chi barhau, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Suzy Davies:** Gwnaf, yn sicr; diolch yn fawr iawn. Gan droi yn gyflym at sylwadau'r Gweinidog, yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cydnabod rhai o'r syniadau da sydd wedi dod o'r Siambr hon, yn arbennig o'r meinciau hyn. Soniasoch am fanwerthu. Yn sicr, un o'r ffyrdd gorau o helpu'r sector manwerthu yng Nghymru yw sicrhau bod yna ychydig bach mwy o arian ar ôl ym mhocedi pobl drwy eu galluogi i gadw arian canlyniadol y dreth gyngor o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddiad a wnaed gan Lywodraeth y DU yn ddiweddar. Gallem hefyd gael trafodaeth bellach ar gaffael cyhoeddus. Yr ydym wedi sôn ychydig am hynny heddiw, ond byddai hynny hefyd yn gymorth drwy greu swyddi cynaliadwy yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydym i gyd am ei weld.

Yn ei hanfod, cawsom ddadl heddiw nad yw wedi mynd â ni lawer ymlaen, ac eithrio clywed gan y Gweinidog ei bod yn barod i edrych ar y syniadau newydd a chyffrous hyn, ac edrychwn ymlaen at unrhyw syniadau a ddaw ymlaen y gallwn eu cefnogi. Ar y llaw arall, yr ydym wedi cael problemau, yn enwedig o ran cyllid yr UE ar gyfer y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, ac nid oes diben gwadu hynny: bu pob un ohonynt yn ystod cyfnod Llafur mewn grym, yma ac yn y DU.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cynnig yw cytuno ar y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 4.06pm  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 4.06pm*

**Dadl Plaid Cymru  
Plaid Cymru Debate**

**Cynllun Gweithredu ar gyfer y Diwydiant Llaeth  
A Dairy Action Plan**

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

*Cynnig NDM4839 Jocelyn Davies*

*Motion NDM4839 Jocelyn Davies*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i lunio cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer y diwydiant llaeth, sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r arferion masnachol annheg sy'n bodoli yn y gadwyn gyflenwi, ac sy'n cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer y canlynol:*

*1. Calls on the Welsh Government to develop a dairy action plan, that tackles the widespread unfair commercial practices inherent within the supply chain, and which includes provision for:*

*a) contract gwaelodlin llaeth amrwd safonol;*

*a) a baseline standard raw milk contract;*

*b) cod ymarfer y gellir ei orfodi i sicrhau trafodion teg rhwng ffermwyr a chwmnïau llaeth; ac*

*b) an enforceable code of practice to ensure fair dealings between farmers and dairy companies; and*

*c) cyhoeddi gwybodaeth dryloyw am ddsbarthiad elw a phrisiau cyfanwerthu.*

*c) publication of transparent information on distribution of margins and wholesale prices.*

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Cynigiau y cynnig.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** I move the motion.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn ar ran Plaid Cymru yn enw Jocelyn Davies gybrbron y Cynulliad y prynhawn yma.

It is a pleasure to present this motion in the name of Jocelyn Davies, on behalf of Plaid Cymru, before the Assembly this afternoon.

Hanfod y cynnig yw bod angen gweithredu er mwyn mynd i'r afael â nifer o'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru. Mae nifer y ffermwyr yn y sector hwn wedi lleihau'n sylweddol o ychydig o dan 4,000 o ffermwyr prin ddegawd yn ôl i lai na 2,000 y llynedd, hynny yw, mae'r ffigur wedi mwy na haneru mewn cwta 10 mlynedd. Credaf fod yr amser wedi dod i Lywodraeth Cymru gymryd yr awenau a

The nub of the motion is that we need action to get to grips with a number of the challenges that are facing the dairy industry in Wales. The number of farmers in the sector has fallen significantly from a little under 4,000 farmers just a decade ago to less than 2,000 last year, that is, the figure has more than halved in just 10 years. I think that the time has come for the Welsh Government to take the lead and develop an action plan to

datblygu cynllun gweithredu i fynd i'r afael â'r arferion masnachol annheg sy'n frith yn y gadwyn gyflenwi. Mae angen arwain drwy esiampl a gweithredu, lle mae'n bosibl gwneud hynny, gwneud datganiadau clir o egwyddor a disgwyliadau'r Llywodraeth o eraill a lobbio San Steffan a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Mae'r sector llaeth o dan warchae, a hynny am nifer o resymau ond, yn bennaf, am nad yw'r gadwyn gyflenwi llaeth yng Nghymru yn gweithio'n iawn. Mae digon o dystiolaeth ar gael i ategu hynny. Er enghraifft, mae pris nwyddau llaeth ar y marchnadoedd byd-eang, yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ac yn y Deyrnas Unedig wedi codi'n sylweddol iawn yn y 12 mis diwethaf, ond prin fod y pris i ffermwyr wedi symud.

Mae elw manwerthu gros ar gynhyrchu llaeth wedi cynyddu yn 2010 tra bod elw gweddill y gadwyn gyflenwi wedi lleihau. Yn ystod 2010, cyhoeddodd nifer o gwmnïau llaeth eu helw mwyaf erioed, ond dim ond ychydig fisoedd wedyn, yr oedd yr hinsawdd wedi newid ac yr oeddent yn rhyddhau rhybuddion elw.

Dylai'r diwydiant llaeth yn y wlad hon fod yn mwynhau buddion o'r twf yn y galw am eu cynnyrch gan fod gan Gymru gynhyrchwyr llaeth effeithlon a hinsawdd dda ar gyfer cynhyrchu llaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'r diwydiant wedi mynd o un argyfwng i'r llall ac wedi gorfod dioddef degawd o ddiffyg buddsoddiad a phroffidoldeb isel.

Gallech ddadlau bod hyn yn rhannol oherwydd ei etifeddiaeth fel diwydiant a oedd wedi'i reoleiddio, fel ag yr oedd tan ganol y 1990au, ac, efallai, oherwydd diffyg effeithlonrwydd a chystadleuaeth yn y maes prosesu. Fodd bynnag, i'r ffermwr llaeth cyffredin, y broblem fwyaf, heb os nac oni bai, yw'r ffordd y mae cytundebau llaeth yn gweithio. Y cytundeb llaeth sy'n ganolog i lunio'r berthynas fusnes rhwng ffermwyr a phrynwyr llaeth. Nid yw'n syndod i neb fod y dogfennau hynny yn rhy aml o lawer yn rhy unochrog gan sicrhau mai'r ffermwr sy'n ysgwyddo'r rhan fwyaf o'r risg, a hynny am y tâl lleiaf.

Mae llaeth yn gynnyrch darfodus, wrth gwrs,

tackle the unfair commercial practices that litter the supply chain. We need to lead by example, take action where possible, make clear statements of principle and on the Government's expectations of others, and lobby Westminster and the European Union on these issues.

The dairy sector is under siege for a number of reasons, but primarily because the dairy supply chain in Wales is not working properly. There is plenty of evidence available to demonstrate that. For example, dairy commodity prices in global markets, in the European Union and the UK have increased significantly in the past 12 months, but the prices paid to farmers have hardly moved at all.

The gross retail profit on milk production has increased in 2010 while the profits of the rest of the supply chain have fallen. During 2010, a number of dairy companies announced their greatest profits ever, but just a few months later, the climate had changed and they were releasing profit warnings.

The dairy industry in this country should be enjoying benefits from the growth in demand for the produce because Wales has efficient milk producers and a good climate for milk production. However, the industry has moved from one crisis to another and has had to suffer a decade of underinvestment and low profitability.

You could argue that that is partially because of its legacy as a regulated industry, as it was until the mid-1990s, and perhaps a lack of efficiency and competitiveness in processing. However, to the ordinary dairy farmer, the greatest problem, without any doubt, is the way in which dairy contracts work. The dairy contract is central to forming the business relationship between farmers and milk buyers. It will come as no surprise to anyone that those documents are far too often too one-sided and ensure that the farmer takes most of the risk for the lowest gain.

Milk is a perishable product, of course, which

sy'n rhaid ei gasglu'n ddyddiol. Yn aml iawn, felly, nid oes gan ffermwyr llaeth fawr o ddewis ond arwyddo'r cytundebau a gynigir iddynt oherwydd mae'n rhaid i'r llaeth barhau i lifo oddi ar y fferm. Cânt eu cloi i mewn i gytundebau â chyfnod rhybudd o 18 mis, sy'n llesteirio'r posibilrwydd o greu marchnad fwy cystadleuol am laeth crai, lle byddai ffermwyr yn gallu symud yn haws, efallai, o un prynwr i'r llall.

Yn waeth na hynny, nid yw'r mwyafrif o gytundebau llaeth yn cynnig unrhyw sicrwydd nac eglurder am y pris a delir i'r ffermwr o fis i fis. Mae newidiadau yn y pris yn aml yn digwydd ar fyr rybudd ac ar fympwy a disgresiwn y prynwr llaeth. Nid oes gan y ffermwr llaeth unrhyw gymal gadael yn ei gytundeb i symud i brynwr arall os yw'r pris yn annerbyniol.

Mae cytundebau llaeth hefyd, gan amlaf, yn allgynhwysol, yn gorfodi'r ffermwr i werthu ei laeth i un prynwr ac un prynwr yn unig, sy'n rhywbeth arall sy'n llesteirio cystadleuaeth. Fodd bynnag, beth yw goblygiadau hyn i ni yng Nghymru? Yr un amlycaf yw bod ffermwyr Cymru yn derbyn y pris isaf ond un ymhlith ffermwyr Ewrop am eu llaeth. Ar gyfartaledd, telir 31c y litr i ffermwyr llaeth Ewrop, tra bod ffermwyr Cymru yn derbyn, ar gyfartaledd, 27.5c y litr am yn union yr un cynnyrch. Os feddylwch fod 1.6 biliwn litr o laeth yn cael ei werthu ar gyfartaledd o 4c y litr yn llai na'i werth mewn gwirionedd, mae hynny'n cynrychioli £65 miliwn sy'n cael ei golli i economi Cymru ac economi wledig Cymru yn benodol bob blwyddyn.

Ar yr un pryd, mae costau cynhyrchu llaeth wedi cynyddu, boed yn danwydd, yn wrtaith neu'n borthiant. Maent i gyd yn costio mwy erbyn hyn. Gyda chost cynhyrchu llaeth yn fwy na 31c y litr ar hyn o bryd, mae ffermwyr llaeth Cymru yn wynebu gaeaf caled a dweud y lleiaf. Yn y cyfamser, mae'r archfarchnadoedd yn mwynhau oes aur ac yn mwynhau lefelau elw sy'n dod â dŵr i'n llygaid ni i gyd, yr wyf yn siŵr. Maent yn cystadlu am y gorau i gynnig y llaeth rhataf, sy'n ychwanegu at yr angen i sicrhau nad yw'r manwerthwyr yn camddefnyddio eu pŵer dros y cynhyrchwyr.

has to be collected daily. Very often, therefore, dairy farmers do not have much choice but to sign the contracts that are offered to them because the milk has to continue to flow from the farms. They are locked into contracts with an 18-month notice period that hinders the possibility of creating a more competitive market for raw milk where farmers could find it easier to move, possibly, from one buyer to another.

Worse than that, most of the dairy contracts do not provide any certainty or clarity about the price that will be paid to farmers from one month to the next. Changes in prices often happen with little notice and at the discretion of the buyer. Dairy farmers do not have an exit clause in their contract to move to another buyer if the price is not acceptable to them.

Milk contracts are most often exclusive, forcing the farmer to sell to a certain buyer and only one buyer, which is another thing that hampers competition. However, what are the implications of this for us in Wales? The most apparent is that farmers in Wales receive the lowest but one price among European farmers for their milk. The average price paid to dairy farmers in Europe is 31p per litre, while Welsh farmers receive, on average, 27.5p per litre for the same product. When you think about it, that means that, on average, 1.6 billion litres of milk are sold for 4p less per litre than its actual value, which represents £65 million lost to the Welsh economy and, specifically, the rural economy in Wales annually.

At the same time, the costs of milk production have increased, be it fuel, fertiliser or feed. All of those are more expensive now. With the cost of milk production at more than 31p per litre currently, farmers in Wales are facing a very hard winter to say the very least. In the meantime, the supermarkets are enjoying a golden era and enjoying profit levels that are eye-watering for us all, I am sure. They are competing to offer the cheapest milk, which adds to the need to ensure that the retailers do not misuse their power over the producers.

Daw hynny â mi at welliant y Ceidwadwyr, sy'n welliant na fyddwn yn ei gefnogi, yr wyf yn ofni, oherwydd yr oeddwn i ac eraill wedi ein siomi'n fawr na fydd gan yr ombwdsmon arfaethedig y grym i osod cosbau priodol; ni fydd ond yn gallu enwi a chywilyddio tramgwyddwyr. Y broblem yw ein bod yn gwybod eisoes pwy yw'r troseddwyr. Yr hyn sydd ei angen yw ombwdsmon effeithiol a grymus a fydd yn gallu dirwyo'r busnesau hyn sy'n tramgwyddo o'r cychwyn cyntaf, nid dyfarnwyr diddannedd fel y cawn o dan y trefniant arfaethedig.

Mae'r gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen ar y diwydiant llaeth yn estyn i'r trafodaethau ar ddiwygio PAC hefyd. Mae goblygiadau sylweddol iawn i ffermwyr llaeth Cymru wrth symud o'r taliadau hanesyddol—yr wyf yn gwybod bod y Dirprwy Weinidog yn ymwybodol iawn o'r bygythiadau sylweddol a ddaw o'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yng nghyd-destun y cynnig hwn heddiw, mae pecyn llaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n rhan o argymhellion PAC yn cynnig cyfle ychwanegol, yn enwedig o safbwynt cyflwyno mwy o dryloywder a thegwch o ran sut y mae prisiau llaeth yn cael eu pennu. Hefyd, yn sgil diddymu'r cwotas llaeth mewn rhai blynnydoedd, bydd yn helpu i sicrhau nad y prynwyr llaeth fydd yn pennu drwy'u cytundebau lle y bydd llaeth yn cael ei gynhyrchu a faint ohono a fydd yn cael ei gynhyrchu.

Ar ben cynhyrchu llaeth ar golled o dan gytundebau annheg a'r holl ansicrwydd a darogan gwae o gylch PAC, mae ffactor arall sy'n tanseilio hyder a moral y diwydiant llaeth, sef TB mewn gwartheg. Mae bron 700 o wartheg yn cael eu colli bob mis yng Nghymru oherwydd TB—mae 12,000 o wartheg wedi eu difa mewn llai na 18 mis, a chanran helaeth o'r rheini yn wartheg godro ar eu mwyaf cynhyrchiol. Mae cwestiynau mawr, fel yr ydym eisoes wedi eu trafod, ynglŷn ag amddiffyn lles yr anifeiliaid hynny. Yr ydym yn gwybod am yr effaith emosiynol ar y teuluoedd sy'n ffermio a sut y mae hynny'n cyfrannu at yr iselder a digalondid a brofir yn aml o fewn y sector hwn. Nid yw'r raddfa frawychus honno o golledion yn un y gall y diwydiant barhau i'w goddef os ydyw am fod yn gystadleuol

That brings me to the Conservative amendment, an amendment that we shall not be supporting, I am afraid, because I and others have been very disappointed that the proposed ombudsman will not have the power to properly penalise offending businesses, but only to name and shame. The problem is that we already know who the offenders are. What is needed is an effective and powerful ombudsman who can penalise these businesses that offend from the very outset, not the toothless adjudicator that we will see under the proposed system.

The support required for the dairy industry extends to the discussion on CAP reform as well. There are very significant implications for Welsh dairy farmers in moving from historic payments—and I know that the Deputy Minister is very aware of those significant threats that will emerge from that change. However, in the context of this motion today, the European Union milk package that is part of the CAP recommendations offers an additional opportunity, particularly in terms of providing more transparency and fairness with regard to the way in which prices are set. Furthermore, after the abolition of milk quotas in a few years' time, it will help to ensure that it is not the buyers through their contracts who will decide where milk will be produced and how much will be produced.

With milk production at a loss under unfair contract arrangements and with all the uncertainty around the CAP, there is another factor that is undermining the morale and confidence of the dairy industry, namely bovine TB. Almost 700 cattle are lost monthly in Wales because of TB—12,000 have been slaughtered in less than 18 months, and a large percentage of those were dairy cattle at their most productive. There are huge questions, as we have already discussed, about the welfare of those animals. We know about the emotional impact on the farming families and how that can contribute to the depression and despondency often experienced by those working in the sector. That frightening level of loss is not one that the industry can sustain if it is to be competitive in the domestic and global

yn y marchnadoedd domestig a byd eang. markets.

Mae'r amser wedi dod, felly, i Lywodraeth Cymru gamu i'r adwy a chwarae ei rhan wrth geisio sicrhau perthynas tecach rhwng ffermwyr llaeth Cymru a chynhyrchwyr llaeth. Nodais y cyfeiriad yn rhaglen Llywodraeth Cymru at ddefnyddio arfer gorau yn y sector llaeth a chymryd arweiniad o waith Hybu Cig Cymru er mwyn datblygu a chryfhau dull sector o ddatblygu diwydiannau eraill yng Nghymru. Nid oedd amserlen ar gyfer hynny. Nid oedd mwy o fanylion na hynny, ond yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen mewn gobaith i glywed mwy o bosibl gan y Dirprwy Weinidog am fwradau'r Llywodraeth i'r perwyl hwn pan fydd yn ymateb i'r ddadl hon heddiw.

Therefore, the time has come for the Welsh Government to step into the breach and play its part in trying to ensure a fair relationship between dairy farmers in Wales and milk retailers. I noted that there was a reference in the Welsh Government's programme to using best practice in the dairy sector and taking a lead from the work of Hybu Cig Cymru in developing a sectoral approach to the development of other industries in Wales. There was no timetable for that. There were no more details than that, but I look forward hopefully to possibly hearing more from the Deputy Minister about the Government's intentions in that regard as he responds to this debate today.

Mae rôl i'r Llywodraeth o ran gosod allan ei disgwiliadau sylfaenol o safbwynt cytundebau llaeth safonol, cod ymarfer i sicrhau trafodion teg rhwng ffermwyr a chwmnïau llaeth, a'r angen i edrych ar gynhyrchu gwybodaeth fwy tryloyw am brisiau cyfanwerthu a dosbarthiad elw o fewn y gadwyn gyflenwi llaeth.

There is a role for Government in setting out its fundamental expectations in terms of standard dairy contracts, code of practice to ensure fair practices between farmers and dairy companies, and the need to look at the production of more transparent information about wholesale prices and the distribution of profit within the dairy supply chain.

4.15 p.m.

Mae nifer ohonom yn ymwybodol o'r cytundeb mae'r NFU wedi ei lunio. Awgrymaf fod hwnnw'n fan cychwyn cystal â dim o ran y posibilrwydd o ddatblygu fersiwn y byddai'r Llywodraeth hon yn barod i'w hyrwyddo.

Many of us will be aware of the contract that the NFU has drawn up. I suggest that that would be as good a starting point as any for the possibility of developing a version that the Government here would be willing to promote.

Gwyddom fod digon o elw yn y gadwyn gyflenwi i sicrhau bod pob haen yn dod yn broffidiol. Ar hyn o bryd, wrth gwrs, mae'r cynhyrchwyr yn cael eu gwasgu i'r fath raddau bod eu hanner erbyn hyn wedi gadael y diwydiant. Mae Cymru ymysg prif gynhyrchwyr llaeth Ewrop. Mae'n sector hynod bwysig i ni. Mae'n darparu ac yn cefnogi cannoedd ar gannoedd o swyddi yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Mae'n ddiwydiant yr ydym yn falch ohono, ond mae'r amser wedi dod i weithredu i'w amddiffyn.

We know that there is plenty of profit within the supply chain to ensure that every tier becomes profitable. As things stand, of course, the producers are squeezed to such an extent that half of them have now left the industry. Wales is one of Europe's main milk producers. It is an extremely important sector for us. It provides and supports hundreds of jobs in our rural communities. It is an industry of which we are proud, but the time has come to take action to protect it.

*Gwelliant 1 William Graham*

*Amendment 1 William Graham*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add new point at end of motion:*

*Yn croesawu gwaith Llywodraeth y DU i gyflwyno Dyfarnwr y Cod Cyflenwi Bwydydd i fonitro ac i orfodi'r Cod Ymarfer Cyflenwi Bwydydd.*

**Antoinette Sandbach:** I move amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

I am grateful that Plaid Cymru has tabled this debate. There is absolutely no doubt that there is a very real need to address a declining dairy industry in Wales. In April 2002, there were 3,181 producers in Wales. By October 2011, that figure had declined to fewer than 2,000 producers. That represents a reduction of just over a third of producers. That is a serious loss to the Welsh economy.

In moving the amendment, I refer back to the 2008 Competition Commission report, which recommended the introduction of a grocery code adjudicator, largely due to unequal bargaining power and the transfer of risk from big retailers to farmers. One of the requirements of the new code was to prohibit grocery retailers from making retrospective adjustments to the terms and conditions of supply. The importance of a grocery code adjudicator can be seen in the fact that, only last week, *The Grocer* reported that Asda was reducing the premium paid to dairy farmers by 20 per cent. This was despite Asda's statement that reductions in the price of milk would not be at the expense of its dairy farmers. Meanwhile, Tesco has increased the amount it pays to its dairy farmer members, despite cutting the price of its milk to consumers. That is an example, perhaps, of how the big supermarkets are able to do this. They have increased their share of the milk price from 19 per cent in 2000 to 34 per cent in 2009-10. They have retained a far greater proportion of the price, which we say should go back to the farmer.

During the same period, the amount that dairy farmers received dropped by 7 per cent. That brings home the importance of the grocery code adjudicator. The adjudicator would prohibit large grocery retailers from making retrospective adjustments to the terms and conditions of supply, requiring large grocery retailers to deal fairly and

*Welcomes work by the UK Government to introduce a Groceries Code Adjudicator to monitor and enforce the Groceries Supply Code of Practice.*

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod Plaid Cymru wedi cyflwyno'r ddaadl hon. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth o gwbl bod gwir angen fynd i'r afael â dirywiad y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru. Ym mis Ebrill 2002, roedd 3,181 o gynhyrchwyr yng Nghymru. Erbyn Hydref 2011, roedd y ffigur hwnnw wedi gostwng i lai na 2,000 o gynhyrchwyr. Mae hynny'n cynrychioli gostyngiad o ychydig dros draean o gynhyrchwyr. Mae hynny'n golled ddifrifol i economi Cymru.

Wrth gynnig y gwelliant, cyfeiriai yn ôl at adroddiad y Comisiwn Cystadleuaeth yn 2008, sy'n argymhell cyflwyno dyfarnwr y cod bwydydd, i raddau helaeth oherwydd grym bargeinio anghyfartal a throsglwyddo risg o'r manwerthwyr mawr i ffermwyr. Roedd un o ofynion y cod newydd yn gwahardd manwerthwyr bwyd rhag gwneud addasiadau ôl-weithredol i delerau ac amodau cyflenwi. Gwelwyd pwysigrwydd dyfarnwr y cod bwydydd dim ond yr wythnos diwethaf, pan adroddodd *The Grocer* bod Asda yn lleihau'r premiwm a delir i ffermwyr llaeth gan 20 y cant. Roedd hyn er gwaethaf datganiad Asda na fyddai gostyngiadau yn y pris llaeth ar draul ei ffermwyr llaeth. Yn y cyfamser, mae Tesco wedi cynyddu'r swm y mae'n talu i'w aelodau ffermwr llaeth, er gwaethaf torri pris ei laeth i ddefnyddwyr. Dyna enghraifft, efallai, o sut y mae archfarchnadoedd mawr yn gallu gwneud hyn. Maent wedi cynyddu eu cyfran o'r pris llaeth o 19 y cant yn 2000 i 34 y cant yn 2009-10. Maent wedi cadw cyfran uwch o lawer o'r pris, y dywedwn ni y dylai fynd yn ôl at y ffermwr.

Yn ystod yr un cyfnod, gostyngodd y swm a gafodd ffermwyr llaeth gan 7 y cant. Mae hynny'n dangos pwysigrwydd dyfarnwr y cod bwydydd. Byddai'r dyfarnwr yn gwahardd manwerthwyr bwyd mawr rhag gwneud addasiadau ôl-weithredol i delerau ac amodau cyflenwi, a fydd yn gorfodi manwerthwyr bwyd mawr i ymdrin yn deg ac



lawfully with their suppliers. It should prohibit large grocery retailers from entering into arrangements with suppliers that result in dairy farmers being held liable for losses due to shrinkage or wastage. It will also require grocery retailers to keep written records of all agreements with suppliers. These and other important steps were established by the grocery code. I know that Plaid Cymru has said that it will not support our amendment, but I would invite its Members to reconsider because, in the Bill, there is provision for the Secretary of State to introduce an Order at a later date, if he or she deems it necessary, that would enable the adjudicator to impose financial penalties. Setting up the adjudicator role to help regulate and deal with supply is incredibly important. It is clear that dairy farmers in Wales need such a post, and the steps being taken by the European Union on the development that may happen next year in relation to milk producers will be important.

Competition in the UK marketplace is not a matter that can be dealt with by the Assembly, and I was grateful that Plaid Cymru recognised that there are European and UK elements to this motion. It is for that reason that the Conservatives will support the Plaid Cymru motion. We have some reservation over the drafting of the first part, where it indicates that there is an inherent problem with supply. We recognise that there are clearly problems within the supply chain, but we do not say that they apply across all areas of the supply chain. It is vital that dairy producers in Wales get a more level playing field with the supermarkets; the steps taken by Asda last week demonstrated more than adequately the problems that dairy farmers face. For those reasons, we will support the motion.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn diolch am gefnogaeth grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru i'r cynnig. Y rheswm nad ydym yn gallu cefnogi eich gwelliant yw ein bod yn teimlo na fydd y mesurau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn cael effaith wirioneddol ar sefyllfa cynhyrchwyr llaeth Cymru. Yr ydym o'r farn bod y mesurau yn ddi-

yn gyfreithlon â'u cyflenwyr. Dylid gwahardd manwerthwyr bwyd mawr rhag gwneud trefniadau â chyflenwyr sy'n arwain at ffermwyr llaeth yn ysgwyddo unrhyw golledion oherwydd traul neu leihad. Bydd hefyd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i fanwerthwyr bwyd i gadw cofnodion ysgrifenedig o bob cytundeb gyda chyflenwyr. Sefydlwyd y rhain a chamau pwysig eraill gan y cod bwydydd. Gwn fod Plaid Cymru wedi dweud na fydd yn cefnogi ein gwelliant, ond yr wyf yn gwahodd ei haelodau i ailystyried oherwydd, yn y Bil, ceir darpariaeth i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i gyflwyno Gorchymyn yn ddiweddarach, os tybir ef neu hi ei bod yn angenrheidiol, a fyddai'n galluogi'r dyfarnwr i osod cosbau ariannol. Mae sefydlu rôl y dyfarnwr i helpu i reoleiddio ac ymdrin â chyflenwad yn hynod o bwysig. Mae'n amlwg bod angen ar ffermwyr llaeth yng Nghymru swydd o'r fath, a bydd y camau a gymerir gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar ddatblygu a all ddigwydd y flwyddyn nesaf mewn perthynas â chynhyrchwyr llaeth yn bwysig.

Nid yw cystadleuaeth ym marchnad y DU yn fater y gall y Cynulliad ymdrin ag ef, ac yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar bod Plaid Cymru yn cydnabod bod elfennau Ewropeaidd a DU i'r cynnig hwn. Y mae am y rheswm hwnnw y bydd y Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi cynnig Plaid Cymru. Mae gennym rai amheuan dros ddrafftio'r rhan gyntaf, lle mae'n dangos fod problem gynhenid ynghlwm â chyflenwi. Rydym yn cydnabod ei fod yn amlwg bod problemau o fewn y gadwyn gyflenwi, ond nid ydym yn dweud eu bod yn berthnasol ar draws holl feysydd y gadwyn gyflenwi. Mae'n hanfodol bod cynhyrchwyr llaeth yng Nghymru yn cael mwy o chwarae teg gyda'r archfarchnadoedd; dangosodd y camau a gymerwyd gan Asda yr wythnos diwethaf yn glir y problemau sy'n wynebu ffermwyr llaeth. Am y rhesymau hynny, cefnogwn y cynnig.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I thank the Welsh Conservative group for its support for the motion. The reason why we are unable to support your amendment is that we feel that the measures implemented by the UK Government will not really impact upon the situation of Welsh dairy producers. We think that the measures lack teeth. We would have

ddannedd. Byddem wedi gobeithio y byddai Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi ymateb i'r alwad a wnaethpwyd yn gyntaf gan Simon Thomas pan oedd yn Aelod Seneddol dros Geredigion yn 2003-04 am ombwdsmon a fyddai'n gyfrifol am y diwydiant llaeth. Byddai ombwdsmon o'r fath yn sicrhau bod cynhyrchwyr llaeth yng Nghymru yn cael pris teg am eu cynnyrch, ac felly'n sicrhau tryloywder drwy'r broses o gynhyrchu, prosesu a gwerthu llaeth, fel ein bod yn glir ynglŷn â lle yn union mae'r elw i'w gael. Yr ydym yn dal i chwilio am yr eglurder hwnnw.

Mae Llyr wedi amlinellu rhai o'r problemau sydd yn wynebu cynhyrchwyr llaeth yng Nghymru. Er ein bod yn aml yn canolbwyntio ar y newyddion drwg, yr wyf am ddechrau gyda'r newyddion da am y ganolfan brosesu newydd yn Hendy-gwyn, sy'n newyddion da iawn i'r diwydiant llaeth. Mae rhai ohonom yn cofio'r dyddiau du hynny yn 1992 pan gaewyd y ffatri laeth yn Hendy-gwyn, a oedd ar un adeg yn darparu cannoedd o swyddi yn sir Gaerfyrddin o fewn y diwydiant llaeth. Os cofiaf yn iawn, yr oedd dros 100 o swyddi yno pan gaewyd y ffatri yn 1992. Yr ydym yn sôn am greu degau o swyddi ar hyn o bryd, ond mae gobeithion y bydd nifer y gweithwyr yn cynyddu. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig am y ganolfan brosesu yn Hendy-gwyn yw ei bod yn edrych ar y posibiladau o ychwanegu gwerth at y cynnyrch sylfaenol. Dyna oedd y diffyg sylfaenol gyda'r ffatri laeth yn ôl yn y 1990au—yr oedd wedi methu'r cyfle i ychwanegu at werth y cynnyrch sylfaenol.

Fodd bynnag, mae problemau sylfaenol, ac yr ydym yn mawr obeithio y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny. Yr wyf am amlinellu rhai meysydd lle gallai ymyrryd. Yn gyntaf, mae angen amlwg am drafodaethau rhwng pawb sydd yn rhan o'r gadwyn cynhyrchu llaeth yng Nghymru. Pan yr oeddwn yn gadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor Materion Gwledig ar ddiwedd y 1990au, yn y Cynulliad cyntaf, yr wyf yn cofio ceisio cael yr holl bobl hyn ynghyd, yn enwedig yr archfarchnadoedd, i sicrhau bod y cynhyrchwyr yn cael pris teilwng am eu llaeth. Mae dal angen gwneud y gwaith hwnnw, a mawr obeithiaf y byddwch yn manteisio, Ddirprwy Weinidog, ar y cyfle i gael y bobl hynny ynghyd er mwyn sicrhau

hoped that the UK Government would have responded to the call first made by Simon Thomas when he was Member of Parliament for Ceredigion in 2003-04, for an ombudsman to be responsible for the dairy industry. Such an ombudsman would ensure that dairy producers in Wales received a fair price for their product, thereby ensuring transparency through the process of producing, processing and selling milk, so that we know exactly where the profits are to be had. We are still waiting for that clarity.

Llyr has outlined some of the problems facing dairy producers in Wales. Even though we often focus on bad news, I am going to start with the good news about the new processing plant in Whitland, which is very good news for the dairy industry. Some of us will remember the dark days of 1992 when the dairy plant was closed in Whitland; the plant once provided hundreds of jobs in Carmarthenshire in the dairy industry. If I remember correctly, there were more than 100 jobs there when the plant was closed in 1992. We are now talking about creating tens of jobs, but there is hope that the numbers will increase. What is important about the processing plant in Whitland is that it looks at the possibility of adding value to the core product. That was the fundamental deficiency with the original plant back in the 1990s—it missed the opportunity of adding value to the core product.

However, there are fundamental problems, and we sincerely hope that the Deputy Minister will get to grips with those problems. I will outline some areas in which he can intervene. First, there is a clear need for discussions between everyone involved in the dairy supply chain in Wales. When I chaired the Rural Development Subcommittee at the end of the 1990s, in the first Assembly, I remember trying to get all these people together, especially the supermarkets, to ensure that the producers received a fair price for their milk. There is still a need to do that work, and I sincerely hope that you will take advantage, Deputy Minister, of the opportunity to get those people together in order to ensure that everyone co-operates

bod pawb yn cydweithio o fewn y gadwyn honno.

Yr ydym yn gwybod pwy sydd yn dioddef yn y broses honno—y sawl sy'n cynhyrchu'r llaeth. Nid oes angen imi ddweud wrthy ch nad oes cadwyn yn bodoli heb y sawl sy'n cynhyrchu'r llaeth. Mae o fudd i bawb arall yn y gadwyn i sicrhau bod y sawl sy'n cynhyrchu yn cael pris teilwng. Yr oeddwn mewn sioe laeth yn sir Gaerfyrddin rai wythnosau yn ôl, ac ar y noson cyn y sioe yr oedd Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru wedi trefnu noson lle'r oedd aelod o'r NFU yn yr Alban yn esbonio sut yr oedd wedi creu, bron o ddim, fuches laeth hynod lwyddiannus, ac yn bwysicach na hynny, sut yr oedd wedi mynd ati i greu cwmni o gynhyrchwyr llaeth er mwyn trafod cytundebau gyda'r archfarchnadoedd—cytundebau am dri neu chwe mis, yn hytrach na chytundebau hirdymor, a oedd o fantais i'r cynhyrchwyr. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog geisio sicrhau ein bod yn elwa o'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd gyda'r NFU yn yr Alban.

Y mater olaf yr wyf am gyfeirio ato yn fyr yw TB—mae Llyr eisoes wedi cyfeirio at hyn. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod beth yw safbwynt y Dirprwy Weinidog; gwnaeth ei safbwynt yn glir yn huawdl iawn yn y Siambr yn ystod y trydydd Cynulliad. Yr oedd yn un o'r bobl ddewr hynny o fewn y Blaid Lafur a oedd yn cefnogi'r cynllun difa—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please conclude.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It is a very important point, Deputy Presiding Officer. We know what the Deputy Minister's view is on the cull; he made his view very clear in the last Assembly. We hope that he will continue to put pressure on his fellow Ministers to ensure that the comprehensive policy—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf William Powell.

**William Powell:** I am pleased to have the opportunity to contribute to this important debate. The Welsh dairy industry is indeed in crisis, as we have heard. With the prospect of significant common agriculture policy

within that chain.

We know who suffers in that process—the milk producers. I do not have to tell you that without the milk producers there will be no chain. It benefits all those in the chain to ensure that the producers get a fair price. I was at a dairy show in Carmarthenshire a few weeks ago, and on the night before the show the Farmers Union of Wales had arranged an event where an NFU member from Scotland explained how he had created a very successful dairy herd from almost nothing and, more importantly, how he had set about establishing a company of dairy producers in order to discuss contracts with the supermarkets—they were contracts for three or six months, rather than long-term contracts, which were of benefit to the producers. I hope that the Deputy Minister will be able to try to ensure that we can take advantage of what has happened with the NFU in Scotland.

The final matter that I will refer to is TB—Llyr has already referred to this. We all know what the Deputy Minister's position is; he made his views very clear in the Chamber during the third Assembly. He was one of those brave souls in the Labour Party who supported the cull—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gorffennwch os gwelwch yn dda.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n bwynt pwysig iawn, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Gwyddom beth yw barn y Dirprwy Weinidog ar y difa; gwnaeth ei farn yn glir iawn yn y Cynulliad diwethaf. Rydym yn gobeithio y bydd yn parhau i roi pwysau ar ei gyd-Weinidogion i sicrhau bod y polisi cynhwysfawr—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call William Powell.

**William Powell:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl bwysig hon. Yn wir, mae diwydiant llaeth Cymru mewn argyfwng, fel yr ydym wedi clywed. Gyda phosibilrwydd o ddiwygiadau sylweddol i'r

reforms on the horizon, this is a much needed and timely debate. We are grateful to Plaid Cymru for bringing it forward.

However, in the motion there is more emphasis on describing the demise of the industry and its problems rather than on solutions. With that in mind, we shall be supporting the motion, as well as the Conservative amendment put forward in the name of William Graham, as we feel that the grocery regulator does have a role to play and is a useful start in addressing some of the injustices that apply within the sector. Since the demise of the Milk Marketing Board in the 1980s, we have seen an unsustainable downward spiral in the profit margins of our dairy farmers. If we fail to take advantage of the opportunities for reform now, as offered to us, we run the real risk of seeing this vital industry effectively disappearing altogether.

In conversations that I have had over recent days with dairy farmers, some have acknowledged that, to a degree, they could have been responsible for the situation themselves through their own short-sightedness—as one described it, quite candidly—in previous dealings. However, far more than that, we need to be aware that the Assembly's support is vital in bringing further prospects for the blossoming of this vital Welsh industry.

In light of the recently published draft proposals for CAP reform from the European Commission, it is vital that the Welsh Government undertakes, as a matter of urgency, specific modelling to establish the level of additional support that may be required if the dairy sector appears to be particularly adversely affected by the proposals coming forward from the Commissioner. As an Assembly, we must move to support the implementation of a baseline raw milk contract, under which farmers are paid a fair price for what they produce.

4.30 p.m.

As things stand, the average UK farm-gate price is 27p, while production costs regularly

polisi amaethyddiaeth cyffredin ar y gorwel, mae hon yn ddadl amserol a mawr angen. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i Blaid Cymru am ei gyflwyno.

Fodd bynnag, yn y cynnig, mae mwy o bwyslais ar ddisgrifio cymyniad y diwydiant a'i broblemau yn hytrach nag ar atebion. Gyda hynny mewn golwg, byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig, yn ogystal â gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr a gyflwynwyd yn enw William Graham, gan ein bod yn teimlo bod gan y rheoleiddiwr bwyd rôl i'w chwarae a'i fod yn fan cychwyn defnyddiol wrth fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r anghyfiawnderau sydd i'w gweld o fewn y sector. Ers cymyniad y Bwrdd Marchnata Llaeth yn y 1980au, yr ydym wedi gweld dirywiad anghynladwy mewn elw ein ffermwyr llaeth. Os ydym yn methu i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd ar gyfer diwygio yn awr, fel y cynigir i ni, yr ydym mewn perygl gwirioneddol o weld y diwydiant hollbwysig hwn yn diflannu'n gyfan gwbl.

Mewn sgysiau y cefais dros y dyddiau diwethaf gyda ffermwyr llaeth, mae rhai wedi cydnabod, i raddau, eu bod efallai'n gyfrifol am y sefyllfa eu hunain drwy eu diffyg—fel y disgrifiodd un yn blwmp ac yn blaen—o ran y ffordd yr oeddent wedi gweithredu cyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, yn fwy na hynny, mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol bod cymorth y Cynulliad yn hanfodol wrth ddod â chyfleoedd pellach i dyfu'r diwydiant Cymreig hanfodol hwn.

Yng ngoleuni'r cynigion drafft a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar ar gyfer diwygio'r PAC gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, mae'n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynnal, fel mater o frys, modelu penodol i sefydlu lefel y cymorth ychwanegol efallai bydd ei angen os ymddengys y bydd effaith arbennig o andwyol ar y sector llaeth o ganlyniad i'r cynigion y cyflwynir gan y Comisiynydd. Fel Cynulliad, rhaid inni symud i gefnogi gweithredu'r contract llaeth amrwd sylfaenol, lle y caiff ffermwyr eu talu pris teg am eu cynnyrch.

Fel y saif pethau, pris cyfartalog y DU wrth-gât-y-fferm yw 27c, tra bod costau cynhyrchu

exceed 31p for the reasons that we have already heard described. According to the NFU, this is one of the largest discrepancies in the whole of the European Union; it needs to change, and to change soon. For years, we have acknowledged the need for fair trade around the world, and rightly so, yet we have continued to neglect its principles closer to home. That must stop.

However, in drawing up such a contract, we also need to take account of the triple-layered structure of the industry's supply chain: the producers; the processors; and the retailers. This is where the proposals that have informed this debate, to some extent, fall down and where I would argue that we can push further as an Assembly. When Ms Delyth Davies of the Dairy Development Centre gave evidence last year to the Rural Development Sub-committee, she argued that such farm-gate contracts mainly exist between producers and processors and that they consistently fail to take account of the retailers at the end of the supply chain. It is critical, when designing the implementation of such contracts, that we ensure that all three stakeholders are fully considered and included in our thinking.

Furthermore, we must ensure that the processor does not become what has been described in another place as 'the squeezed middle'. A processor whose need is to make a profit is also essential to the survival of the Welsh dairy sector. Data produced by DairyCo and used by the National Federation of Women's Institutes in its ongoing dairy campaign—and as the Deputy Minister knows, when the Women's Institute speaks, we should listen—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Tony Blair learned that.

**William Powell:** Absolutely. [*Laughter.*] These demonstrate that, over the last decade, the share of the retail price that is effectively passed to the processor has reduced from 37 per cent to 29 per cent, while the share that is effectively passed to the producer has also reduced from 44 per cent to 37 per cent. The

yn aml yn fwy na 31c am y rhesymau a glywsom eisoes yn cael eu disgrifio. Yn ôl Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr, dyma un o'r anghysondebau mwyaf yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd gyfan; mae angen iddo newid, a newid cyn bo hir. Ers blynyddoedd, yr ydym wedi cydnabod bod angen masnach deg o amgylch y byd, a hynny'n gwbl briodol, eto rydym wedi dal i esgeuluso ei egwyddorion yn agosach at adref. Mae'n rhaid i hynny ddod i ben.

Fodd bynnag, wrth lunio contract o'r fath, mae angen inni hefyd ystyried strwythur tair-haen cadwyn gyflenwi'r diwydiant: y cynhyrchwyr; y proseswyr; a'r manwerthwyr. Dyma lle mae'r cynigion sydd wedi llywio'r ddadl hon, i ryw raddau, yn cwmpo a lle byddwn yn dadlau y gallwn wthio ymhellach fel Cynulliad. Pan roddodd Ms Delyth Davies o'r Ganolfan Datblygu Llaeth dystiolaeth y llynedd i'r Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig, dadleuodd bod contractau wrth-gât-y-fferm o'r fath yn bodoli rhwng cynhyrchwyr a phroseswyr yn bennaf ac nad ydynt yn gyson cymryd i ystyriaeth y manwerthwyr ar ddiwedd y gadwyn gyflenwi. Mae'n hanfodol, wrth ddylunio'r broses o weithredu contractau o'r fath, ein bod yn sicrhau bod pob un o'r tri o randdeiliaid yn cael eu hystyried a'u cynnwys yn llawn yn ein meddylfryd.

At hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw'r prosesydd yn cael ei 'wasgu yn y canol' fel y disgrifir mewn lle arall. Mae prosesydd sydd angen gwneud elw hefyd yn hanfodol i barhad y sector llaeth yng Nghymru. Mae data a gynhyrchwyd gan DairyCo a ddefnyddiwyd gan Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol Sefydliad y Merched yn ei ymgyrch llaeth barhaus—ac fel y gwyr y Dirprwy Weinidog, pan fo Sefydliad y Merched yn siarad, dylem wrando—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dysgodd Tony Blair hynny.

**William Powell:** Yn hollol. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'r rhain yn dangos, dros y degawd diwethaf, fod cyfran y pris manwerthu a gaiff ei throsglwyddo i'r prosesydd wedi lleihau o 37 y cant i 29 y cant, tra bod y gyfran a gaiff ei throsglwyddo i'r cynhyrchydd hefyd wedi gostwng o 44 y cant i 37 y cant. Mae'r un

same data demonstrate that, in the same period, retailers have seen their share grow from 20 per cent to 34 per cent. That is a massive increase.

We all know that Wales is full of such processors, be they Cowpots Ice Cream, Proper Welsh Milk Co Ltd—the news of which last week Rhodri Glyn has quite rightly celebrated in relation to Whitland—or Rachel's Organic in Ceredigion. We must ensure that our actions in support of these proposals do not act to their detriment. That is why the subsequent proposals for an enforceable code of practice and greater transparency need to be adopted as a matter of urgency. We must ensure that all three aspects of the chain have a fair crack of the whip. There is enough profit to go around, so we must ensure that it is distributed equitably.

**Simon Thomas:** I am grateful for the opportunity to take part in this debate as someone who represents a region with a considerable amount of dairy industry within it and a region that demonstrates the vast changes that are now happening within the industry and includes the vast range of practices pertaining to that industry now. I agree with William Powell when he says that we need to look at the future and not just concern ourselves with the past. Undoubtedly, the dairy industry in Wales has had a difficult recent past and, although the international price of dairy products is now improving, that is not necessarily filtering down to the dairy farmer. Therefore, we need to analyse, as we are doing in this debate, some of the steps that we can take and some of the steps that the Government can support to improve the delivery of that better international commodity price down to the farmer. It is a socialist thing to do, because if the market is not working and if international commodity prices are not delivering for the producer, we should intervene in that market. It is a core principle of a mixed-market economy and a core principle for anyone who stands for social democratic traditions to try to adjust the market, if necessary, through regulation.

data yn dangos bod manwerthwyr, yn yr un cyfnod, wedi gweld eu cyfran yn tyfu o 20 y cant i 34 y cant. Mae hynny'n gynydd enfawr.

Gwyddom oll fod Cymru'n llawn o broseswyr o'r fath, boed yn hufen iâ Cowpots, Proper Welsh Milk Co Ltd—ac fe ddathlwyd newyddion hwnnw'r wythnos diwethaf gan Rhodri Glyn mewn perthynas â Hendy-gwyn, yn gwbl briodol—neu Rachel's Organic yng Ngheredigion. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw'n camau i gefnogi'r cynigion hyn yn gweithredu er anfantais iddynt hwy. Dyna pam fod angen mabwysiadu'r cynigion dilynol ar gyfer cod ymarfer y gellid ei orfodi a mwy o dryloywder fel mater o frys. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y dair agwedd ar y gadwyn yn cael cyfle teg. Mae digon o elw i bawb, felly rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff ei ddyrannu yn deg.

**Simon Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddatl hon fel rhywun sy'n cynrychioli rhanbarth sydd â chyfran sylweddol o'r diwydiant llaeth ynddo a rhanbarth sy'n dangos y newidiadau enfawr sydd bellach yn digwydd o fewn y diwydiant ac yn cynnwys yr amrywiaeth helaeth o arferion sy'n ymwneud â'r diwydiant hwnnw bellach. Yr wyf yn cytuno â William Powell pan ddywed fod angen inni edrych ar y dyfodol ac nid canolbwyntio ar y gorffennol yn unig. Yn ddiau, mae'r diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru wedi cael cyfnod anodd yn ddiweddar ac, er bod pris rhyngwladol cynnyrch llaeth wedi gwella bellach, nid yw hynny o reidrwydd yn treiddio i lawr i'r ffermwr llaeth. Felly, mae angen inni ddadansoddi, fel rydym yn ei wneud yn y ddatl hon, rhai o'r camau y gallwn eu cymryd a rhai o'r camau y gall y Llywodraeth gefnogi i wella'r modd mae'r pris gwell am nwyddau rhyngwladol yn cyrraedd y ffermwr. Mae'n beth sosialaidd i'w wneud, oherwydd os nad yw'r farchnad yn gweithio ac os nad yw prisiau nwyddau rhyngwladol o fudd i'r cynhyrchydd, dylem ymyrryd yn y farchnad honno. Mae'n egwyddor graidd mewn economi farchnad gymysg ac egwyddor graidd i unrhyw un sy'n sefyll dros draddodiadau cymdeithasol democrataidd i geisio addasu'r farchnad, os oes angen, drwy reoleiddio.

I will turn in a couple of minutes to talk a little more about the regulation that might happen around the ombudsman within the United Kingdom, but, as I said, the dairy industry is one of the most amazingly technological, efficient and changing industries within farming. In my region alone, you can go to massive outdoor milking carousels—you cannot call them sheds—on the Madryn estate in Llŷn; you can look at the proposals for a superdairy in Powys, which has just been given some kind of cautious semi-approval by the councillors there; or you can look to the more traditional dairy farms in west Wales. However, in every single place, you will see technology being used to ensure the purity of the product and that it is as good as possible when delivered to the customer.

Increasingly, as Rhodri Glyn pointed out, there is some ability to add value to the product in the area where it is produced. That surely must be one of the key things that we need to develop to ensure the survival of a healthy dairy industry in Wales. I hope to hear from the Minister about those aspects of the changes in the dairy industry, and a little bit about the vision that the Government has for the industry post quotas. Some of us are old enough to remember the devastation wrought in west Wales by quotas at the time, and the changes that that led to. Some of them were positive, in terms of farmhouse cheeses and alternative products like Rachel's Organic yoghurt, and so on, but some of the changes were devastating to some farmers. So we now need to look and prepare better than we did in the early 1980s for the world post quotas.

There are a couple of key things that the Government can do. First, as has already been mentioned, it can support a model, baseline contract. I hope that the Government can say something about that. Secondly, in the reviews of the common agricultural policy, we can look at capital support for the dairy industry. It is changing enormously, with pressures from superdairies and so forth on more traditional producers, and with more niche producers, and organic producers. A capital programme of investment and support

Trof mewn ychydig funudau i sôn fwy am y rheoleiddio a allai ddigwydd o du yr ombwdsmon yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond, fel y dywedais, mae'r diwydiant llaeth yn un o'r diwydiannau mwyaf rhyfeddol dechnolegol, effeithlon a chyfnewidiol ym myd ffermio. Yn fy rhanbarth i yn unig, gallwch fynd i barlyrau godro awyr agored enfawr—ni allwch eu galw'n siediau—ar stâd Madryn yn Llŷn; gallwch edrych ar gynigion am fferm odro anferth ym Mhowys, sydd newydd dderbyn rhyw fath o led-gymeradwyaeth wylidwrus gan y cynghorwyr yno; neu gallwch edrych ar y ffermydd llaeth mwy traddodiadol yn y gorllewin. Fodd bynnag, ym mhob un ohonynt, fe welwch dechnoleg yn cael ei defnyddio i sicrhau purdeb y cynnyrch a'i fod cystal â phosibl pan gaiff ei roi i'r cwsmer.

Fwyfwy, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn, mae rhywfaint o allu i ychwanegu gwerth i'r cynnyrch yn yr ardal lle cafodd ei gynhyrchu. Siawns mai hynny yw un o'r pethau allweddol mae angen inni ddatblygu i sicrhau bod diwydiant llaeth iach yn goroesi yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf glywed gan y Gweinidog am yr agweddau hynny ar y newidiadau yn y diwydiant llaeth, a rhywfaint am y weledigaeth sydd gan y Llywodraeth i'r diwydiant wedi cyflwyno'r cwtotâu. Mae rhai ohonom yn ddigon hen i gofio'r llanastr a grëwyd yng ngorllewin Cymru gan gwtotâu ar y pryd, a'r newidiadau o ganlyniad i hynny. Roedd rhai ohonynt yn gadarnhaol, o ran caws ffermdy a chynnyrch amgen fel iogwrt Rachel's Organic, ac ati, ond roedd rhai o'r newidiadau yn llanastr i rai ffermwyr. Felly, mae angen inni yn awr edrych a pharatoi yn well nag y gwnaethom yn yr 1980au cynnar ar gyfer byd ar ôl cwtotâu.

Mae un neu ddau o bethau allweddol y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud. Yn gyntaf, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, gall gefnogi model contract sylfaenol. Gobeithio y gall y Llywodraeth ddweud rhywbeth am hynny. Yn ail, yn adolygiadau'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, gallwn edrych ar gymorth cyfalaf i'r diwydiant llaeth. Mae'n newid yn aruthrol, gyda phwysau o ffermydd godro enfawr ac ati ar gynhyrchwyr mwy traddodiadol, a gyda mwy o gynhyrchwyr arbenigol, a chynhyrchwyr organig. Byddai rhaglen

for these changes within CAP, allowing our farmers to adapt to the modern market, would be extremely useful. Furthermore, this Government in particular would surely want to support collective bargaining by dairy farmers, because it is one of the things that retailers and mass commodity buyers do so well—they isolate farmers as much as possible, buy singly from them, and put them in a weak bargaining position. There are proposals under the EU dairy package to strengthen the ability of farmers within a national envelope to negotiate collectively, not only as a co-operative, but as a business, and I would like to see that taken forward, because that would strengthen the hand of farmers on many occasions.

Finally, we have unfortunately to reject the amendment from the Conservatives. The kind of ombudsman that I want to see—and, as Rhodri Glyn kindly alluded to, I happened to introduce my own Private Member's Bill on a milk ombudsman in Parliament several years ago—is a watchdog with real teeth and real regulatory powers, who can monitor the food market and food prices and enforce a reformed code. It is not someone who can fix prices, but someone who can prevent price fixing. I will read some words with which I agree completely:

'If this ombudsman is to be truly effective then he or she should have the powers of and act like any other regulatory body'.

That of course was said by Kirsty Williams on 24 January 2010, and that is not the position taken now by the Liberal Democrats, or the Conservatives, unfortunately, but, in that debate, they also wanted an ombudsman with teeth. Until we get an ombudsman with teeth, we cannot, unfortunately, support this amendment.

**Russell George:** I am pleased to speak in this debate today, and I thank Plaid Cymru for bringing it forward. The future of the dairy industry in Wales is very important. To be fair to the previous Minister, she was a strong advocate for the dairy industry, and realised the important role that it plays within the wider Welsh economy, amounting to £350

gyfalaf buddsoddi a chymorth ar gyfer y newidiadau hyn o fewn y PAC, gan ganiatáu ein ffermwyr i addasu i'r farchnad fodern, yn hynod ddefnyddiol. At hynny, siawns na fyddai'r Llywodraeth hon am gefnogi cydfargeinio gan ffermwyr llaeth, gan ei fod yn un o'r pethau mae manwerthwyr a phrynwyr nwyddau torfol yn ei wneud mor dda—maent yn ynysu ffermwyr gymaint â phosibl, prynu'n unigol oddi wrthynt, a'u rhoi mewn sefyllfa fargeinio wan. Ceir cynigion o dan becyn llaeth yr UE i gryfhau gallu ffermwyr o fewn cyllid cenedlaethol i negodi gyda'i gilydd, nid yn unig fel cwmni cydweithredol, ond fel busnes, a hoffwn weld hynny'n cael ei ddatblygu, oherwydd byddai hynny'n cryfhau achos ffermwyr ar sawl achlysur.

Yn olaf, yn anffodus, mae'n rhaid inni wrthod y gwelliant gan y Ceidwadwyr. Y math o ombwdsmon yr hoffwn ei weld—ac, fel y crybwyllodd Rhodri Glyn yn garedig, digwyddais gyflwyno Bil Aelod Preifat fy hun ar ombwdsmon llaeth yn y Senedd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl—yw corff gwarchod gyda dannedd go iawn a phwerau rheoleiddio go iawn, sy'n gallu monitro'r farchnad bwyd a phrisiau bwyd a gorfodi cod diwygiedig. Nid rhywun sy'n gallu pennu prisiau, ond rhywun a all atal pennu prisiau. Fe wnaaf ddarllen geiriau y cytunaf yn llwyr â nhw:

Os yw'r ombwdsmon hwn am fod yn wirioneddol effeithiol, dylai ef neu hi feddu ar bwerau sydd gan unrhyw gorff rheoleiddio arall a'r gallu i weithredu arnynt.

Wrth gwrs, dywedwyd hynny gan Kirsty Williams ar 24 Ionawr 2010, ac nid dyna yw safbwynt y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol na'r Ceidwadwyr bellach, yn anffodus, ond, yn y ddadl honno, yr oeddent hefyd am gael ombwdsmon gyda dannedd. Hyd nes y cawn ombwdsmon sydd â dannedd, ni allwn, yn anffodus, gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn.

**Russell George:** Yr wyf yn falch o siarad yn y ddadl hon heddiw, a diolch i Blaid Cymru am ei chyflwyno. Mae dyfodol y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru yn bwysig iawn. I fod yn deg i'r Gweinidog blaenorol, roedd hi'n eiriolwr cryf dros y diwydiant llaeth, ac yn sylweddoli'r rôl bwysig y mae'n ei chwarae yn economi ehangach Cymru, sy'n cyfrif am



million a year, or one third of Wales's agricultural output. She did what she could to alleviate the pressures felt by the industry while investing to help improve levels of efficiency, sustainability and added value in the dairy supply chain. However, one of the things that she did not crack was the contractual concerns that producers have with the wholesale buyers.

I have spoken to a number of dairy farmers in my constituency about the issue, and while it is not a large sector in Montgomeryshire compared to other parts of Wales, there is strong evidence to show that the dairy supply chain simply is not functioning properly. I think that we agree on that. The issue is not a new one, of course. The one-sided nature of the business contracts that farms enter into has long been a cause for concern. There is a lack of transparency in relation to price levels, and exclusive lock-in clauses with unreasonable notice periods. Coupled with a competitive market, these contracts allow the farmer little room for negotiation, and there is little to incentivise the industry for the next generation.

The unions have long called for an ombudsman to ensure fair play between the supplier and the retailer. I am therefore pleased that the UK Government has committed to establishing a groceries code adjudicator. However, I agree with a lot of what has been said today in that the establishment of that position alone will be futile unless it has the necessary teeth to take retailers to task. I therefore hope that that will not be the case.

The Welsh Government has a role to play to ensure that the relationship between the two parties is more equal. Setting out a baseline requirement for milk contracts will go some way towards eliminating unreasonable contractual prices and creating more balanced contractual prices prior to the removal of the quotas in 2015. We have reached a point where voluntary agreements to achieve results do not work and we should perhaps look towards more mandatory contracts.

Transparency is important, not just of the contractual agreements, but in relation to the distribution margins of wholesale prices. The

£350 miliwn y flwyddyn, neu draean o allbwn amaethyddol Cymru. Fe wnaeth bopeth o fewn ei gallu i leddfu'r pwysau ar y diwydiant tra'n buddsoddi i helpu i wella effeithlonrwydd, cynaliadwyedd a gwerth ychwanegol yn y gadwyn gyflenwi llaeth. Fodd bynnag, un o'r pethau na lwyddodd i ddatrys oedd y pryderon cytundebol sydd gan gynhyrchwyr gyda phrynwyr cyfanwerthu.

Rwyf wedi siarad â nifer o ffermwyr llaeth yn fy etholaeth ynghylch y mater, ac er nad yw'n sector mawr yn Sir Drefaldwyn o gymharu â rhannau eraill o Gymru, mae tystiolaeth gref i ddangos nad yw'r gadwyn gyflenwi llaeth yn gweithio'n iawn. Credaf ein bod yn cytuno ar hynny. Nid yw'r mater yn un newydd, wrth gwrs. Mae natur unochrog contractau busnes ffermydd wedi bod yn achos pryder ers peth amser. Mae diffyg tryloywder o ran lefelau prisiau, a chymalau gwarant unigryw gyda chyfnodau afresymol o rybudd. Ynghyd â marchnad gystadleuol, nid yw'r contractau hyn yn caniatáu fawr o le i'r ffermwr negodi, ac nid oes fawr i gymell y diwydiant ar gyfer y genhedlaeth nesaf.

Mae'r undebau wedi galw ers amser maith am ombwdsmon i sicrhau chwarae teg rhwng y cyflenwr a'r manwerthwr. Yr wyf felly yn falch bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi ymrwymo i sefydlu dyfarnwr cod bwydydd. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud heddiw y bydd dim ond sefydlu'r swydd honno yn ofer oni bai fod ganddi'r grym angenrheidiol i ddwyn manwerthwyr i gyfrif. Felly, gobeithio nad hynny fydd yr achos.

Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru rôl i'w chwarae i sicrhau bod y berthynas rhwng y ddwy ochr yn fwy cyfartal. Bydd gosod gofyniad sylfaenol ar gyfer contractau llaeth yn mynd rywfaint o'r ffordd at ddileu prisiau cytundebol afresymol ac yn creu prisiau cytundebol mwy cytbwys cyn diddymu'r cwtotâu yn 2015. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd pwynt lle nad yw cytundebau gwirfoddol i gael canlyniadau yn gweithio a dylem efallai edrych tuag at contractau mwy gorfodol.

Mae tryloywder yn bwysig, nid yn unig o ran y cytundebau, ond mewn perthynas â dosbarthu elw'r prisiau cyfanwerthu. Mae

Government has a role in the collation and production of that information to the supply chain. The sector can be profitable when farmers are doing what they can to diversify what they produce. However, the current trend of farmers exiting the industry is worrying. The backbone of the sector is crumbling and the next generation can only see the sector having too much risk and very little reward. We must reverse this trend as a matter of urgency, otherwise we will reach a situation where family-run farms will disappear, which we would all agree would be very sad.

**The Deputy Minister for Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and European Programmes (Alun Davies):** I am grateful for the opportunity to reply to this debate, and I will start with William Graham's amendment, which I am pleased to say that we will accept in a spirit of generosity that is probably undeserved. I agree with the points made by the proposer of the amendment on the groceries code adjudicator, and I wrote to the UK Government on this matter last month. I am dismayed and disappointed with the response from the United Kingdom Government, because, in removing the financial penalty provision from this legislation, it is effectively removing the teeth from the regulator. I agree with the points made by Kirsty in a previous life and I would like to see those provisions returned to the legislation.

We will accept the amendment this afternoon because we believe that having an adjudicator is, in conceptual terms at least, a step forward. However, let me be absolutely clear that, in doing so, I want to move away from and reject the very simplistic and sometimes naive attacks that are made on the supermarkets, because, frankly, without the supermarkets, there would not be access to the markets for the industry and there would not be an industry. We must work with the supermarkets to deliver these things and not simply to launch ritual attacks upon them from the safety of opposition benches. *[Interruption.]* I was not necessarily talking about you. We must have a clear approach to this—and an approach that is based on what we seek to achieve.

gan y Llywodraeth rôl o ran casglu a chynhyrchu'r wybodaeth honno i'r gadwyn gyflenwi. Gall y sector fod yn broffidiol pan mae ffermwyr yn gwneud popeth yn eu gallu i arallgyfeirio'r hyn maent yn ei gynhyrchu. Fodd bynnag, mae tuedd presennol ffermwyr i adael y diwydiant yn peri pryder. Mae asgwrn cefn y sector yn dadfeilio ac mae'r genhedlaeth nesaf yn gweld y sector fel un â gormod o risg am ychydig iawn o wob. Rhaid inni wrthdroi'r duedd hon fel mater o frys, fel arall byddwn yn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle bydd ffermydd teuluol yn diflannu, a byddem oll yn cytuno y byddai hynny'n drist iawn.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd (Alun Davies):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i ymateb i'r ddatl hon, a dechreuaf gyda gwelliant William Graham, y byddwn yn ei dderbyn, rwyf yn falch o ddweud, mewn ysbryd hael sydd fwy na thebyg yn anhaeddiannol. Cytunaf gyda'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan gynigydd y gwelliant am y dyfarnwr cod bwydydd, ac ysgrifennais at Lywodraeth y DU ar y mater hwn fis diwethaf. Yr wyf wedi fy siomi gyda'r ymateb gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, oherwydd, wrth ddileu'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer cosb ariannol o'r ddeddfwriaeth hon, mae'n tynnu'r grym oddi wrth y rheoleiddwr i bob pwrpas. Cytunaf gyda'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Kirsty mewn bywyd blaenorol a hoffwn weld y darpariaethau hynny yn dychwelyd i'r ddeddfwriaeth.

Byddwn yn derbyn y gwelliant hwn y prynhawn yma oherwydd ein bod yn credu bod cael dyfarnwr, yn gysyniadol o leiaf, yn gam ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, gadewch imi fod yn gwbl glir, wrth wneud hynny, fy mod am bellhau oddi wrth a gwrthod yr ymosodiadau hynod simplistig ac weithiau naif a wneir ar yr archfarchnadoedd, oherwydd, a dweud y gwir, heb yr archfarchnadoedd, ni fyddai mynediad i'r marchnadoedd i'r diwydiant ac ni fyddai diwydiant. Rhaid inni weithio gyda'r archfarchnadoedd i gyflawni'r pethau hyn ac nid dim ond ymosodiadau arnynt yn ddeddfol o ddiogelwch meinciau'r wrthblaid. *[Torri ar draws.]* Nid oeddwn o reidrwydd yn sôn amdanoch chi. Rhaid inni gael ymagwedd glir at hyn—ac ymagwedd sydd wedi'i seilio ar beth yr ydym yn ceisio ei gyflawni.

As a Government, we will be supporting the motion this afternoon. As Bill Powell pointed out, we will have to do more than simply rehearse the difficulties and problems facing the industry. When I first read this motion last week, I thought that it was rather a timid motion. It was very good at rehearsing the problems, but it did not articulate many answers. I am pleased by the debate that we have had, certainly the contributions from Simon Thomas, Rhodri Glyn Thomas and Bill Powell, who articulated some of the solutions that need to be found for the industry.

**Jocelyn Davies:** If you found the motion wanting, why did you not table a Government amendment?

4.45 p.m.

**Alun Davies:** I will answer that in my argument. On 22 September we recognised formally that the food and farming sector is a high priority sector given its significant contribution to the economy. We now have a newly appointed advisory panel, with a wealth of experience and expertise in food and farming, to provide advice to the Welsh Government directly. That was announced on 22 September. On 29 September I met the chair of this panel, and the panel will meet for the first time on 24 November. I will be asking that panel to review the Welsh Government's existing food strategy, which was launched last December, and to look at how we deliver on the supply chain management issues that have been described in the debate this afternoon. I very much agree with the point that Simon Thomas made, but intervention in the supply chain is more than simply regulation. If we can intervene to provide support, we can intervene to provide an element of management of the supply chain to ensure that we deliver profitability within each element of that supply chain, which means that we will have profitability for the farmers, the processors and the retailers.

In the debate this afternoon, I want to look at how we start to deliver that. We have to have intervention in the supply chain and

Fel Llywodraeth, byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig y prynhawn yma. Fel y dywedodd Bill Powell, bydd yn rhaid inni wneud mwy na dim ond ailadrodd yr anawsterau a'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant. Pan ddarllenais y cynnig hwn yn gyntaf yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddwn yn meddwl ei fod yn gynnig tila braidd. Yr oedd yn ailadrodd y problemau yn dda iawn, ond nid oedd ganddo lawer o atebion. Yr wyf yn falch o'r ddadl a gawsom, yn sicr y cyfraniadau gan Simon Thomas, Rhodri Glyn Thomas a Bill Powell, a soniodd am rai o'r atebion mae angen eu canfod ar gyfer y diwydiant.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Os oeddech yn meddwl bod y cynnig yn ddiffygiol, pam na wnaethoch gyflwyno gwelliant gan y Llywodraeth?

**Alun Davies:** Atebaf hynny yn fy naddl. Ar 22 Medi cydnabuom yn ffurfiol fod y sector bwyd a ffermio yn sector blaenoriaeth uchel o ystyried ei gyfraniad sylweddol i'r economi. Erbyn hyn rydym wedi penodi panel cynghori newydd, gyda môr o brofiad ac arbenigedd mewn bwyd a ffermio, i roi cyngor i Lywodraeth Cymru yn uniongyrchol. Cyhoeddwyd hynny ar 22 Medi. Ar 29 Medi cyfarfûm â chadeirydd y panel hwn, a bydd y panel yn cyfarfod am y tro cyntaf ar 24 Tachwedd. Byddaf yn gofyn i'r panel hwnnw adolygu strategaeth fwyd bresennol Llywodraeth Cymru, a lansiwyd fis Rhagfyr diwethaf, ac i edrych ar sut yr ydym yn cyflawni ar y materion rheoli cadwyn gyflenwi a ddisgrifiwyd yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r pwynt a wnaeth Simon Thomas, ond mae ymyrryd yn y gadwyn gyflenwi yn fwy na dim ond rheoleiddio. Os gallwn ymyrryd i roi cymorth, gallwn ymyrryd i ddarparu elfen o reoli yn y gadwyn gyflenwi i sicrhau fod pob elfen o'r gadwyn gyflenwi yn broffidiol, sy'n golygu y bydd y ffermwyr, y proseswyr a'r manwerthwyr yn broffidiol.

Yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma, yr wyf am edrych ar sut yr ydym yn dechrau cyflawni hynny. Mae'n rhaid i ni ymyrryd yn y

management of it, and we have to ensure that the existing food strategy goes further than it has done, frankly. The current food strategy is not as I would have wanted to see it. I want to see us looking at how we can use best practice, as mentioned in the programme for government and our manifesto, to deliver for the dairy industry. If you look at how the dairy industry is managed, and the organisations that are involved in it, you will see that, in many ways, it resembles the red meat industry pre 2003. There is fragmented support for the industry. What we need to be able to do is to bring that together and deliver profitability and success at the different levels.

On intervention, I have met at least two of the major UK milk processors since my appointment and I have discussed how we can develop and deliver significant investment into Wales. I very much welcome the new dairy in Whitland, but I want to see more such development so that we have the added value products in Wales and are able to deliver and export much higher value products than at present. I hope that the food strategy that will come out of the new process will help us to deliver that.

Bill Powell made a point about the common agricultural policy, and we will have a debate on it in this Chamber on 29 November. I therefore propose to restrict my comments to observation at present. Some of the proposals on CAP provide a significant challenge for the dairy industry, and the Welsh Government is looking at ways of providing specific support to intensive dairy producers and, potentially, to intensive beef producers as well, as a consequence of those proposals. However, we are clear that, at the moment, the proposals in relation to CAP are proposals. We will need to do more modelling. When we are in a position to inform Members as to what we propose to do, we will do so. I hope to be in that position by the end of the month.

Other Members have discussed the issue of contracts for the production of milk. I am aware of what the farming unions have

gadwyn gyflenwi a'r modd y caiff ei rheoli, ac mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau bod y strategaeth fwyd bresennol yn mynd ymhellach nag y gwnaeth, i fod yn blwmp ac yn blaen. Nid yw'r strategaeth fwyd bresennol yn edrych fel y byddwn am iddi edrych. Yr wyf am inni edrych ar sut y gallwn ddefnyddio arfer gorau, fel y soniwyd yn y rhaglen lywodraethu ac yn ein maniffesto, i gyflawni ar gyfer y diwydiant llaeth. Os edrychwch ar sut caiff y diwydiant llaeth ei reoli, a'r sefydliadau sy'n rhan ohono, fe welwch ei fod, mewn sawl ffordd, debyg i'r diwydiant cig coch cyn 2003. Cefnogaeth dameidiog sydd i'r diwydiant. Yr hyn yr ydym angen ei wneud yw tynnu hynny at ei gilydd a chyflwyno elw a llwyddiant ar y gwahanol lefelau.

O ran ymyrryd, yr wyf wedi cyfarfod ag o leiaf ddau o brif broseswyr llaeth mawr y DU ers fy mhenodi ac yr wyf wedi trafod sut y gallwn ddatblygu a sicrhau buddsoddiad sylweddol i Gymru. Croesawaf y llaethdy newydd yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf yn fawr, ond rwyf am weld mwy o ddatblygiadau tebyg fel bod gennym gynnyrch â gwerth ychwanegol yng Nghymru ac yn gallu darparu ac allforio cynnyrch â gwerth llawer uwch nag ydym ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithio y bydd y strategaeth fwyd a ddaw o'r broses newydd yn ein helpu i gyflawni hynny.

Gwnaeth Bill Powell bwynt am y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, a byddwn yn cael dadl arno yn y Siambr hon ar 29 Tachwedd. Yr wyf felly yn bwriadu cyfyngu fy sylwadau i arsylwi ar hyn o bryd. Mae rhai o'r cynigion ar y PAC yn rhoi her sylweddol i'r diwydiant llaeth, ac mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn edrych ar ffyrdd o ddarparu cymorth penodol i gynhyrchwyr llaeth dwys ac, o bosibl, i gynhyrchwyr cig eidion dwys hefyd, o ganlyniad i'r cynigion hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn glir, ar hyn o bryd, mai dim ond cynigion ydynt o ran y PAC. Bydd angen i ni wneud mwy o fodelu. Pan fyddwn mewn sefyllfa i roi gwybod i'r Aelodau am beth y bwriadwn ei wneud, byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Gobeithio y byddaf yn y sefyllfa honno erbyn diwedd y mis.

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi trafod contractau ar gyfer cynhyrchu llaeth. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn mae'r undebau

suggested in terms of a formula for calculating a price that can be used for contracts. Members will also be aware that this was a matter that was discussed at the dairy show in Birmingham in early September, where the industry agreed to work together to form a voluntary code of best practice. That work is ongoing and the results will be discussed at the UK dairy supply chain forum at the end of this month. It is my proposal to allow those discussions to continue and to come to a conclusion. When they come to a conclusion, we will be in a better position to judge whether that voluntary code of practice is workable or not. If it is not one that will deliver fairness within the supply chain, the Welsh Government will want to make a fuller statement on that at the appropriate time. I do not anticipate that I will be in a position to do that this side of Christmas.

The commitment of this Government to the dairy industry is absolutely clear. It is a commitment to fairness, to the management of the supply chain in its entirety, to investment in the supply chain and its management, and a commitment to use the strength, power and responsibility of Government to ensure that dairy farming in Wales has a significant and important future, not only for the communities that sustain the industry, but for the whole country. We want to see a productive, profitable and successful industry, and we are prepared to invest the resources, the time and the effort into achieving that over the coming Assembly.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Diolchaf i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu i'r ddadl ac am y consensws amlwg i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau sylfaenol sy'n wynebu'r sector. Cyfeiriaf at un neu ddau o'r pwyntiau a godwyd. Cyfeiriwyd at fater y rheoleiddiwr sawl gwaith. Yr oedd adroddiad gan Bwyllgor Busnes, Arloesedd a Sgiliau San Steffan wedi galw am yr hawl i ddirwyo o'r cychwyn cyntaf, ond gwrthododd Llywodraeth y DU hynny. Yr oedd Pwyllgor Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig San Steffan, yr undebau amaeth, a chyrrff sy'n cynrychioli cyflenwyr i'r archfarchnadoedd, hefyd wedi galw am yr un peth, ond mae hynny wedi'i anwybyddu. Yr ydym yn gwrthwynebu'r gwelliant, felly, oherwydd ein bod yn teimlo

amaethyddol wedi awgrymu o ran fformiwla i gyfrifo pris y gellir ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer contractau. Bydd Aelodau hefyd yn gwybod y cafodd hyn ei drafod yn y sioe laeth yn Birmingham ddechrau mis Medi, lle y cytunodd y diwydiant i gydweithio i lunio cod arfer gorau gwirfoddol. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn mynd rhagddo a bydd y canlyniadau yn cael eu trafod yn fforwm cadwyn cyflenwi laeth y DU ddiwedd y mis hwn. Fy mwriad yw caniatáu i'r trafodaethau hynny barhau a dod i gasgliad. Pan fyddant yn dod i gasgliad, byddwn mewn sefyllfa well i farnu a yw'r cod ymarfer gwirfoddol yn ymarferol ai peidio. Os na fydd yn deg i bawb yn y gadwyn gyflenwi, bydd Llywodraeth Cymru am wneud datganiad llawnach ar hynny ar yr adeg briodol. Nid wyf yn rhagweld y byddaf mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny cyn y Nadolig.

Mae ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon i'r diwydiant laeth yn gwbl glir. Mae'n ymrwymiad i degwch, i reoli'r gadwyn gyflenwi yn ei chyfanrwydd, i fuddsoddi yn y gadwyn gyflenwi a'i rheolaeth, ac ymrwymiad i ddefnyddio cryfder, grym a chyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod gan ffermio laeth yng Nghymru ddyfodol arwyddocaol a phwysig, nid yn unig ar gyfer y cymunedau sy'n cynnal y diwydiant, ond y wlad gyfan. Yr ydym am weld diwydiant cynhyrchiol, proffidiol a llwyddiannus, ac yr ydym yn barod i fuddsoddi adnoddau, amser ac ymdrech i gyflawni hynny dros y Cynulliad i ddod.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** I thank everyone who has contributed to the debate and for the clear consensus to get to grips with some of the fundamental problems that face the sector. I will refer to one or two of the points raised. The issue of the adjudicator was referred to several times. A report by the Business, Innovation and Skills Committee in Westminster called for the right to penalise from the outset, but the UK Government rejected that. The Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Committee in Westminster, the farming unions, and bodies representing supermarket suppliers, also called for the same thing, but that has been ignored. We oppose the amendment, therefore, because we feel that this is a lost opportunity. Who

bod cyfle wedi'i golli. Pwy a wŷr? Rhyw ddiwrnod yn y dyfodol, fel y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig yn caniatáu, efallai bydd cyfle i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn teimlo bod y cyfle hwnnw'n cael ei golli heddiw ac yn awr, gan fod ffermwyr yn wynebu realiti sy'n haeddu datrysiad ac ymateb cyflymach.

Croesawaf, wrth gwrs, y datblygiad yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf—yr oedd Rhodri Glyn wedi'n hatgoffa am y datblygiad hwnnw. Fel rhywun o sir Gaerfyrddin, ac a oedd yn byw yno ar y pryd, yr wyf yn cofio'r ergyd a deimlwyd drwy'r sector yn y de-orllewin adeg cau'r hufenfa yno. Mae'r pwyntiau ynghylch ychwanegu gwerth yn gwbl ddilys. Mae'n sefyllfa hurt bod miliynau o litrau o laeth, er gwaethaf yr holl ymdrechion, yn cael eu cludo o dde-orllewin Cymru, un o feysydd laeth mwyaf Ewrop, i gael eu prosesu yn rhywle arall, a bod miliynau o dunelli yn dychwelyd i gael eu gwerthu yma, a bod y gwerth ychwanegol, yn rhy aml o lawer, yn cael ei fwynhau yn rhywle arall.

Soniodd y Dirprwy Weinidog am y strategaeth fwyd ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld gwaith y panel sector yn datblygu. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn mynd i roi arweiniad clir i'r panel ynghylch y blaenoriaethau y dylai fod yn edrych arnynt. Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at yr hyn a gaiff ei argymhell o ran y strategaeth fwyd.

Cytunaf â sylwadau William Powell am fasnach deg. Mae enghreifftiau o dan ein trwynau o gynhyrchwyr sy'n cael eu hecsploetio a'u gorfodi i gynhyrchu ar golled. Clywsom gyfeiriad at Sefydliad y Merched, sydd wedi gwneud gwaith clodwiw iawn gyda'r ymgyrch Mission Milk, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn teimlo bod ganddi hi hefyd 'Mission Milk' i'w gyflawni dros y blynyddoedd nesaf.

Mae Simon Thomas yn berffaith iawn i sôn am y dechnoleg a gaiff ei defnyddio erbyn hyn, a'r arloesedd yr ydym am ei weld yn y sector. Cyfeiriais at y £65 miliwn sy'n cael ei golli i'r diwydiant oherwydd bod ffermwyr yn cael pris llai nag y maent yn ei haeddu am eu llaeth. Pe bai'r arian hwnnw ar gael, dychmygwch sut y byddai modd i ffermwyr ei fuddsoddi mewn isadeiledd ac arloesedd er mwyn gwella effeithlonrwydd ac

knows? At some point in the future, as the proposed legislation allows, there may be an opportunity to do that. I feel that we are missing an opportunity today and now, because farmers are facing a reality that deserves a swifter resolution and response.

I welcome, of course, the Whitland development—Rhodri Glyn reminded us about that development. As someone from Carmarthenshire, and who was living there at the time, I remember the blow felt throughout the sector in south-west Wales at the time of the closure of the plant there. The points about adding value are completely valid. It is a bizarre situation that millions of litres of milk, despite all the efforts, are transported from south-west Wales, one of the largest milk fields in Europe, to be processed elsewhere, and that millions of tonnes come back to be sold here, with the added value, far too often, enjoyed elsewhere.

The Deputy Minister mentioned the food strategy and I look forward to seeing the work of the sector panel develop. I am pleased that he will give the panel clear guidance on the priorities that it should be looking at. I also look forward to what will be recommended in relation to the food strategy.

I agree with William Powell about fair trade. There are examples under our very noses of producers that are being exploited and forced to produce at a loss. We heard reference to the Women's Institute, which has done excellent work in the Mission Milk campaign, and I pleased to hear that the Welsh Government also feels that it has a 'Mission Milk' to achieve over the next few years.

Simon Thomas is quite right to refer to the technology that is now used, and the innovation that we want to see in the sector. I referred to the £65 million lost to the industry because farmers receive a price lower than that which they deserve for their milk. If that money were available, imagine how farmers could invest it in infrastructure and innovation in order to improve efficiency and effectiveness in the industry. A capital

effeithiolrwydd y diwydiant. Byddai buddsoddiad cyfalaf drwy'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, fel y cyfeiriodd Simon Thomas ato, yn ategu at hynny hefyd.

investment through the common agricultural policy, as Simon Thomas mentioned, would also add to that.

Diolchaf i bawb am eu cyfraniadau. Gofynnaf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddatgan yn glir—yr wyf yn hyderus y byddant yn ei wneud—drwy gefnogi'r cynnig hwn, ein bod i gyd yn credu mewn dyfodol tecach i ffermwyr Ilaeth Cymru.

I thank everyone for their contributions. I ask Assembly Members to state clearly—I am confident that they will—by supporting this motion, that we all believe in a fairer future for dairy farmers in Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore, I defer all voting on this item to voting time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw cytuno ar y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriaf yr holl bleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

## **Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate**

### **Codi CMC Raising GDP**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of William Graham.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw William Graham.

*Cynnig NDM4840 Peter Black*

*Motion NDM4840 Peter Black*

*Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*The National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn gresynu methiant Llywodraeth Cymru i ddefnyddio arian yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn effeithiol er mwyn helpu i godi CMC cymharol rhanbarth Gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd;*

*1. Regrets the failure of Welsh government to effectively use EU funding to help raise the relative GDP of the West Wales and the Valleys region;*

*2. Yn cydnabod cyfraniad gwerthfawr y rhaglenni sgiliau lefel uwch ac arloesedd, megis y cynllun POWIS, at godi CMC;*

*2. Recognises the valuable contribution of innovation and higher level skills programmes, such as the POWIS scheme, to raising GDP;*

*3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sefydlu cynllun i olynu POWIS gyda nodau ac amcanion tebyg.*

*3. Calls on the Welsh Government to establish a successor scheme to POWIS with similar aims and objectives.*

**Eluned Parrott:** I move the motion.

**Eluned Parrott:** Cynigiaf y cynnig.

I introduce this motion today with a sense of

Cyflwynaf y cynnig hwn heddiw gydag

sadness and frustration: sadness, because, despite a massive injection of cash into our poorest areas, those areas are poorer now than they were a decade ago, and frustration because of the opportunities that have been missed, and that continue to be missed, by this Government.

The facts before us are well rehearsed. Despite two rounds of European funding, the gross domestic product per capita of west Wales and the Valleys has fallen from 66.8 per cent of the European average to just 64.4 per cent in 2008. Of the 66 regions that qualified for these funds, only eight have failed to improve. Even areas in Greece have managed to progress, but, sadly, not us. You would think that that appalling statistic would give the Welsh Government pause for thought, but, in previous debates and in questions, we have seen little sign of that.

The Government has called gross domestic product a 'blunt instrument' in the past, in response to questions. Perhaps, therefore, we could offer it some statistics that may have greater incision. Only 4,849 jobs have been created, less than two thirds of the target. There was £213 million invested from the European regional development fund in that, which equates to £44,000 per job. Against a target of 3,000, only 1,015 small businesses have been created as a result of European funding, which is just 36 per cent of the target. Only 32 per cent of people on European-funded training projects who were expected to enter employment have done so.

We believe that the programme has not been focused on the right areas, which are skills, infrastructure and promoting the private sector. In terms of the latter, we will support the Conservatives' amendment 3, because we support a greater role for the private sector in improving the economy, which must be the main aim for European funding. The First Minister has said that the private sector in Wales is too small, and I absolutely agree. Developing the Welsh economy must be done by helping our small and medium-sized enterprises to become medium-sized and large enterprises. That must be our top priority.

ymdeimlad o dristwch a rhwystredigaeth: tristwch oherwydd, er chwistrelliad enfawr o arian i'n hardaloedd tlotaf, mae'r ardaloedd hynny yn dlotach yn awr nag yr oeddent ddegawd yn ôl; a rhwystredigaeth oherwydd y cyfleoedd a gollwyd, ac sy'n dal i gael eu colli, gan y Llywodraeth hon.

Cafodd y ffeithiau ger ein bron eu trafod ganwaith. Er dwy rownd o gyllid Ewropeaidd, mae cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd wedi gostwng o 66.8 y cant o'r cyfartaledd Ewropeaidd i ond 64.4 y cant yn 2008. O'r 66 rhanbarth a oedd yn gymwys i gael y cronfeydd hyn, dim ond wyth sydd wedi methu gwella. Mae hyd yn oed ardaloedd yng Ngroeg wedi llwyddo i symud ymlaen, ond yn anffodus, nid ydym ni. Fe dybiech y byddai'r ffigur arswydus hwnnw'n peri i Lywodraeth Cymru ailfeddwl, ond mewn dadleuon blaenorol ac mewn cwestiynau, prin yw'r arwyddion o hynny.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi galw cynnyrch domestig gros yn erfyn di-awch yn y gorffennol, wrth ymateb i gwestiynau. Efallai, felly, y gallem gynnig rhai ystadegau gyda mwy o awch. Dim ond 4,849 o swyddi sydd wedi cael eu creu, llai na dau draean o'r targed. Buddsoddwyd £213 miliwn o gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop yn hynny, sy'n cyfateb i £44,000 y swydd. Gyda tharged o 3,000, dim ond 1,015 o fusnesau bach sydd wedi cael eu creu o ganlyniad i gyllid Ewropeaidd, sydd ond yn 36 y cant o'r targed. Dim ond 32 y cant o'r bobl ar brosiectau hyfforddi a ariennir gan Ewrop a ddisgwyliid i gael gwaith sydd wedi llwyddo.

Yr ydym o'r farn nad yw'r rhaglen wedi canolbwyntio ar y meysydd cywir, sef sgiliau, isadeiledd a hyrwyddo'r sector preifat. O ran yr olaf, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 y Ceidwadwyr, oherwydd ein bod yn cefnogi mwy o rôl i'r sector preifat o ran gwella'r economi, sy'n gorfod bod yn brif amcan cyllid Ewropeaidd. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud bod y sector preifat yng Nghymru yn rhy fach, a chytunaf yn llwyr. Mae'n rhaid datblygu economi Cymru drwy helpu ein busnesau bach a chanolig i ddod yn fentrau canolig a mawr. Rhaid i hynny fod yn brif flaenoriaeth i ni.



With regard to infrastructure, it is notable that many other regions have invested heavily in developing the framework of a modern nation. We must be able to move people and goods effectively around our country if we want our country to be able to compete internationally. Examples of things that we might have been able to achieve include improving rail freight beyond Swansea, introducing 100 Mbps broadband for areas with creative industries at their core, and refurbishing disused ports for wind turbine development. All of these things could be possible.

Providing access to relevant training at all levels is critical. Basic skills for those who struggle with literacy and numeracy need to be addressed, as well as high-level skills for the very best of our talented young people. I was extremely disappointed when the Prince of Wales Innovation Scholarships scheme was scrapped without a robust alternative being put in place. It sends the worst possible message to the world: that Wales neither values nor supports innovation. I believe that this was one of the European-funded programmes that had real potential. It placed graduates with companies that needed research and development assistance. It kept more of our talented young people in Wales, lowered research and development costs in Wales, and offered the potential for developing home-grown businesses. It also delivered research and development in companies in the key sectors identified in the economic renewal programme. It seems odd to me that the Government will make it harder for those sectors to invest in research and development by the removal of this scheme.

**David Rees:** Will you take an intervention?

**Eluned Parrott:** No, I will not, thank you.

Even odder, when I wrote to query this situation, the Minister replied:

‘the concept of recruiting the best graduate talent to boost innovation among businesses in Wales has much to commend it.’

O ran isadeiledd, mae'n werth nodi bod sawl rhanbarth arall wedi buddsoddi llawer mewn datblygu fframwaith cenedl fodern. Mae'n rhaid i ni allu symud pobl a nwyddau yn effeithiol o amgylch ein gwlad os ydym am i'n gwlad allu cystadlu'n rhyngwladol. Mae enghreifftiau o bethau y gallem fod wedi eu cyflawni yn cynnwys gwella rheilffyrdd cludo nwyddau y tu hwnt i Abertawe, cyflwyno band eang 100 Mbps mewn ardaloedd lle mae diwydiannau creadigol yn greiddiol, ac ailwampio porthladdoedd segur ar gyfer datblygu tyrbinau gwynt. Gallai'r holl bethau hyn fod yn bosibl.

Mae darparu mynediad at hyfforddiant perthnasol ar bob lefel yn hanfodol. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â sgiliau sylfaenol i'r rhai sy'n cael trafferth gyda llythrennedd a rhifedd, yn ogystal â sgiliau lefel uchel ar gyfer y goreuon o blith ein pobl ifanc talentog. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig dros ben pan ddilëwyd cynllun Ysgoloriaeth Arloesi Tywysog Cymru heb roi cynllun cadarn arall yn ei le. Mae'n anfon y neges waethaf bosibl i'r byd nad yw Cymru'n gwerthfawrogi na chefnogi arloesedd. Credaf fod hon yn un o'r rhaglenni a ariennir gan Ewrop oedd â photensial gwirioneddol. Gosodai raddedigion gyda chwmnïau oedd angen cymorth ymchwil a datblygu. Cadwai fwy o'n pobl ifanc dawnus yng Nghymru, gan ostwng costau ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru a chynnig potensial i ddatblygu busnesau cynhenid. Darparai hefyd ymchwil a datblygu mewn cwmnïau yn y sectorau allweddol a nodwyd yn rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi. Ymddengys yn rhyfedd i mi y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei gwneud yn anoddach i'r sectorau hynny fuddsoddi mewn ymchwil a datblygu drwy gael gwared ar y cynllun hwn.

**David Rees:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Eluned Parrott:** Na, dim diolch.

Yn rhyfeddach byth, pan ysgrifennais i holi am y sefyllfa hon, atebodd y Gweinidog:

Mae llawer i'w gymeradwyo am y cysyniad o recriwtio'r graddedigion mwyaf talentog i roi hwb i arloesedd ymhlith busnesau yng Nghymru.

'Much to commend it' but, apparently, not quite enough to put a safety net in place before you push it off the proverbial cliff.

If the Welsh Government really valued innovation, it could have replaced the Welsh European Funding Office funding with Welsh Government funding, either from reserves or from other sources. That would have had the advantage that the programme, which previously had been restricted to the convergence area, could have been rolled out to other areas across Wales that are in desperate need of assistance. It was a key mechanism for supporting innovation in Wales and I call on the Welsh Government to put an effective alternative in place.

I know that the Government is proud of its record in administering these funds, and I am sure that we will hear, at least once today, about the award that we have won for administering these funds. Well, indeed, we have won an award for bureaucracy from Brussels. That is some kind of achievement, but I am not necessarily sure it is the sort of achievement I would be proud of.

5.00 p.m.

Frankly, when it comes to the success of these European programmes, there is only one measurement that actually matters: are the people of Wales better off as a result? As the statistics clearly show, the answer to that is 'no'.

*Gwelliant 1 Jocelyn Davies*

*Dileu pwynt 1 a rhoi yn ei le:*

*Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gynnal asesiad cynhwysfawr o'i defnydd o arian yr UE yng Ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiad welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Mae grŵp Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r cynnig a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig er inni gyflwyno gwelliant, a chyfeiriaf at y gwelliant hwnnw mewn munud. Byddwn

'Mae llawer i'w gymeradwyo amdano' ond, fe ymddengys, nid digon i roi mesur diogelwch yn ei le cyn ei ddiddymu.

Pe bai Llywodraeth Cymru wir yn gwerthfawrogi arloesedd, gallai cyllid gan Lywodraeth Cymru ddisodli cyllid gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, naill ai o gronfeydd wrth gefn neu o ffynonellau eraill. Mantais hynny yw y gellid cyflwyno'r rhaglen, a gyfyngwyd i'r ardal gydygyfeirio yn flaenorol, i ardaloedd eraill ar draws Cymru sydd angen cymorth dybryd. Yr oedd yn ffordd allweddol o gefnogi arloesedd yng Nghymru a galwaf ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gyflwyno cynllun amgen effeithiol.

Gwn fod y Llywodraeth yn ymfalchïo yn ei record wrth weinyddu'r cronfeydd hyn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn clywed, o leiaf unwaith heddiw, am y wobr yr ydym wedi ei ennill am weinyddu'r cyllid hwn. Wel, do wir, rydym wedi ennill gwobr am fiwrocratiaeth gan Frwsel. Mae hynny'n rhyw fath o gamp, ond nid wyf o reidrwydd yn siŵr ei fod y math o gamp y buaswn yn falch ohoni.

A dweud y gwir, pan ddaw i lwyddiant y rhaglenni Ewropeaidd hyn, dim ond un mesur sy'n cyfrif: a yw pobl Cymru yn well eu byd o ganlyniad? Fel mae'r ystadegau yn dangos yn glir, yr ateb i hynny yw 'na'.

*Amendment 1 Jocelyn Davies*

*Delete point 1 and replace with:*

*Calls on the Welsh Government to undertake a comprehensive assessment of its use of EU funding in West Wales and the Valleys.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I move amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

The Plaid Cymru group welcomes this motion tabled by the Liberal Democrats. We will support the motion, although we have tabled an amendment to it, and I will speak to that amendment in a moment. We will also

hefyd yn cefnogi'r tri gwelliant yn enw William Graham. Mae gwelliant 2 yn cyfeirio at y ffigurau, ac nid oes modd anghytuno â'r rheini. Mae gwelliant 3 yn enw William Graham yn codi pwynt pwysig am y sector preifat, a chredaf ein bod ni i gyd yn derbyn nad ydym wedi llwyddo i sicrhau bod yn sector preifat wedi clymu ei hun i'r defnydd o gronfeydd strwythurol o Ewrop. Byddai pawb yn croesawu datblygiadau yn y maes hwnnw.

Serch hynny, gadewch inni gofio y defnyddiwyd arian y gronfa gydyfeirio i gefnogi cynlluniau ProAct a ReAct. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog menter a busnes yn gynharach at lwyddiant y cynlluniau ac at y ffaith fod Lywodraethau eraill—nid Llywodraeth y DU yn unig—wedi bod yn edrych ar y cynlluniau ac wedi pwysleisio pa mor bwysig y maent. Wrth gwrs, mae'r cynlluniau hynny wedi clymu'r sector preifat i gronfeydd strwythurol mewn ffordd ymarferol iawn. Maent wedi cadw swyddi a sgiliau yng Nghymru ac wedi cadw cwmnïau yn hyfyw pan oedd y marchnadoedd yn eu bygwth mewn termau real iawn. Wedi dweud hynny, yr ydym yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywed y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, sef bod angen inni gael mwy o ymrwymiad gan y sector preifat i ddefnyddio'r cronfeydd hyn.

Yr ydym yn sicr yn derbyn ysbryd gwelliant 4 yn enw William Graham. Nid ydym am weld sefyllfa lle mae cronfeydd strwythurol yn cael eu defnyddio fel ffordd o sicrhau bod blychau'n cael ei ticio. Serch hynny, unwaith eto, byddwn yn dadlau bod newid sylfaenol wedi bod yn y ffordd y mae arian cydgyfeiriant wedi cael ei ddosbarthu yng Nghymru o'i gymharu ag arian Amcan 1. Mae newid wedi digwydd, a'n gobaith yw y bydd y newid hwnnw'n parhau. Mae'r system wedi dod yn fwy hyblyg o lawer, sy'n golygu y gellir ei defnyddio mewn ffordd fwy effeithiol ac uniongyrchol.

Cawn ein harwain yn ôl at welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies ac at y newid yr ydym am ei weld yng nghynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrodol. Mae'r ffigurau cymharol sydd gennym i gyd yn ymwneud â 2008. Felly, maent yn ymwneud â'r defnydd a wnaed o arian Amcan 1 rhwng 2002 a 2007. Yr ydym yn derbyn, pan gafwyd yr arian yn 2008, nad

support the three amendments tabled in the name of William Graham. Amendment 2 refers to the figures, and there is no way of disputing those. Amendment 3 in the name of William Graham raises an important point about the private sector, and I think that we all accept that we have not succeeded in ensuring that the private sector tied itself into the use of structural funds from Europe. We would all welcome developments in that regard.

However, let us remember that convergence funding was used to support ProAct and ReAct. The Minister for business and enterprise referred earlier to how successful those programmes have been and the fact that other Governments—not only the UK Government—have been looking at those programmes and have emphasised how important they are. Of course, those programmes tied in the private sector to structural funds in a very practical way. They have kept jobs and skills in Wales and have kept companies viable when they were being threatened by the markets in very real terms. However, we accept what the Welsh Conservatives say, namely that we need more commitment from the private sector to the use of these funds.

We certainly accept the spirit of amendment 4 in the name of William Graham. We do not want to see a situation where structural funds are being used as part of a tick-box exercise. However, again, we would argue that there has been a fundamental change in the way that convergence funding has been allocated in Wales in comparison to Objective 1 funding. There has been a change, and we hope that the change will continue. The system has become much more flexible, and it can now be used much more effectively and directly.

That takes us back to amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and the change that we want to see to the Liberal Democrat motion. The comparative figures that we have all relate to 2008. Therefore, they involve the use made of Objective 1 funding from the years 2002 to 2007. We certainly accept that when we received funding in

oedd gan Lywodraeth Cymru ar y pryd gynllun ar gyfer defnyddio'r arian. Nid oedd gweledigaeth o ran sut y gellid ei ddefnyddio i weddnewid economi Cymru. I raddau helaeth, cafodd yr arian ei wario ar nifer o gynlluniau bach a oedd, ar y gorau, yn cyfiawnhau eu hunain. Nid oedd unrhyw ddilyniant i'r prosiectau hynny nac unrhyw effaith ar yr economi. Wedi dweud hynny, gadewch i ni beidio â chondemnio'r defnydd a wnaed o arian Amcan 1. Mae pethau gwerthfawr wedi datblygu o ganlyniad i'r buddsoddiad hwnnw, ond credaf y byddai pawb yn cytuno y gellid bod wedi defnyddio'r arian yn fwy pwrpasol ac effeithiol. Yn wir, sylwais fod Derek Vaughan, Aelod o Senedd Ewrop ar ran y Blaid Lafur, wedi dweud hynny ychydig wythnosau yn ôl a'i fod e'n teimlo fod methiant wedi digwydd yn hyn o beth.

Hyd yn oed gydag arian Amcan 1—gan mai 2008 yw'r flwyddyn a ddefnyddir ar gyfer y ffigurau cymharol—byddai rhywun yn tybio y byddai budd y prosiectau hynny, o ganlyniad i'r buddsoddiad, i'w weld tua diwedd y cyfnod. Felly, gellid dadlau, hyd yn oed o ran Amcan 1, nad yw 2008 yn dangos yn llawn effaith y buddsoddiadau hynny ac, yn sicr o ran cydgyfeiriant, nid ydym wedi cael cyfle i weld y buddsoddiad hwnnw eto. Mawr obeithiwn y bydd y buddsoddiad hwnnw'n sylweddol fwy na'r hyn a oedd Amcan 1 o 2000 hyd 2007.

*Gwelliant 2 William Graham*

*Cynnwys pwynt 2 newydd ac ail-rifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:*

*Yn nodi â phryder y gostyngiad yn CMC Gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd o 66.8 y cant o gyfartaledd yr UE yn 2000; i 64.4 y cant (y ffigur diweddaraf sydd ar gael) yn 2008.*

*Gwelliant 3 William Graham*

*Cynnwys pwynt 2 newydd ac ail-rifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:*

*Yn cydnabod bod angen ymgysylltu'n ehangach â'r sector preifat i feithrin twf cynaliadwy yn CMC y rhanbarthau hyn.*

2008, the Welsh Government did not have a plan for how to use that funding. There was no vision for how it could be used to transform the economy of Wales. To a great extent, the funding was spent on a great number of small projects that, at best, perhaps justified themselves. There was no follow-up to those projects or any effect on the economy. Having said that, let us not condemn the use that was made of Objective 1 funding. Very valuable things have developed as a result of that investment, but I think that we would all agree that we could have used that funding in a more purposeful and effective way. Indeed, Derek Vaughan, a Member of the European Parliament for the Labour Party, said a few weeks ago that he felt that there had been a failure in that regard.

Even with Objective 1 funding—because 2008 is the year used for the comparative figures—one would think that the benefit of those projects, as a result of the investment, would have been seen towards the end of the period. Therefore, it could be argued, even in terms of Objective 1, that 2008 does not reflect the full effect of the investment, and certainly in terms of convergence funding, we have not yet seen the investment. We very much hope that that investment will be far greater than Objective 1 funding from 2002 to 2007.

*Amendment 2 William Graham*

*Insert as new point 2 and renumber accordingly:*

*Notes with concern the decline in the GDP for West Wales and the valleys from 66.8% of the EU average in 2000; to 64.4% (the latest figure available) in 2008.*

*Amendment 3 William Graham*

*Insert as new point 2 and renumber accordingly:*

*Acknowledges the necessity for a wider engagement with the private sector to engender sustainable growth in the GDP of these regions.*

*Gwelliant 4 William Graham*

*Cynnwys pwynt 2 newydd ac ail-rifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:*

*Yn cydnabod bod rhaid i gynlluniau a ariannir gan yr UE symud i ffwrdd wrth y 'rheoliadau ticio blychau' a chanolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau hyfyw.*

**William Graham:** I move amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 in my name.

In the spirit of reciprocity, may I say that we agree with the Plaid Cymru amendment?

There is universal acceptance among politicians, industrialists and community workers in the voluntary sector that Objective 1 offered once-in-a-lifetime funding. It was an opportunity to enhance quality of life and to attract the further investment that would create employment opportunities and generate the wealth to lift west Wales and the Valleys out of social, economic and environmental poverty. The key message from Labour at Westminster and Cardiff was the promise of accomplishment. As Glenys Kinnock, then an MEP, described it in 2000:

'I am obviously pleased that Wales has qualified for £1.1 billion of aid over the next few years...But there's a downside. Wales gets this money because it is one of the poorest parts of the European Union. We'll know we are winning when we stopped qualifying for such aid.'

Other regions of the United Kingdom did win. During the time they were in receipt of Objective 1 funding, the relative prosperity of Cornwall, South Yorkshire and Merseyside increased. By November 2005, the promises of accomplishment had faded. Glenys Kinnock stated that she was confident that the UK Government was 'pulling out the stops' to ensure that Wales qualified for the next round of EU funding. The Labour United Kingdom Government, reverently supported by the Labour Assembly Government, pulled out the stops. Their failed and failing policies would ensure that Wales would qualify again for European funding. Sadly, the latest EU figures

*Amendment 4 William Graham*

*Insert as new point 2 and renumber accordingly:*

*Acknowledges the requirement, for EU funded schemes, to move away from 'tick box regulations' to focusing upon viable outcomes.*

**William Graham:** Cynigaf welliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn fy enw i.

Mewn ysbryd o ddwyochredd, a gaf ddweud ein bod yn cytuno â gwelliant Plaid Cymru?

Derbynnir yn gyffredinol ymhlith gwleidyddion, diwydianwyr a gweithwyr cymunedol yn y sector gwirfoddol fod Amcan 1 yn cynnig cyllid unwaith-mewn-oes. Roedd yn gyfle i wella ansawdd bywyd ac i ddenu buddsoddiad pellach a fyddai'n creu cyfleoedd cyflogaeth a chreu cyfoeth i godi gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd o dlodi cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol. Y neges allweddol gan Lafur yn San Steffan a Chaerdydd oedd yr addewid o gyflawni. Fel y disgrifiodd Glenys Kinnock, ASE bryd hynny, yn 2000:

Rwy'n amlwg yn falch bod Cymru wedi llwyddo i gael £1.1 biliwn o gymorth yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf...Ond mae yna anfantais. Mae Cymru yn cael yr arian hwn oherwydd ei bod yn un o rannau tlotaf yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Byddwn yn gwybod ein bod yn ennill pan nad ydym yn gymwys i gael cymorth o'r fath.

Fe wnaeth rhanbarthau eraill y Deyrnas Unedig ennill. Yn y cyfnod yr oeddent yn derbyn arian Amcan 1, cynyddodd ffyniant cymharol Cernyw, De Swydd Efrog a Glannau Merswy. Erbyn mis Tachwedd 2005, pylodd yr addewidion am lwyddiant. Dywedodd Glenys Kinnock ei bod yn hyderus bod Llywodraeth y DU yn 'gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu' i sicrhau bod Cymru yn gymwys ar gyfer y rownd nesaf o gyllid UE. Fe wnaeth Llywodraeth Lafur y Deyrnas Unedig bopeth o fewn ei gallu, gyda chefnogaeth barchus Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad. Byddai methiant eu polisiau yn sicrhau y byddai Cymru'n gymwys eto i gael arian Ewropeaidd. Yn anffodus, mae ffigurau

highlight that, of the 66 regions that received both Objective 1 and convergence funding, 57 of them became relatively wealthier, including regions of Greece, Latvia, Slovakia and Spain. Nine regions—that is, west Wales and the Valleys, two regions of Portugal, four regions of southern Italy, and Malta—were the only regions to receive this funding and become relatively poorer. I am sure that we can all recall how, in October 2004, Wales was airbrushed from the map of Europe on the cover of the ‘Eurostat Statistical Compendium’; I am sure that Labour AMs would wish to airbrush these damning facts about the decline in GDP in west Wales and the Valleys out of existence.

In September 2006, the European Commission signed a contract of confidence with Wales, which largely affected the functioning of the management and control systems, the audit strategy and the quality of the annual control reporting. Once again, I quote from Glenys Kinnock:

‘It’s a strong endorsement of the way the Assembly Government has handled European regional aid since 2000.’

We know that, by 2013, £3.5 billion-worth of funding will have been received. Further, the reality is that the contract of confidence, in which we have gained a tick in every box for regulating management and control systems, is not worth one iota. It did not harness funding and neither did it create a real and positive effect in our most deprived communities.

We support the POWIS initiative in broad terms and welcome the review. The Labour Welsh Government has warned, and Welsh Conservatives, together with representatives of the private and voluntary sectors, have highlighted time and again that, too often, public sector schemes fail to become self-sustaining and fold as soon as their funding streams dry up. If change is not realised, and the public sector domination of the social and economic agenda continues with little input from private enterprise, Wales will be destined to remain at the lowest levels of United Kingdom and European prosperity.

diweddaraf yr UE yn amlygu, o’r 66 o ranbarthau a dderbyniodd arian Amcan 1 ac arian cydgyfeirio, mai dim ond 57 ohonynt a ddaeth yn gymharol gyfoethocach, gan gynnwys rhanbarthau yng Ngwlad Groeg, Latfia, Slofacia a Sbaen. Roedd naw rhanbarth—hynny yw, gorllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd, dau ranbarth o Bortiwgal, pedwar rhanbarth de’r Eidal, a Melita—oedd yr unig ranbarthau i dderbyn y cyllid hwn ac wedi mynd yn gymharol dlotach. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn i gyd yn cofio sut, ym mis Hydref 2004, y diflannodd Cymru o fap Ewrop ar glawr y ‘Eurostat Statistical Compendium’; yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai ACau Llafur am i’r ffeithiau damniol hyn ddiflannu, o ran y dirywiad mewn CMC yn ngorllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd.

Ym mis Medi 2006, llofnododd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd gontract o hyder gyda Chymru, a oedd yn effeithio i raddau helaeth ar y ffordd roedd y systemau rheoli a rheolaeth yn gweithio, y strategaeth archwilio ac ansawdd yr adrodd rheoli blynyddol. Unwaith eto, dyfynnaf Glenys Kinnock:

Mae’n gymeradwyaeth gref i’r ffordd mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymdrin â chymorth rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd ers 2000.

Gwyddom y bydd £3.5 biliwn o ariannu wedi dod i law erbyn 2013. At hynny, y gwir amdani yw nad yw’r contract o hyder, lle’r ydym wedi ennill tic ym mhob blwch ar gyfer rheoleiddio systemau rheoli a rheolaeth, yn werth tamaid. Ni wnaeth harneisio arian ac nid oedd yn creu effaith wirioneddol a chadarnhaol yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig.

Yr ydym yn cefnogi menter POWIS yn fras ac yn croesawu’r adolygiad. Rhybuddiodd Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru, ac mae’r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, ynghyd â chynrychiolwyr y sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol, wedi tanlinellu dro ar ôl tro bod cynlluniau’r sector cyhoeddus, yn rhy aml, yn methu dod yn hunangynhaliol ac yn dod i ben cyn gynted ag y mae eu ffrydiau arian yn sychu. Os na ddaw newid, ac y bydd goruchafiaeth y sector cyhoeddus o’r agenda cymdeithasol ac economaidd yn parhau gyda fawr ddim o fewnbwn gan fenter preifat, bydd Cymru yn debyg o aros ar lefelau isaf

This was once again highlighted by Mike Theodoulou, the chairman of the Mid and West Wales Chamber, who was a member of the negotiating team that helped to secure EU funding. He asks whether the money was used in the right way. Some of it was, but some of it was not; not enough direct aid went to business. That is a lesson that we have to learn.

An inquiry by the Assembly's Enterprise and Learning Committee specified the importance of greater engagement with smaller players in the third and private sectors. I hope that the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science will fully embrace working with the private sector. It is vital that we get this balance right. She must also work with her ministerial colleagues to ensure that an increasing number of students gain STEM qualifications, which will attract wider investment for research, development and innovation to increase prosperity, not only within west Wales and the Valleys, but also throughout Wales.

**Peter Black:** I will concentrate on the Prince of Wales innovation scholarships and the disastrous decision by the Welsh Government to suspend the European payments for that scheme. That decision has had a number of consequences, one of which was to send a signal to academics and investors outside Wales that we are not interested in commercially based research, and that the Welsh Government does not understand the needs of business.

If we are to build the Welsh economy, we need to make use of the important work that is going on in our universities and turn it into wealth-creating enterprise and high-quality jobs. That is something that POWIS was particularly good at. This is a scheme that has hit all the targets set for it. It has brought in £14 million of inward investment and assisted 72 companies. Examples of firms that have been attracted to Wales as a result of this scheme are Pingar (NZ) and Kaimai Research (UK), which took the decision to relocate their research and development arms to Swansea, due to the personal academic relationships between Swansea University

ffyniant yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac Ewrop. Amlygwyd hyn drachefn gan Mike Theodoulou, cadeirydd Siambr Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, a oedd yn aelod o'r tîm negodi a helpodd i sicrhau cyllid UE. Mae'n holi a yw'r arian yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn y ffordd gywir. Fe gafodd rhywfaint ohono, a rhywfaint ddim; ni aeth digon o gymorth uniongyrchol i fusnesau. Mae honno'n wers i ni i'w dysgu.

Nododd ymchwiliad gan Bwyllgor Menter a Dysgu'r Cynulliad pa mor bwysig oedd cael mwy o ymgysylltu â chwaraewyr llai yn y trydydd sector a'r sector preifat. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth yn llwyr gofleidio gweithio gyda'r sector preifat. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cael y cydbwysedd hwn yn iawn. Rhaid iddi weithio hefyd gyda'i chyd-Weinidogion i sicrhau bod nifer cynyddol o fyfyrwyr yn ennill cymwysterau STEM, a fydd yn denu buddsoddiad ehangach ar gyfer ymchwil, datblygu ac arloesi er mwyn cynyddu ffyniant, nid yn unig yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, ond hefyd ledled Cymru.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar ysgoloriaethau arloesi Tywysog Cymru a phenderfyniad trychinebus Llywodraeth Cymru i atal taliadau Ewropeaidd i'r cynllun hwnnw. Mae nifer o oblygiadau wedi bod i'r penderfyniad hwnnw, ac un ohonynt oedd cyfleu i academyddion a buddsoddwyr tu allan i Gymru nad oes gennym ddi-ddordeb mewn ymchwil fasnachol, ac nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn deall anghenion busnes.

Os ydym am adeiladu economi Cymru, mae angen ddefnyddio'r gwaith pwysig sy'n cael ei wneud yn ein prifysgolion a'i droi i mewn i fenter sy'n creu cyfoeth a swyddi o safon uchel. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth mae POWIS yn arbennig o dda am ei wneud. Mae hwn yn gynllun sydd wedi taro'r holl dargedau a osodwyd ar ei gyfer. Mae wedi dod â £14 miliwn o fuddsoddiad o'r tu allan ac wedi cynorthwyo 72 o gwmnïau. Mae enghreifftiau o gwmnïau sydd wedi cael eu denu i Gymru o ganlyniad i'r cynllun hwn yn cynnwys Pingar (NZ) a Kaimai Research (UK), a benderfynodd adleoli eu canghennau gwaith ymchwil a datblygu i Abertawe,

and the University of Waikato. They had planned to develop a new centre for knowledge engineering in Swansea, which could mean the creation of up to 100 high-value jobs in the area. However, they are being frustrated by the current position on POWIS and the failure of Ministers to sign off new leases in the digital technium. They sought an urgent meeting with Ministers, but were fobbed off with an acknowledgement indicating that they will receive a response within 17 days. Is that any way to attract new jobs to Wales and to grow the economy?

What of the decision to stop European funding to the POWIS scheme? I have in my possession an independent report written by PricewaterhouseCoopers, which was commissioned by the University of Wales's audit committee. It is fair to say that its commentary on the Welsh Government's decision verges on the incredulous. It says that it was apparent from the outset that the nature, scale and intent of the POWIS scheme were well understood by the Welsh Government and the Welsh European Funding Office. It points out that the progress to date includes 54 identified collaborative research and development projects, and a total investment of £9.2 million, of which £408,000 came from WEFO. That represents much better value for money than most European investments. Its report has a point-by-point rebuttal of the Welsh Government's decision to stop the funding for this project, and it questions why identified problems could not be worked through and put right to continue this successful project.

This is especially so as the Welsh Government and WEFO were represented on the steering group and industry panel of POWIS, and were party to all the decisions of which they have subsequently been critical. The report says that there is no evidence that WAG or WEFO representatives raised any concern in respect of these issues as being deal-breakers for the POWIS scheme. It also says that there is nothing in the WAG report on corporate governance or its conflicts of interest matters that it would not have been aware of from the industry panel and steering

oherwydd y berthynas academiaidd bersonol rhwng Prifysgol Abertawe a Phrifysgol Waikato. Roedden nhw wedi bwriadu datblygu canolfan newydd ar gyfer peirianeg gwybodaeth yn Abertawe, a allai greu hyd at 100 o swyddi uchel eu gwerth yn yr ardal. Fodd bynnag, maent yn teimlo'n rhwystredig oherwydd y sefyllfa bresennol o ran POWIS a methiant Gweinidogion i lofnodi prydlesi newydd yn y technium digidol. Maent wedi gofyn am gyfarfod brys â Gweinidogion, ond cawsant esgusodion gyda chydabyddiaeth yn nodi y byddant yn derbyn ymateb o fewn 17 diwrnod. A yw hynny'n unrhyw ffordd o ddenu swyddi newydd i Gymru ac i dyfu'r economi?

Beth am y penderfyniad i roi'r gorau i roi arian Ewropeaidd i gynllun POWIS? Mae gen i yn fy meddiant adroddiad annibynnol a ysgrifennwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers, a gomisiynwyd gan bwyllgor archwilio Prifysgol Cymru. Teg dweud bod ei sylwadau ar benderfyniad Llywodraeth Cymru bron yn anghrediniol. Mae'n dweud ei bod yn amlwg o'r cychwyn cyntaf bod Llywodraeth Cymru a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn deall yn iawn natur, maint a bwriad cynllun POWIS. Mae'n nodi bod y cynnydd hyd yma yn cynnwys 54 o brosiectau ymchwil a datblygu ar y cyd, a buddsoddiad o £9.2 miliwn yn ei gyfanswm, gyda £408,000 yn dod o WEFO. Mae hynny'n cynrychioli gwerth am arian llawer gwell na'r rhan fwyaf o fuddsoddiadau Ewropeaidd. Mae'r adroddiad yn gwrthbrofi pwynt ar ôl pwynt o benderfyniad Llywodraeth Cymru i atal y cyllid ar gyfer y prosiect hwn, ac mae'n cwestiynu pam na ellid bod wedi datrys problemau a nodwyd er mwyn parhau â'r prosiect llwyddiannus hwn.

Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir gan fod Llywodraeth Cymru a WEFO yn cael eu cynrychioli ar grŵp llywio a phanel diwydiant POWIS, ac roeddent yn rhan o'r penderfyniadau y buont yn eu beirniadu ers hynny. Dywed yr adroddiad nad oes unrhyw dystiolaeth bod cynrychiolwyr LICC na WEFO wedi codi unrhyw bryder fod y materion hyn yn rhoi sail i atal cynllun POWIS. Mae hefyd yn dweud nad oes dim yn adroddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar lywodraethu corfforaethol na materion gwrthdaro buddiannau na fyddai wedi



group meetings. It is therefore surprising that it is now formally raising these matters in a way that questions the validity of the project in its totality, rather than by addressing those issues at the time that they arose.

In light of this, the decision by the Government to withdraw funding is perverse and against the interests of Wales and its economy. I urge the Minister to think again about that particular decision. I understand that the Minister has taken a decision and that there may be issues around this that she considers important in terms of the way in which European funds are being used. If you are not able to reinstate POWIS, it is important that we have something in its place. It is not right that the Welsh Government should step aside from a scheme that has been so successful and that has brought research and jobs to Wales, albeit limited to the convergence area. It is crucial that the Welsh Government shows that it understands business and the way that we can use research to create wealth and jobs. Therefore, it is crucial that there is some sort of replacement scheme for POWIS as a result.

So, if you are not able to reinstate the funding to POWIS, can we look at alternatives? Where we are at the moment is an untenable no man's land that we cannot sustain for much longer. There must be a replacement and something must be done to put in place an alternative scheme, or the business and academic world will take away the message that Wales is not interested in them, or in attracting those high-quality jobs to Swansea or to Wales.

5.15 p.m.

**Mark Drakeford:** I hope to contribute this afternoon in my capacity as chair of the programme monitoring committee for European funding. Most Members will know that the PMC is a European requirement that brings together senior figures from business, local authorities, the research community, trade unions, the third sector and beyond to discharge functions on behalf on the Commission and to advise the Welsh

gwybod amdanynt o'r cyfarfodydd panel diwydiant a'r grŵp llywio. Felly, mae'n syndod ei fod yn awr yn codi'r materion hyn yn ffurfiol mewn ffordd sy'n cwestiynu dilysrwydd y prosiect yn ei gyfanrwydd, yn hytrach na mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny ar yr adeg y gwnaethant godi.

Yng ngoleuni hyn, mae'r penderfyniad gan y Llywodraeth i dynnu cyllid yn wydroedig ac yn erbyn buddiannau Cymru a'i heconomi. Anogaf y Gweinidog i feddwl eto am y penderfyniad penodol hwnnw. Deallaf fod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud penderfyniad a gall fod materion sy'n ymwneud â hyn y mae'n ystyried i fod yn bwysig o ran y ffordd y caiff cronfeydd Ewropeaidd eu defnyddio. Os nad ydych yn gallu ailsefydlu POWIS, mae'n bwysig bod rhywbeth gennym yn ei le. Nid yw'n iawn y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru gamu nôl o gynllun a fu mor lwyddiannus ac sydd wedi dod â gwaith ymchwil a swyddi i Gymru, er ei fod yn gyfyngedig i'r ardal cydgyfeiriant. Mae'n hollbwysig bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn dangos ei bod yn deall busnes a'r modd y gallwn ddefnyddio gwaith ymchwil i greu cyfoeth a swyddi. Felly, mae'n hanfodol bod rhyw fath o gynllun newydd ar gyfer POWIS o ganlyniad.

Felly, os nad ydych yn gallu ailsefydlu'r cyllid i POWIS, allwn ni edrych ar ddewisiadau eraill? Rydym yn nhir neb ar hyn o bryd ac na allwn gynnal hynny am lawer hirach. Mae angen rhywbeth yn ei le, ac mae'n rhaid gwneud rhywbeth i roi cynllun amgen ar waith, neu bydd y byd busnes ac academiaidd yn cael y neges nad oes gan Gymru ddiddordeb ynddynt, neu o ran denu'r swyddi o safon uchel hynny i Abertawe neu i Gymru.

**Mark Drakeford:** Rwy'n gobeithio cyfrannu y prynhawn yma yn rhinwedd fy rôl fel cadeirydd y pwyllgor monitro'r rhaglen ar gyfer arian Ewropeaidd. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau yn gwybod fod y pwyllgor yn ofyniad Ewropeaidd sy'n dod â phobl uwch ynghyd o fusnes, awdurdodau lleol, y gymuned ymchwil, undebau llafur, y trydydd sector a thu hwnt er mwyn cyflawni swyddogaethau ar ran y Comisiwn ac i

Government on the progress of the programme. Thanks largely to the hard work of my predecessor, Jeff Cuthbert, and the team that works on the programme, there have been significant achievements in recent years. I believe that members of the PMC would be disappointed at the negative tone with which this motion begins—not at the call for lessons to be learned, because we do that all of the time, but at the way in which it devalues the efforts of so many individuals and organisations, not here, but in those parts of Wales where European funding makes a positive difference every day. The mover of the motion was right in one thing at least: it is worth putting on record some of those achievements. They are not bureaucratic achievements, in the rather flippant way that she suggested, and in a moment I will try to explain to her why those achievements that are to do with administration are particularly important to Wales's reputation in this area.

Beyond issues of administration, it is worth reminding ourselves that Wales was the first country in the European Union to win the RegioStars award for innovation. It was nothing to do with bureaucracy; it was to do with recognition of the work done by European-funded companies. In 2008, it was OpTIC Technium in St Asaph. In 2009, it was a programme at Swansea University that shows businesses how to use new technologies to improve energy efficiency, increase turnover and become more successful. It is no wonder that, in 2010, during a visit to Wales, EC President Barosso praised Wales and said that he considered it to be one of the most successful regions, or in this case a nation, properly using EU funding. He said that Wales is among the best and most effective spenders. The awards for innovation did not stop there. We are the only place in Europe that has won a third RegioStars innovation award. This year it was for growth in environment and marine sciences, for a project that prepares graduates working in marine sciences for the commercial world. When he presented that award, Commissioner Hahn of DG Regio said that Wales should be proud of its successes and for providing inspiration for other European nations.

gynggori Llywodraeth Cymru ar hynt y rhaglen. Diolch yn bennaf i waith caled fy rhagflaenydd, Jeff Cuthbert, a'r tîm sy'n gweithio ar y rhaglen, bu llwyddiannau sylweddol yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Credaf y byddai aelodau'r pwyllgor yn siomedig gyda'r tòn negyddol y mae'r cynnig yn dechrau ag onid am y galw i wersi gael eu dysgu, achos rydym yn gwneud hynny drwy'r adeg, ond gyda'r ffordd mae'n dibrisio ymdrechion gymaint o unigolion a sefydliadau, nid yn y fan hyn, ond yn y rhannau hynny o Gymru lle mae arian Ewropeaidd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth cadarnhaol bob dydd. Roedd cynigiwr y cynnig yn iawn am un peth o leiaf: mae'n werth cofnodi rhai o'r llwyddiannau hynny. Nid llwyddiannau biwrocraataidd mohonynt, yn y ffordd braidd yn wamal y gwnaeth hi awgrymu, ac mewn eiliad fe geisïaf egluro wrthi pam fod y llwyddiannau hynny sy'n ymwneud â gweinyddu yn arbennig o bwysig i enw da Cymru yn y maes hwn.

Tu hwnt i faterion gweinyddu, mae'n werth atgoffa ein hunain mai Cymru oedd y wlad gyntaf yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i ennill gwobr RegioStars am arloesi. Nid oedd gan hynny ddim i'w wneud â biwrocraatiaeth; roedd yn ymwneud â chydabod y gwaith a wnaed gan gwmnïau a ariannwyd gan Ewrop. Yn 2008, OpTIC Technium yn Llanellwyr a gafodd ei gydnabod. Yn 2009, rhaglen ym Mhrifysgol Abertawe sy'n dangos i fusnesau sut i ddefnyddio technolegau newydd i wella effeithiolrwydd ynni, cynyddu trosiant a dod yn fwy llwyddiannus a gafodd ei chydabod. Nid yw'n syndod, yn 2010, yn ystod ymweliad â Chymru, fod Llywydd y Gymuned Ewropeaidd, Llywydd Barosso, wedi canmol Cymru a dweud ei fod yn ei hystyried yn un o'r rhanbarthau mwyaf llwyddiannus, neu genedl yn yr achos hwn, sy'n defnyddio arian o'r UE yn briodol. Dywedodd fod Cymru ymysg y rhai gorau a'r mwyaf effeithiol o ran gwario. Ond nid dyna'r cwbl o ran gwobrau ar gyfer arloesi. Ni yw'r unig le yn Ewrop sydd wedi ennill trydydd gwobr arloesi RegioStars. Eleni, roedd am dwf yn y gwyddorau amgylchedd a morol, am brosiect sy'n paratoi graddedigion sy'n gweithio yn y gwyddorau morol ar gyfer y byd masnachol. Wrth gyflwyno'r wob, dywedodd Comisiynydd Hahn o'r DG Regio y dylai Cymru fod yn falch o'i llwyddiannau

ac am fod yn ysbrydoliaeth i genhedloedd Ewropeaidd eraill.

Nid ydym yng Nghymru yn ystyried materion Ewropeaidd yn yr un ffordd elyniaethus ag y mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn eu gweld. Yr ydym yn cydnabod y cymorth cyson yr ydym wedi'i gael o gyllidebau Ewropeaidd dros y degawd o ddatganoli. Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at gynllunio a pharatoi ar gyfer y cyfnod nesaf. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus er mwyn diogelu'r enw da yr ydym wedi llwyddo i'w ennill ers dechrau'r rhaglen.

It is on that point—its willingness to dispense with that hard-won reputation for careful and effective administration—that this motion is so badly wrong-headed. It attacks where it ought to have proceeded carefully; it suggests action where only care is required. Let us hope that, at the end of this afternoon, it does not leave here representing this Assembly's view of those very important issues on which our reputation depends, not only in Wales, but far beyond.

**Aled Roberts:** Nid wyf yn credu bod y cynnig hwn a'r gwelliannau yn elyniaethus tuag at yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o ran yr arian sydd wedi cael ei wario na'r gefnogaeth yng Nghymru i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym yn ceisio gofyn i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar y sefyllfa a gofyn i'w hun a yw'r arian sydd wedi cael ei wario yng Nghymru—rhyw £6 biliwn dros y cyfnod—wedi cael ei wario'n effeithiol. Yr wyf yn meddwl bod William Graham yn hollol iawn i ofyn pam yr ydym, am y trydydd tro yn olynol, mewn sefyllfa lle nad oes llawer o bobl yn credu na fydd gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn cael arian ychwanegol am gyfnod ychwanegol.

Mae'n rhaid i ni fel Cynulliad ofyn pam fod y sefyllfa'n gwaethygu yng Nghymru o'i chymharu â'r rhan fwyaf o ranbarthau Ewrop. Mae'n rhaid inni ofyn pam. Nid yw'n fater o fod yn negyddol ond o ofyn pam. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cymryd y cynnig hwn ac yn gofyn a oes gwersi i'w dysgu o'r ranbarthau yn Ewrop lle cafwyd mwy o lwyddiant dros y degawd diwethaf.

We in Wales do not think of European issues in the same hostile way as the Westminster Government. We recognise the consistent support that we have received from European funds over the decade of devolution. We look forward to planning and preparing for the next period. We must be careful, so that we safeguard the reputation that we have succeeded in gaining since the start of this programme.

Dyna pam fod y cynnig hwn—ei barodrwydd i ddiystyru'r enw da hwnnw am weinyddu gofalus ac effeithiol y gweithiwyd mor galed amdano—mor gyfeiliornus. Mae'n ymosod lle dylai fod wedi troedio'n ofalus; mae'n awgrymu gweithredu lle mai dim ond gofal sydd ei angen. Gadewch i ni obeithio, erbyn diwedd y prynhawn yma, na fydd yn gadael yma yn cynrychioli safbwynt y Cynulliad am y materion pwysig iawn hynny y mae ein henw da yn dibynnu arnynt, nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond ymhell tu hwnt.

**Aled Roberts:** I do not believe that this motion and the amendments are hostile to the European Union with regard to the money that has been spent or Welsh support for the European Union. We are trying to ask the Government to look at the situation and to ask itself whether the money that has been spent in Wales—some £6 billion over the period—has been spent effectively. I think that William Graham is right to ask why, for the third consecutive round, we are in a situation where few people believe that west Wales and the Valleys will not qualify for additional funding for an additional round.

We as an Assembly have to ask why the situation in Wales is deteriorating in comparison with the majority of European regions. We have to ask why. It is not a matter of being negative, but of asking why that is the case. I hope that the Government takes this motion and asks itself whether there are lessons to be learned from the European regions where there has been greater success over the last decade.

It is clear that, in recent years, we have been falling back. There is no question about it. Despite the £6 billion of funds, we are comparatively poorer than when the first round of European funding was given to Wales. In saying that, I do not seek to devalue or negate the moneys and support that have been granted by the European Union, but to ask whether our assessment of the effectiveness of that spending is objective.

I also hope that, as far as the reviews are concerned—here I might upset my colleague Peter Black—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’] With POWIS, there is an issue regarding why the Minister has perhaps sought to cease European funding, but there is also an issue as to how effective POWIS has been across Wales in general. I am sure that the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science and Peter Black are more than content with the concentration of funding in a certain part of Wales. That is understandable, given the existence of two high-ranking institutions and the population of 170,000, but, as far as my region is concerned, I would hope that the review looks at how successful it has been—

**Peter Black:** I wanted to point out to my colleague that, because it is funded by convergence funding, it is limited to the convergence area.

**Aled Roberts:** That is why I was going to go on to talk about the position of Bangor University in my region, which has a good research facility, and ask why POWIS has little or no involvement with it. I would hope that, in the review that is to be undertaken, we look at how POWIS can be properly distributed across Wales. That was a rather tongue-in-cheek comment, Peter, to underline the point that you were trying to make. I would also underline the point that Glyndŵr University has been engaged in the programme through the GeoLang facility, where a POWIS scholar is supervised.

However, there are real issues here regarding the figures, not only as far the success of the economic effect of the £6 billion is concerned, but also the points that Eluned Parrott mentioned with regard to the success

Yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'n amlwg ein bod wedi llithro'n ôl. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Er gwaethaf £6 biliwn o arian, rydym yn gymharol dlotach na phan roddwyd y cylch cyntaf o arian Ewrop i Gymru. Wrth ddweud hynny, nid wyf yn ceisio dibrisio na siarad yn negyddol am yr arian a'r cymorth a roddwyd gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ond gofyn a yw ein hasesiad o effeithiolrwydd y gwario hwnnw yn wrthrychol.

Gobeithio, o ran yr adolygiadau—efallai y gwnaf dramgwyddo fy nghyd-Aelod Peter Black—[AELODAU CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’] Gyda POWIS, mae mater o ran pam fod y Gweinidog hwyrach wedi penderfynu dod ag arian Ewropeaidd i ben, ond mae mater hefyd am ba mor effeithiol fu POWIS ar draws Cymru yn gyffredinol. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth a Peter Black yn fwy na bodlon bod yr arian wedi ei ganolbwyntio mewn rhan arbennig o Gymru. Mae hynny'n ddealladwy, o gofio bod dau sefydliad o safon uchel a phoblogaeth o 170,000 yno, ond o ran fy rhanbarth i, gobeithio y bydd yr adolygiad yn edrych ar ba mor llwyddiannus y bu—

**Peter Black:** Roeddwn eisiau tynnu sylw fy nghyd-Aelod at y ffaith ei fod wedi ei gyfyngu i'r ardal gydygyfeirio, gan ei fod wedi cael ei ariannu gan arian cydgyfeirio.

**Aled Roberts:** Dyna pam yr oeddwn am fynd ymlaen i sôn am sefyllfa Prifysgol Bangor yn fy ardal, sydd â chyfleuster ymchwil da, a holi pam nad yw POWIS wedi ymwneud fawr ddim â hi. Yn yr adolygiad a fydd yn cael ei gynnal, gobeithio y byddwn yn edrych ar sut y gellir dosbarthu POWIS yn briodol ar draws Cymru. Rhyw sylw tafod-mewn-boch braidd oedd hwnnw, Peter, i danlinellu'r pwynt yr oeddech yn trio ei wneud. Byddwn hefyd yn tanlinellu'r pwynt fod Prifysgol Glyndŵr wedi ymwneud â'r rhaglen drwy'r cyfleuster GeoLang, lle mae ysgolhaig POWIS yn cael ei oruchwylio.

Fodd bynnag, mae materion go iawn o ran y ffigurau, nid yn unig o ran llwyddiant effaith economaidd y £6 biliwn, ond hefyd y pwyntiau y soniodd Eluned Parrott amdanynt am lwyddiant cynlluniau hyfforddi, sy'n

of training schemes, which are particularly worrying. I hope that Jeff Cuthbert and other Ministers will look at why the figures in Wales appear to be more startling than in other European regions. Why is it that only 32 per cent of people on European-funded training projects, who were expected, as part of those training projects, to enter into employment, have done so? In addition, why, according to the Government's figures as reported to the European Union, have 44,000 fewer people applied for European-funded training schemes than was originally expected?

It is right that we take stock of where we are. I hope that the Government reflects on why the position in Wales is not as positive as we all would have hoped that it would be, given the amount of funding that we have had. As William Graham said, the real measure of success would have been if west Wales and the Valleys had not qualified for a further round of European funding. There must be a review of where we are; and that is what this motion seeks—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Conclude now, please.

**Aled Roberts:** I would hope that the review contains a proper estimation of why the training schemes, in particular, have not been as successful as we might have hoped.

**David Rees:** Thank you for allowing me to speak in this debate. The facts are the facts, and I do not think that anyone would question them. First, I want to concur with everything that my colleague from Cardiff West said; it is not irrelevant to look at the recognition that the Welsh Government has had for the way that it has dealt with European issues, despite what the Member for South Wales Central said.

I agree, though, that it is disappointing that, even with the possible change in transition figures, which may be 75 or 90 per cent of GDP, west Wales and the Valleys is likely to be eligible once again for funding from Europe, even after convergence funding.

destun pryder arbennig. Gobeithio y bydd Jeff Cuthbert a Gweinidogion eraill yn edrych ar pam fod y ffigurau yng Nghymru yn ymddangos yn fwy syfrdanol na rhai rhanbarthau Ewropeaidd eraill. Pam mai dim ond 32 y cant o bobl ar brojectau hyfforddiant a ariannwyd gan Ewrop, yr oedd disgwyl iddynt, fel rhan o'r projectau hyfforddiant hynny, fynd i gyflogaeth, sydd wedi gwneud hynny? Yn ogystal, pam, yn ôl ffigurau'r Llywodraeth a roddwyd i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, fod 44,000 yn llai o bobl wedi gwneud cais am gynlluniau hyfforddiant a ariannwyd gan Ewrop nag oedd disgwyl yn wreiddiol?

Mae'n iawn ein bod yn cymryd cam nôl ac edrych ar ble yr ydym. Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ystyried pam nad yw'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru mor gadarnhaol ag y byddem i gyd wedi gobeithio, o ystyried faint o arian a gawsom. Fel dywedodd William Graham, y gwir fesur o lwyddiant fyddai pe bai gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd ddim wedi cymhwyso i gael cylch arall o arian Ewrop. Rhaid bod adolygiad yn cael ei gynnal o le yr ydym; a dyna mae'r cynnig hwn yn ceisio—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gorffennwch yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Aled Roberts:** Byddwn yn gobeithio bod yr adolygiad yn cynnwys amcangyfrif priodol o pam nad yw cynlluniau hyfforddiant, yn benodol, wedi bod mor llwyddiannus ag y byddem wedi gobeithio.

**David Rees:** Diolch am ganiatáu i mi siarad yn y ddadl hon. Y ffeithiau yw'r ffeithiau, ac nid wyf yn meddwl y byddai neb yn eu cwestiynu. Yn gyntaf, rwyf eisiau cytuno â phopeth a ddywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod o Orllewin Caerdydd; nid yw'n amherthnasol i edrych ar y gwynbyddiaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei chael am y ffordd mae wedi delio â materion Ewropeaidd, er gwaethaf beth ddywedodd yr Aelod dros Ganol De Cymru.

Serch hynny, cytunaf ei bod yn siomedig, hyd yn oed gyda'r newid posibl yn y ffigurau pontio, a allai fod yn 75 neu 90 y cant o gynnyrch domestig gros, fod gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn debyg o fod yn gymwys drachefn i gael arian gan Ewrop,

Having said that, we must look at what we have achieved to date, and at some of the reasons why GDP in that region has failed to climb above the 75 per cent threshold. I will come on to POWIS later, because I have a point to make on that, too.

In the 2007-13 funding period, a total of 236 projects were funded by over £1.5 billion. Almost £0.25 billion went directly to organisations within South Wales West, many of them in Swansea. There is a huge amount of money coming in, and we have been able to develop those projects and take the region on. High Performance Computing Wales is a perfect example, and we can do more.

I also agree with Rhodri Glyn Thomas. The calculation of GDP for 2008 does not really reflect the 2007 investment, where it is clearly recognised that we are moving forward with the funding situation. There are other issues that I will come back to in a minute with regard to why those figures are quite so low. However, for now I will focus on improving the skills of the workforce so that we can attract inward investment and help our own entrepreneurs to create businesses. Over 581,000 employment and training opportunities have been made available through the funding, and let us remember that, behind every one of those figures, there is an individual, a family, a community and employment. Let us not forget that.

This has led to world-class innovation, in my view. Some examples have already been mentioned. I have to mention Swansea University, because Swansea is adjacent to my constituency, where the digital, industrial, packaging, lean and environment project received a RegioStars award, as Mark Drakeford said. We also have infrastructure projects in my own constituency, with over £54 million put into the Harbour Way road, which will open up a huge area for development. That links in with investment in the railway station, so we are preparing the infrastructure for future work to come in, and we have received interest from across the world in coming into that development area.

hyd yn oed ar ôl arian cydgyfeirio. Wedi dweud hynny, rhaid i ni edrych ar beth rydym wedi ei gyflawni hyd yma, ac ar rai o'r rhesymau pam fod CDC yn y rhanbarth hwnnw wedi methu â chyrraedd mwy na'r trothwy 75 y cant. Fe ddof at POWIS yn nes ymlaen, gan fod gen i bwynt i'w wneud ar hynny hefyd.

Yng nghyfnod ariannu 2007-13, cafodd cyfanswm o 236 o brojectau eu hariannu gan dros £1.5 biliwn. Aeth bron i £0.25 biliwn yn uniongyrchol i sefydliadau yng Ngorllewin De Cymru, llawer ohonynt yn Abertawe. Mae swm anferth o arian yn dod mewn, ac rydym wedi gallu datblygu'r projectau hynny a mynd â'r rhanbarth yn ei blaen. Mae Cyfrifiadura Perfformiad Uchel Cymru yn enghraifft berffaith, a gallwn wneud mwy.

Rwy'n cytuno hefyd â Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Nid yw'r cyfrifiad o CDC ar gyfer 2008 wir yn adlewyrchu'r buddsoddiad yn 2007, lle cafodd ei gydnabod yn glir ein bod yn symud ymlaen gyda'r sefyllfa ariannu. Dof yn ôl at faterion eraill mewn munud o ran pam fod y ffigurau hynny mor isel. Fodd bynnag, am y tro fe wnaaf ganolbwyntio ar wella sgiliau'r gweithlu fel ei fod yn gallu denu buddsoddiad mewnol a helpu ein hentrepreneuriaid i greu busnesau. Mae dros 581,000 o gyfleoedd cyflogaeth a hyfforddiant wedi cael eu creu drwy'r arian, a rhaid i ni gofio bod unigolyn, teulu, cymuned a chyflogaeth y tu ôl i bob un o'r ffigurau hynny. Ni ddylem anghofio hynny.

Mae hynny wedi arwain at arloesi o'r safon uchaf, yn fy marn i. Soniwyd am rai enghreifftiau yn barod. Rhaid i mi sôn am Brifysgol Abertawe, gan fod Abertawe yn cyd-ffinio â'm hetholaeth, lle gwnaeth y project DIPLE dderbyn gwobr RegioStars, fel y dywedodd Mark Drakeford. Mae gennym hefyd brojectau seilwaith yn fy etholaeth, gyda dros £54 miliwn wedi cael ei roi yn y ffordd Harbour Way, a fydd yn agor ardal anferth ar gyfer datblygu. Mae hyn yn cyd-fynd â buddsoddiad yn yr orsaf reilffordd, felly rydym yn paratoi'r seilwaith ar gyfer gwaith yn y dyfodol i ddod mewn, ac rydym wedi cael diddordeb rhyngwladol o ran dod i'r ardal ddatblygu honno. Ni allwn ddweud

We cannot say that this is not bringing opportunities to Wales. Those are just some examples. I am sure that many Members across this Chamber can give other examples of where this has benefitted communities, and the long-term investment will also help. In fact, although he is leaving the Chamber, the former Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development and Transport—he is staying now—said in February that the One Wales Government's management of EU funds had helped to fulfil his ambition of making Wales one of the best places in the world to live, work and thrive. I agree with him.

Clearly, the issue of GDP needs to be addressed, but even the European Commissioner has identified that the recession was a major factor; Johannes Hahn has said that

'nobody is more disappointed than the politicians there themselves because they have really tried to improve the situation by changing the economic situation etc. Wales was definitely hit very hard by the economic crisis just during the process of change, and therefore I want to say in that area the external factors have outweighed internal factors'.

This point of view was supported again by Guy Flament when he spoke on this last month, saying that, because of the recession in this programme's period, the benefits have really been cancelled out by the loss of employment. I can tell you that the UK Government's plan A has not helped one bit.

Now, in relation to POWIS, before I comment further, I want to put on record that I think that work done by the companies, scholars and foot soldiers has been excellent.

5.30 p.m.

They have operated POWIS to the targets. The question, however, is about the governance and management of the schemes, which I will come back to in a minute. Since its creation, I agree that it has received over £400,000 of EU funding. The figure that I have on inward investment is £12.5 million,

nad yw hyn yn dod â chyfleoedd i Gymru. Dim ond rhai enghreifftiau yw'r rheini. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd sawl Aelod ar draws y Siambr hon yn gallu rhoi enghreifftiau eraill o le mae hyn wedi elwa cymunedau, a bydd y buddsoddiad tymor hir hefyd yn helpu. Yn wir, er ei fod yn gadael y Siambr, dywedodd y cyn Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth—mae'n aros yn awr—ym mis Chwefror fod ffordd Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un o reoli arian UE wedi helpu i wireddu ei uchelgais o wneud Cymru yn un o'r lleoedd gorau yn y byd i fyw, gweithio a ffynnu ynddynt. Yr wyf yn cytuno ag ef.

Yn amlwg, mae angen ymdrin â'r mater CDC, ond mae hyd yn oed y Comisiynydd Ewropeaidd wedi nodi fod y dirwasgiad yn ffactor o bwys; dywedodd Johannes Hahn

nid oes neb yn fwy siomedig na'r gwleidyddion yno eu hunain gan eu bod wedi gwneud ymdrech fawr i wella'r sefyllfa drwy newid y sefyllfa economaidd ac yn y blaen. Cafodd Cymru yn sicr ergyd drom gan yr argyfwng economaidd yn ystod y broses o newid, ac felly rwyf eisiau dweud yn y maes hwnnw bod y ffactorau allanol wedi gorbwyso'r ffactorau mewnol.

Cafodd y safbwynt hwn ei gefnogi eto gan Guy Flament pan siaradodd am hyn fis diwethaf, gan ddweud, oherwydd y dirwasgiad yng nghyfnod y rhaglen hon, fod y buddion wedi cael eu colli oherwydd bod swyddi wedi cael eu colli. Gallaf ddweud wrthyfch nad yw prif gynllun Llywodraeth y DU wedi helpu tamaid.

O ran POWIS, cyn i mi fynd yn fy mlaen, rwyf eisiau dweud ar goedd fy mod o'r farn fod y gwaith a wnaed gan y cwmnïau, ysgolheigion a'r staff cymorth yn rhagorol.

Maent wedi bod yn gweithredu POWIS i'r targedau. Mae'r cwestiwn, fodd bynnag, yn ymwneud â llywodraethiant a rheoli'r cynlluniau, a dof yn ôl at hynny mewn munud. Ers ei greu, yr wyf yn cytuno ei fod wedi derbyn dros £400,000 o arian yr UE. Y ffigur sydd gennyf ar fewnfuddsoddi yw

but I will not argue over £0.5 million. There were central projects—we all get that—and the creation of new businesses. However, the benefit of the POWIS scheme, according to the positive comments made by a company in the testimonials, is that it is unique because it allowed the sponsoring company to retain sole ownership of the copyrights.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Conclude now, please.

**David Rees:** I want to point out one thing about the Knowledge Economy Skills Scholarships. There are other schemes in the system that allow academic input and scholarship to take place, but they have been ignored—POWIS is the only one. We should look at other schemes as well.

**Angela Burns:** I am delighted to speak in today's debate and I thank the Liberal Democrats for bringing it forward. I have been listening to everyone's contributions with interest, and one of the key areas that we need to look at, which is a point that was made by Aled Roberts, is that we are going in for a third round of structural funds, and the fact that we still have to do that. Mark Drakeford put up a spirited defence of the deployment of structural funds. I do not disagree; I am not here to trash what we have done with the billions of pounds that we have had. However, I particularly want to draw your attention to our amendment 4, which proposes that we acknowledge

'the requirement, for EU funded schemes, to move away from "tick box regulations" to focusing upon viable outcomes.'

Looking at the different sources of information, we can see that we have had somewhere between £1.7 billion and £1.9 billion, and, by the time that it is match funded and rounded up, you have £4 billion. We have created 9,000 jobs, which is spot-on. It is great. However, that works out at roughly £444,444 per job. We therefore need to ask ourselves whether that is a good outcome and whether we could have achieved more with that money and perhaps

£12.5 miliwn, ond nid af i ddadlau dros £0.5 miliwn. Roedd prosiectau canolog—rydym i gyd yn deall hynny—a chreu busnesau newydd. Fodd bynnag, y budd o ganlyniad i gynllun POWIS, yn ôl y sylwadau cadarnhaol a wnaed gan gwmni yn y tystlythyrau, yw ei fod yn unigryw gan ei fod yn caniatáu i'r cwmni noddi fod yn unig berchen ar yr hawlfreintiau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gorffennwch yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.

**David Rees:** Yr wyf am dynnu sylw at un peth am yr Ysgoloriaethau Sgiliau'r Economi Wybodaeth. Mae cynlluniau eraill yn y system sy'n caniatáu mewnbwn academiaidd ac ysgolheictod i ddigwydd, ond maent wedi cael eu hanwybyddu—POWIS yw'r unig un. Dylem edrych ar gynlluniau eraill hefyd.

**Angela Burns:** Mae'n bleser gennyf siarad yn y ddadl heddiw a diolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am ei chyflwyno. Yr wyf wedi gwrandao ar gyfraniadau pawb gyda diddordeb, ac un o'r meysydd allweddol y mae angen i ni ei ystyried, sy'n bwynt a wnaed gan Aled Roberts, yw ein bod yn mynd i mewn i drydedd rownd o gronfeydd strwythurol, a'r ffaith bod yn dal rhaid i ni wneud hynny. Gwnaeth Mark Drakeford amddiffyniad dygn o'r defnydd o gronfeydd strwythurol. Nid wyf yn anghytuno; nid wyf yma i fychanu'r hyn a wnaethom gyda'r biliynau o bunnoedd a gawsom. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn dynnu eich sylw yn arbennig at ein gwelliant 4, sy'n cynnig ein bod yn cydnabod bod

rhaid i gynlluniau a ariannir gan yr UE symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth y 'rheoliadau ticio blychau' a chanolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau hyfyw.

O edrych ar y gwahanol ffynonellau o wybodaeth, gallwn weld ein bod wedi cael rhywle rhwng £1.7 biliwn ac £1.9 biliwn, ac, erbyn bod arian cyfatebol ar gyfer hynny a'i grynhoi, mae gennych £4 biliwn. Rydym wedi creu 9,000 o swyddi, sydd yn dda iawn. Mae'n wych. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n gweithio allan tua £444,444 am bob swydd. Felly, mae angen gofyn i ni'n hunain a yw hynny'n ganlyniad da ac a allem fod wedi cyflawni mwy gyda'r arian hwnnw a chreu



created 16,000 jobs and helped more companies than the 1,700-odd that we have created. We need to have a look at what we are going to do with the next tranche of European funding.

I want to raise the subject of POWIS, given that it is the subject of quite a few of the amendments. I want to speak in support of the concept of the Prince of Wales Innovation Scholarship scheme. The reason why I think that it is such a good scheme is because it is company based. It is about what a company here in Wales needs to drive itself forward, and what it needs to take from the skills set of the people around it to incorporate within its business in order to move forward.

I want to mention one company in north Wales in particular—I will have to consult my notes on this, because, to be honest, I do not understand all of it. There are two incredibly bright people up in north Wales—*[Interruption.]* I did not say ‘only two’—I said ‘there are two’.

**Ann Jones:** I am one. *[Laughter.]*

**Angela Burns:** One of those people is doing PhD research into novel adhesives for advanced engineering and the other is researching novel composite structures bonding and properties. They are both working for the same well-established business, and they are trying to understand how generic reactive processing methods, involving new polymer-based materials or composites, can be turned into viable products and processes, which would bring results for the economy of Wales. That is one reason why I am a great supporter of the POWIS scheme. It allows scholars to make practical use of their PhDs and the research that they have done in universities and enables them to have a stipend. Companies must also show commitment; they cannot just pick a scholar, but have to pay £16,000 a year.

**David Rees:** Do you agree that POWIS is not the only scheme that allows academics to go into businesses and operate within them? There are other schemes, such as KESS, which is supported by Bangor University—therefore it is working up there—that allow

efallai 16,000 o swyddi a helpu mwy o gwmnïau na'r oddeutu 1,700 yr ydym wedi eu creu. Mae angen i ni edrych ar yr hyn yr ydym yn mynd i'w wneud gyda'r ddogon nesaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd.

Hoffwn sôn am POWIS, o ystyried mai dyna yw testun sawl un o'r gwelliannau. Yr wyf am siarad o blaid y cysyniad o gynllun Ysgoloriaeth Arloesi Tywysog Cymru. Y rheswm pam y credaf ei fod yn gynllun mor dda yw oherwydd ei fod yn seiliedig ar gwmni. Mae'n ymwneud â'r hyn sydd angen ar gwmni yma yng Nghymru i ddatblygu ei hun, a'r hyn sydd angen iddo dynnu ar sgiliau'r bobl o'i gwmpas i'w hymgorffori o fewn ei fusnes er mwyn symud ymlaen.

Yr wyf am sôn am un cwmni yn y gogledd yn benodol—bydd yn rhaid i mi edrych ar fy nodiadau ar hyn, oherwydd, i fod yn onest, nid wyf yn deall y cyfan ohono. Mae dau o bobl hynod alluog i fyny yn y gogledd—*[Torri ar draws.]* Nid ‘dim ond dau’ a ddywedais—dywedais ‘mae dau’.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf i'n un. *[Chwerthin.]*

**Angela Burns:** Mae un o'r bobl hynny yn gwneud gwaith ymchwil PhD i gludyddion newydd ar gyfer peirianeg uwch a'r llall yn ymchwilio i fondio strwythurau cyfansawdd newydd a'u nodweddion. Mae'r ddau ohonynt yn gweithio i'r un busnes sefydledig, ac maent yn ceisio deall sut y gall dulliau prosesu adweithiol cyffredinol, sy'n cynnwys deunyddiau neu gyfansoddion newydd sy'n seiliedig ar bolymerau, gael eu troi'n gynhyrchion a phrosesau hyfyw, a fyddai'n dod â chanlyniadau i economi Cymru. Dyna un rheswm pam yr wyf yn gefnogwr mawr o gynllun POWIS. Mae'n caniatáu i ysgolheigion wneud defnydd ymarferol o'u graddau PhD a'r ymchwil y maent wedi'i wneud mewn prifysgolion ac yn eu galluogi i gael cyflog. Rhaid i gwmnïau hefyd ddangos ymroddiad; ni allant ond dewis ysgolhaig, mae'n rhaid iddynt dalu £16,000 y flwyddyn.

**David Rees:** A ydych yn cytuno nad POWIS yw'r unig gynllun sy'n caniatáu i academyddion fynd i mewn i fusnesau a gweithredu ynddynt? Mae cynlluniau eraill, megis KESS, sy'n cael ei gefnogi gan Brifysgol Bangor—felly, mae'n gweithio i

academics and scholars to go into businesses and develop with those businesses.

**Angela Burns:** You are absolutely right, but—and this is a big ‘but’, because when I was running a software house, I would have loved to have a POWIS scholar on my books—the POWIS scheme enables the company to retain the intellectual property, while KESS does not. That is really important to a business that is looking to invest and grow. The IP element should not be overlooked. POWIS facilitates partnerships between our universities and, because of the multiple research that scholars might undertake with a university here, they will have links with other universities. That helps to bring about the whole university collaborative network that I know is an item on the Minister for Education and Skills’s agenda. It brings in scholars from outside Wales too, which enables us to exploit their intellectual property. It gives small Welsh businesses a research and development division. I mentioned that I had my own business, and I would have loved to have been able to have such research and development, because when you have a small business and you are running fast and are at the bleeding end of technology, which an awful lot of these companies are, you need that help but you cannot afford it. There is not a lot of help around from Government to give you that boost. Above all, POWIS safeguards IP for companies. However, Minister, we need to look at the scheme. I appreciate that I am running out of time, so I will gabble my way through this last bit.

I ask you to look at getting the best and the brightest to go into a scheme to help businesses, but do not just measure the best and the brightest on the basis of a degree. I ask you to look at peer review, how these people are respected in their field and what it is that they do, because if you look some of our most eminent people in all sorts of different industries in Wales and the UK, and at how they got there, they came a very different way than simply by having a first-class honours degree from a university.

fynd yn y fan honno—sy’n caniatáu i academyddion ac ysgolheigion fynd i mewn i fusnesau a datblygu gyda’r busnesau hynny.

**Angela Burns:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, ond—ac mae hyn yn ‘ond’ fawr, achos pan oeddwn yn rhedeg cwmni meddalwedd, byddwn wrth fy modd o fod wedi cael ysgolhaig POWIS ar fy llyfrau—mae cynllun POWIS yn galluogi’r cwmni i gadw’r eiddo deallusol, ond nid yw KESS. Mae hynny’n bwysig iawn i fusnes sy’n edrych i fuddsoddi a thyfu. Ni ddylai’r elfen IP gael ei hanwybyddu. Mae POWIS yn hwyluso partneriaethau rhwng ein prifysgolion ac, oherwydd y gwaith ymchwil gwahanol y gallai ysgolheigion ymgymryd ag ef gyda phrifysgol yn y fan hyn, bydd ganddynt gysylltiadau â phrifysgolion eraill. Mae hynny’n helpu i ddatblygu rhwydwaith cydweithredol ymhlith ein prifysgolion sydd, rwy’n gwybod, ar agenda’r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau. Mae hefyd yn cyflwyno ysgolheigion o du allan i Gymru hefyd, sy’n ein galluogi i fanteisio ar eu heiddo deallusol. Mae’n rhoi adran ymchwil a datblygu i fusnesau yng Nghymru. Soniais fy mod wedi bod yn berchen ar fy musnes fy hun, a byddwn wedi bod wrth fy modd o gael gwaith ymchwil a datblygu o’r fath, oherwydd pan mae gennych fusnes bach ac rydych yn rhedeg yn gyflym ac yn gweithredu ar ochr eithaf technoleg, fel ag y mae llawer iawn o’r cwmnïau hyn, rydych angen y cymorth hwnnw, ond ni allwch ei fforddio. Nid oes llawer o gymorth ar gael gan y Llywodraeth i roi’r hwb hwnnw i chi. Yn anad dim, mae POWIS yn diogelu IP i gwmnïau. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, mae angen i ni edrych ar y cynllun. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli fy mod yn rhedeg allan o amser, felly brysiad drwy’r darn olaf.

Gofynnaf ichi edrych ar gael y gorau a’r galluocaf i fynd i mewn i gynllun i helpu busnesau, ond peidiwch â mesur y gorau a’r galluocaf ar sail gradd. Gofynnaf ichi edrych ar adolygiad cyfoedion, sut mae’r bobl hyn yn cael eu parchu yn eu maes a beth yn union maent yn ei wneud, oherwydd os edrychwch ar rai o’n pobl fwyaf amlwg mewn pob math o wahanol ddiwydiannau yng Nghymru a’r DU, a sut maent wedi cyrraedd yno, daethant ar hyd llwybr gwahanol iawn na dim ond cael gradd anrhydedd dosbarth cyntaf o brifysgol.

**Simon Thomas:** Ni allwn anghytuno â'r cynnig a geiriad y gwelliannau o ran y ffeithiau. Yn anffodus, nid yw'r defnydd o arian Ewrop wedi gwella CMC y pen Cymru yn ddigonol. Mae'r ffaith ein bod yn debygol o gael trydedd dafell o arian Ewrop yn arwydd o fethiant ac yn siom. Rhaid i ni wneud y gorau ohoni, ond nid yw'n arwydd o lwyddiant. Rhaid derbyn hynny. Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu llawer o sylwadau Mark Drakeford. Mae sawl peth cadarnhaol i'w ddweud ynglŷn â'r cynlluniau, yn enwedig o ran y rhaglen gydgyfeirio. Mae'r ffigurau sydd wedi eu cyhoeddi, sydd yn dyddio o 2008—cyn y dirwasgiad, David—yn adlewyrchu cynllun Amcan 1. Yr ydym oll yn cofio nad oedd Amcan 1 yn addas iawn. Yr ydym oll yn cofio brwydro dros arian cyfatebol ar gyfer cynlluniau Amcan 1 yn 2000-01. Ni chafodd Amcan 1 y cychwyn gorau. Yr oedd yn rhy fratiog o lawer ac yr oedd gormod o arian mân yn mynd at ormod o fân chwaraewyr. Yr wyf o'r farn bod y rhaglen gydgyfeirio wedi bod yn well, a byddwn yn siomedig os gwelwn ffigurau ymhen tair neu bedair blynedd nad ydynt yn dangos rhyw fath o effaith ar y CMC y pen oherwydd y rhaglen gydgyfeirio. Fodd bynnag, bydd rhaid ei osod yng nghyd-destun y dirwasgiad ers 2008 yn arbennig.

Y rheswm mae'r rhaglen gydgyfeirio wedi bod yn well yw bod y ffocws wedi bod ar isadeiledd. Gwariant ar isadeiledd yw'r ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer arian Ewrop. Nid wyf yn sôn am y rheilffordd a'r ffyrdd yn unig. Yr wyf yn sôn am IP ac am yr hyn fydd yn cael ei adael ar ôl, ar ôl i'r arian symud o'r wlad, i gael ei ddefnyddio gan drigolion, busnesau a chwmnïau. Felly, yr wyf yn sôn am fand eang, IP, y priffyrdd a'r trenau. Yn groes i'r hyn a glywsom gynnu, pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr yn honni nad ydym wedi buddsoddi arian Ewrop mewn trafndiaeth, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi miliynau o bunnoedd mewn trafndiaeth: mewn signalau drwy'r canolbarth, gwella rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd ac agor rheilffyrdd newydd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi gwario'n helaeth ar ein hisadeiledd trafndiaeth. Mae hynny yn agwedd bositif ar hyn.

Dyfynnwyd geiriau Ieuan Wyn Jones sawl

**Simon Thomas:** We cannot disagree with the motion and the wording of the amendments in terms of the facts. Unfortunately, the use of European money has not improved GDP per capita in Wales sufficiently. The fact that we are likely to have a third tranche of European funding is a sign of failure and a disappointment. We have to make the best of it, but it is not a sign of success. That said, I welcome many of Mark Drakeford's comments. There is much that is positive to say about the schemes, particularly in relation to the convergence programme. The figures that have been published, which date from 2008—before the recession, David—reflect the Objective 1 scheme. We all recall that Objective 1 was not very suitable. We all recall fighting for match funding for Objective 1 schemes in 2000-01. It was too piecemeal and there was too much small change going to too many small players. I think that the convergence programme has been better, and we would be disappointed were we to see, in three or four years' time, figures that did not show some impact on GDP per capita as a result of the convergence programme. However, it has to be put in the context of the recession since 2008 in particular.

The reason why the convergence programme has been better is because the focus has been on infrastructure. Spending on infrastructure is the way forward for European funding. I am not talking about just railways and roads. I am talking about IP and about what will be left behind, after the money has left the country, to be used by residents, businesses and companies. Therefore, I am talking about broadband, IP, roads and trains. Contrary to what we heard earlier, when the Conservatives alleged that we have not invested European funding in transport, we have invested millions of pounds in transport: in signals throughout mid Wales, in improving the Valleys railway lines, and in opening new railway lines in Wales. We have spent substantial amounts on our transport infrastructure. That is a positive aspect of this.

Ieuan Wyn Jones's words have been quoted

gwaith heddiw ac yr oedd yn bod yn onest. Yr ydym wedi gwario'n sylweddol ar ddatblygu economaidd ac nid ydym wedi cael y canlyniad yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y byddem yn ei gael. Wrth fynd ymlaen, rhaid i ni adolygu pam na chawsom y canlyniad hwnnw a pha camau y gallwn roi yn eu lle i wella'r tebygolrwydd o gael canlyniad gwell yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n fy nghaniatáu i sôn yn benodol am un peth sydd eisoes wedi ei grybwyll gan sawl siaradwr heddiw, sef cynllun POWIS. Dyna'r cynnig i wella'r canlyniad. Oes, mae cynlluniau clodwiw eraill, ond dyna'r cynnig, mewn ardal difreintiedig, sef yr ardal cydgyfeirio, lle nad oedd ymchwil yn arbennig o gryf a lle nad oedd y cysylltiadau rhwng prifysgolion a chwmnïau yn arbennig o gryf, i wella'r broses honno.

Mae sôn eisoes wedi bod am allbwn cynllun POWIS—ni fedraf ei enwi'n llawn, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, mae'n rhaid i mi ei alw'n 'POWIS'. Mae gwraidd cynllun da yma ac mae'n gynllun sydd eisiau cael ei weld yng Nghymru. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Yr ydym yn gwybod am yr hanes a pham fod y Llywodraeth wedi tynnu'r arian yn ôl, ond mae angen gofyn dau gwestiwn penodol: pwy benderfynodd dynnu'r plwg ar POWIS yn derfynol—y Gweinidog neu Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru? Mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru i fod yn annibynnol ac i fod i gymryd y penderfyniadau ei hun ar gynlluniau fel POWIS. Yr oedd swyddogion Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ar fyrddau cynllun POWIS bob cam o'r ffordd. Felly, pwy a gymerodd y penderfyniad hwnnw? Mae angen craffu ar y mater hwnnw, ac mae angen i ni gael ateb. Gan fod y penderfyniad bellach wedi'i wneud, mae'n debyg bod yr enw wedi colli'i fri ac nad oes modd adfer y cynllun, ond pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd i'w cymryd i sefydlu cynllun tebyg? Fel y mae nifer o siaradwyr wedi crybwyll yn ystod y ddadl, mae allbwn POWIS, y buddsoddiad a'r hyn a arweiniodd ato, yn ogystal â'r ffaith ei fod yn caniatáu i gwmnïau ddatblygu eu IP eu hunain i gyd yn ffactorau yr ydym am weld yn parhau yng Nghymru. Felly, peidied neb â thafu'r baban allan gyda dŵr y baddon. Yr oedd hwn yn gynllun da gan Brifysgol Cymru a dylai barhau.

several times today and he was being honest. We have spent substantial amounts on economic development and we have not had the result that we were hoping to have. In going forward, we have to review why we have not had that result and what steps we can put in place to improve the likelihood of getting a better result in future. That allows me to mention specifically one thing that has already been mentioned by several speakers today, and that is the POWIS scheme. That is the proposal to improve the outcome. Yes, there are other laudable schemes, but that is the proposal, in a deprived area, namely the convergence area, where research was not particularly strong and where the links between universities and companies were not particularly strong, to improve that process.

Mention has been made already about the outputs of POWIS—I cannot name it in full, I am afraid, I have to call it 'POWIS'. The fundamentals of a good scheme are here to be seen and it is one that we need to see in Wales. There is no doubt about that. We know the history and why the Government has decided to take that money back, but we have to ask two specific questions: who took the ultimate decision to pull the plug on POWIS—the Minister or the Welsh European Funding Office? WEFO is meant to be independent and is meant to take its own decisions on schemes such as POWIS. WEFO officials were on the boards of the POWIS scheme every step of the way. Therefore, who took that decision? We have to scrutinise that matter and we have to have an answer. As the decision has already been made, it is likely that the scheme will have now lost its reputation and that there is no way of resurrecting it, but what steps are being taken by the Government to establish a similar scheme? As many speakers have said during the debate, the outputs of POWIS, the investment and what led to it, and the fact that it allows companies to develop their own IP are all factors that we want to see continuing in Wales. Therefore, let us please not throw the baby out with the bathwater. This was a good scheme by the University of Wales and it should continue.

**Nick Ramsay:** I will keep my points brief, because many of the points that I was going to make have already been made. This has been an interesting debate brought forward by the Welsh Liberal Democrats. On the subject of POWIS, which Simon Thomas was referring to, I got as far as ‘Prince of Wales Innovation’ when William Graham has whispered ‘scholarship’ in my ear. That is what ‘POWIS’ stands for. There is no doubt that there were several advantages to the scheme. Angela Burns pointed out the advantages quite eloquently, one of them being that it is intrinsically company-based, which other schemes could be, but are not necessarily. Therefore, Simon’s comment about not throwing the baby out with the bath water is a case in point. If we are not going to pursue that scheme, we need to know from the Welsh Government what other avenues are going to be pursued so that we do not lose that particular type of scheme.

Referring back to Mark Drakeford’s comments, in a way, both views are right. There is no doubt that we want to be able to access the maximum amount of structural funds and, if Wales is able to qualify, then that is good. However, we also have to ask why we are in that position, as we have already had two rounds of structural funds. One would hope that we would be able to invest the next round of funding in such a way that we will not have to access that sort of funding in future.

Finally, I turn to David Rees’s comments. I sit with him on the Business and Enterprise Committee, and he generally makes some very good points on it. Very occasionally, however, he gets it completely wrong—I do as well, so do not worry; I am not being overly critical. In the previous debate, you said that there is no plan in Westminster to deal with the deficit, but there clearly is. The fact that this country’s AAA credit rating was saved, and was not jeopardised, is a success. That is not to say that plans do not need to be monitored and tweaked along the way, according to circumstances. I think that you were getting to that point, but you were disingenuous in not saying that the UK Government has a plan that it is trying to

**Nick Ramsay:** Cadwaf fy sylwadau yn rhai byr, oherwydd gwnaethpwyd llawer o’r pwyntiau yr oeddwn yn mynd i’w gwneud eisoes. Bu hon yn ddadl ddiddorol gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. O ran POWIS, y cyfeiriodd Simon Thomas ato, cyrhaeddais cyn belled ag ‘Arloesi Tywysog Cymru’ pan sibrydodd William Graham ‘ysgoloriaeth’ yn fy nghlust. Dyna beth mae ‘POWIS’ yn sefyll amdano. Nid oes amheuaeth y bu nifer o fanteision i’r cynllun. Nododd Angela Burns y manteision yn huawdl, ac un ohonynt yw ei fod yn seiliedig ar gwmni, fel y gallai cynlluniau eraill fod, ond nid ydynt o reidrwydd. Felly, mae sylwadau Simon am beidio taflu’r llo a chadw’r brych yn enghraifft o hyn. Os nad ydym am fynd ar drywydd y cynllun hwnnw, mae angen i ni wybod gan Lywodraeth Cymru pa lwybrau eraill fydd yn cael eu dilyn fel nad ydym yn colli cynllun o’r math hwnnw.

Gan gyfeirio yn ôl at sylwadau Mark Drakeford, mewn ffordd, mae’r ddwy farn yn iawn. Nid oes amheuaeth ein bod am allu cael mynediad at y swm uchaf o gronfeydd strwythurol ac, os bydd Cymru’n gallu bod yn gymwys, gorau oll. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i ni hefyd ofyn pam ein bod yn y sefyllfa honno, gan ein bod eisoes wedi cael dau gylch o gronfeydd strwythurol. Byddai rhywun yn gobeithio y byddem yn gallu buddsoddi’r rownd nesaf o arian yn y fath fodd na fydd yn rhaid i ni gael mynediad at y math hwnnw o gyllid yn y dyfodol.

Yn olaf, trof at sylwadau David Rees. Yr wyf yn eistedd gydag ef ar y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, ac ar y cyfan mae’n gwneud pwyntiau da iawn arno. Yn achlysurol iawn, fodd bynnag, mae’n ei chael hi’n hollol anghywir—fel minnau, felly peidiwch â phoeni; nid wyf yn bod yn rhy feiriadol. Yn y ddadl flaenorol, dywedasoch nad oes unrhyw gynllun yn San Steffan i ddelio â’r diffyg ariannol, ond mae’n amlwg bod. Mae’r ffaith bod statws credyd AAA y wlad hon wedi cael ei arbed, ac nid ei rhoi mewn peryg, yn llwyddiant. Nid yw hynny’n golygu nad oes angen monitro a newid cynlluniau o bryd i’w gilydd, yn ôl yr amgylchiadau. Credaf eich bod yn dod at y pwynt hwnnw, ond yr oeddech yn annidwyll yn peidio â

pursue. I am happy to support the amendments that have been tabled in the name of William Graham.

**The Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science (Edwina Hart):** I welcome being able to add my voice to the discussion on European structural funds programmes and to say a few words about the POWIS scheme. I ask Members to oppose the motion, but I also ask Members to support three of the four amendments laid. I will go into detail on those later.

An inevitable, yet often misleading, link is drawn by others between structural funds and GDP, because of the role of GDP in the allocation of European funding. However, GDP is not a measure of the real impact of structural funds. Neither does GVA nor GDP paint the full picture of the Welsh economy. It is only one of the many indicators for comparing regions, and it does not reflect living standards and the wages of people living in west Wales and the Valleys who commute to work in east Wales, for example.

5.45 p.m.

We also need to take into account trends in household income, wages and employment to have a complete view. From devolution to the recession of 2008-09, total gross disposable household income in west Wales and the Valleys increased by 47.6 per cent, compared to the UK's increase of 44.4 per cent. Between 2001 and the year to March 2011, economic inactivity rates, excluding students, in west Wales and the Valleys fell by 3.1 percentage points, compared to a fall of just 1.2 percentage points for the United Kingdom.

The Welsh economy is influenced by historical and geographical factors, by the spread of wealth around the UK and by the challenges of globalisation. We must recognise that we are a small nation on the edge of western Europe. Having said that, the

dweud bod gan Lywodraeth y DU gynllun y mae'n ceisio ei ddilyn. Yr wyf yn hapus i gefnogi'r gwelliannau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno yn enw William Graham.

**Y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf yn croesawu gallu ychwanegu fy llais at y drafodaeth ar raglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd a dweud ambell air am gynllun POWIS. Gofynnaf i Aelodau wrthwynebu'r cynnig, ond gofynnaf hefyd i Aelodau gefnogi tri o'r pedwar gwelliant a gyflwynwyd. Soniaf yn fanwl am y rheini wedyn.

Mae cyswllt anochel, ond camarweiniol yn aml, yn cael ei wneud gan bobl rhwng cronfeydd strwythurol a CMC, oherwydd y rôl sydd gan CMC wrth ddyrannu cyllid Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw CMC yn fesur o effaith wirioneddol y cronfeydd strwythurol. Hefyd, nid yw gwerth ychwanegol crynswth na CMC yn rhoi'r darlun llawn o economi Cymru. Dim ond un dangosydd ymhlith llawer o ddangosyddion ar gyfer cymharu rhanbarthau ydyw, ac nid yw'n adlewyrchu safonau byw a chyflogau pobl sy'n byw yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd sy'n cymudo i weithio yn nwyrain Cymru, er enghraifft.

Mae angen i ni hefyd gymryd i ystyriaeth tueddiadau o ran incwm aelwydydd, cyflogau a chyflogaeth i weld y cyfan. O ddatganoli i ddirwasgiad 2008-09, cynyddodd cyfanswm incwm gwario gros aelwydydd yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd o 47.6 y cant, o'i gymharu â chynnydd yn y DU o 44.4 y cant. Rhwng 2001 a'r flwyddyn hyd at fis Mawrth 2011, gostyngodd cyfraddau anweithgarwch economaidd, heb gynnwys myfyrwyr, yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd o 3.1 pwynt canran o'i gymharu â gostyngiad o ddim ond 1.2 pwynt canran ar gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig.

Mae economi Cymru yn cael ei dylanwadu gan ffactorau hanesyddol a daearyddol, gan ledaeniad cyfoeth o amgylch y DU a chan heriau globaleiddio. Mae'n rhaid i ni gydnabod ein bod yn genedl fach ar gyrion gorllewin Ewrop. Wedi dweud hynny, bu'r

structural funds have been a valuable tool to get other macro-economic measures and wider public investment. They have helped us to stabilise the widening historical gaps before 1999 and enabled Wales to weather the storm. They are also creating the right conditions for growth as we prepare for the upturn.

EU projects, delivered in partnership, have supported 72,500 participants to gain qualifications, over 29,500 into work, 9,000 gross jobs and nearly 1,800 enterprises. These statistics stand on their own.

I thank Mark Drakeford for his contribution. Some of the contributions today have been about the mythology of what has not been done by the structural funds, rather than the reality of what we have done with structural funds, which I think that Mark Drakeford eloquently outlined.

Turning to POWIS, I am sure that we have all had a lot of correspondence and e-mails on this issue—I know that I have. We all recognise and support the valuable contribution of innovation and higher skills to the Welsh economy—Angela Burns made some relevant points on that issue. We have invested over £300 million in EU projects to support innovation and higher level skills and improve collaboration between academia and Welsh businesses, which includes the POWIS project. Its concept of recruiting the best graduate talent to boost innovation among businesses in Wales has much to commend it. However, the Welsh Government identifies significant management and governance shortcomings and has raised questions on the eligibility of EU expenditure. To put it simply, it is not delivering its promise to be the Rolls Royce of schemes, attracting world-class scholars to help boost innovation among business. It departed from the agreed business plan with WEFO, including the process for recruiting scholars, the academic qualifications of scholars and the context of the objectives of the scheme. This, in turn, raises questions about value for money, the transparency of selection and recruitment processes and compliance with WEFO and European requirements. Ultimately, the issue put EU

cronfeydd strwythurol yn offeryn gwerthfawr i gael mesurau macro-economaidd eraill a buddsoddiad cyhoeddus ehangach. Maent wedi ein helpu i sefydlogi'r bylchau hanesyddol a oedd yn ehangu cyn 1999 ac sydd wedi galluogi Cymru i oroesi'r storm. Maent hefyd yn creu'r amodau iawn ar gyfer twf wrth i ni baratoi ar gyfer y gwelliant.

Mae prosiectau'r UE, wedi eu cyflawni mewn partneriaeth, wedi cefnogi 72,500 o gyfranogwyr i ennill cymwysterau, dros 29,500 i mewn i waith, 9,000 o swyddi gros a bron 1,800 o fentrau. Mae'r ystadegau hyn yn sefyll ar eu pen eu hunain.

Diolch i Mark Drakeford am ei gyfraniad. Mae rhai o'r cyfraniadau heddiw wedi bod am y chwedloniaeth ynghylch yr hyn na wnaeth y cronfeydd strwythurol, yn hytrach na realiti'r hyn a wnaethom gyda chronfeydd strwythurol, a chredaf fod Mark Drakeford wedi amlinellu hynny yn huawdl.

Gan droi at POWIS, yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd wedi cael llawer o ohebiaeth a negeseuon e-bost ar y pwnc—gwn fy mod i wedi. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod a chefnogi cyfraniad gwerthfawr arloesi a sgiliau uwch i economi Cymru—gwnaeth Angela Burns ambell i bwynt perthnasol ar y mater hwnnw. Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi dros £300 miliwn mewn prosiectau UE i gefnogi arloesi a sgiliau lefel uwch a gwella cydweithrediad rhwng academia a busnesau yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnwys prosiect POWIS. Mae llawer i'w gymeradwyo am ei syniad o recriwtio'r graddedigion disgleiriaf i hybu arloesedd ymhlith busnesau yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn nodi diffygion sylweddol o ran rheoli a llywodraethu ac wedi codi cwestiynau am gymhwysedd gwariant yr UE. Yn syml, nid yw'n gwireddu ei addewid i fod yn gynllun o'r safon uchaf, gan ddenu ysgolheigion gorau'r byd i helpu i hybu arloesedd ymysg busnesau. Gwyrodd o'r cynllun busnes y cytunwyd arno gyda WEFO, gan gynnwys y broses i recriwtio ysgolheigion, cymwysterau academaidd ysgolheigion a chyd-destun amcanion y cynllun. Yn ei dro, cododd hyn gwestiynau am werth am arian, tryloywder prosesau dethol a recriwtio a chydymffurfio â gofynion WEFO ac Ewrop. Yn y pen draw, roedd yn rhoi arian yr UE yn y fantol, gyda'r

funds at risk, potentially leading to the loss of money to Wales.

The internal audit service report was finalised in agreement with the former vice chancellor of the University of Wales, as will the follow-up actions and response to the recommendations. Although it is not the Welsh Assembly Government's policy to publish reports of this kind, given the public interest, the Permanent Secretary will be writing to Members tomorrow enclosing an executive summary of the report. That, in some way, goes to the heart of some of the issues that Simon Thomas raised.

The university has agreed to scale back the EU-funded project, while WEFO has agreed to continue to honour existing contractual funding commitments to the university in respect of eligible scholars, up to a total of 18 of them. This commitment on future EU payments is subject to the university's forthcoming assurances on the quality of academic support and supervision. Decommitted funds of just over £3 million—over two thirds of the initial EU funds awarded—will be allocated by WEFO to other research and development project proposals.

**Angela Burns:** As you are talking about the scaling back of the current system, I wonder whether you would also look at the scholars who did not fulfil the eligibility criteria, but who were accepted on the scheme in good faith from their point of view, but also in good faith by the companies that have already paid their £16,000 contribution in order to have one of those scholars, because they will be left high and dry having made an investment. I wonder whether you will review that situation.

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for raising those points. We have tried our best to be clear with the university and others on commitments. I recently wrote to Debbie Garside and others on the latest position. However, it is for the university, as the lead sponsor, to fully inform participating eligible and non-eligible scholars of developments and commitments.

David Rees made a very valid point about

posibilrwydd o golli arian i Gymru.

Cwblhawyd adroddiad y gwasanaeth archwilio mewnol mewn cytundeb â chyn is-ganghellor Prifysgol Cymru, fel ag y caiff y camau gweithredu a'r ymateb dilynol i'r argymhellion. Er nad polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw cyhoeddi adroddiadau o'r math hwn, o ystyried lles y cyhoedd, bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn ysgrifennu at Aelodau yfory gyda chrynodeb gweithredol o'r adroddiad. Mae hynny, i ryw raddau, yn mynd at wraidd rhai o'r materion a gododd Simon Thomas.

Mae'r brifysgol wedi cytuno i gwtogi'r project a ariennir gan yr UE, tra bod WEFO wedi cytuno i barhau i anrhydeddu'r ymrwymadau cyllido cytundebol presennol i'r brifysgol o ran ysgolheigion cymwys, hyd at 18 ohonynt. Mae'r ymrwymiad hwn ar daliadau UE yn y dyfodol yn amodol ar sicrwydd sydd i ddod gan y brifysgol am ansawdd y cymorth a'r oruchwyliaeth academaidd. Bydd cronfeydd wedi eu dadneilltuo o ychydig dros £3 miliwn—dros ddwy ran o dair o gyllid cychwynol yr UE a ddyfarnwyd—yn cael eu dyrannu gan WEFO i gynigian prosiect ymchwil a datblygu eraill.

**Angela Burns:** Gan eich bod yn siarad am gwtogi'r system bresennol, tybed a fydddech yn edrych hefyd ar yr ysgolheigion nad oeddynt yn bodloni'r meini prawf cymhwysedd, ond a gafodd eu derbyn i'r cynllun gyda phob ewyllys da o'u safbwynt hwy, ond hefyd mewn ewyllys da gan y cwmnïau sydd eisoes wedi talu eu cyfraniad o £16,000 er mwyn cael un o'r ysgolheigion hynny, oherwydd byddant yn cael eu gadael heb ddim ar ôl gwneud buddsoddiad. Tybed a wnewch chi adolygu'r sefyllfa honno.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch am godi'r pwyntiau hynny. Gwnaethom ein gorau i fod yn glir gyda'r brifysgol ac eraill am ymrwymadau. Ysgrifennais at Debbie Garside ac eraill yn ddiweddar am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf. Fodd bynnag, mater i'r brifysgol, fel y prif noddwr, yw hysbysu ysgolheigion cymwys ac anghymwys sy'n cymryd rhan yn llawn am ddatblygiadau ac ymrwymadau.

Gwnaeth David Rees bwynt dilys iawn am



other successful EU schemes that are helping to provide scholarships to help increase collaboration between academia and business. For example, the £33 million *knowledge economy skills* scholarships programme provides PhD and Masters places to develop higher level skills through collaborative research projects with Welsh companies. The £50 million A4B academic expertise for business programme encourages higher education institutions to collaborate with industry on research and development and knowledge transfer projects, as well as on the commercialisation of new projects and processes.

With regard to the points raised by Peter Black, my officials are currently considering options for delivering an alternative scheme to that offered through the POWIS project. I will keep Members apprised of those developments.

Turning to the amendments, I have already explained that William Graham's amendment 2 relating to GDP does not paint a full picture. The figures, which relate to EU 15, not EU 27, showed a figure of 71.5 per cent for 2008 for the west Wales and the Valleys region, reflecting not only the recession, but the inevitable strong growth of new EU member states benefiting from new market opportunities. Therefore, I ask the Assembly to vote against that particular amendment.

I ask the Assembly to support the other three amendments. I agree with the comprehensive evaluation of 2007-13 programmes and arrangements that are under way. It is very important to continue to learn the lessons to help inform our investment priorities. We applied the lessons learned from Objective 1, and this time around there is a greater focus on strategic delivery and less duplication of activities, which I am sure Members will welcome. The lessons learned from this round on the role of the private sector will be critical to the development of the European programmes beyond 2013. We want key private sector engagement, and we have started that engagement very early on this occasion.

gynlluniau UE llwyddiannus eraill sy'n helpu i ddarparu ysgoloriaethau i helpu i gynyddu cydweithio rhwng academia a busnesau. Er enghraifft, mae'r rhaglen ysgoloriaethau sgiliau'r economi wybodaeth gwerth £33 miliwn yn darparu lleoedd PhD a Meistr i ddatblygu sgiliau lefel uwch trwy broiectau ymchwil ar y cyd â chwmnïau o Gymru. Mae'r rhaglen arbenigedd academiaidd i fusnesau A4B gwerth £50 miliwn yn annog sefydliadau addysg uwch i gydweithredu â diwydiant ar brosiectau ymchwil a datblygu a throsglwyddo gwybodaeth, yn ogystal ag ar fasnacheiddio prosiectau a phrosesau newydd.

O ran y pwyntiau a gododd Peter Black, mae fy swyddogion wrthi'n ystyried opsiynau ar gyfer cyflwyno cynllun amgen i'r un a gynigir drwy broiect POWIS. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod Aelodau yn dod i wybod am y datblygiadau hynny.

Gan droi at y gwelliannau, yr wyf eisoes wedi egluro nad yw gwelliant 2 William Graham am CMC yn cyfleu'r darlun llawn. Dengys y ffigurau, sy'n ymwneud ag UE 15, nid UE 27, ffigur o 71.5 y cant ar gyfer 2008 ar gyfer rhanbarth gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, gan adlewyrchu nid yn unig y dirwasgiad, ond hefyd dwf cryf anochel aelod-wladwriaethau newydd yr UE wrth iddynt elwa o gyfleoedd newydd yn y farchnad. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant penodol hwnnw.

Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r tri gwelliant arall. Cytunaf â'r gwerthusiad cynhwysfawr o raglenni a threfniadau 2007-13 sydd ar y gweill. Mae'n bwysig iawn dal ati i ddysgu'r gwersi er mwyn helpu i lywio ein blaenoriaethau buddsoddi. Yr ydym yn cymhwyso'r gwersi a ddysgwyd o Amcan 1, a'r tro hwn mae mwy o ffocws ar gyflawni strategol a llai ar ddyblygu gweithgareddau, ac rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau'n croesawu hynny. Bydd y gwersi a ddysgwyd o'r cylch hwn ar rôl y sector preifat yn hanfodol i ddatblygu'r rhaglenni Ewropeaidd y tu hwnt i 2013. Yr ydym eisiau ymgysylltiad allweddol â'r sector preifat, ac yr ydym wedi dechrau'r ymgysylltu hwnnw yn gynnar iawn y tro hwn.

It is in everyone's interests that we create the right opportunities for businesses to flourish, so that they can create jobs and help to increase the wealth of the nation. As you know, I have already made an announcement about Elizabeth Haywood and the city region programme, which will help this discussion. The Deputy Minister has already informed Members about the partnership arrangements for the development of future programmes, which include the European programme partnership forum for 2014 to 2020, which is very balanced. We are also looking at the lessons we have learnt. We have an open-door policy on what we want to do that would be best for the future. Thank you very much for allowing me to contribute to this debate.

**Eluned Parrott:** First, I would like to thank all the Members who contributed to this debate, which has been a very lively one. I would like to thank Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Thank you for your support in this area. One of the things that you and a number of speakers pointed out was that, obviously, 2008 figures are not as instructive as they might be with regard to convergence funds as opposed to Objective 1. Obviously, I take that on board, but we must recognise that those are the most up-to-date figures that we have at our disposal.

I would also like to thank William Graham for his contribution, which I thought was really interesting. He gave us an interesting perspective on the optimism that we felt here in Wales when we first had this fantastic opportunity. He described it as a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity. Sadly, it has been three times in a lifetime now, but who's counting? He also quoted Tony Blair, I think, who said that we will know we are winning when we stop qualifying. How sad. How sad it is that the optimism we felt in the first instance has been replaced by such a sense of resignation, frankly.

On Peter Black's contribution, it was incredibly interesting to listen to the findings of the report by PricewaterhouseCoopers on the situation with the POWIS scheme. It would be very helpful if further information on that were to be shared with the Chamber. We also heard from him that the Welsh

Mae o fudd i bawb ein bod yn creu'r cyfleoedd cywir i fusnesau ffynnu, fel y gallant greu swyddi a helpu i gynyddu cyfoeth y genedl. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud cyhoeddiad am Elizabeth Haywood a'r rhaglen dinas-ranbarth, a fydd yn helpu'r drafodaeth hon. Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog eisoes wedi dweud wrth Aelodau am y trefniadau partneriaeth ar gyfer datblygu rhaglenni yn y dyfodol, sy'n cynnwys fforwm partneriaeth y rhaglen Ewropeaidd ar gyfer 2014 at 2020, sydd yn gytbwys iawn. Yr ydym hefyd yn edrych ar y gwersi a ddysgasom. Mae gennym bolisi drws agored ar beth yr ydym am ei wneud a fyddai orau ar gyfer y dyfodol. Diolch yn fawr iawn am ganiatáu imi gyfrannu at y ddadl hon.

**Eluned Parrott:** Yn gyntaf, diolch i'r holl Aelodau sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl hon, sydd wedi bod yn un fywiog iawn. Hoffwn ddiolch i Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Diolch i chi am eich cefnogaeth yn y maes hwn. Un o'r pethau a nodasoch chi a nifer o siaradwyr oedd, yn amlwg, nad yw ffigurau 2008 mor addysgiadol ag y gallent fod o safbwynt cyllid cydgyfeirio yn hytrach nag Amcan 1. Yn amlwg, yr wyf yn derbyn hynny, ond mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod mai rheini yw'r ffigurau mwyaf diweddar sydd gennym.

Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch i William Graham am ei gyfraniad, a oedd yn ddiddorol iawn yn fy marn i. Rhoddodd bersbectif diddorol i ni ar y gobaith a deimlwyd yma yng Nghymru pan gawsom y cyfle gwych hwn yn gyntaf. Fe'i disgrifiodd fel cyfle unwaith-mewn-oes. Yn anffodus, bu yn deirgwaith mewn oes erbyn hyn, ond pwy sy'n cyfrif? Hefyd, dyfynnodd Tony Blair, rwy'n meddwl, a ddywedodd y byddwn yn gwybod ein bod yn ennill pan na fyddwn yn gymwys mwyach. Dyna drist. Dyna drist yw hi fod y gobaith yr oeddem yn deimlo yn y lle cyntaf wedi cael ei ddisodli gan y fath anobaith, a dweud y gwir yn blaen.

O ran cyfraniad Peter Black, yr oedd yn hynod o ddiddorol gwranddo ar ganfyddiadau adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers ar hynnt cynllun POWIS. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol iawn pe gellid rhannu rhagor o wybodaeth am hynny gyda'r Siambr. Clywsom hefyd ganddo fod Llywodraeth Cymru a WEFO yn

Government and WEFO were represented in the governance of the POWIS scheme, but failed to raise concerns until the day they pulled the plug on it, which is not the most constructive way forward to help schemes flourish and thrive.

Mark Drakeford said that I was devaluing the efforts of the people involved in these schemes. I would like to make it clear that I do not wish to criticise those people who have been involved in actioning the chosen projects and, frankly, putting their life and soul into some really interesting schemes. Rather, I think that it is right that this Chamber questions the decision-making process that has failed to deliver results.

Aled Roberts asked some interesting questions, including one about whether a successor to POWIS might be rolled out to other parts of Wales, and another about whether we are being objective in our assessment of these schemes' success. That is something that we need to bear in mind on both sides in this Chamber.

David Rees, I thought that it was very honest of you to say that it was disappointing that west Wales and the Valleys will qualify again. However, there were a few things that I would take issue with, one of which was that the main purpose of the structural funds was to help us to attract inward investment. I do not think that that is what we should be using structural funds for. Actually, we ought to have a different primary focus because, for a decade now, we have been chasing the magic bullet economic strategy that will cure the Welsh economy with big inward investment, however, the sad truth is that those elements that make a company flexible and mobile enough to come to Wales also make them mobile enough to leave. We need to be focusing on things like innovation so that we can grow our own knowledge-based economy.

**David Rees:** Just to correct you, I did not say that it was the main purpose; I said that it would lead to inward investment. Also, do you agree that the development of skills provides a workforce that encourages

cael eu cynrychioli yn y gwaith o lywodraethu cynllun POWIS, ond methasant godi pryderon tan y diwrnod y gwnaethant ei derfynu. Nid dyna'r ffordd fwyaf adeiladol i helpu cynlluniau i ffynnu a phrifio.

Dywedodd Mark Drakeford fy mod yn dibrisio ymdrechion y bobl sy'n rhan o'r cynlluniau hyn. Hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir nad wyf yn dymuno beirniadu'r bobl hynny a fu'n rhan o weithredu'r prosiectau a ddewiswyd ac sydd wedi, a dweud y gwir, ymroi'n llwyr i ambell gynllun diddorol iawn. Yn hytrach, yr wyf yn meddwl ei bod yn iawn fod y Siambr hon yn cwestiynu'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau sydd wedi methu â chyflawni canlyniadau.

Gofynnodd Aled Roberts ambell i gwestiwn diddorol, gan gynnwys un ynghylch a ellid cyflwyno olynedd i POWIS mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, ac un arall ynghylch a ydym yn asesu llwyddiant y cynlluniau hyn yn wrthrychol. Dyna rywbeth y mae angen inni gadw mewn cof ar ddwy ochr y Siambr hon.

David Rees, credaf y buoch yn onest iawn yn dweud ei fod yn siom y bydd gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn gymwys drachefn. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd ambell beth y byddwn yn anghytuno â chi arnynt, ac un ohonynt oedd mai prif bwrpas y cronfeydd strwythurol oedd ein helpu i ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad. Nid wyf yn credu mai at hynny y dylem fod yn defnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol. A dweud y gwir, dylem gael prif ffocws gwahanol oherwydd, ers degawd bellach, buom ar drywydd strategaeth economaidd hud a lledrith a fydd yn gwella economi Cymru drwy fewnfuddsoddiad mawr. Fodd bynnag, y gwirionedd trist yw bod yr elfennau hynny sy'n gwneud cwmni yn ddigon hyblyg a symudol i ddod i Gymru hefyd yn ei wneud yr un mor abl i adael. Mae angen i ni ganolbwyntio ar bethau fel arloesedd fel y gallwn dyfu economi sy'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth.

**David Rees:** I'ch cywiro chi, ni ddywedais mai dyna oedd y prif bwrpas; dywedais y byddai'n arwain at fewnfuddsoddi. Yn ogystal, a ydych yn cytuno bod datblygu sgiliau yn darparu gweithlu sy'n annog

investors to stay in Wales, and that if we do not develop the skills, the probability is that they will leave?

**Eluned Parrott:** Thank you, David; I would absolutely agree with you that the development of skills is critical. However, as I said in my opening contribution, the development of skills at all levels, along with protecting and encouraging our brightest and best to stay in Wales by providing them with opportunities for scholarships, is one of the important ways in which we can do that.

You quoted Johannes Hahn, who mentioned in his statement that the recession might be a factor. I think that would be a mistake to fall back on that argument, because the figures relate to 2008, which was before the main impact of the recession hit us. Also, this is relative gross domestic product; it is not an assessment of GDP, but rather how we are performing in comparison with other parts of Europe. Of course, the recession did not hit Wales specifically and avoid Europe; on the contrary, there are parts of Europe that have been affected much more badly than we have. I therefore think that it would be a mistake to fall back on that argument.

I thank Angela Burns for what I thought was a really helpful contribution in which she drew on her experience of working in such programmes. She talked about viable outcomes, and I absolutely agree with her. We will be supporting the Conservative amendments.

I thank you for your support for the concept of POWIS and your clarification of what was special about it, namely that it was based on the needs of companies, which were critically involved in the development of projects. There was also that one special element, in that the companies had the right to retain the intellectual property rights for the things that were developed with their money and with their investment of time. That is really important.

Simon Thomas, thank you for your contribution. You said, quite rightly, that you cannot disagree with the facts. Frankly, they are there for all to see, as plain as the noses

buddsoddwyr i aros yng Nghymru, ac os nad ydym yn datblygu'r sgiliau, y tebyg yw y byddant yn gadael?

**Eluned Parrott:** Diolch, David; byddwn yn cytuno yn llwyr â chi bod datblygu sgiliau yn hanfodol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrth agor, datblygu sgiliau ar bob lefel, ynghyd â diogelu ac annog ein pobl gorau a galluocaf i aros yng Nghymru drwy ddarparu cyfleoedd ar gyfer ysgoloriaethau iddynt, yw un o'r ffyrdd pwysig y gallwn wneud hynny.

Gwnaethoch ddyfynnu Johannes Hahn, a ddywedodd yn ei ddatganiad y gallai'r dirwasgiad fod yn ffactor. Credaf y byddai'n gamgymeriad syrthio nôl ar y ddadl honno, gan mai i 2008 mae'r ffigurau'n perthyn, cyn i brif effaith y dirwasgiad ein taro. Hefyd, cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth cymharol yw hyn; nid yw'n asesiad o CMC, ond yn hytrach sut yr ydym yn perfformio o gymharu â rhannau eraill o Ewrop. Wrth gwrs, ni wnaeth y dirwasgiad daro Cymru yn benodol a methu Ewrop; i'r gwrthwyneb, mae rhannau o Ewrop wedi cael eu heffeithio yn llawer gwaeth na ni. Felly, credaf y byddai'n gamgymeriad syrthio nôl ar y ddadl honno.

Diolch i Angela Burns am gyfraniad hynod o ddefnyddiol yn fy marn i, a oedd yn ffrwyth ei phrofiad o weithio mewn rhaglenni o'r fath. Soniodd am ganlyniadau hyfyw, a chytunaf yn llwyr â hi. Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr.

Diolch am eich cefnogaeth i gysyniad POWIS a'ch eglurhad o'r hyn a oedd yn arbennig yn ei gylch, sef ei fod yn seiliedig ar anghenion cwmnïau, a fu'n rhan allweddol o ddatblygu prosiectau. Yr oedd hefyd yr un elfen arbennig honno, sef bod gan y cwmnïau'r hawl i gadw'r hawliau eiddo deallusol am y pethau a ddatblygwyd gyda'u harian a gyda'r amser y gwnaethant ei fuddsoddi. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn.

Simon Thomas, diolch am eich cyfraniad. Gwnaethoch ddweud, yn ddigon teg, na allwch anghytuno â'r ffeithiau. A dweud y gwir, maent yno i bawb eu gweld, mor eglur

on our faces. You reminded us that some infrastructure projects have been implemented under convergence funding—thank you for that. Thank you also for your comments on POWIS, and for the two incisive questions that you put to us. The first was: who made this decision; was it the Minister, or was it WEFO in an independent capacity? The second was: what steps are being taken to create a similar programme? It was with great pleasure that I heard the Minister respond that they are now considering options for a replacement. I would like to thank you, Minister, for that.

Thank you, Nick Ramsay, for your support for the motion and for recapping some of ideas that we have heard. I will return, however, to some of the comments made by the Minister. One of your opening comments was that you felt that the link between gross domestic product and structural funds is misleading in some ways. While it is obviously a blunt tool, it is the one that the EU uses to decide whether we need help, and we must therefore recognise it as something that we have to deal with and address. You also mentioned the geographical and historical factors that come into play in Wales's economy.

6.00 p.m.

It is true that we have specific challenges in Wales due to those factors. However, the fact that our success has declined relative to other parts of Europe, when our location and history has not changed, suggests to me that there was a problem with how the first tranche of funding was used.

To conclude, I thank the Chamber for giving this serious thought. European funds are a fantastic opportunity for us, but it is sad that we are, for a third time, using them again. On this occasion, I hope that we are able to crack the nut and make a significant contribution to the wellbeing of the people of Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there are objections, so I defer voting under this item until voting time, which will

â golau dydd. Gwnaethoch ein hatgoffa bod rhai prosiectau seilwaith wedi cael eu gweithredu o dan gyllid cydgyfeirio—diolch i chi am hynny. Diolch hefyd am eich sylwadau ar POWIS, ac am y ddau gwestiwn treiddgar a osodoch i ni. Y cyntaf oedd: pwy wnaeth y penderfyniad hwn; ai'r Gweinidog, neu ai WEFO mewn rôl annibynnol? Yr ail oedd: pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i greu rhaglen debyg? Cefais bleser mawr o glywed y Gweinidog yn ymateb eu bod bellach yn ystyried opsiynau ar gyfer rhaglen newydd. Hoffwn ddiolch i chi, Weinidog, am hynny.

Diolch i chi, Nick Ramsay, am eich cefnogaeth i'r cynnig ac am sôn eto am rai o'r syniadau a glywsom. Dof yn ôl, fodd bynnag, at rai o sylwadau'r Gweinidog. Un o'ch sylwadau agoriadol oedd eich bod yn teimlo bod y cyswllt rhwng cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a chronfeydd strwythurol yn gamarweiniol mewn rhai ffyrdd. Er ei fod yn amlwg yn ddull bras, dyma mae'r UE yn ei ddefnyddio i benderfynu a oes angen help arnom, felly mae'n rhaid inni ei gydnabod fel rhywbeth sy'n annatod o hyn oll. Sonioch hefyd am y ffactorau daearyddol a hanesyddol sy'n effeithio ar economi Cymru.

Mae'n wir fod gennym heriau penodol yng Nghymru oherwydd y ffactorau hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith fod ein llwyddiant wedi dirywio o'i gymharu â rhannau eraill o Ewrop, pan nad yw ein lleoliad na'n hanes wedi newid, yn awgrymu i mi bod yna broblem gyda sut y defnyddiwyd y gyfran gyntaf o arian.

I gloi, diolch i'r Siambr am roi sylw difrifol i hwn. Mae cronfeydd Ewropeaidd yn gyfle gwych i ni, ond mae'n drist ein bod, am y trydydd tro, yn eu defnyddio eto. Y tro hwn, gobeithio y byddwn yn gallu datrys y broblem a gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i les pobl Cymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw cytuno ar y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiadau, felly gohiriaf y pleidleisio o dan yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio, a

now follow. Under Standing Order No. 12.44, at least three Members must request that the bell be rung. Do three Members support the request? I see that they do not.

fydd yn dilyn yn awr. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 12.44, rhaid i o leiaf dri Aelod ofyn am i'r gloch gael ei chanu. A oes tri Aelod yn cefnogi'r cais? Gwelaf nad oes.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

### **Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time**

*Cynnig NDM4839: O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion NDM4839: For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Julie  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Ramsay, Nick  
Rathbone, Jenny

Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Simon  
Watson, Joyce  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4840: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40.  
Motion NDM4840: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Ramsay, Nick  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Drakeford, Mark  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Gething, Vaughan  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Julie  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Simon  
Watson, Joyce  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Wood, Leanne  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4840: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4840: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Julie  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Ramsay, Nick  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Sandbach, Antoinette  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Watson, Joyce

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4840: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4840: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:



The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Byron  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sandbach, Antoinette  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Keith  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Julie  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Rees, David  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Skates, Kenneth  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4840: O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amendment 3 to NDM4840: For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Byron  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Keith  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley

Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Julie  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Ramsay, Nick  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Watson, Joyce  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4840: O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment to NDM4840: For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Griffiths, Lesley  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Julie  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Rees, David  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sandbach, Antoinette  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Skates, Kenneth  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4840 fel y'i diwygiwyd:*

*Motion NDM4840 as amended:*

*Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*The National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gynnal asemiad cynhwysfawr o'i defnydd o arian yr UE yng Ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd;*

*1. Calls on the Welsh Government to undertake a comprehensive assessment of its use of EU funding in West Wales and the Valleys;*

*2. Yn cydnabod bod rhaid i gynlluniau a ariannir gan yr UE symud i ffwrdd wrth y 'rheoliadau ticio blychau' a chanolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau hyfyw;*

*2. Acknowledges the requirement, for EU funded schemes, to move away from 'tick box regulations' to focusing upon viable outcomes;*

*3. Yn cydnabod bod angen ymgysylltu'n ehangach â'r sector preifat i feithrin twf cynaliadwy yn CMC y rhanbarthau hyn;*

*3. Acknowledges the necessity for a wider engagement with the private sector to engender sustainable growth in the GDP of these regions;*

*4. Yn cydnabod cyfraniad gwerthfawr y rhaglenni sgiliau lefel uwch ac arloesedd, megis y cynllun POWIS, at godi CMC;*

*4. Recognises the valuable contribution of innovation and higher level skills programmes, such as the POWIS scheme, to raising GDP;*

5. *Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sefydlu cynllun i olynu POWIS gyda nodau ac amcanion tebyg.*

5. *Calls on the Welsh Government to establish a successor scheme to POWIS with similar aims and objectives.*

*Cynnig NDM4840 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Motion NDM4840 as amended: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Ramsay, Nick  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Keith  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Julie  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Trefi ar gyfer yr Unfed Ganrif ar Hugain? Twenty-first Century Towns?

**Christine Chapman:** Joyce Watson and Mike Hedges have asked to speak in this debate, and I am very happy for them, and other Members, to do so.

I make no apology for the fact that this is second time that I have raised the issue of town regeneration in a short debate. I was pleased to hear a number of Members refer to the issue today, as it is a very important issue for the Assembly. Wales is made up of small

**Christine Chapman:** Mae Joyce Watson a Mike Hedges wedi gofyn am gael siarad yn y ddadl hon, ac yr wyf yn hapus iawn iddynt wneud hynny, ynghyd ag Aelodau eraill.

Nid ymddiheuraf am y ffaith mai hon yw'r ail dro i mi sôn mewn dadl fer am adfywio trefi. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed nifer o Aelodau yn cyfeirio at hyn heddiw, gan ei fod yn bwnc pwysig iawn i'r Cynulliad. Mae gan Gymru drefi bach a phentrefi, ac os nad

towns and villages, and if we do not ensure their viability, Wales's future prosperity will, I fear, be at risk. I am also pleased that the Enterprise and Business Committee is undertaking an inquiry into this. I have been following the evidence taken with great interest.

Neglect in towns and villages is a social justice matter. If the quality of life in towns and villages is poor, and if they offer poor facilities and services, it is the poorest in our society who will be disproportionately affected. If we decide to spend our money in out-of-town retail parks rather than in our towns and villages, our towns and villages will not thrive. In the Labour manifesto, my party promised to continue its efforts to regenerate town centres through planning policies that breathe new life into towns by using safer and better quality design, and by developing family-friendly environments and mixed-use developments in our towns. I look forward to seeing all of this rolled out.

Initiatives that have already been introduced by the Welsh Government have helped to start to sustain towns in such challenging economic times. For example, the business rate relief scheme has helped some of our small shops on the high street. I was pleased to hear today that the Minister will be looking at a review, as there is a lot to be done. I look forward to the task group, which will be chaired by Professor Brian Morgan.

The Tidy Towns programme is also helping to make our environment much more attractive. A quality environment and job opportunities go hand in hand if we want to regenerate. I can think of an example in Pittsburgh—some Assembly Members visited Pittsburgh some years ago—where, in order to stem the outward migration of people from the area, young people in particular, after the coal and steel industries closed down, they came up with a solution to look at this problem that was encapsulated by a simple slogan about cool jobs and cool communities. You need both to ensure that your communities prosper.

Although crime levels are low in many parts

ydym yn sicrhau eu hyfywedd, bydd ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol, mae arnaf ofn, yn y fantol. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes yn cynnal ymchwiliad i hyn. Bûm yn dilyn y dystiolaeth a gymerwyd gyda chryn ddiddordeb.

Mae esgeulustod mewn trefi a phentrefi yn ymwneud â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Os yw ansawdd bywyd mewn trefi a phentrefi yn wael, ac os ydynt yn cynnig cyfleusterau a gwasanaethau gwael, y tlotaf yn ein cymdeithas a fydd yn cael eu heffeithio'n anghymesur. Os byddwn yn penderfynu gwario ein harian mewn parciau manwerthu ar gyrion trefi yn hytrach nag yn ein trefi a'n pentrefi, ni fydd ein trefi a'n pentrefi yn ffynnu. Ym maniffesto Llafur, addawodd fy mhlaid ddal ati i adfywio canol trefi drwy bolisiau cynllunio sy'n rhoi bywyd newydd i drefi drwy gynllunio lleoedd mwy diogel ac o safon well a datblygu lleoedd sy'n gyfeillgar i deuluoedd a datblygiadau defnydd cymysg yn ein trefi. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld hyn oll yn cael ei gyflwyno.

Mae mentrau a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru wedi helpu i ddechrau cynnal trefi mewn cyfnod economaidd mor heriol. Er enghraifft, mae cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes wedi helpu rhai o'n siopau bach ar y stryd fawr. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed heddiw y bydd y Gweinidog yn edrych ar adolygiad, gan fod llawer i'w wneud. Edrychaf ymlaen at y grŵp gorchwyl, a gaiff ei gadeirio gan yr Athro Brian Morgan.

Mae'r rhaglen Trefi Taclus hefyd yn helpu i wneud ein hamgylchedd yn llawer mwy deniadol. Mae ansawdd yr amgylchedd a chyfleoedd swyddi yn mynd law yn llaw os ydym am adfywio. Gallaf feddwl am enghraifft yn Pittsburgh—ymwelodd rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad â Pittsburgh rai blynyddoedd yn ôl—Ile, er mwyn atal allfudiad pobl o'r ardal, a phobl ifanc yn arbennig, ar ôl i'r diwydiannau glo a dur gau, daethant o hyd i ateb i edrych ar y broblem hon a gafodd ei grynhoi gan y slogan syml am swyddi a chymunedau gwych. Mae angen arnoch y ddau er mwyn sicrhau bod eich cymunedau'n ffynnu.

Er bod lefelau troseddau yn isel mewn sawl

of Wales, the fear of crime is very real. The extra 500 police community support officers will help, and will be an asset to offer reassurance to visitors and residents alike. This is an important tool to tackle crime. However, I do wonder whether some other crime reduction measures, such as lots of closed circuit television cameras and railings, contrast with what the essence of our towns should be. They should be warm, friendly and welcoming environments. While there are some good points to those things, we need to be measured in our approach.

There is real potential for power to shift towards town and village centres through the growing interest in our developing food culture and the desire for local produce and services. Rising fuel costs is likely to mean that the cost of travelling to out-of-town retail parks outweighs the perceived cost savings. We have to think carefully about sustainability. The internet simply cannot offer the same experience as town-centre shopping. The sights, the smells and the social interaction are all activities that we cannot put a value on as human beings. That is not to say that the internet does not have a role in regeneration; it can help small businesses to enhance their levels of custom and increase their virtual footfall. I am pleased that the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science has set up a task and finish group to look at the needs of microbusinesses, because they are essential contributors to the economy of Wales. I am keen for small town and village businesses to have someone to call on in the Welsh Government for support, and perhaps to offer mentoring. I would like to see that being considered.

Independent shops and businesses benefit from the growth of new ideas by collaboration with each other, and it strikes me that many European towns face many of the same challenges as ours. In countries such as France, Italy and Spain, town-centre management schemes have been led from the beginning by small and medium-sized independent retailers. That has contributed to a greater focus on retail, customer service and local trade associations. There are successful examples of collaboration that I have read

rhan o Gymru, mae ofn troseddau'n real iawn. Bydd y 500 o swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu ychwanegol yn helpu, a bydd yn gaffaeliad i gynnig sicrwydd i ymwelwyr a thrigolion fel ei gilydd. Mae hyn yn arf pwysig i fynd i'r afael â throseddu. Fodd bynnag, tybed a yw rhai mesurau eraill i ostwng troseddau, fel llawer o gamerâu teledu cylch cyfyng a rheiliau, yn cyferbynnu â beth ddylai ein trefi fod yn eu hanfod. Dylent fod yn amgylcheddau cynnes, cyfeillgar a chroesawgar. Er bod gan y pethau hynny rai pwyntiau da, mae angen inni fod yn bwyllog yn ein dull gweithredu.

Mae potensial gwirioneddol i'r pŵer i symud tuag at ganolfannau trefi a phentrefi drwy'r diddordeb cynyddol yn ein diwylliant bwyd a'r awydd am gynnyrch a gwasanaethau lleol. Mae costau tanwydd cynyddol yn debygol o olygu bod y gost o deithio i barciau manwerthu ar gyrion trefi yn fwy na'r arbedion tybiedig. Rhaid inni feddwl yn ofalus am gynaliadwyedd. Ni all y rhyngwyd ar ei phen ei hun gynnig yr un profiad â siopa canol tref. Mae golygfeydd, arogleuon a rhyngweithio cymdeithasol yn weithgareddau na ellir rhoi gwerth arnynt fel bodau dynol. Nid yw hynny'n dweud nad oes gan y rhyngwyd rôl mewn adfywio; gall helpu busnesau bach i wella lefel eu busnes ac i gynyddu nifer eu hymwelwyr rhithwir. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i edrych ar anghenion microfusnesau, gan eu bod yn gyfranwyr hollbwysig i economi Cymru. Yr wyf yn awyddus i fusnesau trefi a phentrefi bach gael rhywun i alw arnynt yn Llywodraeth Cymru am gefnogaeth ac efallai i gynnig mentora. Hoffwn weld hynny'n cael ei ystyried.

Mae siopau annibynnol a busnesau'n elwa ar dwf syniadau newydd drwy gydweithio â'i gilydd, ac mae'n ymddangos bod llawer o drefi Ewropeaidd yn wynebu llawer o'r un heriau â'n rhai ni. Mewn gwledydd megis Ffrainc, yr Eidal a Sbaen, arweiniwyd cynlluniau rheoli canol tref o'r dechrau gan fanwerthwyr annibynnol bach a chanolig. Cyfrannodd hynny at ganolbwyntio mwy ar fanwerthu, gwasanaeth cwsmeriaid a chymdeithasau masnach lleol. Darllenais am enghreifftiau llwyddiannus o gydweithredu y

about that we can learn from, such as those in Cesena in Italy, Terrassa in Catalonia and in the Cittaslow town of Ludlow, which is part of the slow movement that has produced some interesting developments.

Towns and villages are about much more than just shops—they are about communities. In order for our towns to prosper, we must recognise that we cannot compete directly with retail parks and the internet in retailing terms. We must offer things that they cannot. I liked what Ken Skates said in the Business and Enterprise Committee that we must focus on the quality of the time spent in town centres as opposed to them being a quick, convenient place to shop; that is precisely what they are not in the twenty-first century. We need to think carefully about this, because our towns and villages can offer much more and can become environments that cater for leisure, relaxation, entertainment and physical activity such as cycling and walking—it is all there. Housing is also important in showcasing our heritage and culture.

Finally, I believe that education and skills are the building blocks of a healthy society upon which the future prosperity of Wales depends. I would like to see all of our towns and villages become learning hubs in locations such as community centres and pubs, which can be revitalised in sustaining this. We need to be ambitious here. That aspiration should permeate through every level of our community. For example, I am impressed by the work being done through Communities First groups to help young people to have greater aspirations about learning, despite the real challenges that modern society presents to those young people.

In conclusion, I believe that our towns and villages are important to us in Wales, and I urge the Welsh Government to ensure that they remain a political priority.

**Mike Hedges:** I thank Christine Chapman for bringing this important issue to the Chamber and for allowing me to say a few words on it.

gallwn ddysgu ganddynt, megis y rheini yn Cesena yn yr Eidal, Terrassa yng Nghatalonia ac yn nhref Cittaslow Llwydlo, sy'n rhan o'r mudiad araf a gynhyrchodd rai datblygiadau diddorol.

Mae trefi a phentrefi yn ymwneud â llawer mwy na dim ond siopau—maent yn ymwneud â chymunedau. Er mwyn i'n trefi ffynnu, rhaid inni gydnabod na allwn gystadlu'n uniongyrchol â pharciau manwerthu a'r rhyngwyd mewn termau manwerthu. Rhaid inni gynnig pethau na allant eu gwneud. Roeddwn yn hoffi'r hyn a ddywedodd Ken Skates yn y Pwyllgor Busnes a Menter bod yn rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar ansawdd yr amser a dreulir mewn canol trefi yn hytrach na'u bod yn llefydd hwylus a chyfleus i siopa; dyna'n union beth nad ydynt yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae angen inni feddwl yn ofalus am hyn, oherwydd gall ein trefi a'n pentrefi gynnig llawer mwy a gallant ddod yn amgylcheddau sy'n darparu ar gyfer hamdden, ymlacio, adloniant a gweithgarwch corfforol megis cerdded a beicio—mae'r cyfan yno. Mae tai hefyd yn bwysig o ran arddangos ein treftadaeth a'n diwylliant.

Yn olaf, credaf mai addysg a sgiliau yw conglfeini cymdeithas iach y mae ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu arni. Hoffwn weld pob un o'n trefi a phentrefi yn dod yn ganolfannau dysgu mewn lleoliadau fel canolfannau cymunedol a thafarndai, y gellir eu hadfywio wrth gynnal hyn. Mae angen inni fod yn uchelgeisiol yma. Dylai'r dyhead hwnnw dreiddio drwy bob lefel o'n cymuned. Er enghraifft, gwnaed argraff arnaf gan y gwaith a wneir drwy grwpiau Cymunedau'n Gyntaf i helpu pobl ifanc i gael mwy o ddyheadau am ddysgu, er gwaethaf yr heriau gwirioneddol y mae cymdeithas fodern yn ei chyflwyno i bobl ifanc.

I gloi, credaf fod ein trefi a'n pentrefi yn bwysig i ni yng Nghymru, ac anogaf Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau eu bod yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth wleidyddol.

**Mike Hedges:** Diolch i Christine Chapman am gyflwyno'r mater pwysig hwn yn y Siambr ac am ganiatáu imi ddweud ychydig

eiriau arno.

In many parts of south Wales, we have high streets that were built in the nineteenth century with some modifications made to them in the twentieth century, and we are trying to turn them into twenty-first century cities. I can wax lyrically about Morriston for several hours, but I promise not to, if only because you will not let me.

We have seen huge changes in Morriston—the variety of shops has changed. The Co-op is now closing, which is the last ‘proper’ supermarket there, and which is important to elderly people who live close to the centre of Morriston and who use it for their daily shop. We have seen huge changes in shopping habits—our grandparents shopped daily, but we come from a generation where shopping weekly or fortnightly is more normal.

With regard to protecting the built environment, we have a large number of old buildings, especially chapels and public houses—the two great nineteenth century innovations—that are now falling into disuse. We must ensure that some of the better buildings do not fall into complete disrepair and fall down.

6.15 p.m.

My final point is that we need to support our town centres. I ask the Minister whether he has considered setting up a high street champion or someone to speak up for and support town centres. The very large supermarkets in out-of-town areas do not need anyone to speak up for them.

**Joyce Watson:** I would like to thank Christine Chapman for this debate today. I support everything that has been said so far. However, the one thing we can all say with confidence is that there is no agreement on what makes a twenty-first century town something special. There cannot be agreement on that because there can be no single plan or solution as one size does not fit all. I sit on the Enterprise and Business Committee, which is currently looking at this

Mewn llawer o rannau o dde Cymru, mae gennym stryd fawr a adeiladwyd yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg gyda rhai addasiadau a wnaed iddynt yn yr ugeinfed ganrif, ac yr ydym yn ceisio eu troi'n ddinasoedd unfed ganrif ar hugain. Gallaf delynegu ynghylch Treforys am oriau, ond addawaf beidio â gwneud hynny gan na fyddwch yn gadael i mi.

Yr ydym wedi gweld newidiadau aruthrol yn Nhreforys—mae amrywiaeth y siopau wedi newid. Mae'r Co-op bellach yn cau, sef yr archfarchnad ‘go iawn’ ddiwethaf yno, sy'n bwysig i bobl oedrannus sy'n byw yn agos i ganol Treforys ac yn ei defnyddio ar gyfer eu siopa bob dydd. Yr ydym wedi gweld newidiadau aruthrol mewn arferion siopa—roedd ein teidiau a neiniau yn siopa bob dydd, ond rydym yn dod o genhedlaeth lle mae siopa wythnosol neu bob pythefnos yn fwy arferol.

O ran diogelu yr amgylchedd adeiledig, mae gennym nifer fawr o hen adeiladau, yn enwedig capeli a thafarndai—dwy greadigaeth fawr y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg—sydd bellach yn segur. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw rhai o'r adeiladau gwell yn dadfeilio'n gyfan gwbl ac yn disgyn i'r llawr.

Fy mhwynt olaf yw bod angen inni gefnogi canol ein trefi. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a yw wedi ystyried sefydlu hyrwyddwr stryd fawr neu rywun i siarad ar ran canol trefi a'u cefnogi. Nid oes angen i neb i siarad ar ran yr archfarchnadoedd mawr iawn ar gyrion trefi.

**Joyce Watson:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Christine Chapman am y ddadl hon heddiw. Yr wyf yn cefnogi popeth a ddywedwyd hyd yn hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr un peth y gallwn oll ddweud gyda hyder yw nad oes cytundeb ar yr hyn sy'n gwneud tref unfed ganrif ar hugain yn arbennig. Ni ellir cael cytundeb ar hynny gan nad oes un cynllun nac ateb sy'n addas i bawb. Rwyf yn eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn edrych ar y mater hwn, a'r hyn a gafodd ei gydnabod



issue, and what has been recognised is the need for mixed use of the space. This runs alongside the idea that no single solution will fit all. We have, as we have heard already, changing patterns of behaviour with regard to the way we use our twenty-first century towns, and that has shaped the way that those towns are and probably will be.

I would like the Minister to examine something that was raised in our committee evidence session today. We had evidence from the Heritage Lottery Fund, which is building in skills as well as regeneration. These are skills that can be taken on to the next generation to secure not only the built environment we are talking about but the future prosperity through that regeneration for the generation who will live there and pass the skills on to the next generation. That is my one plea to the Minister when he is looking at the regeneration of our town centres.

This is going to amaze Pembrokeshire County Council, but I would like to pay tribute to it and particularly its food officer Kate Morgan who has done untold works in promoting food and fine food in Pembrokeshire, taking what is on offer and promoting it to the people who live there, the people who might come there and those who might enjoy it. In particular, she has flagged up Milford Haven as a place of excellence where you will find excellent fish being served and turning it into a tourist attraction so that there are benefits for businesses and communities. Also, Pembrokeshire Tourism—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have allowed you two and a half minutes now, Joyce.

**Joyce Watson:** Thank you. It does an excellent job on behalf of the private sector.

**William Powell:** I am very pleased to speak in this short debate today. It is a topic that is of great importance—greater importance than the attendance here today would suggest. As Christine said, town and village centre developments are enormously important in bringing the heart back into our communities. Joyce has referred to the work of the Heritage

yw'r angen am ddefnydd cymysg o'r gwagle. Mae hyn yn cydfynd â'r syniad nad oes un ateb addas i bawb. Mae gennym, fel y clywsom eisoes, batrymau ymddygiad newidiol o ran y ffordd yr ydym yn defnyddio ein trefi unfed ganrif ar hugain, ac mae hynny wedi siapio'r trefi hynny heddiw a sut byddant, fwy na thebyg, yn y dyfodol.

Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog ystyried rhywbeth a godwyd yn ein sesiwn dystiolaeth yn y pwyllgor heddiw. Cawsom dystiolaeth gan Gronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri, sy'n adeiladu ar sgiliau yn ogystal ag adfywio. Mae'r rhain yn sgiliau y gellir eu cymryd ymlaen i'r genhedlaeth nesaf i sicrhau nid yn unig yr amgylchedd adeiledig yr ydym yn sôn amdano, ond ffyniant yn y dyfodol trwy'r adfywio hynny ar gyfer y genhedlaeth a fydd yn byw yno ac yn pasio'r sgiliau ymlaen i'r genhedlaeth nesaf. Dyna fy mhle i'r Gweinidog pan fydd yn edrych ar adfywio canol ein trefi.

Mae hyn yn mynd i syfrdanu Cyngor Sir Penfro, ond hoffwn dalu teyrnged iddo ac yn arbennig i'w swyddog bwyd Kate Morgan sydd wedi gwneud gwaith aruthrol wrth hyrwyddo bwyd a bwyd da yn Sir Benfro, gan gymryd yr hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig a'i hyrwyddo i bobl sy'n byw yno, y bobl a allai ddod yno a'r rhai a allai ei fwynhau. Yn benodol, tynnodd sylw at Aberdaugleddau fel lle rhagorol lle byddwch yn dod o hyd i bysgod gwych yn cael eu gweini ac yn ei droi i mewn i atyniad twristaidd fel bod yna fanteision i fusnesau a chymunedau. Hefyd, mae Pembrokeshire Tourism—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rwyf wedi caniatáu i chi gael dwy funud a hanner bellach, Joyce.

**Joyce Watson:** Diolch. Mae'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol ar ran y sector preifat.

**William Powell:** Rwyf yn falch iawn o siarad yn y ddadl fer hon heddiw. Mae'n bwnc o bwys mawr—pwysicach nag y byddai presenoldeb Aelodau yma heddiw yn ei awgrymu. Fel y dywedodd Christine, mae datblygiadau canol trefi a phentrefi yn hynod bwysig o ran rhoi calon yn ôl yn ein cymunedau. Cyfeiriodd Joyce at waith y

Lottery Fund. In that context, I would also mention the recent activities of the Big Lottery Fund, and its Village SOS scheme, which has had two significant successes in Wales—one in Carmarthenshire and one in Powys—both of which have brought some major life and regeneration activities, via microbusinesses, back into those communities of Myddfai and my own community of Talgarth.

As Christine has referred to, one thing that is really important is the sense of civic pride. It is important to foster that in a more effective way. That was certainly one of the effects of the work of the old physical regeneration fund that, in a previous Assembly, had to be closed down due to funding restraints. It would be really helpful if the Minister could consider lending some support to a new physical regeneration fund of a much more modest nature to receive seed-corn funding for local projects that would enhance the environment and our communities.

**The Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage (Huw Lewis):** I thank Chris Chapman for bringing this timely and important short debate to the Chamber. I also welcome the Enterprise and Business Committee's inquiry into town centre regeneration. I will be giving evidence to the committee later this month. That confirms that the issue of town centres is firmly on the agenda of the National Assembly and the Welsh Government.

In Wales, we have towns and cities of all shapes and sizes, and they have their origins in a rich and diverse past, from market towns to fishing ports, to centres of industry, past and present, to key transport hubs. Whatever their origins, town centres should be dynamic places that provide communities with an important range of employment, goods and services. They should be the focus of cultural, recreational and leisure activities for residents, surrounding communities and visitors.

Town centre businesses still provide a valuable contribution to the local economy, directly and indirectly, but there have been

Gronfa Loteri Treftadaeth. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, byddwn hefyd yn sôn am weithgareddau diweddar y Gronfa Loteri Fawr, a'i chynllun Village SOS, sydd wedi cael dau lwyddiant sylweddol yng Nghymru—un yn Sir Gaerfyrddin ac un ym Mhowys—sydd wedi dod â bywyd a gweithgareddau adfywio, drwy fusnesau micro, yn ôl i gymunedau Myddfai a fy nghymuned innau yn Nhalgarth.

Fel y cyfeiriodd Christine ato, un peth pwysig iawn yw'r ymdeimlad o falchder dinesig. Mae'n bwysig meithrin hynny mewn ffordd fwy effeithiol. Dyna'n sicr oedd un o effeithiau gwaith yr hen gronfa adfywio ffisegol yn y Cynulliad blaenorol, y bu'n rhaid ei chau i lawr oherwydd cyfyngiadau cyllido. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol iawn pe gallai'r Gweinidog ystyried rhoi rhywfaint o gefnogaeth i gronfa adfywio ffisegol newydd o natur llawer mwy cymedrol i dderbyn cyllid sbarduno ar gyfer projectau lleol a fyddai'n gwella'r amgylchedd a'n cymunedau.

**Y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth (Huw Lewis):** Diolch i Chris Chapman am ddod â'r ddatl fer amserol a phwysig hon i'r Siambr. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes i adfywio canol trefi. Byddaf yn rhoi tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Mae hynny'n cadarnhau bod canol trefi yn gadarn ar agenda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Llywodraeth Cymru.

Yng Nghymru, mae gennym drefi a dinasoedd o bob lliw a llun, wedi eu gwreiddio mewn gorffennol cyfoethog ac amrywiol, o drefi marchnad i borthladdoedd pysgota, i ganolfannau diwydiant, ddoe a heddiw, i ganolbwyntiau trafnidiaeth allweddol. Beth bynnag fo'u gwreiddiau, dylai canol trefi fod yn lleoedd deinamig sy'n darparu cymunedau gydag amrywiaeth bwysig o gyflogaeth, nwyddau a gwasanaethau. Dylent fod yn ganolbwynt i weithgareddau diwylliannol, adloniannol a hamdden i breswylwyr, cymunedau cyfagos ac ymwelwyr.

Mae busnesau canol tref yn dal i wneud cyfraniad gwerthfawr i'r economi leol, yn uniongyrchol ac yn anuniongyrchol, ond

challenges, as Chris and others have mentioned. The most significant, perhaps, is the development of out-of-town retail outlets since the 1970s, as they have accelerated the decline in the vibrancy of many of our town centres by competing against the traditional retail offer. Of course, there is the ongoing and as yet not fully understood impact of online shopping, which will have a continuing effect.

In the past, Governments have attempted to address this sort of challenge through planning policy, by directing mixed-use developments adjacent to the existing urban areas, and they have also intervened in the planning of public transport and other access issues. However, in an age of increased car ownership, out-of-town parks have clearly delivered what consumers want, all of which only serves to highlight the challenge in reinventing what town centres can offer. Members have made intelligent comments on that issue this afternoon. One aspect of this challenge, reflected in the make-up of my ministerial portfolio and in points that have already been mentioned, is the opportunity to rediscover town centres as attractive, vibrant places to live in as well as to shop in—to live there and spend quality time there as well as to access retail opportunities.

As town centres evolve, we need to find alternative uses for the vacant properties and sites that become available. We need to encourage landlords and landowners not to hold back development. As towns change, we can explore how to consolidate retail in more focused areas, perhaps, and locate housing and local services in town centres alongside that retail offer. This includes increasing opportunities to consider the role of leisure and the night-time economy as part of a town's offer to residents and as a destination for visitors. I am also convinced that we can do more to celebrate the history of many towns. The historic character of a town, in the buildings and structures that the past has bequeathed to us, lends distinctiveness and creates a sense of place. I want to ensure that we use heritage in the form of monuments and the built environment, as well as in the

cafwyd heriau, fel y soniodd Chris ac eraill. Y mwyaf arwyddocaol, efallai, yw datblygu siopau manwerthu ar gyrion y dref ers y 1970au, gan eu bod wedi cyflymu'r dirywiad ym mywiogrwydd llawer o ganol ein trefi drwy gystadlu yn erbyn y cynnig manwerthu traddodiadol. Wrth gwrs, mae gan siopa ar-lein effaith barhaus nad ydym, hyd yn hyn, wedi ei ddeall yn llawn.

Yn y gorffennol, mae Llywodraethau wedi ceisio datrys y math hwn o her drwy bolisiau cynllunio, drwy gyfeirio datblygiadau defnydd cymysg wrth ymyl yr ardaloedd trefol sy'n bodoli yn barod, ac maent hefyd wedi ymyrryd wrth gynllunio cludiant cyhoeddus a materion mynediad eraill. Fodd bynnag, mewn oes o gynnydd ym mherchnogaeth ceir, mae parciau ar gyrion trefi yn amlwg wedi diwallu yr hyn y mae defnyddwyr ei eisiau, sydd ond yn fodd i dynnu sylw at yr her o ailddyfeisio'r hyn y gall canol trefi eu cynnig. Mae Aelodau wedi gwneud sylwadau deallus ar hynny y prynhawn yma. Un agwedd ar yr her hon, a adlewyrchir yng nghyfansoddiad fy mhortffolio gweinidogol ac mewn pwyntiau sydd eisoes wedi'u crybwyll, yw'r cyfle i ailddarganfod canol trefi fel lleoedd deniadol a bywiog i fyw ynddynt yn ogystal â siopa ynddynt—i fyw ynddynt ac i dreulio amser o safon yno yn ogystal â chael mynediad i gyfleoedd manwerthu.

Wrth i ganol trefi esblygu, mae angen inni ddod o hyd i ddefnydd arall i'r eiddo a safleoedd gwag a ddaw ar gael. Mae angen inni annog landlordiaid a thirfeddianwyr i beidio â dal datblygiad yn ôl. Wrth i drefi newid, gallwn edrych ar sut i leoli manwerthu mewn ardaloedd mwy penodol, efallai, a lleoli tai a gwasanaethau lleol yng nghanol trefi ochr yn ochr â'r cynnig manwerthu. Mae hyn yn cynnwys cyfleoedd cynyddol i ystyried rôl hamdden a'r economi gyda'r nos fel rhan o gynnig tref i drigolion ac fel cyrchfan i ymwelwyr. Yr wyf hefyd yn argyhoeddedig y gallwn wneud mwy i ddathlu hanes llawer o drefi. Mae cymeriad hanesyddol tref, yn yr adeiladau a'r strwythurau a adawyd inni gan y gorffennol, yn rhoi natur unigryw iddi ac yn creu ymdeimlad o le. Rwyf am sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio treftadaeth ar ffurf henebion a'r

form of historic character more generally, to help to regenerate our towns.

Generally, we must identify and seize all available opportunities. This is part of my consideration of how best to use the regeneration investment under my portfolio, within the context of co-ordinated actions across Government. I share with all of my Cabinet colleagues a determination to deliver deeper and broader partnership working across all of our policy areas. This will be the key to successful regeneration. I therefore welcome the opportunity to reiterate the Welsh Government's commitment to safeguarding and regenerating our town centres.

In taking action at the national level, I also emphasise the importance of taking action at the local level. We must ensure that our regeneration efforts, which focus on town centres, are linked with the needs of the communities living in and around them. Our vision of town centres as thriving hubs of sustainable communities will not be achieved, as has already been said by Joyce Watson, by a one-size-fits-all approach to their development. That is why the link between town centre regeneration and Communities First is extremely important. We made a commitment in our manifesto to integrate Communities First with all our regeneration activity, and I am working closely with the Minister, Carl Sargeant, to do just that.

We also believe that the infrastructure and physical improvements that we talk about need to be seen in the wider context of social regeneration, for example, tackling worklessness, ensuring community safety and improving health. Therefore, our response to developing twenty-first century town centres needs to be shaped by the communities that they serve. Each town faces some similar issues, but each has its own unique challenges and presents its own opportunities that require bespoke solutions. We need to work closely with local people to design those solutions and get them right. For instance, I would always encourage town centre management, as has been mentioned. I also encourage business improvement

amgylchedd adeiledig, yn ogystal ag ar ffurf cymeriad hanesyddol yn fwy cyffredinol, er mwyn helpu i adfywio ein trefi.

Yn gyffredinol, mae'n rhaid inni nodi a manteisio ar bob cyfle sydd ar gael. Mae hyn yn rhan o sut rwy'n ystyried y ffordd orau i ddefnyddio'r buddsoddiad adfywio yn fy mhortffolio, yng nghyd-destun camau gweithredu cydlynus ar draws y Llywodraeth. Yr wyf yn rhannu penderfyniad gyda'm holl gyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet i gyflwyno gwaith dyfnach ac ehangach mewn partneriaeth ar draws pob un o'n meysydd polisi. Bydd hyn yn allweddol ar gyfer adfywio llwyddiannus. Felly, yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i ailddatgan ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i ddiogelu ac adfywio canol ein trefi.

Wrth gymryd camau yn genedlaethol, rwyf hefyd yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cymryd camau yn lleol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein hymdrechion adfywio, sy'n canolbwyntio ar ganol trefi, yn gysylltiedig ag anghenion y cymunedau sy'n byw ynddynt ac o'u hamgylch. Ni chaiff ein gweledigaeth o ganol trefi fel canolfannau ffyniannus cymunedau cynaliadwy ei gyflawni, fel y dywedwyd eisoes gan Joyce Watson, gan agwedd un-ateb-i-bawb tuag at eu datblygu. Dyna pam mae'r cysylltiad rhwng adfywio canol trefi a Chymunedau yn Gyntaf yn hynod o bwysig. Gwnaethom ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto i integreiddio Cymunedau yn Gyntaf gyda'n holl weithgarwch adfywio, ac yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r Gweinidog, Carl Sargeant, i wneud hynny.

Rydym hefyd yn credu bod angen i'r seilwaith a'r gwelliannau ffisegol yr ydym yn sôn amdanynt gael eu gweld yng nghyd-destun ehangach adfywio cymdeithasol, er enghraifft, mynd i'r afael â diweithdra, gan sicrhau diogelwch y gymuned a gwella iechyd. Felly, mae angen i'n hymateb i ddatblygu canol trefi ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain gael ei lunio gan y cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu. Mae pob tref yn wynebu materion tebyg, ond mae gan bob un ei heriau unigryw ei hun ac yn cyflwyno cyfleoedd ei hun sy'n mynnu atebion pwrpasol. Mae angen inni weithio'n agos gyda phobl leol i ddylunio'r atebion hynny a sicrhau eu bod yn iawn. Er enghraifft, byddwn bob amser yn annog rheoli canol

districts, as Mike touched upon in relation to Swansea.

We have already been pursuing this kind of approach in our seven regeneration areas. We have levered in substantial European funding, as well as investment from the private sector, local authorities and other partners. We have addressed many different issues, from consistency in the way public spaces are designed to town centre management, as I mentioned, and from major investment schemes to help individual shopkeepers to protect and enhance the fabric of their establishments. In a climate of reducing budgets across the public centre and beyond, we will need to be even more creative with our interventions to maximise the impact from limited resources.

I thank Christine for the opportunity to have this important debate today. It is good to see such passion and enthusiasm for the future of our towns. This short debate will help inform the shape of how we look ahead with our policies and priorities. In the meantime, I hope that I have reassured Members that the development of twenty-first century town centres is a key priority for the Welsh Government.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw.

trefi, fel sydd wedi'i grybwyll. Rwyf hefyd yn annog ardaloedd gwella busnes, fel y soniodd Mike mewn perthynas ag Abertawe.

Rydym eisoes wedi bod yn dilyn y math hwn o ddull yn ein saith ardal adfywio. Rydym wedi denu arian Ewropeaidd sylweddol, yn ogystal â buddsoddiad gan y sector preifat, awdurdodau lleol a phartneriaid eraill. Rydym wedi mynd i'r afael â sawl mater gwahanol, o gysondeb yn y ffordd y mae manau cyhoeddus yn cael eu cynllunio i reoli canol trefi, fel y soniais, ac o gynlluniau buddsoddi mawr i helpu siopwyr unigol i ddiogelu a gwella adeiladwaith eu sefydliadau. Mewn hinsawdd o leihau cyllidebau ar draws y canol cyhoeddus a thu hwnt, bydd angen inni fod hyd yn oed yn fwy creadigol gydag ein hymyriadau i gynyddu yr effaith o adnoddau cyfyngedig.

Diolch i Christine am y cyfle i gael y ddadl bwysig hon heddiw. Mae'n dda gweld y fath angerdd a brwdfrydedd o'r fath dros ddyfodol ein trefi. Bydd y ddadl fer yn helpu i lywio sut yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen gyda'n polisiau a'n blaenoriaethau. Yn y cyfamser, gobeithio fy mod wedi rhoi sicrwydd i'r Aelodau fod datblygiad canol trefi'r unfed ganrif ar hugain dref yn flaenoriaeth allweddol i Lywodraeth Cymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.27 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 6.27 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Antoniwi, Mick (Llafur – Labour)  
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)  
 Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)